Joseph Papin

VS.

University of Mississippi Medical

Deposition of:

Pat Whitlock

December 02, 2020

Vol 1

## PHIPPS REPORTING

Raising the Bar!

| 1  | IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT                            |
|----|--|
| 2  | FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI<br>JACKSON DIVISION   |
| 3  | 70.070%  |
| 4  | JOSEPH PAPIN PLAINTIFF   |
| 5  | V. CASE NO. 3:17-CV-763-CWB-FKB                                |
| 6  | V. CASE NO. 3:17-CV-763-CWR-FKB                                |
| 7  | UNIVERSITY OF MISSISSIPPI<br>MEDICAL CENTER; DR.               |
| 8  | LOUANN WOODWARD, IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY; AND                 |
| 9  | DR. T. MARK EARL, IN HIS INDIVIDUAL CAPACITY                   |
| 10 | DEFENDANTS   |
| 11 |  |
| 12 | DEPOSITION OF PAT WHITLOCK                                     |
| 13 |  |
| 14 | Taken at the instance of the Plaintiff at Via ZOOM on Tuesday, |
| 15 | December 2, 2020,<br>beginning at 9:00 a.m.                    |
| 16 |  |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 | REPORTED BY:   |
| 25 | DAWN DILLARD, CCR #1763  |

| 1  | APPEARANCES:   | Page 2 |
|----|--|--------|
| 2  |  |        |
| 3  | GREGORY SCHMITZ, ESQ.  |        |
| 4  | Morgan & Morgan (Orlando)<br>Suite 1400, 20 North Orange Avenue                |        |
| 5  | Orlando, Florida 32801<br>gschmitz@forthepeople.com                            |        |
| 6  | COUNCEL FOR TAXABLE  |        |
| 7  | COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF  |        |
| 8  | TOMMY MULTIPLE TO THE  |        |
| 9  | TOMMY WHITFIELD, ESQ. Whitfield Law Group                                      |        |
| 10 | 660 Lakeland East, Suite 200 Flowood, Mississippi 39232 tommy@whitfieldlaw.org |        |
| 11 | commyewniciteidiaw.org   |        |
| 12 | COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT  |        |
| 13 |  | i      |
| 14 |  |        |
| 15 |  |        |
| 16 |  |        |
| 17 |  |        |
| 18 |  |        |
| 19 |  |        |
| 20 |  |        |
| 21 |  |        |
| 22 |  |        |
| 23 |  |        |
| 24 |  |        |
| 25 |  |        |
|    |  |        |

| 1  | Page 3                                  |
|----|---|
| 2  | Style and Appearances1                  |
| 3  | Index4                                  |
| 4  | Certificate of Deponent220              |
| 5  | Certificate of Court Reporter221        |
| 6  | EXAMINATIONS                            |
| 7  | Examination By Mr. Schmitz5             |
| 8  | EXHIBITS                                |
| 9  | Exhibit 1 E-mail32                      |
| 10 | Exhibit 2 E-mail79                      |
| 11 | Exhibit 3 E-mail94                      |
| 12 | Exhibit 4 GME Committee Hearings for101 |
| 13 | House Officers since 2014               |
| 14 | Exhibit 5 E-mail119                     |
| 15 | Exhibit 6 E-mail122                     |
| 16 | Exhibit 7 E-mail125                     |
| 17 | Exhibit 8 E-mail125                     |
| 18 | Exhibit 9 E-mail127                     |
| 19 | Exhibit 10 E-mail128                    |
| 20 | Exhibit 11 E-mail130                    |
| 21 | Exhibit 12 E-mail138                    |
| 22 | Exhibit 13 E-mail138                    |
| 23 | Exhibit 14 E-mail145                    |
| 24 | Exhibit 15 E-mail148                    |
| 25 | Exhibit 16 House Staff Manual156        |
|    |   |

| - 1 |    |  |
|-----|----|--|
|     | 1  | Exhibit 17 Remediation Guidelines161   |
|     | 2  | and Grievance Algorithm                |
|     | 3  | Exhibit 18 Policy on Sanctions for163  |
|     | 4  | Plan Violations                        |
|     | 5  | Exhibit 19 House Officer Contract172   |
|     | 6  | Exhibit 20 Papin HR Meeting177         |
|     | 7  | Transcripts                            |
|     | 8  | Exhibit 21 E-mail202                   |
|     | 9  | Exhibit 22 Document dated January207   |
|     | 10 | 10, 2017 Re: Joe Papin, MD             |
|     | 11 | Exhibit 23 Academic Remediation and215 |
|     | 12 | Protocol Checklist                     |
|     | 13 | Exhibit 24 Policy and Grievance215     |
|     | 14 | Algorithm                              |
|     | 15 | Exhibit 25 Remediation Checklist216    |
|     | 16 |  |
|     | 17 |  |
|     | 18 |  |
|     | 19 |  |
|     | 20 |  |
|     | 21 |  |
|     | 22 |  |
|     | 23 |  |
|     | 24 |  |
|     | 25 |  |
|     |    | l l                                    |

| 1  | PAT WHITLOCK,                                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | having been first duly sworn, was examined and     |
| 3  | testified as follows:                              |
| 4  | EXAMINATION BY MR. SCHMITZ:                        |
| 5  | Q. Ms. Whitlock, can you state your full           |
| 6  | legal name for the record please?                  |
| 7  | A. Patricia Rosenthal Whitlock.                    |
| 8  | Q. And have you ever had your deposition           |
| 9  | taken before?                                      |
| 10 | A. I have.   |
| 11 | Q. Okay. When were you last deposed?               |
| 12 | A. Not here, but it's been several years           |
| 13 | ago with a different organization.                 |
| 14 | Q. And what was that deposition regarding?         |
| 15 | A. I served as HR director for an                  |
| 16 | organization where an employee's contract was      |
| 17 | severed and he filed claims to return to that      |
| 18 | place of employment.                               |
| 19 | Q. Okay. Any other depositions?                    |
| 20 | A. Yes.  |
| 21 | Q. Okay. What other depositions?                   |
| 22 | A. There was another situation many, many          |
| 23 | years ago where the company that I worked for had  |
| 24 | programs through which employees were retained or  |
| 25 | separated and there was another situation where an |

Page 6 1 employee's employment was not retained. 2 And was that employee alleging discrimination or retaliation or something along 3 4 those lines? 5 A. Yes. 6 0. In the first case that you mentioned was 7 that also a discrimination retaliation? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. Any other depositions that you've had? 10 A. No, those are the only ones. 11 Ο. Well, I'm going to go over the ground 12 rules really quickly since it's been a couple of 13 So today, you know, you and I will be years. conversing back and forth, please try to make your 14 15 answers yes or no or some type of audible answer. 16 Shaking your head yes or no or anything like that, 17 uh-huhs (affirmative) and huh-uhs (negative) and 18 all that kind of stuff make it difficult for the 19 court reporter to pick that up, so if we could 20 please try to keep our answers audible and clear 21 so that she can type out the record easily. 22 If I ask you a question that you don't 23 understand, please do not hesitate to ask me to 24 rephrase it. If you need a break please let me 25 know, the only thing I ask is that if I have a

| 1  | question pending when you need a break that we   |
|----|--|
| 2  | finish that question, then you can go on your    |
| 3  | break for bathrooms or whatever reason.          |
| 4  | I'm going to assume if you provide an            |
| 5  | answer to my question that you fully understand  |
| 6  | the question.                                    |
| 7  | And what is your date of birth?                  |
| 8  | A. 10/2/53.                                      |
| 9  | Q. And what is your current address?             |
| 10 | A. 102 Quail Run Drive, Madison,                 |
| 11 | Mississippi.                                     |
| 12 | Q. And have you ever testified at trial          |
| 13 | before?  |
| 14 | A. No.   |
| 15 | Q. Okay. Have you ever been convicted of a       |
| 16 | crime?   |
| 17 | A. No.   |
| 18 | Q. Have you ever been arrested?                  |
| 19 | A. No.   |
| 20 | Q. Are you under the influence of any drugs      |
| 21 | of any kind today or do you have any medical     |
| 22 | conditions which may prevent you from accurately |
| 23 | or truthfully answering my questions today?      |
| 24 | A. No.   |
| 25 | Q. What is your highest level of education?      |
|    |  |

|    | <u> </u>   |
|----|--|
| 1  | Page 8 A. I have a master's degree.                |
| 2  | Q. In what?  |
| 3  | A. Sociology.                                      |
| 4  | Q. And what did you get your undergraduate         |
| 5  | degree in?   |
| 6  | A. Sociology.                                      |
| 7  |  |
| 8  | Q. Sociology, okay.                                |
|    | A. Yes.  |
| 9  | Q. Do you hold any other certificates or           |
| 10 | professional credentials?                          |
| 11 | A. I have certification as a professional          |
| 12 | in human resources.                                |
| 13 | Q. Okay. Anything else?                            |
| 14 | A. No.   |
| 15 | Q. Can you please tell me what you did             |
| 16 | other than I don't want to know the substance      |
| 17 | of your conversations potentially with Tommy or    |
| 18 | anything like that because that would be protected |
| 19 | by attorney/client privilege, but can you tell me  |
| 20 | what you did to prepare for this deposition in     |
| 21 | terms of which documents you reviewed?             |
| 22 | A. I reviewed the transcript of my                 |
| 23 | interview with Dr. Papin and I also reviewed       |
| 24 | various e-mails containing back and forth          |
| 25 | conversations regarding his situation.             |
|    |  |

```
Page 9
 1
          Q.
                      Besides your counsel did you
               Okay.
 2
     speak with anybody else in preparation for your
 3
     deposition today?
 4
          Α.
               No.
 5
          0.
               Have you reviewed any of the expert
     reports which have been exchanged in this case?
 6
 7
          Α.
               I'm not familiar with what you're
     referring to.
 8
 9
          Q.
               There's expert witnesses that have
10
     rendered opinions in this case --
11
          Α.
               No, I have not.
12
          Q.
               Okay.
                      Have you reviewed any other types
13
     of abstracts or summaries that were prepared by
14
     anybody in this case to prepare you for this
     deposition today?
15
16
          Α.
               No.
17
               Have you reviewed the appeals transcript
          Q.
     from Joseph Papin's appeal of his termination?
18
19
          Α.
               No.
20
               So the only transcript you reviewed
          Q.
     would be the transcript from your interview with
21
22
     Joseph Papin on January 27; is that correct?
23
          Α.
               Yes.
24
               Okay. And what is your position at
25
     UMMC?
```

| 1  | Page 10 A. Human Resource Business Partner.        |
|----|--|
| 2  | Q. And what does that mean? What are your          |
| 3  | duties and responsibilities?                       |
| 4  | A. I serve as a consultant to specified            |
| 5  | departments. It is a role that advises them,       |
| 6  | helps them make strategies, anything pertaining to |
| 7  | their employees, any kind of situations with       |
| 8  | employees, questions that they may have about      |
| 9  | processes, it is my responsibility to listen, to   |
| 10 | guide, and provide advice.                         |
| 11 | Q. And which departments do you work with          |
| 12 | at UMMC?   |
| 13 | A. There are several that I am responsible         |
| 14 | for. Those include I'll tell you in just a         |
| 15 | second. It's quite a few of them.                  |
| 16 | Q. Not a problem, take your time.                  |
| 17 | A. Pathology, dermatology, department of           |
| 18 | medicine, which has 26 divisions.                  |
| 19 | Q. Okay.   |
| 20 | A. Physiology, academic affairs, and that's        |
| 21 | pretty much the sum of it.                         |
| 22 | Q. Would your is academic affairs, that            |
| 23 | would be considered sort of how you got involved   |
| 24 | with this matter here, that would have been in     |
| 25 | A. No, that is it was the department of            |
|    |  |

| 1  | medicine, but also the graduate medical education  |
|----|--|
| 2  | office.  |
| 3  | Q. Okay. So you also help provide advice           |
| 4  | to the graduate medical education office?          |
| 5  | A. Yes.  |
| 6  | Q. Okay. How long have you been with UMMC?         |
| 7  | A. Seven years.                                    |
| 8  | Q. As an HR professional at UMMC what are          |
| 9  | your interactions with residents, if at all, on    |
| 10 | either a day to day or weekly, monthly basis?      |
| 11 | A. Only if they have questions regarding           |
| 12 | benefits or compensation sometimes they will       |
| 13 | contact me, otherwise I have very little           |
| 14 | interaction.                                       |
| 15 | Q. Or also in disciplinary type of matters         |
| 16 | as well, you typically get involved?               |
| 17 | A. With the supervisors or someone in the          |
| 18 | department, but not necessarily with the employee. |
| 19 | Q. So it's only if the program director            |
| 20 | first would reach out to you then you would get    |
| 21 | involved you're not actually going to be getting   |
| 22 | involved in sort of the day to day                 |
| 23 | A. Yes.  |
| 24 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay.                          |
| 25 | MR. WHITFIELD: Okay. I know you're                 |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 12 eager, let him finish his question.        |
|----|--|
| 2  | THE WITNESS: Okay.                                 |
| 3  | MR. WHITFIELD: So you hear the whole               |
| 4  | question before you answer. And plus the           |
| 5  | court reporter will be a lot nicer if we're        |
| 6  | not talking over each other.                       |
| 7  | MR. SCHMITZ: And real quick, Tommy, is             |
| 8  | there anybody else in the room with you guys       |
| 9  | or is it just you two?                             |
| 10 | MR. WHITFIELD: Just us.                            |
| 11 | MR. SCHMITZ: Okay.                                 |
| 12 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Do you recall Joseph           |
| 13 | Papin?   |
| 14 | A. Yes.  |
| 15 | Q. And at UMMC when did you first hear             |
| 16 | about Dr. Papin?                                   |
| 17 | A. Mid January 2017.                               |
| 18 | Q. Is that when Dr. Earl reached out to            |
| 19 | you.   |
| 20 | A. Dr. Barr.                                       |
| 21 | Q. Dr. Barr with Dr. Earl?                         |
| 22 | A. Yes.  |
| 23 | Q. So tell me about your involvement in            |
| 24 | other resident discipline cases not including this |
| 25 | one?   |
|    |  |

|    | Page 13   |
|----|---|
| 1  | A. If there is a concern brought to HR in a       |
| 2  | department that I provide support to I will then  |
| 3  | follow whatever information has been provided.    |
| 4  | Sometimes the department will provide concerns    |
| 5  | that I will need to follow-up on or sometimes a   |
| 6  | concern may come from an employee. It just        |
| 7  | depends on how the information gets to HR.        |
| 8  | Q. Okay. And when you say follow-up on, so        |
| 9  | a concern is typically brought to you regarding a |
| 10 | resident that my require discipline and then you  |
| 11 | would conduct your own investigation into that    |
| 12 | concern and make recommendations based on that?   |
| 13 | A. Yes.   |
| 14 | Q. What are the interactions between let's        |
| 15 | say a program like the general surgery program at |
| 16 | UMMC and human resources?                         |
| 17 | A. Would you clarify your question?               |
| 18 | Q. In terms of specifically with respect to       |
| 19 | that department, what type of things do you do in |
| 20 | terms of advising the general surgery department  |
| 21 | at UMMC?  |
| 22 | A. General surgery is a part of the               |
| 23 | department of medicine.                           |
| 24 | Q. Okay.  |
| 25 | A. And typically the concerns any kind            |
|    |   |

| 1  | of concerns would come there's a hierarchy  |
|--|---|
| 2  | within the department, so it would depend on what   |
| 3  | the concern is, what the question is, how it would  |
| 4  | come to HR. Typically with the general surgery  |
| 5  | department because those the program director   |
| 6  | is considered a faculty staff person, many times  |
| 7  | that direct interaction would not be with the HR  |
| 8  | business partner it would be with the supervisor  |
| 9  | of the HR business partner group. And then if it  |
| 10   | were deemed that whatever the concern is needed to  |
| 11   | be further addressed or an investigation done,  |
| 12   | that would be assigned to the HR business partner.  |
| 13   | Q. And who would be the supervisor HR   |
| 4.4  |   |
| 14   | partner for the general surgery program at UMMC?  |
| 15   | partner for the general surgery program at UMMC?  A. It would be the same person who  |
|  |   |
| 15   | A. It would be the same person who  |
| 15<br>16                                       | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners.  |
| 15<br>16<br>17                                 | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners. Currently that position is vacant.   |
| 15<br>16<br>17<br><b>18</b>                    | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners.  Currently that position is vacant.  Q. Who was it back in 2017?   |
| 15<br>16<br>17<br><b>18</b><br>19              | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners.  Currently that position is vacant.  Q. Who was it back in 2017?  A. It was Molly Brasfield.   |
| 15<br>16<br>17<br><b>18</b><br>19<br><b>20</b> | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners.  Currently that position is vacant.  Q. Who was it back in 2017?  A. It was Molly Brasfield.  Q. Molly Brasfield, okay. With respect to  |
| 15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21         | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners.  Currently that position is vacant.  Q. Who was it back in 2017?  A. It was Molly Brasfield.  Q. Molly Brasfield, okay. With respect to resident discipline, would it be fair to say that  |
| 15<br>16<br>17<br>18<br>19<br>20<br>21         | A. It would be the same person who supervises all of the HR business partners.  Currently that position is vacant.  Q. Who was it back in 2017?  A. It was Molly Brasfield.  Q. Molly Brasfield, okay. With respect to resident discipline, would it be fair to say that basically the program director and program kind of |

| 1  | crossed and Is are dotted?                        |
|----|---|
|    |   |
| 2  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                |
| 3  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You can answer.               |
| 4  | A. Discipline at UMMC is a four-step              |
| 5  | process and the first step would be informal. The |
| 6  | second step would be a verbal counseling. The     |
| 7  | third step would be a written warning. All        |
| 8  | departments are at their discretion to administer |
| 9  | those. Anything that falls outside that must come |
| 10 | to HR for consultation and ultimate approval.     |
| 11 | Q. What did you say the third step was?           |
| 12 | A. The written. The first step is                 |
| 13 | informal.   |
| 14 | Q. Then you said it was written, and then         |
| 15 | you said third was something else?                |
| 16 | A. Verbal. The first step is an informal          |
| 17 | counseling.                                       |
| 18 | Q. Okay.  |
| 19 | A. The second stop where the process              |
| 20 | actually begins would be called a verbal          |
| 21 | counseling although it is documented. The next    |
| 22 | step would be written.                            |
| 23 | Q. And then what's the fourth step?               |
| 24 | A. Final written. And the last one would          |
| 25 | be termination.                                   |
|    |   |

| 1  | Q. Tell me about the procedures at UMMC            |
|----|--|
| 2  | when an allegation of sexual harassment comes to   |
| 3  | HR from an employee of UMMC, what are the typical  |
| 4  | processes?   |
| 5  | A. The typical process would be for                |
| 6  | MR. WHITFIELD: I'm going to make an                |
| 7  | objection. She's not our 30(b)(6) on these         |
| 8  | procedures and all that. She can answer to         |
| 9  | her knowledge but not as to the institution's      |
| 10 | knowledge.   |
| 11 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Sure. Just to the best         |
| 12 | of your knowledge?                                 |
| 13 | A. The process would it would depend on            |
| 14 | to what location the allegations were made. If it  |
| 15 | were an employee it could come to the HR business  |
| 16 | partner or it could go directly to our office of   |
| 17 | employee relations.                                |
| 18 | Q. And once the report comes into either of        |
| 19 | those offices then what takes place?               |
| 20 | A. There would be an investigation                 |
| 21 | including interviews of the pertinent participants |
| 22 | or whomever was engaged in it.                     |
| 23 | Q. Okay. And then after the interviews             |
| 24 | what would take place?                             |
| 25 | A. Recommendations would be made both to           |
|    |  |

| 1  | the department and to employee relations. Page 17  |
|----|--|
| 2  | Q. Recommendations with respect to how to          |
| 3  | just deal with it with the scenario or what?       |
| 4  | A. Recommendations as to resolution of the         |
| 5  | situation.   |
| 6  | Q. Okay. And what would the typical                |
| 7  | resolutions look like in that type of case?        |
| 8  | A. It would depend on the case.                    |
| 9  | Q. Okay. Sometimes termination would be on         |
| 10 | the menu, correct?                                 |
| 11 | A. Yes.  |
| 12 | Q. Would separating the employees be on            |
| 13 | potentially on the menu?                           |
| 14 | A. Please clarify what you mean by                 |
| 15 | separating.  |
| 16 | Q. You know, put them in different shifts          |
| 17 | so that they don't have to interact with each      |
| 18 | other anymore or, you know, just making it so      |
| 19 | that, you know, I don't know, at UMMC it's a large |
| 20 | hospital, right, you could put somebody on the     |
| 21 | other end of the hospital away from somebody else  |
| 22 | who was allegedly bothering somebody and then they |
| 23 | don't have to see each other anymore?              |
| 24 | A. I've not been involved in a case of that        |
| 25 | nature.  |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 18 Q. Okay. Have you ever been involved in a    |
|----|--|
| 2  | case where an employee was accused of sexual         |
| 3  | harassment and that employee was suspended but       |
| 4  | then allowed to come back?                           |
| 5  | A. No.   |
| 6  | Q. So termination is usually the route to            |
| 7  | go in that type of situation?                        |
| 8  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to form, you can               |
| 9  | answer.  |
| 10 | THE WITNESS: In the situation that I                 |
| 11 | have been involved in.                               |
| 12 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. When did you               |
| 13 | first learn that Dr. Papin allegedly harassed and    |
| 14 | made another resident feel uncomfortable?            |
| 15 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form of                 |
| 16 | the question.  |
| 17 | THE WITNESS: Anything that I learned                 |
| 18 | regarding Dr. Papin would have been in               |
| 19 | mid-January 2017.                                    |
| 20 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Are you aware that               |
| 21 | Ashley Griffin, another resident, made UMMC aware of |
| 22 | this on January 9, 2017?                             |
| 23 | A. I am not.   |
| 24 | Q. Do you have any idea why there was no             |
| 25 | investigation completed with respect to the          |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 19 alleged incident of harassment involving another |
|----|--|
| 2  | resident and Dr. Papin?                                  |
| 3  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                       |
| 4  | THE WITNESS: Although residents are                      |
| 5  | employees, because of the educational                    |
| 6  | component there are two tracks for any                   |
| 7  | interaction when there are concerns regarding            |
| 8  | their performance or behavior. The program               |
| 9  | director, the graduate medical office would              |
| 10 | be one track that would initially be                     |
| 11 | responsible for any interaction. Once they               |
| 12 | had done their due diligence, if they thought            |
| 13 | it prudent then it would come to HR.                     |
| 14 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Did you ever or did                  |
| 15 | anyone else in HR ever conduct any interviews            |
| 16 | regarding alleged sexual harassment by Dr. Papin?        |
| 17 | A. I don't know, but I did not.                          |
| 18 | Q. Okay. Do you have any knowledge of the                |
| 19 | ACGME requirements on residency programs?                |
| 20 | A. I do not.   |
| 21 | Q. Have you ever received any type of                    |
| 22 | training or anything like that with respect to           |
| 23 | what the ACGME requires from residency programs?         |
| 24 | A. I have not. The graduate medical office               |
| 25 | handles the graduate medical education office            |
|    |  |

Page 20 1 handles all of that. 2 So HR would have no involvement in any type of whether someone is meeting ACGME 3 requirements or anything like that? 4 5 Α. No. 6 Q. Have you ever been involved in the termination of UMMC employees prior to 2017? 7 8 Α. Yes. 9 Did any of those cases involve house Q. 10 officers? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. Can you tell me about those cases? 13 Α. There was one case where there were allegations of sexual harassment as well as the 14 15 offering of illegal drugs. And because that person was a house officer and others similarly 16 situated were involved, it was handled as a Title 17 18 IX case. 19 And what was the result of that case? 0. 20 I did not have involvement in it beyond Α. 21 the initial interviews. 22 HR didn't make any recommendations with 0. respect to that resident whether that resident be 23 terminated or not? 24 25 The recommendation from the department Α.

| 1  | Page 21 was that the person be terminated and as the HR |
|----|---|
| 2  | business partner involved in a part of those            |
| 3  | interviews that recommendation was supported and        |
| 4  | then submitted to the office of employee                |
| 5  | relations.  |
| 6  | Q. And in that case you conducted                       |
| 7  | interviews of the relevant persons that were            |
| 8  | involved including those who made the allegations       |
| 9  | against this resident?                                  |
| 10 | A. Yes.   |
| 11 | Q. About how many interviews did you                    |
| 12 | actually conduct in that case?                          |
| 13 | A. I don't recall the exact number, but I               |
| 14 | know there were more than five.                         |
| 15 | Q. Okay. Any other terminations involving               |
| 16 | house officers prior to 2017?                           |
| 17 | A. I don't know.  |
| 18 | Q. What about since 2017?                               |
| 19 | A. I don't know. If I am not directly                   |
| 20 | involved in them I would not have knowledge.            |
| 21 | Q. Are there a lot of cases where HR is not             |
| 22 | involved in the termination of a house officer?         |
| 23 | A. I don't know.  |
| 24 | Q. So to your the best of your                          |
| 25 | recollection, the only other house officer              |
|    |   |

| Page 2   | _ |
|--|---|
| 1 termination that you've been involved in was the   | 2 |
| 2 one that you just mentioned before?                |   |
| 3 A. Yes.  |   |
| 4 Q. Have you ever been involved in any type         |   |
| 5 of discipline of house officers not including      |   |
| 6 termination, other types of discipline on house    |   |
| 7 officers?  |   |
| 8 A. Yes.  |   |
| 9 Q. What are those cases?                           |   |
| 10 A. Several years ago after our electronic         |   |
| 11 records system was implemented, the office of     |   |
| 12 compliance did reviews to determine if anyone had |   |
| 13 accessed medical records without a need to know   |   |
| 14 and as they discovered that they conducted the    |   |
| 15 interviews, they determined the discipline, and   |   |
| 16 then that information was forwarded to HR to      |   |
| 17 actually present the discipline to the employees. |   |
| 18 Q. And several residents were disciplined         |   |
| 19 as a result of that policy?                       |   |
| 20 A. They were.                                     |   |
| Q. Okay. What was the discipline that was            |   |
| 22 given to those residents?                         |   |
| A. It was a 10 day suspension without pay            |   |
| 24 and a final written warning.                      |   |
| Q. Did anyone to the best of your knowledge          |   |

| 1  | get terminated because of that?                   |
|----|---|
| 2  | A. Not to my knowledge.                           |
| 3  | Q. Do you or did you have the sole power to       |
| 4  | terminate a house officer in 2017?                |
| 5  | A. I do not have power to terminate anyone.       |
| 6  | Q. In this case with Dr. Papin what               |
| 7  | policies did you have to insure were being        |
| 8  | complied with during his termination process at   |
| 9  | UMMC?   |
| 10 | A. Would you repeat the question?                 |
| 11 | Q. In this case what policies and                 |
| 12 | procedures were you making sure were being        |
| 13 | complied with during Dr. Papin's termination      |
| 14 | process?  |
| 15 | A. Based on the information that the              |
| 16 | department provided I would have reviewed our     |
| 17 | employee staff faculty staff handbook to          |
| 18 | determine what kind of infractions were present.  |
| 19 | They would have included lack of professionalism, |
| 20 | and I would have to review I would have to        |
| 21 | actually look at the policy to give you all of    |
| 22 | those but they were reviewed prior to the         |
| 23 | concurrence in the department's request.          |
| 24 | Q. Okay. Is there anything any other              |
| 25 | policies and procedures, grievance procedures,    |
|    |   |

| 1  | Page 24 anything like that that would need to be complied |
|----|---|
| 2  | with or remediation procedures?                           |
| 3  | A. Not from an HR standpoint, just                        |
| 4  |   |
| 5  | basically whatever those policies were that do            |
|    | guide the performance and behavior of employees.          |
| 6  | Q. Okay. Whose decision was it to                         |
| 7  | terminate Dr. Papin?                                      |
| 8  | A. The final authority rested with the                    |
| 9  | MR. WHITFIELD: I'm going to object to                     |
| 10 | the form, but you can answer to the best of               |
| 11 | your knowledge.   |
| 12 | THE WITNESS: To the best of my                            |
| 13 | knowledge the final authority rested with the             |
| 14 | office of employee relations in human                     |
| 15 | resources.  |
| 16 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) So the program director               |
| 17 | would not have had the authority to terminate             |
| 18 | Dr. Papin?  |
| 19 | A. If they had been using the processes in                |
| 20 | the graduate medical education office, they would         |
| 21 | have had the authority to dismiss him from the            |
| 22 | program, but because a house officer is considered        |
| 23 | an employee as well as a trainee, it depends on           |
| 24 | which approach is being requested. The department         |
| 25 | had requested termination as an employee and that         |

```
Page 25
 1
     is how HR became involved.
 2
               Okay.
                      So but someone's employment is
 3
     completely dependent -- when you're a resident
 4
     your employment is completely dependent on being
 5
     still part of that graduate medical education
 6
     program, correct?
 7
               MR. WHITFIELD:
                                Object to the form.
 8
               THE WITNESS:
                            At UMMC because house
 9
          officers are in a training program there can
          be occasions where they are dismissed from
10
11
          the program.
                        And as a result of that they
12
          are no longer employees, but in terms of
13
          their employment status it is not a
14
          termination from an HR standpoint.
15
          Q.
                (By Mr. Schmitz)
                                 Right. Right, but
16
     that's really just a form though, someone's -- if
17
     you're terminated from a program and you're a
18
     resident, you're no longer working at UMMC,
19
     physically working at UMMC anymore, correct?
20
          Α.
               Yes.
21
          Ο.
               Okay.
                      I get the -- so just basically
22
     there's just a distinction within UMMC of the
23
     program being part of a program and then the
24
     actual formal employment relationship that
25
     residents have, so they kind of have like a dual
```

| _          | Page 26  |
|------------|--|
| 1          | employment, right, you know, where they have to be |
| 2          | both part of the program as well as employees of   |
| 3          | UMMC to continue working at UMMC, correct?         |
| 4          | A. Yes.  |
| 5          | Q. Has there ever been a situation where           |
| 6          | someone has been terminated from a program but     |
| 7          | then continued to work at where a resident         |
| 8          | let me rephrase.                                   |
| 9          | Has there ever been a situation where a            |
| 10         | resident has been terminated from a program but    |
| 11         | continued employment with UMMC?                    |
| 12         | A. I don't know.                                   |
| 13         | Q. Do you recall any of those situations?          |
| 14         | A. I don't know.                                   |
| 15         | Q. Is it that you don't know or you're just        |
| 16         | not aware of any situations?                       |
| 17         | A. I'm not aware. I do know that there is          |
| 18         | a possibility that if someone were to seek         |
| 19         | employment and be selected for that role they      |
| 20         | could be hired, but I have not had any kind of     |
| 21         | direct involvement with it.                        |
| 22         | Q. Okay. What do HR policies and                   |
| 23         | procedures require before a house officer can be   |
| 24         | terminated?  |
| 25         |  |
| <i>4</i> J | A. The policies and procedures for the             |

Page 27 1 house officers would be no different from any 2 other employee in terms of employment. 3 again, it would depend on what those policies are 4 contained in the faculty staff handbook. 5 Q. Are there certain steps or something in 6 terms of resident though that are specific to 7 residents that need to be followed at least to your knowledge from an HR perspective? 8 9 No different from any other employee. 10 0. Do all employees at UMMC have the right 11 to appeal their termination if they are 12 terminated? 13 Α. I don't know. 14 Well, do the HR policies at UMMC dictate 15 who gets to appeal their termination or not? 16 There are some actions listed in the 17 faculty staff handbook that are grievable. 18 Q. Okay. So depending on the situation 19 what policies could apply would be different to 20 each employee, correct? 21 I don't know. Α. 22 Q. Other than the faculty staff handbook 23 were there any other policies or procedures 24 considered in terminating Dr. Papin's employment? 25 Α. Not to my knowledge.

| 1  | Q. UMMC has a contract with its residents;         |
|----|--|
| 2  | is that correct?                                   |
| 3  | A. Yes.  |
| 4  | Q. Was Dr. Papin's contract and the                |
| 5  | language within his contract considered prior to   |
| 6  | terminating his employment?                        |
| 7  | A. I would have to see the contract but I'm        |
| 8  | not sure.  |
| 9  | Q. Did you review his contract prior to            |
| 10 | A. Have I seen it? Yes.                            |
| 11 | Q. And you don't recall whether it was part        |
| 12 | of your decision to recommend his termination or   |
| 13 | not?   |
| 14 | A. I do know it was not a part of the              |
| 15 | decision.  |
| 16 | Q. Okay. Would you characterize the                |
| 17 | process involved in terminating Dr. Papin as being |
| 18 | fair based on your personal knowledge and          |
| 19 | involvement in the process?                        |
| 20 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                 |
| 21 | THE WITNESS: The process was followed              |
| 22 | appropriately based on what the practices and      |
| 23 | the policies were at UMMC.                         |
| 24 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) So you would                   |
| 25 | characterize the process as used in terminating    |
|    |  |

| 1  | Dr. Papin's employment at UMMC as complying with all |
|----|--|
| 2  | applicable policies and procedures at UMMC?          |
| 3  | A. Yes.  |
| 4  | Q. And those policies and procedures would           |
| 5  | be the faculty staff handbook and that's it?         |
| 6  | A. They are outlined in the faculty staff            |
| 7  | handbook, yes.                                       |
| 8  | Q. Do you have the ability to evaluate the           |
| 9  | performance of medical residents?                    |
| 10 | A. No.   |
| 11 | Q. What investigation did HR undertake               |
| 12 | during the termination process for Dr. Papin?        |
| 13 | A. There was a review of the information,            |
| 14 | the documentation that was provided from the         |
| 15 | department, and there was an interview with          |
| 16 | Dr. Papin.   |
| 17 | Q. Other than yourself who was else was              |
| 18 | involved in the investigation of Dr. Papin's         |
| 19 | termination?   |
| 20 | A. There was a second person now deceased            |
| 21 | who was in the interview when Dr. Papin was          |
| 22 | recorded.  |
| 23 | Q. Were there any other members of HR who            |
| 24 | were involved in the process of terminating          |
| 25 | Dr. Papin?   |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 30 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.       |
|----|--|
| 2  | THE WITNESS: The person that I just              |
| 3  | referred to sat in on the interview. The         |
| 4  | determination for the termination was made by    |
| 5  | the department of human resources employee       |
| 6  | relations.                                       |
| 7  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) And that's your              |
| 8  | department though, correct?                      |
| 9  | A. My the overall umbrella is HR, but            |
| 10 | employee relations is a different division.      |
| 11 | Q. That would be oh, that's Molly                |
| 12 | Brasfield?                                       |
| 13 | A. That would be Cecilia Bass.                   |
| 14 | Q. Oh, Cecilia Bass, okay, thank you.            |
| 15 | A. Yes.  |
| 16 | Q. Do you or anyone else conduct in person       |
| 17 | interviews of anyone who made allegations of any |
| 18 | type of misconduct or malfeasance against        |
| 19 | Dr. Papin?                                       |
| 20 | A. I did not. I don't know if anyone else        |
| 21 | did.   |
| 22 | Q. Do you have any idea why that was not         |
| 23 | done?  |
| 24 | A. The information that was provided with        |
| 25 | the department was quite conclusive and in       |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 31<br>Dr. Papin's interview with me he did not deny that |
|----|---|
| 2  | those things had occurred.                                    |
| 3  | Q. Okay. So in your opinion because                           |
| 4  | Dr. Papin had not denied things denied the                    |
| 5  | thing that occurred there was not enough reason               |
| 6  | for you to go out and speak to the people who were            |
| 7  | making allegations against Dr. Papin?                         |
| 8  | A. There was excessive documentation.                         |
| 9  | There was incidents of feedback provided to                   |
| 10 | Dr. Papin. There was a document that Dr. Papin                |
| 11 | signed acknowledging what was listed in the                   |
| 12 | document that he received, and it felt that it was            |
| 13 | conclusive enough to support what the department              |
| 14 | was requesting based on the documentation they                |
| 15 | provided.   |
| 16 | Q. And the document you're talking about                      |
| 17 | that Dr. Papin signed, that would have been the               |
| 18 | remediation plan that Dr. Earl gave to him?                   |
| 19 | A. I'm not sure if that's what it was                         |
| 20 | called but it was a document presented by                     |
| 21 | Dr. Earl.   |
| 22 | Q. Okay. Well, I guess we'll go through                       |
| 23 | that later. Okay. I'm going to show you an                    |
| 24 | exhibit now.  |
| 25 | MR. WHITFIELD: You doing the download                         |
|    |   |

| 1  | Page 32 or you doing the share screen.             |
|----|--|
| 2  | MR. SCHMITZ: I do the share deal.                  |
| 3  | MR. WHITFIELD: Okay.                               |
| 4  | (A brief recess was taken.)                        |
| 5  | (Exhibit 1 marked for identification.)             |
| 6  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Just let me know               |
| 7  | whenever you're done reviewing.                    |
| 8  | A. I see the document.                             |
| 9  | MR. WHITFIELD: There's multiple                    |
| 10 | which page do you want her to look at or all       |
| 11 | of it?   |
| 12 | MR. SCHMITZ: Just, you know, if you                |
| 13 | want yeah, just look at all of them and            |
| 14 | then I'm going to I'll start from the top          |
| 15 | and well, no, I'm probably going to                |
| 16 | actually start from the bottom. I'm going to       |
| 17 | be all over the place on this one a little         |
| 18 | bit, so.   |
| 19 | A. Okay.   |
| 20 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Just take a minute to          |
| 21 | review it and then we'll talk.                     |
| 22 | A. I have reviewed.                                |
| 23 | Q. Okay. All right. I wanted to on the             |
| 24 | first page there's an e-mail from Pamela Greenwood |
| 25 | dated Wednesday, February 15 at 10:22 a.m. Do you  |
|    |  |

| 1  | see that?   |
|----|---|
| 2  | A. Yes.   |
| 3  | Q. And that e-mail was sent to you. And it        |
| 4  | starts, good morning, Pat, after reviewing        |
| 5  | documentation submitted additional information is |
| 6  | needed.   |
| 7  | She asked you several questions so I'm            |
| 8  | going to go through those questions. She asked,   |
| 9  | is there any supporting documentation of the      |
| 10 | feedback/coaching sessions that Dr. Earl          |
| 11 | referenced.                                       |
| 12 | Was there any additional supporting               |
| 13 | documentation regarding the feedback and coaching |
| 14 | sessions that Dr. Earl referenced or stated that  |
| 15 | he had done with Dr. Papin?                       |
| 16 | A. In some of the information that Dr. Earl       |
| 17 | provided it did indicate when he had spoken with  |
| 18 | Dr. Papin.  |
| 19 | Q. Okay. But was there any contemporaneous        |
| 20 | e-mails or feedback that were provided to         |
| 21 | Dr. Papin in writing from Dr. Earl that you can   |
| 22 | recall other than his evaluations?                |
| 23 | A. There were e-mails that referenced he          |
| 24 | had spoken with Dr. Papin.                        |
| 25 | Q. Okay. Do you recall seeing anything            |
|    |   |

Page 34 1 that Dr. Earl had sent to Dr. Papin prior to 2 January 10, 2017? 3 Α. I do not. 4 Q. It states -- the next question is, is 5 there a complete signed academic remediation 6 protocol checklist showing all tasks have been 7 completed. 8 We discussed -- we had a meeting with Α. 9 Ms. Greenwood and Ms. Bass where it was determined 10 that many of the questions that she was asking 11 were more related to the academic environment 12 rather than the HR environment, and so it would 13 not have been relevant to the specific investigation and recommendation for termination 14 15 based on the employee status. 16 0. When you say based on the employee 17 status, what does that mean? 18 Because the termination was being Α. 19 requested of Dr. Papin's employment, many of the 20 questions that Ms. Greenwood was asking would have 21 been more relevant to his status as a house 22 officer in a training program. 23 Yes, but isn't -- his employment had Q. already been decided that he was not going to be 24 25 part of the academic program; is that correct?

| 1  | Page 35 A. I don't know if it had been formally    |
|----|--|
| 2  | initiated.   |
| 3  | Q. Well, the reason why you had sent all           |
| 4  | this stuff there was a request for termination,    |
| 5  | the subject line of the e-mail, that request for   |
| 6  | termination came from Dr. Barr and Dr. Earl, isn't |
| 7  | that correct?                                      |
| 8  | A. It is. At UMMC there are two distinct           |
| 9  | tracks, the academic component and then the        |
| 10 | employee component. The questions that             |
| 11 | Ms. Greenwood raised would have been more relevant |
| 12 | to the academic component rather than the employee |
| 13 | component to which the recommendation for          |
| 14 | termination was made.                              |
| 15 | Q. Doesn't that distinction I get that             |
| 16 | there is a formal distinction but, again, as we    |
| 17 | discussed before, if the academic program decides  |
| 18 | to terminate a resident or wants to terminate a    |
| 19 | resident, there's nothing HR can do to keep that   |
| 20 | person still in the program, correct?              |
| 21 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                 |
| 22 | THE WITNESS: They're just two separate             |
| 23 | distinct tracks and they are operated              |
| 24 | separately from each other.                        |
| 25 | If the program director decides that the           |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 36 house officer is not meeting the           |
|----|--|
| 2  | expectations, they do not have to confer with      |
| 3  | HR in order to remove that person from the         |
| 4  | program. And the questions that                    |
| 5  | Ms. Greenfield raised were all more in line        |
| 6  | with the academic component of Dr. Papin's         |
| 7  | status than they were of the employee              |
| 8  | component of his status and the employee           |
| 9  | component of his status was the basis for the      |
| 10 | request for termination.                           |
| 11 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) In this case here, the         |
| 12 | first thing that came in how you how HR became     |
| 13 | involved was there was a request from the academic |
| 14 | program to terminate Dr. Papin's employment,       |
| 15 | correct?   |
| 16 | A. Yes.  |
| 17 | Q. So if there is a request from the               |
| 18 | academic program to terminate a resident shouldn't |
| 19 | the steps for terminating someone from an academic |
| 20 | program be followed as well as the steps for       |
| 21 | terminating someone from an HR perspective also be |
| 22 | followed?  |
| 23 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                 |
| 24 | You're mixing terms up.                            |
| 25 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You can answer if you          |
|    |  |

Page 37 1 can. 2 Α. When a house officer is in a training 3 program there are specific processes that the graduate medical education office observes that I 4 5 don't have involvement in. My only involvement 6 occurs when there is a request to HR based on the 7 employee status, and that is what was followed in 8 this case. Anything that was done from the 9 graduate medical education office would have 10 existed separate from anything that HR did. 11 Q. Has there ever been a case in your seven 12 years with UMMC where a -- someone in a residency 13 program where the residency program requested a 14 resident be terminated and HR did not ratify that 15 decision? 16 Α. I am not aware. 17 Q. Has there been any cases you've been 18 involved with where a residency program has 19 requested that you look into a situation, we would 20 like to terminate X resident and where you 21 overruled the program and said that that resident 22 should not be terminated? 23 Α. No. 24 Q. The next bullet point states here, how 25 were the performance issues/concerns that are

Page 38 1 noted on the analysis trainee comments document 2 addressed? Is there any supporting documentation? 3 Was there any supporting documentation for any of 4 these things? 5 Α. I don't know. And, again, that would 6 have been part of the academic component. HR 7 would not have any had any involvement in that. 8 Right above this in your e-mail that you 9 responded back to this on February 15, 2017, at 10 10:52 a.m., you stated to Molly Brasfield in 11 employee relations that, I felt this would be an issue and I feel certain that the answer will be 12 13 no to all of these except the last two since he 14 has been off campus since 1/10. Why would you 15 feel that this would be an issue if this is not 16 something that HR deals with or this isn't a 17 problem? 18 Α. The graduate medical education office 19 operates in totality apart from HR. There are 20 times when the actions taken by the graduate 21 medical education office may tend to blur as to 22 whether or not it is academic or HR related. 23 that was the nature of my comments. 24 Q. So in this situation you believe that 25 the involvement was blurred between the two

Page 39

Pat Whitlock December 02, 2020

> 1 tracks, right, between the HR track and the 2 graduate medical education track, they were sort 3 of blurring together so you were concerned about 4 that? 5 Α. There's often a spill over because as 6 you have alluded, the person can not be an 7 employee without being in the program. 8 sometimes it is difficult to determine if it is 9 totally academic or if it is totally employee, and 10 so sometimes there is a blurring of where one 11 stops and where the other one starts. 12 0. Okay. And in this case you believe 13 there was some blurring going on and that is why 14 you thought that there would be issues with this? 15 Α. I thought that there could be some 16 blurring but I also felt that based on the 17 documentation provided there was enough concrete 18 evidence to support the department's request for 19 termination. 20 Q. Sure. Going down back to what we were 21 looking at before, the bullet points that 22 Ms. Greenwood sent to you states the next one, how 23 is the disruptive incident addressed that occurred 24 between Dr. Papin and Joshua? And that would have 25 been Joshua Stavins. Did you conduct any

| 1  | Page 40  |
|----|--|
|    | investigation into the incident between Dr. Papin  |
| 2  | and I believe it was a nurse practitioner Josh     |
| 3  | Stavins?   |
| 4  | A. I did not.                                      |
| 5  | Q. At UMMC when there is a complaint or the        |
| 6  | HR becomes aware that two employees potentially    |
| 7  | got into a violent encounter or physical           |
| 8  | encounter, isn't that something that HR usually    |
| 9  | looks into?  |
| 10 | A. If it is brought to HR's attention              |
| 11 | either at the time it occurs or shortly after it   |
| 12 | has occurred. There are many incidents that the    |
| 13 | departments handle without HR involvement and this |
| 14 | was one of those.                                  |
| 15 | Q. So after becoming aware of this you did         |
| 16 | not deem it necessary as part of your              |
| 17 | investigation function in human resources to look  |
| 18 | into or at least go out and speak to Mr. Stavins   |
| 19 | to see what the situation was with Dr. Papin and   |
| 20 | him?   |
| 21 | A. I felt that the documentation provided          |
| 22 | by the department was complete enough to support   |
| 23 | their recommendation.                              |
| 24 | Q. Next question states, can you provide a         |
| 25 | copy of the expectations that were communicated by |
|    | <u>-</u>   |

Page 41 1 Dr. Mahoney, I'm assuming to Dr. Papin. Did you 2 ever see a copy of the expectations that 3 Dr. Mahoney stated that she had given to 4 Dr. Papin? 5 Α. Again, that would have been a part of 6 the academic component. I did not. 7 So whether -- if someone is giving 8 somebody behavioral expectations, workplace 9 expectation as the senior chief resident, that would have no factor whatsoever in whether HR was 10 11 going to terminate a resident's employment? 12 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form. 13 THE WITNESS: The decision to terminate 14 would have been based on the belief that 15 there was enough documentation presented by 16 the department to support their request. 17 0. (By Mr. Schmitz) Did the department 18 provide you documentation from Dr. Mahoney stating 19 that the expectations which she stated that she had 20 given to Dr. Papin? 21 I would have to go back and review. 22 Currently I do not recall. 23 Okay. It states, the next one, since Q. 2/6 follow-up on ICare report has this been 24 25 completed? If so, provide a copy of the ICare

Page 42 1 report. What are ICare reports? 2 Α. I don't recall what the acronym is for 3 but the report allows employees, faculty members 4 to provide anonymous reporting of any situations 5 that they felt would be potentially endangering to 6 a patient. That was the way it was previously 7 done when I first started at UMMC, and at some 8 point it also now has become where if an employee 9 feels that the behavior or performance of a 10 co-worker in terms of interaction is 11 inappropriate, it can also be reported through the 12 ICare report. It is typically used only on our 13 clinical side of the enterprise. And that's typically just to report if 14 15 there was a problem with patient care or an 16 irregularity of some sort that the hospital should look into and investigate for the sake of patient 17 18 care? 19 I've also seen ICare reports where one 20 employee has reported a co-worker because they did 21 not appreciate the way they were spoken to 22 regarding some kind of performance that they were 23 doing, not necessarily any more just pertaining to 24 potentially derelict patient care. 25 In this case it was about the ICare Q.

| 1  | Page 43 report that she was talking about was regarding |
|----|---|
| 2  | patient care though, correct, than it was               |
| 3  | A. Yes.   |
| 4  | Q. Okay. And do you know if an ICare                    |
| 5  | report was ever done regarding the derelict             |
| 6  | patient care that Dr. Papin was accused of?             |
| 7  | A. There was not.                                       |
| 8  | Q. Why is that?   |
| 9  | A. I don't know.  |
| 10 | Q. You requested that an ICare even                     |
| 11 | after the fact, well after the fact, you had            |
| 12 | requested but nobody ever went ahead and filled         |
| 13 | that out; is that correct?                              |
| 14 | A. I asked if one had been submitted.                   |
| 15 | Q. Okay. And when you asked whether one                 |
| 16 | had been submitted, who did you ask for that?           |
| 17 | A. I don't recall. I think it was Renee                 |
| 18 | Greene who was the senior education administrator.      |
| 19 | Q. And in your request to ask for that                  |
| 20 | well, tell me about this actually. When an ICare        |
| 21 | report is done and it's regarding patient care,         |
| 22 | whether somebody was negligent or derelict as you       |
| 23 | stated, in patient care somehow, what typically         |
| 24 | follows in the wake of an ICare report derelict         |
| 25 | patient care? Is there an investigation done            |
| 1  |   |

Page 44 1 regarding into that incident? 2 There is a clinical committee that reviews those ICare reports and determines what 3 4 kind of resolution should be recommended. It is 5 not something that HR is involved in. 6 Q. Okav. And so because there was no ICare 7 report done here there would have been no 8 committee to review -- no clinical committee to 9 review Dr. Papin's alleged actions or negligence 10 as he was accused, correct? 11 Α. There would not be a clinical committee 12 as a result of the ICare report, but there would 13 be a review within the department for the -- under 14 Dr. Earl's purview to review it. 15 Q. Okay. So because there was no ICare 16 report done there was no prompt for Dr. Earl to 17 conduct a more thorough investigation into the 18 allegations that Dr. Papin had allegedly missed an 19 ulcer on the back of one of the patients he was 20 seeing? 21 I can't attest to that. Α. 22 The last one is, what progress was made 23 or not made by Dr. Papin since receiving the remediation plan on 1/10/17 and being placed on 24 25 administrative leave. Was there any other

| 1  | incidents involving Dr. Papin since 1/10/17? Are   |
|----|--|
| 2  | you aware of any progress that was made or not     |
| 3  | made by Dr. Papin since 1/10 after he was placed   |
| 4  | on administrative leave?                           |
| 5  | A. He was not on campus following that date        |
| 6  | so I am not aware of anything else that may have   |
| 7  | been done.   |
| 8  | Q. Is it typical for residents to get              |
| 9  | placed on remediation plans if they're             |
| 10 | A. I'm not   |
| 11 | Q issues?  |
| 12 | A. I'm not aware.                                  |
| 13 | Q. Have you seen that in other cases               |
| 14 | involving resident discipline that you've been     |
| 15 | involved in?                                       |
| 16 | A. No, not that I have been involved in.           |
| 17 | But, again, please remember that the graduate      |
| 18 | medical education office and those specific        |
| 19 | departments operate totally within their own realm |
| 20 | in terms of the house officers.                    |
| 21 | Q. Okay. So when you say they operate              |
| 22 | completely and totally in their own realm with     |
| 23 | respect to house officers, so, again, these things |
| 24 | that Pamela Greenwood is bringing up to you that   |
| 25 | you're saying aren't important from an HR          |

Page 46 1 perspective, why are they not important? Isn't 2 she just checking up here to see whether the graduate medical department who are operating in 3 their own realm is doing the things that they're 4 5 supposed to do in a termination situation of a 6 resident? 7 Α. I would not say that they are not 8 There are two totally different 9 responsibilities that the graduate medical 10 education office has based on the ACGME standards 11 and there's a totally different responsibility 12 that HR serves at UMMC. And, again, everything 13 that Ms. Greenwood was asking was more -- would be 14 more in line with the purview of the graduate 15 medical education office from a teaching 16 standpoint rather than the role of HR in terms of 17 the employee performance. 18 Q. And you just mentioned the ACGME 19 standards that govern the graduate medical 20 education program, so these would be certain 21 things that would potentially be implicated, the 22 things that they're talking about here that the 23 graduate medical education program would want to be doing if they wanted to be in compliance with 24 25 ACGME standards?

| 1  | A. I can  |
|----|---|
| 2  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form. You              |
| 3  | can answer to the best of your knowledge.           |
| 4  | She's not a 30(b)(6) on the ACGME standards.        |
| 5  | THE WITNESS: Right. I can not address               |
| 6  | those specifics. I can only tell you that           |
| 7  | there are two separate tracks for house             |
| 8  | officers and the graduate medical education         |
| 9  | office operates as that guardian for those.         |
| 10 | And I do not have familiarity with that as          |
| 11 | all of that is managed by a separate office.        |
| 12 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You stated earlier that         |
| 13 | these two areas and tracks, they tend to blur       |
| 14 | sometimes, so wouldn't it be incumbent and wise to  |
| 15 | have some knowledge of the two different tracks so  |
| 16 | that when you're making decisions in HR that you're |
| 17 | also aware of the potential ACGME implications and  |
| 18 | graduate medical education implications of those    |
| 19 | decisions?  |
| 20 | A. Any time there is a need to have that            |
| 21 | information there is conferencing with those        |
| 22 | people who are considered the subject matter        |
| 23 | experts.  |
| 24 | Q. Okay. I'm going to on this page, on              |
| 25 | this exhibit here, if we scroll down to below       |
|    |   |

Page 48 1 Ms. Greenwood's e-mail to you with the bullet 2 points we have an e-mail which you drafted and you 3 said to Cecilia Bass. It starts, good afternoon, 4 feedback sessions have been held. Do you see 5 where I'm talking about? 6 A. Yes. 7 That e-mail is dated February 6, 2017, 8 sent by you at 5:45 p.m.? 9 Α. Yes. 10 0. So this was on February 6 and you wrote, 11 feedback sessions have been held with this 12 employee but his performance continues to be less 13 than satisfactory. How was Dr. Papin's 14 performance continuing to be less than 15 satisfactory since he was no longer on campus at 16 this point and had not been on campus for almost a 17 month at that point? 18 Α. The process for providing a summary to 19 the office of employee relations includes a 20 synopsis of everything that has been used to make 21 the determination. And it always begins with a 22 summary statement and that statement would have 23 been based on a review of all of the 24 documentation. As you can see the first date 25 would be 7/29/16, so that summary statement would

Page 49 be to encompass everything that has occurred over 1 2 the course of whatever caused the concerns of that 3 employee. 4 Q. You go on to say that some of his 5 actions are potentially a threat to patient safety 6 and the director of his program feels that the 7 liability is to great to continue -- to have him 8 What actions were potentially a threat 9 to patient safety in your opinion? 10 Α. There were several instances that the 11 documentation received from the department 12 included such as not conducting a review of a patient to determine whether or not there were 13 14 wounds, for instance. That was one of the things 15 that was included in the documentation received. 16 Anything else, or just that one Q. 17 incident? Was that the only incident you were 18 considering at that time? 19 There was another incident where Α. 20 Dr. Papin was paged toward the end of his shift, 21 there was a code given on one of his patients that 22 he did not answer. There were other incidents 23 where Dr. Papin could not be found on the premises during the day when he should have been on his 24 25 shift.

| 1  | Q. Okay. Okay. We'll go through those.             |
|----|--|
| 2  | MR. WHITFIELD: Greg, if you're at a                |
| 3  | quick stopping point, we've been going a           |
| 4  | little over an hour, can we take about five?       |
| 5  | MR. SCHMITZ: Of course.                            |
| 6  | MR. WHITFIELD: Or, you know, if you're             |
| 7  | not at a stopping point I can wait a few more      |
| 8  | minutes, but just                                  |
| 9  | MR. SCHMITZ: Hold on, let me yes,                  |
| 10 | that's fine. We can take a stop.                   |
| 11 | MR. WHITFIELD: All right.                          |
| 12 | (A brief recess was taken.)                        |
| 13 | EXAMINATION BY MR. SCHMITZ:                        |
| 14 | Q. All right, Ms. Whitlock, so going back          |
| 15 | to what we were looking at prior to the break, I'm |
| 16 | looking at the e-mail that you had sent out on     |
| 17 | February 6, 2017 at 5:45 to Cecilia Bass among     |
| 18 | others within HR and employee relations            |
| 19 | department. So you have here under where it says,  |
| 20 | Facts, Dr. Truman Earl, Director of School of      |
| 21 | Medicine, referred Dr. Papin to employee health to |
| 22 | check for the presence of illegal substances and   |
| 23 | those tests were negative. Is that just a normal   |
| 24 | standard procedure that in these types of          |
| 25 | discipline type cases that the residents are       |
|    |  |

> Page 51 1 referred to go take a drug test? 2 It is not. I would presume that there 3 was some behavior that Dr. Earl deemed 4 questionable. We do not have a standard random 5 drug policy but supervisors may refer an employee 6 if the behavior is such that they fill that there 7 is some outside substance causing a change in the 8 behavior. 9 Do you have any documentation or 10 anything with respect to that or that was just 11 only handled by Dr. Earl in the --12 Α. It was only handled within the 13 department. HR was not involved. 14 Then it goes on to say -- you then 15 state, he then placed Dr. Papin on administrative 16 leave and then consulted with human resources regarding the next steps. Dr. Earl was concerned 17 18 as Dr. Papin's was not up to the standards of a 19 surgical resident. He was not truthful in 20 response to his inquiries and his negligence was 21 liable to result in patient safety issues leaving 22 Dr. Earl to conclude that the only remedy was 23 separation. 24 So Dr. Earl had concluded that the only 25 remedy was separation and then he consulted with

Page 52 1 you guys for what? For what purposes -- if he had 2 already concluded that the only remedy was 3 separation, for what purpose would HR need to get 4 involved? 5 At UMMC any time a department recommends Α. 6 termination of an employee it has to be approved 7 through the office of employee relations and that information first comes to the HR business partner 8 9 who has a responsibility of summarizing the situation and sending it on to employee relations. 10 11 Q. And would the human resources department 12 also have the responsibility to investigate the claims being made by the department to 13 14 substantiate the veracity of those claims? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Here you've got the first date in your Q. 17 timeline of events for Dr. Papin, you've got on 18 7/29/2016, Dr. Papin was in the cardiovascular 19 rotation and was the first house officer to work 20 in the cardiovascular intensive care unit. 21 not accustomed to the way nurse practitioners are 22 utilized at UMMC being able to run the day to day 23 operations of the cardiovascular intensive care 24 unit and his reactions and responses to them were 25 less than professional. When NPs would ask to

Page 53 1 perform routine tasks or wish to teach him 2 something, he would arrogantly respond with such 3 statements -- by stating such as "you are not my boss" or "I am a surgeon." He would not check 4 5 with them -- check in with them and he would not 6 be seen until it was time for evening rounds. 7 Did you ever -- the nurse practitioners 8 that reference in this statement, did you ever 9 interview any of these nurse practitioners to 10 confirm that Dr. Papin had made these statements 11 such as "you are not my boss" or "I am a surgeon"? 12 Α. I did not. 13 0. You also state he would not check in 14 with them and would not be seen until it's time 15 for evening rounds. Did you ever interview or 16 investigate anyone who stated that Dr. Papin did not check in with them or that he had not seen 17 18 them until -- they would not see him until evening 19 rounds? 20 Α. I did not. 21 Q. The next sentence states, Dr. Ines 22 Berger, Professor-Anesthesiology, discovered that 23 Dr. Papin had not been given the cardiovascular 24 intensive care policy at the beginning of the rotation, was only given one after he carried 25

Page 54 1 coffee into a patient's room which was against 2 policy and was confronted by an NP which almost --3 which escalated into a heated exchange. Did vou 4 ever talk to Dr. Ines Berger regarding Dr. Papin's behavior at cardiovascular intensive care unit? 5 6 Α. I did not. 7 Did you ever talk to the nurse 0. practitioner that he almost got into a heated 8 9 exchange -- that he got into a heated exchange 10 with? 11 Α. No. 12 Q. When you say heated exchange, that exchange based on your knowledge, it was an almost 13 14 violent exchange, correct? 15 I can not attest to that, I was just 16 told that it was heated. 17 In incidents where there are heated 0. 18 exchanges amongst employees isn't it incumbent 19 upon HR to conduct at least an interview or an 20 investigation into that or do --21 It depends on the situation and whether 22 or not the department has taken steps to handle 23 it. 24 Which steps did the department take to Q. 25 handle the situation?

| 1  | Page 55 A. It was my understanding that both of    |
|----|--|
| 2  | those people were spoken with. And, again, we're   |
| 3  | talking about something that I received in January |
| 4  | of 2017 that had occurred six months prior.        |
| 5  | Q. Wouldn't an incident regardless of              |
| 6  | whether it occurred six months ago or a year ago   |
| 7  | of workplace bullying or harassment, especially of |
| 8  | the type that could potentially involve a physical |
| 9  | altercation be something that HR should always     |
| 10 | want to look into?                                 |
| 11 | A. If the department has not handled it,           |
| 12 | yes.   |
| 13 | Q. Well, you did see it necessary to talk          |
| 14 | with Dr when you interviewed Dr. Papin on          |
| 15 | January 27, you did bring up this incident with    |
| 16 | Dr. Papin, correct?                                |
| 17 | A. I brought everything with him that had          |
| 18 | been reported.                                     |
| 19 | Q. Right. But you didn't bring the                 |
| 20 | incident up with the other nurse practitioner who  |
| 21 | was also involved in the altercation?              |
| 22 | A. I did not.                                      |
| 23 | Q. So you then go on to state that                 |
| 24 | Dr. Berger then e-mailed Dr. Earl and Dr. Shake    |
| 25 | and she indicated that Dr. Papin had issues with   |
|    |  |

Page 56 1 all four cardiovascular nurse practitioners as 2 well as the pharmacist. Did you ever go speak 3 with any of the cardiovascular nurse 4 practitioners -- the four cardiovascular nurse 5 practitioners or the pharmacist who had alleged 6 nondescript issues with Dr. Papin? 7 Α. No. 8 0. Are you aware if Dr. Papin was ever told 9 the identity and issues that these four 10 cardiovascular nurse practitioners and pharmacists 11 had with him? 12 Α. I don't know. 13 Q. Yeah, and she assessed that he was 14 bright and motivated with a lot of potential but 15 needed help to mentor him to navigate the system 16 and get off to a good start. Isn't that -- in 17 terms of residents at UMMC, residency program, 18 that's a training program, correct, for doctors? 19 Α. Yes. 20 Q. So that they can advance into a full fledged practice, medical practice, correct? 21 22 Α. Yes. 23 Q. And this was -- Dr. Papin had only been a resident, this was his first year of residency 24 25 at UMMC, correct?

Page 57 1 Α. Yes. 2 0. So in essence he was a first year intern 3 at UMC; is that correct? 4 Α. Yes. 5 0. Are the expectations on first year 6 intern residents at UMMC different from the 7 expectations from somebody who might be a fourth 8 or fifth year resident at UMMC? 9 I'm not familiar with their specific 10 expectations. 11 Q. Are you aware whether a first year 12 resident would have less expectations and 13 responsibilities than a fourth or fifth year 14 resident? 15 I would presume they would have 16 expectations of their specific program, but I am 17 not familiar with that program. 18 Q. Okay. Then you have in your timeline 19 8/31/16 to 12/15/16. That's a span of almost four 20 months there. And you state that all house 21 officers receive evaluations for various rotations 22 for which they are assigned. Although some 23 statements were complimentary, many of Dr. Papin's 24 were quite concerning. There was a consensus that he was intelligent and desirous to become an 25

| 1  | excellent surgeon; however, he was absent for some |
|----|--|
| 2  | activities, did not seem prepared for others, and  |
| 3  | resorted to the blame game when confronted with    |
| 4  | his shortcomings. Just going just these            |
| 5  | allegations that you have here, he was absent for  |
| 6  | some activities, did you ever do you recall        |
| 7  | what specific activities he was absent from that   |
| 8  | you uncovered during your investigation?           |
| 9  | A. I do not. I would have to go back and           |
| 10 | review the information that Dr. Earl had provided. |
| 11 | Q. You also stated that he did not seem            |
| 12 | prepared for others. Do you recall the incidence   |
| 13 | where he was not prepared for any activities that  |
| 14 | he was doing as a first year resident at UMMC?     |
| 15 | A. I do not.                                       |
| 16 | Q. Do you recall where he resorted to the          |
| 17 | blame game when confronted with his shortcomings?  |
| 18 | A. Again, I would have to go back and              |
| 19 | review the information that was presented.         |
| 20 | Q. At UMMC are there policies and                  |
| 21 | procedures from an HR perspective that state that  |
| 22 | all incidents of well, actually let me are         |
| 23 | the HR is there an HR policy or procedure or       |
| 24 | perhaps a zero tolerance policy for violence at    |
| 25 | UMC?   |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 59 A. I would have to review that specifically |
|----|---|
| 2  | to determine that. I'm not currently familiar.      |
| 3  | Q. If two employees get into a fight at             |
| 4  | UMMC and there's a physical altercation, whether    |
| 5  | that be pushing, hitting, kicking, anything like    |
| 6  | that, is it your experience that those employees    |
| 7  | are both terminated?                                |
| 8  | A. I actually have not had an experience of         |
| 9  | that nature.  |
| 10 | Q. Okay. And you're not aware whether UMMC          |
| 11 | has a zero tolerance policy for violence?           |
| 12 | A. Again, I would have to review that to            |
| 13 | see how it is specifically stated.                  |
| 14 | Q. Where would that be found?                       |
| 15 | A. It would be found in the faculty staff           |
| 16 | handbook.   |
| 17 | Q. Okay. Then you have here on between              |
| 18 | this 8/31 and 12/15 here, other than the            |
| 19 | evaluations that Dr. Papin would have received in   |
| 20 | the regular course you did not document that        |
| 21 | anybody else had spoken to or had a how you put     |
| 22 | it earlier, an informal verbal warning or written   |
| 23 | verbal warnings or final written warnings at any    |
| 24 | point in time during that process; is that          |
| 25 | correct?  |
|    |   |

| 1  | A. Are you saying given to Dr. Papin?              |
|----|--|
| 2  | Q. Yes.  |
| 3  | A. That's correct.                                 |
| 4  | Q. Then on 1/3/17 through 1/10/17 you              |
| 5  | state, Renee Green, Senior Education               |
| 6  | Administrator, compiled e-mails concerning         |
| 7  | Dr. Papin's performance. When you say she          |
| 8  | compiled e-mails, she was going around asking      |
| 9  | Dr. Papin's co-workers I'm assuming if they had    |
| 10 | any issues or experienced any issues with          |
| 11 | Dr. Papin?   |
| 12 | A. I can't attest to that. I don't know            |
| 13 | the nature of those e-mails being received.        |
| 14 | Q. Okay. But you summarized those e-mails          |
| 15 | that were received afterwards, correct, so you are |
| 16 | aware that she did compile e-mails from the other  |
| 17 | folks in the department, correct?                  |
| 18 | A. Yes, but I don't know the impetuous for         |
| 19 | that.  |
| 20 | Q. Okay. Renee Greene as the Senior                |
| 21 | Education Administrator for the general surgery    |
| 22 | department, she worked closely hand in hand with   |
| 23 | Dr. Earl?  |
| 24 | A. Yes.  |
| 25 | Q. Okay. And she's sort of Dr. Earl's              |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 61  |
|----|--|
|    | administrative assistant, is that                  |
| 2  | A. No.   |
| 3  | Q. No?   |
| 4  | A. Her role is to ensure that the house            |
| 5  | officers, residents, fellows are on track with all |
| 6  | of their requirements, and she would serve as      |
| 7  | their main point of contact if they had questions  |
| 8  | regarding any of their requirements.               |
| 9  | Q. Okay. The first person that you mention         |
| 10 | here is Dr. Colin Muncie. You state that           |
| 11 | Dr. Papin had she had been delegated the           |
| 12 | admittance of a trauma patient to the ICU. She     |
| 13 | instructed Dr. Papin to enter orders and           |
| 14 | communicate to the ICU. He was informed by         |
| 15 | Dr. Colin Muncie was informed by another resident  |
| 16 | that the ICU was never notified that the patient   |
| 17 | was coming.  |
| 18 | Did you ever do any investigation to               |
| 19 | with Dr. Muncie or speak with Dr. Muncie or        |
| 20 | anybody in the ICU to confirm that Dr. Papin       |
| 21 | dropped the ball in communicating with the ICU     |
| 22 | department regarding this patient?                 |
| 23 | A. I did not.                                      |
| 24 | Q. Are you aware of the identity of this           |
| 25 | patient?   |
|    |  |

Page 62 1 Α. No. 2 Did you receive any medical records to Q. 3 substantiate that this patient's admittance into the ICU department was delayed because of this 4 5 error? 6 Α. No. 7 Was there an ICare report filled out Q. regarding this incident involving this patient who 8 9 was not -- who was delayed being admitted into the 10 ICU? 11 Α. I don't know. 12 Stated, when he confronted Dr. Papin he **Q**. 13 confidently told him that he'd spoken to someone although he could not remember who it was. 14 Dr. Muncie followed up with the ICU nurse 15 practitioner who had spoken to everyone who had 16 17 been on duty and it was confirmed that Dr. Papin never -- it was confirmed that Dr. Papin never 18 spoke to anyone on the ICU team. Do you know who 19 the ICU nurse practitioner who Dr. Muncie 20 21 communicated with was? 22 Α. No. 23 Q. Did you verify any of these allegations 24 with that nurse practitioner? 25 Α. No.

| 1  | Q. Did you direct anybody to verify the            |
|----|--|
| 2  | allegations regarding this ICU nurse practitioner? |
| 3  | A. No.   |
| 4  | Q. Did you ever have anyone try to figure          |
| 5  | out who the identity of this person was?           |
| 6  | A. No.   |
| 7  | Q. So how can you state that it was                |
| 8  | confirmed that Dr. Papin never spoke to anyone on  |
| 9  | the ICU team with such confidence when you had     |
| 10 | conducted no investigation or interviews into any  |
| 11 | of these allegations whatsoever?                   |
| 12 | A. I had to take the word of Dr. Earl in           |
| 13 | his preparation for his recommendation. As the     |
| 14 | leader of that group it would have been his        |
| 15 | responsibility to insure that everything that was  |
| 16 | reported to him was accurate. And as he was        |
| 17 | providing us with the summary we decided to take   |
| 18 | his word that these things had actually occurred.  |
| 19 | Q. But this wasn't a summary from Dr. Earl,        |
| 20 | this was an actual e-mail that you had reviewed    |
| 21 | from Dr. Muncie, correct?                          |
| 22 | A. As a result of a compilation of those           |
| 23 | things through Dr. Earl, yes.                      |
| 24 | Q. Dr. Muncie is a research fellow, so             |
| 25 | Dr. Muncie he is also that's a resident as         |
|    |  |

| 1  | well, correct?  Page 64                            |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. Yes.  |
| 3  | Q. Okay. So there was a report from a              |
| 4  | resident regarding another resident and HR you     |
| 5  | and HR did not deem it necessary to verify         |
| 6  | independently verify the validity of any of this   |
| 7  | other resident's allegations regarding Dr. Papin?  |
| 8  | A. No.   |
| 9  | Q. In your opinion is it possible that             |
| 10 | this that Dr. Papin did in fact make this call     |
| 11 | down to the ICU and somebody else just maybe had   |
| 12 | dropped the ball and didn't enter it and were      |
| 13 | trying to cover for their own skin so that they    |
| 14 | didn't get in trouble?                             |
| 15 | A. It's possible, but it seems highly              |
| 16 | unlikely.  |
| 17 | Q. But we don't know one way or the other?         |
| 18 | A. Correct.  |
| 19 | Q. But yet you stated it was confirmed that        |
| 20 | he never spoke to anyone on the ICU team?          |
| 21 | A. It was perceived to be correct in               |
| 22 | Dr. Muncie's assertion that, yes, it was confirmed |
| 23 | that Dr. Papin had never spoken with anyone. The   |
| 24 | ICU team would not have been so large that if      |
| 25 | someone had spoken with Dr. Papin no one would     |

Page 65 1 have remembered it. 2 Well, you can't tell one way or the 3 other because you didn't actually conduct any 4 investigation into that? 5 Α. Correct. 6 0. Would there have been a way to 7 independently check the phones within the hospital 8 to see if Dr. Papin had called from a certain 9 place in the hospital to another place in the 10 hospital at a certain specified time? 11 Α. I don't know. 12 Ο. Did you ever try to find that out? 13 Α. I did not. So many times the house officers use their personal phones, and I'm not 14 15 sure how long records of calls are maintained. 16 0. Are those -- when a house officer like a 17 resident is on -- they're given a UMMC pager; is 18 that correct? 19 Α. I'm not aware of all those processes. 20 Q. But there are phones all Okay. 21 throughout the hospital, correct? 22 Α. Yes. 23 And many times if someone is calling 0. from, let's say, one department down to the ICU 24 25 they would typically use a hospital phone; isn't

Page 66 1 that correct? 2 Α. I don't know. 3 Q. Did you ever ask Dr. Papin whether he 4 used a hospital phone or not? 5 Α. I did not. 6 Ο. Okav. The next one is Dr. William 7 Crews, a PGY3 surgical resident, he was not a PGY3 8 surgical resident at that time, correct? 9 Dr. Crews? Α. 10 0. Yes. 11 Α. That's what was reported to me so I 12 don't know. 13 0. Okay. He said that while working with Dr. Papin he always seemed to show up just before 14 15 rounds without actually having seen any patients 16 but then he would lie to the residents about what 17 he had done. Was there any investigation by you 18 or interviews by you of Dr. Crews to verify or 19 test the validity of the fact that Dr. Papin was 20 not showing up or just showing up right before 21 rounds and not seeing his patients? 22 Α. No. 23 Q. Have you ever been involved in any kind 24 of -- for any employees, have you ever been 25 involved in any kind of investigation regarding an

Page 67 1 employee showing up late to work or excessive 2 tardiness where that employee had to be 3 disciplined as a result? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Q. And in -- during that, during those 6 investigations was there -- did the employees ever 7 deny that they were late or not was it -- or did they always admit that they were late? 8 9 Α. No, any time we've done investigations with employees regarding tardiness those have been 10 11 non-exempt employees who have to record all of their time through the Kronos Time System, so it 12 13 would be easy to determine when they actually 14 clocked in. 15 0. Okay. In this case the medical residents -- at the parking garage at UMMC when 16 17 they pull in, they pull into a parking garage and 18 they swipe their card; isn't that correct? 19 Α. Yes. 20 Q. So would it have been possible for you 21 in HR to pull the records for Dr. Papin's parking 22 card to see what time he was swiping in to park 23 his car in the morning? 24 Α. Yes. 25 But you didn't do that? Ο.

Page 68 1 No because you can swipe in the garage Α. 2 to park but that doesn't necessarily indicate when 3 you actually arrive where you're scheduled to be. 4 But -- yes, while that might be true, 0. 5 but wouldn't -- if he was arriving so late and 6 just right before rounds wouldn't you also have 7 been able to see that he was showing up and 8 swiping his card right before rounds and running 9 in, you know, and pretending like he had seen 10 patients when he had not? It would indicate what time he arrived 11 Α. 12 at the garage only. 13 Q. Okay. But you would have been able to see that if he was arriving in the garage right 14 15 before his rounds were starting with the attending 16 physicians, correct? 17 It would indicate what time he arrived Α. in the garage, correct. 18 19 Q. But that would -- if you would have done 20 that step that would have tended to indicate 21 that -- whether Dr. Papin was being truthful or 22 not about the time he was showing up to work, 23 correct? 24 Α. It would indicate what time he arrived 25 at the garage.

Page 69 1 Q. What about when Dr. Papin -- when 2 the residents, when they come in to relieve each 3 other, right, there's a sign in/sign out process where one resident comes in and says, hi, I'm here 4 5 to relieve you, you're on the -- one resident is 6 on the night shift and one is on the day shift and 7 they relieve each other? They typically meet in 8 the resident lounge; isn't that correct? 9 Α. I'm not aware of what the exact process 10 is. 11 Is there a swipe card to get into the Q. 12 resident lounge or is it just open to anybody? 13 Α. I don't know. 14 Are there any other points in time where Ο. 15 Dr. Papin would have to swipe his card to access 16 parts of the building into UMMC as he began his 17 day? 18 There are many places on campus that are Α. badge accessible only, but I'm not familiar with 19 all of the different places Dr. Papin would have 20 21 been required to go. 22 0. When a doctor comes into the hospital 23 and they start seeing patients, I'm assuming everything is done in patient charting, that's 24 25 done electronically on the computers and

| 1  | everything like that, correct?  Page 70            |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. It is.  |
| 3  | Q. And when somebody is doing their                |
| 4  | charting or making observations or ordering things |
| 5  | for patients, they have their own specific log in; |
| 6  | isn't that correct? Like Dr. Papin's log in at     |
| 7  | UMMC so that whatever actions he takes or          |
| 8  | recommended is then recorded electronically in     |
| 9  | that system?                                       |
| 10 | A. Yes.  |
| 11 | Q. And that symptom would also record the          |
| 12 | date and time whenever Dr. Papin would be doing    |
| 13 | work on an electronic basis within that system;    |
| 14 | isn't that correct?                                |
| 15 | A. Yes.  |
| 16 | Q. Did we ever check the charts of                 |
| 17 | Dr. Papin to see what time he started charting     |
| 18 | patients or seeing patients on any given day or    |
| 19 | looking at any samples of that to see whether he   |
| 20 | was showing up just before rounds as Dr. Crews     |
| 21 | indicated here?                                    |
| 22 | A. I did not.                                      |
| 23 | Q. Do you know if anybody else ever did?           |
| 24 | A. I do not.                                       |
| 25 | Q. The next thing Dr. Crews, I'm still             |
|    |  |

| 1  | here, it says, when caught doing something wrong  |
|----|---|
| 2  | he would blame a medical student for his own      |
| 3  | error. Do you recall what incident that was or    |
| 4  | what medical student he blamed for his own error? |
| 5  | A. I do not. I would have to go back and          |
| 6  | review all of the e-mails that this was compiled  |
| 7  | from.   |
| 8  | Q. The next paragraph is Dr. Mahoney              |
| 9  | e-mailed Dr. Earl and Ms. Greene regarding        |
| 10 | numerous specific concerns. One had to do with    |
| 11 | Dr. Papin having told Dr. Mahoney that upon his   |
| 12 | observation a patient did not have any skin       |
| 13 | changes. When the patient was seen by wound care  |
| 14 | they reported a severe ulcer that was so          |
| 15 | significant that surgery was required. This could |
| 16 | not have happened over the course of a few days   |
| 17 | and the resulting action could have been lessened |
| 18 | had Dr. Papin examined the patient and reported   |
| 19 | it.   |
| 20 | Are you aware that Dr. Papin had been             |
| 21 | observing and examining that patient for weeks    |
| 22 | prior to this wound becoming infected?            |
| 23 | A. I am not.                                      |
| 24 | Q. Are you aware that there was a wound           |
| 25 | care nurse also attending to this patient who had |
|    |   |

| _  |  |
|----|--|
| 1  | Page 72 been applying creams and other topical ointments |
| 2  | to that wound for weeks prior to the wound               |
| 3  | becoming infected?                                       |
| 4  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form,                       |
| 5  | misstating prior testimony.                              |
| 6  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You can answer.                      |
| 7  | A. I am not.   |
| 8  | Q. Did you review any of the medical                     |
| 9  | records with respect to this patient that was            |
| 10 | referenced by Dr. Mahoney?                               |
| 11 | A. I did not.  |
| 12 | Q. So then how could you say with such                   |
| 13 | certainty in your summary that this could not have       |
| 14 | happened over the course of a few days and the           |
| 15 | resulting action could have lessened could have          |
| 16 | been lessened had he examined the patient and            |
| 17 | reported it?   |
| 18 | -  |
| 19 | ye m, sare assessment provided note was                  |
| 20 | a summary of the e-mails that had been received          |
|    | through Dr. Earl.  |
| 21 | Q. And there was no ICare report done on                 |
| 22 | this incident regarding this patient with the            |
| 23 | ulcer that was so severe that surgery was                |
| 24 | required?  |
| 25 | A. I don't know.   |
| r  |  |

| 1  | Q. Is that normal where something that is            |
|----|--|
| 2  | allegedly so severe that a patient is required an    |
| 3  | unnecessary surgery and there's no ICare report      |
| 4  | filled out?  |
| 5  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form of                 |
| 6  | the question. You can answer.                        |
| 7  | THE WITNESS: ICare reports, again, are               |
| 8  | submitted anonymously, so it would just              |
| 9  | depend on whomever else was in contact with          |
| 10 | that provider who determined that an ICare           |
| 11 | report should have been submitted. ICare             |
| 12 | reports are not requirements.                        |
| 13 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Sure. But shouldn't              |
| 14 | have, like you said, an independent clinical         |
| 15 | committee have reviewed this to see where UMMC could |
| 16 | have done better with respect to the care of this    |
| 17 | patient?   |
| 18 | A. If someone had noted that there was a             |
| 19 | lack of appropriate attention given to the patient   |
| 20 | they could have reported that within the             |
| 21 | department and the department would have taken the   |
| 22 | necessary steps to review. ICare reports, again,     |
| 23 | are not the only way that attention is given to      |
| 24 | potentially dangerous situations.                    |
| 25 | Q. Let me ask you this, when a resident is           |
|    |  |

Page 74 1 seeing patients they typically do that under the 2 supervision of an attending physician, an actual 3 They're not allowed to just doctor, correct? 4 freely practice medicine because they're just interns, correct? 5 6 Α. Yes. 7 And so did you ever look or speak to the 0. 8 attending physician who was also overseeing this 9 patient along with Dr. Papin? 10 Α. I did not. 11 Did you confirm whether the wound care 12 nurse or that attending physician who are subject 13 matters experts in those activities had any different opinions other than what Dr. Papin had 14 15 with respect to the wound on this patient? 16 Α. I did not. 17 So the blame that you placed here on 18 Dr. Papin that the -- that the severity of this 19 wound could have been lessened had he examined the 20 patient and reported it, so that blame you place 21 on the first year resident and there was no 22 investigation or talks with the attending 23 physician, the wound care team, or any of the 24 other nurse practitioners who are actually 25 licensed to treat patients?

| 1  | Page 75 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.          |
|----|---|
| 2  | THE WITNESS: I did not confer with                  |
| 3  | anyone after reading the e-mails.                   |
| 4  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) So you just basically           |
| 5  | took for all of these people you took their         |
| 6  | allegations at face value without any investigation |
| 7  | or follow-up regarding any of these things?         |
| 8  | A. I believe that the leader of the program         |
| 9  | had done the due diligence to determine that these  |
| 10 | were accurate statements.                           |
| 11 | Q. But you don't know what he did in terms          |
| 12 | of due diligence one way or the other, correct?     |
| 13 | A. I do not.  |
| 14 | Q. In fact, before Ms. Greenwood had raised         |
| 15 | a bunch of concerns regarding the lack of           |
| 16 | documentation; isn't that correct, that which came  |
| 17 | from Dr. Earl? The concerns that we went through    |
| 18 | before, all those bullet points that we went        |
| 19 | just before the break?                              |
| 20 | A. Would you clarify your question?                 |
| 21 | Q. In the last if you scroll up here the            |
| 22 | e-mail from Pam Greenwood to you, good morning,     |
| 23 | Pat, after reviewing documents additional           |
| 24 | information is needed. She asked for all of this    |
| 25 | additional information and all of these things      |
|    |   |

Page 76 1 where she viewed things that Dr. Earl had done as 2 being deficient or not there as part of 3 Dr. Papin's file. All of these things, but yet 4 you just assumed that -- what basis do you have to 5 assume that Dr. Earl did do his due diligence after Ms. Greenwood had raised all these concerns 6 7 with you? 8 Again, those concerns that she raised 9 would have been more pertinent to the academic 10 component of his status rather than what we were 11 reviewing in terms of the recommendation for 12 termination. As Dr. Earl is the program director 13 he has the responsibility for insuring that the 14 house officers are meeting the expectations. 15 as the person who is trusted with that, it would 16 be my responsibility to believe that he is 17 appropriately conducting his requirements. 18 Q. Did you ever ask him if he was 19 appropriately conducting his requirements? 20 Α. I did have conversations with Dr. Earl where he reiterated all of the concerns that he 21 22 had but, no, I did not ask him if he were actually 23 appropriately doing his job. 24 0. Isn't that part of your job in HR to 25 make sure that other people are -- within UMMC are

Page 77 1 following the proper policies and procedures in 2 doing their jobs with respect to employee 3 discipline and terminations? 4 Α. It is not. 5 Q. So then what is the involvement of HR --6 what is the point of HR being involved if all 7 you're going to do is not investigate anything, 8 take what somebody else at face value with no 9 investigation and then just regurgitate the same thing? What is the role of HR, just to summarize 10 11 everything that --12 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form, you 13 can answer. 14 THE WITNESS: The role of HR is to act 15 as the conduit, the liaison, to determine 16 whether or not documentation that has 17 presented is sufficient enough to concur with 18 and then seek approval for the 19 recommendations that the department is 20 bringing forth. When I reviewed all of the 21 information that Dr. Earl had provided, it 22 did appear conclusive enough to support the 23 recommendation. I did review the evaluations 24 that had been given to Dr. Papin. 25 review the letter that Dr. Earl had given to

| 1  | Page 78<br>him where he signed an acknowledgement that |
|----|--|
| 2  | all of those things had occurred. So in my             |
| 3  | estimation that was sufficient enough to               |
| 4  | support the recommendation for the                     |
| 5  | termination.   |
| 6  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) In the context of a                |
| 7  | relationship between an attending physician and a      |
| 8  | medical resident in terms of patient care,             |
| 9  | ultimately the buck has to stop with the attending     |
| 10 | physician; isn't that correct?                         |
| 11 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                     |
| 12 | She's not a 30(b)(6) witness as to the                 |
| 13 | relationships between residents and                    |
| 14 | attendings.  |
| 15 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You can answer if you              |
| 16 | can.   |
| 17 | A. I don't know.                                       |
| 18 | Q. An attending physician is ultimately                |
| 19 | responsible for patient care; isn't that correct?      |
| 20 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                     |
| 21 | Once again she's not a 30(b)(6) on patient             |
| 22 | care.  |
| 23 | THE WITNESS: I would presume that every                |
| 24 | provider involved in patient care would be             |
| 25 | responsible.   |
|    |  |

|    | Barra 70   |
|----|--|
| 1  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) In the next part of this         |
| 2  | e-mail, the next one says, Ashley Griffin, RN, cited |
| 3  | several incidents of inappropriate behavior by       |
| 4  | Dr. Papin.   |
| 5  | Now, I'm going to put as Exhibit 2, we're            |
| 6  | going to kind of bounce back and forth between       |
| 7  | those, but I'm going to give you Exhibit 2 now,      |
| 8  | which is going to be what Ms. Griffin put in there.  |
| 9  | (Exhibit 2 marked for identification.)               |
| 10 | MR. SCHMITZ: It's going to say                       |
| 11 | Exhibit 3 but it's really 2. It's going to           |
| 12 | be confusing, sorry, I'm going out of order.         |
| 13 | MR. WHITFIELD: Got to do better, Greg,               |
| 14 | got to do better.                                    |
| 15 | MR. SCHMITZ: I can't relabel it now,                 |
| 16 | it's too late.                                       |
| 17 | COURT REPORTER: So how do you want to                |
| 18 | identify it on the record?                           |
| 19 | MR. SCHMITZ: It's Exhibit 2.                         |
| 20 | MR. WHITFIELD: Oh, this is a picture.                |
| 21 | MR. SCHMITZ: Now, we're going to be                  |
| 22 | messed up for the rest of the day. Sorry.            |
| 23 | MR. WHITFIELD: Can you read that?                    |
| 24 | THE WITNESS: Uh-huh (affirmative).                   |
| 25 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Let me know when you're          |
|    |  |

| 1  | ready?   |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. I've read it.                                   |
| 3  | Q. Okay. Was this the e-mail that you had          |
| 4  | reviewed from Ashley Griffin where you noted       |
| 5  | the cited seven incidents of inappropriate         |
| 6  | behavior by Dr. Papin?                             |
| 7  | A. Yes.  |
| 8  | Q. I want to there is one incident, the            |
| 9  | first one on the first bullet point in her e-mail  |
| 10 | states, left during a code while I was on night    |
| 11 | float. The code occurred approximately at 5:59     |
| 12 | p.m. Joe said he was at his car at 6:01 when he    |
| 13 | found out it was his patient in the garage and     |
| 14 | proceeded to leave. He did hear the code called    |
| 15 | overhead prior to 6:00 p.m.                        |
| 16 | Now, when a Code Blue is called out in a           |
| 17 | hospital do they state the patient's name and who  |
| 18 | it is or is it just Code Blue?                     |
| 19 | A. I'm not certain, but I think they only          |
| 20 | call out the specific code color and the location. |
| 21 | Q. Okay. And did you speak with Dr. Papin          |
| 22 | regarding this?                                    |
| 23 | A. I did.  |
| 24 | Q. And what was his response?                      |
| 25 | A. He indicated that he heard it but he did        |
|    |  |

Page 81 1 not stop to check. He never thought whether or 2 not it was his patient. He said that he had 3 signed out and so he was headed out of the 4 hospital for the day. 5 Q. Okay. And so once a resident signs out 6 it would be the other resident's responsibility at 7 that point to go attend to any patients that would 8 be needed in that area; is that correct? 9 I don't know what kind of information they have been provided. 10 11 Q. Okay. Did you ever conduct any 12 investigation or ever speak to Ms. Griffin 13 regarding this incident? 14 Α. I did not. 15 0. Another -- the next bullet point, he did 16 not show up on time to pre-round prior to the start of the shift -- the start of a shift during 17 18 the holidays or get sign out prior to completion 19 of trip. 20 Did you do any investigation regarding 21 this to verify the validity of what she's stating 22 here? 23 Α. I did not. 24 He did not go to traumas during the Q. 25 day -- during holidays.

| 1  | Page 82  Do you know which trauma she's speaking   |
|----|--|
| 2  | of?  |
| 3  | A. I do not.                                       |
| 4  | Q. Did you ever ask Dr. Earl which traumas         |
| 5  | she was speaking of?                               |
| 6  | A. I did not.                                      |
| 7  | Q. Next bullet point, he tried to send a           |
| 8  | patient home walking to the car whose car was      |
| 9  | across the street at the VA despite several nurses |
| 10 | telling him the patient was not competent.         |
| 11 | Did you ever try to determine who this             |
| 12 | patient was?                                       |
| 13 | A. No.   |
| 14 | Q. Did you ask Dr. Earl who this patient           |
| 15 | was?   |
| 16 | A. I did not.                                      |
| 17 | Q. Did you ever try to obtain this person's        |
| 18 | medical records?                                   |
| 19 | A. No.   |
| 20 | Q. He made the next bullet point, he               |
| 21 | made a female trauma student incredible            |
| 22 | uncomfortable and preferentially chooses and       |
| 23 | favors her over the male. He tries to be alone     |
| 24 | with the female student as well.                   |
| 25 | Now, again, earlier you testified that             |

| 1  | when someone makes an allegation of harassment at |
|----|---|
| 2  | UMMC that there's an investigation, correct?      |
| 3  | A. Yes.   |
| 4  | Q. Was there an investigation done here           |
| 5  | regarding this alleged harassment by Dr. Papin of |
| 6  | this unknown resident?                            |
| 7  | A. When it's a student I would need to know       |
| 8  | specifically because if the person is a student   |
| 9  | there would be a different office that would be   |
| 10 | involved in handling those situations but, no, I  |
| 11 | did not.  |
| 12 | Q. Did you over reach out to see if any           |
| 13 | other offices had tried to handle this situation  |
| 14 | or conducted an investigation?                    |
| 15 | A. I did not.                                     |
| 16 | Q. Are you aware that it is an offense for        |
| 17 | UMMC in harassment cases to conduct an            |
| 18 | investigation and then also take prompt remedial  |
| 19 | measures where the investigation warrants such    |
| 20 | measures? It's a legal defense for HR to do that? |
| 21 | MR. WHITFIELD: I'm going to object,               |
| 22 | asking for legal conclusions.                     |
| 23 | THE WITNESS: I don't know.                        |
| 24 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) But it's the policy at        |
| 25 | UMMC that whenever allegations of harassment are  |
|    |   |
|    |   |

```
Page 84
      brought forward to the attention of HR that an
  1
  2
      investigation is conducted, correct?
  3
                MR. WHITFIELD:
                                 Object to the form as
           she's not a 30(b)(6) on the policies.
  4
  5
           Q.
                (By Mr. Schmitz)
                                   You can answer.
  6
                I'm -- I don't know.
           Α.
  7
           0.
                You don't know what?
 8
                I don't know if the policy is that when
           Α.
     there's an allegation made because, again, it
 9
     would depend on who is making the allegation.
10
                                                      Ιf
     it's the person who has been aggrieved, if it is
11
     someone just saying a student, so I would need to
12
13
     know more specific information in order to
14
     definitively respond.
15
                In this situation involving a resident
     with a trauma student when this investigation --
16
17
     when this is brought to your attention and you're
     reading this e-mail and making your summary that
18
19
     you've typed up here, you did not see that it was
     necessary or part of any -- did you check to see
20
21
     if this was part of the policies and procedures to
     conduct an investigation into these allegations of
22
     sexual harassment which are brought forward to
23
     your attention and that you reviewed?
24
25
               I did not. And it does not specifically
          A.
```

Page 85 say sexual harassment. It said, preferentially 1 2 chooses and favors her. So I can not infer exactly what that means. But, no, I did not seek 3 to see if anyone else had done an investigation 4 5 regarding that. 6 So making another female student Q. 7 incredibly uncomfortable and trying to be alone with that student as well, that didn't raise any 8 alarm bells on your head as an HR professional 9 with years and years of experience that that might 10 be something that needs to be looked into on 11 12 behalf of UMMC? 13 Α. It did not. 14 Do you think now looking back at that, Q. that that's something that you should have looked 15 16 into as an HR professional? 17 I would have needed more information on Α. And, again, I was basing my recommendation on 18 19 the totality of everything that had been presented. And in the course of -- from June 2016 20 until I was notified in January '17, I felt that 21 22 there were enough egregious acts by Dr. Papin to support the department's recommendation. 23 What other information other than there 24 Ο. was a female trauma student and Dr. Papin and this 25

```
Page 86
     stuff, what other information were you looking
 1
     I mean, do you need a smoking gun, do you need --
 2
 3
     what else do you need?
 4
                MR. WHITFIELD:
                                Object to the form.
 5
                              I don't know Ashley
                THE WITNESS:
 6
                     I don't know the context in which
          Griffin.
 7
          she was reporting these. She said he tries
 8
          to be alone with the female student.
 9
          know if he was alone.
                                 I don't know if the
          female student was specifically feeling that
10
          he was trying to do something untoward.
11
          there's so many unknowns in this situation.
12
13
                (By Mr. Schmitz) So with that many
          Q.
     unknowns, you as an HR professional sitting there
14
     summarizing Ashley Griffin's e-mail to everybody
15
     else in the human resources and employee relations
16
17
     and then recommending a termination based upon the
     seven incidents -- partially at least, upon the
18
     seven incidents of inappropriate behavior by
19
     Dr. Papin, you did not think it was incumbent upon
20
     yourself with all the unknowns that you just
21
     mentioned to pick up the phone and call Ashley
22
23
     Griffin to determine at least the identity of this
24
     student and --
25
               I did not.
          Α.
```

| 1  | Q and the name of student?                        |
|----|---|
| 2  | A. I did not.                                     |
| 3  | Q. Thank you.                                     |
| 4  | Your next paragraph states, Dr. Earl met          |
| 5  | with Dr. Papin and discussed concerns that had    |
| 6  | been raised regarding his lying or being          |
| 7  | untruthful about patient care.                    |
| 8  | When did Dr. Earl meet with Dr. Papin?            |
| 9  | Is that the January 10 meeting that you reference |
| 10 | where he signed that document?                    |
| 11 | A. That is where the information was              |
| 12 | summarized. I am not sure on the specific dates   |
| 13 | or date that Dr. Earl and Dr. Papin met.          |
| 14 | Q. You state that he was lying or being           |
| 15 | untruthful about patient care. I asked if that    |
| 16 | was a fact but, again, you conducted no           |
| 17 | investigation and only took whatever Dr. Earl     |
| 18 | thought had happened, correct?                    |
| 19 | A. Yes.   |
| 20 | Q. Leaving the hospital in the middle of          |
| 21 | his shift to exercise. Did you conduct any        |
| 22 | investigation into that?                          |
| 23 | A. Dr. Papin admitted that to me.                 |
| 24 | Q. Okay. That was during your the                 |
| 25 | transcript conversation that you had with him on  |
|    |   |

Page 88 the 27th of January? 1 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. Unwillingness to help with tasks. That would have been the I'm a surgeon, 4 5 you're not my boss, is that what you're 6 referencing there? 7 Α. Yes. 8 1/19/17 is the next bullet point, starts 0. 9 with Molly Brasfield, HR director, and I met with 10 Dr. Rick Barr who is the Associate Dean of the Graduate Medical Education; Dr. Truman Earl, 11 Director of Medicine; Jamie Christian, Associate 12 13 General Counsel; Renee Greene, Senior Education Administrator; and Bryce Ainsworth, Project 14 15 Manager in the GME office. 16 What's a project manager in the GME 17 office? 18 Α. Project manager is the title but as the personal who -- she's not longer at UMMC, but at 19 the time she was the person who coordinated all of 20 the activities of the graduate medical education 21 22 office. 23 You all sat down to discuss the 0. 24 performance of Dr. Papin it states. You put here, Dr. Earl was adamant that he had no faith in 25

| 1  | Dr. Papin's honesty and was concerned about the   |
|----|---|
| 2  | liability of his continued participation in the   |
| 3  | surgery program.                                  |
| 4  | What types of things was Dr. Earl being           |
| 5  | so adamant about at this meeting with respect to  |
| 6  | Dr. Papin?  |
| 7  | A. All of the things that have previously         |
| 8  | been summarized. His lack of preparation. His     |
| 9  | unwillingness to admit that he was not always     |
| 10 | truthful, the concerns about his interaction with |
| 11 | other people with whom he had come in contact.    |
| 12 | Q. You go on to state that although he did        |
| 13 | appear to be concerned about being a surgeon, he  |
| 14 | was not concerned about what was required to get  |
| 15 | to that point. And you stated, the incident       |
| 16 | referenced above by Dr. Mahoney regarding the     |
| 17 | patient's ulcer is one of the items discussed.    |
| 18 | Were there any other items discussed              |
| 19 | regarding patient safety at this meeting?         |
| 20 | A. I don't recall. I don't recall.                |
| 21 | Q. But the patient's ulcer that was the           |
| 22 | primary topic of discussion regarding Dr. Papin's |
| 23 | patient safety issues?                            |
| 24 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form, you            |
| 25 | can answer.                                       |
|    |   |

| 1  | Page 90 THE WITNESS: It would have been one of     |
|----|--|
| 2  | the items discussed.                               |
| 3  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay.                          |
| 4  | A. There was no transcript of that meeting         |
| 5  | and we're talking about something that occurred    |
| 6  | three years ago, so I do not have total recall of  |
| 7  | everything that was discussed.                     |
| 8  | Q. Fair enough. You state, after inquiring         |
| 9  | if an ICare report had been submitted and learning |
| 10 | that it had not it was recommended; however, I     |
| 11 | followed up today and was told it still had not    |
| 12 | been done. So who did you recommend that an ICare  |
| 13 | report be submitted?                               |
| 14 | A. In that meeting, not to anyone specific,        |
| 15 | just in that meeting.                              |
| 16 | Q. Okay. And an ICare report eventually            |
| 17 | never was done on this incident?                   |
| 18 | A. Not to my knowledge.                            |
| 19 | Q. But you did recommend it to everybody           |
| 20 | who was sitting at that meeting, correct?          |
| 21 | A. Yes.  |
| 22 | Q. Okay.   |
| 23 | A. Well, it would have been recommended            |
| 24 | only to the people who would have been involved.   |
| 25 | Some of those people would not have been involved  |
|    |  |

Page 91 1 in doing an ICare report. It would have been specifically recommended to Dr. Earl to insure 2 that it would be done as he was the program 3 4 director. 5 Q. But this was something you openly announced at this meeting where all of these 6 7 people were in attendance, correct? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. So Dr. Barr, Molly Brasfield, Jamie 10 Christian, Renee Greene, Bryce Ainsworth, everybody would have heard you say that? 11 12 Α. Yes. 13 0. Okay. Then you have here 1/27/17. Dr. Papin had been contacted by phone to meet with 14 HR for an interview and was -- 3:00 was scheduled. 15 16 Dr. Papin called at 3:40 to inquire location for his 4:00 appointment, arrived shortly thereafter. 17 18 Concerns above were discussed with him and he 19 provided a response for each. He did not accept accountability for his actions and indicated that 20 it was either someone else's fault or no one had 21 22 given him clear instructions. 23 When you state that he did not accept accountability for his actions, what action was he 24 25 not accepting accountability for?

Page 92 1 All of the items that had been presented Α. 2 as stated -- summarized above, and those things 3 that had been presented in the letter from Dr. Earl as well as other e-mails that had been 4 5 reviewed were discussed with Dr. Papin. 6 Q. Okay. Goes on to say that he indicated he had grown up in Florida, studied in Michigan, 7 8 the culture in Mississippi was different. not think he was being rude or condescending, and 9 10 once again pointed out that to him that this 11 was -- he once again pointed that this is he's 12 perceived and he was putting in an effort to 13 He further maintained that neither change. 14 Dr. Earl nor anyone else had given him any 15 feedback that there were any concerns. 16 What your response to the fact or what 17 did your -- what were your thoughts in the fact 18 that he did not perceive that he was being rude to other members of the staff or anything like that? 19 Did you believe that, or did you believe that he 20 21 was, in fact, being rude to other members of the 22 staff? 23 My perception of Dr. Papin was that he Α. was rather cavalier. There had been quite a bit 24 of effort put forth to try to get him to the 25

Page 93 1 He had agreed to the 3:00 meeting. meeting. As I 2 said, at 3:40 when he called to inquire where the 3 4:00 appointment was to be, he was reminded that it was for 3:00. When he came in he wanted to 4 know how long it would take because he had a happy 5 6 hour appointment. 7 So my perception was that if he were 8 taking a cavalier approach to being called to come 9 and speak with HR, then it did make me wonder if 10 he were being truthful about the other things. 11 Q. So are you aware whether Dr. Papin drinks alcohol or not? 12 13 Α. I am not. 14 He mentioned to you that he was going to 0. drink alcohol for a happy hour appointment when he 15 16 showed up? 17 Α. He did not say he was going to drink 18 alcohol. He asked how long would the appointment 19 last because he had a happy hour appointment. 20 did not ask any questions because that was not relevant to our discussion, but to make that kind 21 22 of comment when you know you're coming for a discussion with HR just did pique my interest a 23 24 bit. 25 And he used the term happy hour Q.

| 1  | appointment when he said this; or did he said,   |
|----|--|
| 2  | I've got to go meet some friends at happy hour?  |
| 3  | What was exactly said?   |
| 4  | A. Again, this is three years ago, but in  |
| 5  | my recollection he said happy hour appointment.  |
| 6  | Q. Okay.   |
| 7  | A. And he showed up almost 45 minutes late.  |
| 8  | Q. Right. Did you had you set up the   |
| 9  | meeting with him and you said 3:00 p.m.?   |
| 10 |  |
|    | in the second se |
| 11 | deceased, but we do have e-mail confirmation where   |
| 12 | he did agree to that time.   |
| 13 | Q. Okay.   |
| 14 | MR. WHITFIELD: I'm looking at breaking   |
| 15 | in about 30 for lunch.   |
| 16 | MR. SCHMITZ: That's fine. I'm going to   |
| 17 | try to rename these exhibits and number them   |
| 18 | so that we can not get all messed up. All  |
| 19 | right, I'm sharing another exhibit with you.   |
| 20 | MR. WHITFIELD: So this is 3 again.   |
| 21 | (Exhibit 3 marked for identification.)   |
| 22 | MR. SCHMITZ: This is yeah.   |
| 23 | Actually, I'm trying to relabel things as I  |
| 24 |  |
|    | go so it doesn't get all messed up.  |
| 25 | MR. WHITFIELD: I'm going to go back and  |
|    |  |

```
Page 95
 1
          change that other one to 2 on my end.
                                                  Looks
 2
          like the same model but different.
 3
               THE WITNESS: It's pertaining to --
 4
               MR. WHITFIELD: I think that one is
 5
          different. Or wherever it went.
 6
               THE WITNESS: Scroll back up to the --
 7
          yeah, that's from Molly.
 8
               MR. WHITFIELD: All right.
 9
          Q.
                (By Mr. Schmitz) We're not going to go
     through your summary and all that other stuff again.
10
      So you can just -- I'm only talking about the first
11
12
     two pages here.
13
               I'm just walking around. You just tell me
14
     when you're ready.
15
          Α.
               I'm ready.
16
          Q.
               So I want to talk to you about -- it's
17
     from Molly Brasfield and it's dated February 15,
     2017 at 1:32 p.m. And it's to Pamela Greenwood
18
19
     and then you're also copied on that. And Molly
20
     Brasfield, she's the HR director?
21
               At that time she was. She's currently
22
     the chief HR officer.
23
          Q.
               Okay. That's a promotion?
24
          Α.
               Yes.
25
          Q.
               She states that HR has no scope of
```

| 1  | Page 96 involvement in the termination processes unless or |
|----|--|
| 2  | until a decision to dismiss is made by the                 |
| 3  | program; is that correct?                                  |
| 4  | A. Yes.  |
| 5  | Q. That's an accurate statement by                         |
| 6  | Ms. Brasfield.   |
| 7  | A. Yes.  |
| 8  | Q. This is what you were talking about                     |
| 9  | earlier before, the scope of the our                       |
| 10 | responsibility is to separate their employment             |
| 11 | since it is dependent on their admission and               |
| 12 | enrollment in an academic program, that's what             |
| 13 | we've been discussing today?                               |
| 14 | A. Yes.  |
| 15 | Q. So the decision here was made the                       |
| 16 | decision to dismiss here was made by the program           |
| 17 | director and the director of the GME office first,         |
| 18 | and then HR would confirm that, correct? That's            |
| 19 | basically what she's stating?                              |
| 20 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                         |
| 21 | Once again she's not the 30(b)(6) but she can              |
| 22 | answer to her knowledge.                                   |
| 23 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) That's fine.                           |
| 24 | A. The program director and the GME office                 |
| 25 | director would determine that they no longer want          |
|    |  |

Page 97 a house officer in a learning program, which is 1 2 the academic track of status of the person. 3 the employee side it would have to go through HR and ultimately through the office of employee 4 5 relations in order for employment to be 6 terminated. 7 0. Right. But it's kind of like the 8 chicken and the egg, right? Like, so the egg would be the program and the chicken that comes 9 10 afterwards would be HR, right? 11 Α. In this case. There are instances where 12 the GME office and the program director determine 13 that a person should not continue in a program and 14 there is mutual agreement between those entities 15 and the person may resign. Some of those 16 instances never reach to the level of having HR 17 involvement. 18 Are you aware of whether Dr. Papin was 0. 19 ever given or asked to resign by Dr. Earl from the 20 program? 21 Α. I'm not sure. We were only informed 22 after Dr. Earl and the GME office had taken 23 certain steps. 24 Q. Have you ever asked Dr. Earl did you --25 did you ever ask Dr. Earl or have a conversation

Page 98 1 regarding Dr. Papin potentially being given the 2 opportunity to resign? 3 Α. I did not. 4 0. Did you ever discuss with Dr. Earl or 5 anybody else at the GME office regarding any other 6 measures which could have potentially been taken in this case other than the termination of 7 8 Dr. Papin? 9 Α. I did not. 10 You've been involved in other cases 0. 11 involving residents however where other measures 12 were taken including suspension, remediation 13 plans, performance improvement plans, things of 14 that nature, where termination was then avoided? 15 Α. I can not recall. 16 0. On the first page there's an Okay. 17 e-mail from Cecilia Bass to Molly Brasfield, Pam Greenwood, Johnny Gilmore, Chris Morgan, and 18 19 yourself. And she says, Molly, after reviewing 20 this it appears "tricky" to me. Let's plan to 21 I'll check your calender and send an 22 appointment to both you and Pat. 23 So I'm assuming after this you met with Ms. Bass to discuss Dr. Papin's termination 24 25 along --

| December | 02, 2020   |
|----------|--|
| 1        | Page 99  |
| 2        | Q with Ms. Brasfield and Ms. Greenwood?            |
| 3        | A. Yes.  |
| 4        | Q. And when did that meeting take place?           |
| 5        | A. I do not recall.                                |
| 6        | Q. It would have been within days of this          |
| 7        | e-mail?  |
| 8        | A. Yes.  |
| 9        | Q. Okay. And what was discussed at that            |
| 10       | meeting?   |
| 11       | A. The same points that Ms. Greenwood had          |
| 12       | initially raised in the e-mail to me. And in that  |
| 13       | meeting Molly Brasfield reiterated everything that |
| 14       | was included in her February 15 e-mail, and there  |
| 15       | was just discussion about where the obligations    |
| 16       | and responsibilities of GME office and the         |
| 17       | programs are in relation to employment.            |
| 18       | As I said, sometimes those relationships           |
| 19       | can blur because even though the house officer is  |
| 20       | an employee, he is ultimately in a training        |
| 21       | program and all of that is guided by the program   |
| 22       | direct and the GME office. And that was why in     |
| 23       | Ms. Brasfield's e-mail she indicated that those    |
| 24       | issues can be tricky.                              |
| 25       | Q. And you previously testified or is it           |
|          |  |

| 1  | correct that you're not really sure about what the |
|----|--|
| 2  | requirements for discipline within a program of a  |
| 3  | trainee actually require or don't require,         |
| 4  | correct?   |
| 5  | A. I'm not aware of whether or not                 |
| 6  | discipline is even included in their guidelines.   |
| 7  | Q. Okay. So you don't have any knowledge           |
| 8  | about what   |
| 9  | A. I do not.                                       |
| 10 | Q to do? Okay. Without having                      |
| 11 | knowledge about what the program is supposed to do |
| 12 | or not do, how can you from an HR perspective from |
| 13 | the HR track that you've been discussing,          |
| 14 | recommend and confirm a termination when you're    |
| 15 | not even sure whether the program has dotted all   |
| 16 | their Ts and, you know, dotted the Is and crossed  |
| 17 | all the Ts?  |
| 18 | A. The recommendation that I made was based        |
| 19 | on Dr. Papin's employee status, and I felt certain |
| 20 | based on the documentation that Dr. Earl had       |
| 21 | provided, the meeting with Dr. Barr and Dr. Earl   |
| 22 | that there were enough concerns that termination   |
| 23 | could be upheld.                                   |
| 24 | Q. Go to the next exhibit.                         |
| 25 | (Exhibit 4 marked for identification.)             |
|    |  |

| 1  | MR. WHITFIELD: We got it up.                       |
|----|--|
| 2  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You just let me know           |
| 3  | whenever you're ready.                             |
| 4  | A. I'm ready.                                      |
| 5  | Q. On the first page here you have GME             |
| 6  | Committee Hearings for House Officers since 2014.  |
| 7  | Do you see where it states that?                   |
| 8  | It states that there is a there was                |
| 9  | an African American, Resident 78, who appealed his |
| 10 | nonrenewal of contract in 2015. What is the        |
| 11 | difference between a termination and a nonrenewal  |
| 12 | of contract?                                       |
| 13 | A. Contracts are given for one year at a           |
| 14 | time and there would be information that would     |
| 15 | deem it not prudent to continue with that after    |
| 16 | the end of that contract, and persons will need to |
| 17 | be notified at least 30 days in advance. It        |
| 18 | depends on there's a lot of information that       |
| 19 | would depend on what their status is as to how     |
| 20 | much advanced notice they would be given, but it   |
| 21 | would need to be at least a 30 day notice. And     |
| 22 | they would be told that their contract would not   |
| 23 | be renewed. That would not be viewed in the same   |
| 24 | light as a termination.                            |
| 25 | Q. Did you ever discuss not renewing               |

| 1  | Dr. Papin's contract with Dr. Earl rather than   |
|----|--|
| 2  | terminating his employment?                      |
| 3  | A. I did not. Anytime there's a nonrenewal       |
| 4  | of a contract all of those items would be        |
| 5  | conducted by and through the GME office.         |
| 6  | And, again, there is a distinct line of          |
| 7  | demarcation with what occurs from the GME        |
| 8  | standpoint and what occurs from the HR employee  |
| 9  | standpoint. So there are some actions by the GME |
| 10 | area that are never involving HR.                |
| 11 | Q. Do you recall with this resident why          |
| 12 | their contract was not renewed, Resident 78?     |
| 13 | A. That would not have been one I was            |
| 14 | involved in.                                     |
| 15 | Q. The African American resident, Resident       |
| 16 | 79, appealed academic probation. Probation was   |
| 17 | upheld in 2017. This was around the same time as |
| 18 | Dr. Papin was terminated. What were the          |
| 19 | circumstances of Resident 79 being put on        |
| 20 | probation?                                       |
| 21 | A. I was not involved in that one.               |
| 22 | Q. Were you involved in any of these other       |
| 23 | than Dr. Papin?                                  |
| 24 | A. I was not.                                    |
| 25 | Q. Who was? Who would have been involved         |

Page 103 1 in these things? 2 Α. There are multiple HR business partners 3 and so it would depend on what department that 4 person would have been in as to who the business 5 partner was that was involved in it. 6 Q. Okay. 7 But, again, if it were a determination Α. 8 solely by GME, there would not have been HR 9 involvement in that decision making. 10 0. The next page is for surgical residents. 11 Do you see that -- now, you do oversee the 12 surgical residents, correct, from an HR 13 perspective at least? 14 I do consult with that department, ves. 15 Q. The first one states ethnicity Okay. 16 was -- he was of Asian descent, Resident 23, had a -- type of problem, anger management. Do you 17 18 recall that resident? 19 Α. Again, if these were handled within the 20 GME area HR would not have been involved. 21 0. Is there a reason why Resident 23 with 22 anger management issues would have never gotten 23 escalated to HR at all? 24 If in the decision and discretion of the Α. 25 GME office it was something that they would

Page 104 1 handle, it would not come to HR. 2 Wasn't Dr. Papin also accused of 0. 3 something similar to that, having some type of 4 anger management issue with respect to his interaction with Nurse Practitioner Stavins, but 5 6 yet his issue was escalated to HR for termination, 7 and this resident got to just have a meeting with 8 his mentors and program directors? In fact, this 9 resident was promoted from a preliminary resident to a categorical resident after his second year? 10 11 Α. I can not respond to that. 12 Okay. Can you explain the differential Q. 13 treatment with respect to those two residents? 14 I can not. I don't know how the GME 15 operated in those instances. 16 Q. Resident 37, there was an Okay. 17 inappropriate sexual conversation. Did you have 18 any involvement in that? 19 Α. I did not. 20 Q. So, again, here, UMMC, there's 21 inappropriate sexual conversation and HR is not 22 getting involved to investigate a sexual harassment sexual conversation between employees 23 24 and a resident? 25 I don't know the specifics. I don't Α.

Page 105 1 know what GME's or the program director's 2 determination was in that instance. 3 So it states here, the result was there **Q**. was -- this person was just warned by the program 4 5 director probably then to knock it off. can you explain the differential treatment between 6 this white resident and Dr. Papin who is also 7 8 accused of having or trying to be alone and being in -- making another resident or medical student I 9 10 believe, a female medical student feel incredibly uncomfortable? That was escalated to HR though, 11 12 but in this case this was kept within the 13 department. Can you explain that differential 14 treatment? 15 Α. I can not. 16 Resident 44, were you involved at all 0. with that where the resident chose to resign due 17 18 to his medical -- lack of medical knowledge, 19 clinical abilities? 20 Α. I was not. 21 Did you review any of the things Q. Okay. 22 before today regarding these residents and their 23 numbers to get a familiarization for who these 24 folks were? 25 MR. SCHMITZ: Tommy?

```
Page 106
 1
                           She doesn't -- I don't
          MR. WHITFIELD:
 2
     have my list in here. I wasn't expecting the
 3
     numbers today for her for these people, so I
     don't have it in here. I can get it and --
 4
 5
     print it out and get it. We can go back to
 6
     this after lunch if you want.
          MR. SCHMITZ: Well, I'm just trying
 8
     to -- it's hard because I don't have the
 9
     numbers -- I only have numbers and I don't
10
     have names, so I don't know who she would
11
     have been involved with or not in terms of
12
     the folks that were provided to us on these
13
     lists?
14
          MR. WHITFIELD: I know you don't want my
15
     knowledge, but I don't think she had any
16
     involvement in any of these on the list
17
     except for Papin.
18
          MR. SCHMITZ:
                        I know she did on page 3,
19
     she did mention earlier the Title IX.
20
          MR. WHITFIELD:
                          I was talking about the
21
     first two pages. I was talking about the
22
     first two pages.
23
          MR. SCHMITZ:
                        All right.
24
          MR. WHITFIELD:
                          Because the second page
25
     is the HR page, and we do know who -- she
```

| 1  | knows who Resident 76 is.                          |
|----|--|
| 2  | MR. SCHMITZ: Okay. All right.                      |
| 3  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Let's go to page 3 then        |
| 4  | where it says Human Resources House Officer Cases  |
| 5  | since January 2014.                                |
| 6  | The first four, 73, 74 and 75 or the               |
| 7  | first four boxes. It says, violation of the        |
| 8  | compliance policy. That's where the people were    |
| 9  | looking at the information that they didn't have a |
| 10 | need to be looking at. They got suspended for 10   |
| 11 | days for that. Is that what that is?               |
| 12 | A. Yes.  |
| 13 | Q. What is FWW?                                    |
| 14 | A. Final written warning.                          |
| 15 | Q. So all of these folks violated a policy         |
| 16 | and they were all white and they only received a   |
| 17 | final written warning and 10 day suspension as     |
| 18 | opposed to Dr. Papin; is that correct?             |
| 19 | A. All of those situations where there was         |
| 20 | a violation of compliance policy, those incidents  |
| 21 | were reviewed and investigated by the Office of    |
| 22 | Compliance. It was the Office of Compliance that   |
| 23 | determined the nature of the infraction and what   |
| 24 | the discipline should be. HR's only involvement    |
| 25 | in that was to present what the discipline was.    |
|    |  |

| 1  | Q. Okay. All right. Resident 76, you were          |
|----|--|
| 2  | involved directly in that case, correct?           |
| 3  | A. In the initial investigations, yes.             |
| 4  | Q. Tell me about your investigation into           |
| 5  | that case?   |
| 6  | A. There were concerns brought to HR by an         |
| 7  | interested third party, and as a result of that    |
| 8  | Q. Can you be more specific who brought it         |
| 9  | to your attention?                                 |
| 10 | MR. WHITFIELD: Hold on. Before we I                |
| 11 | want to make sure we protect these people's        |
| 12 | privacy.   |
| 13 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You don't need to say          |
| 14 | their names. You can just say it was like another  |
| 15 | resident or it was another, you know.              |
| 16 | A. It was a nurse.                                 |
| 17 | Q. It was a nurse, okay. That's fine.              |
| 18 | A. The people involved in that particular          |
| 19 | situation were either all nurses and nurse         |
| 20 | practitioners. The subject who was accused was     |
| 21 | the only one who was a house officer.              |
| 22 | Q. Okay.   |
| 23 | A. There were some concerns brought forth          |
| 24 | that he made unwanted inappropriate actions toward |
| 25 | these people. Also there was information provided  |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 109<br>that he offered illegal drugs to several people |
|----|---|
| 2  | and that was what prompted the investigations in            |
| 3  | that case.  |
| 4  | My involvement in that was to interview                     |
| 5  | the nurse who brought forth the allegation. And             |
| 6  | then after the person who was considered the                |
| 7  | potential victim was identified, she was                    |
| 8  | interviewed. Some of the interaction occurred at            |
| 9  | a party where several of these people were, so              |
| 10 | they were each interviewed. Then when it was                |
| 11 | determined that it was a Title IX case my                   |
| 12 | involvement ended at that point.                            |
| 13 | Q. Okay. So when these allegations of                       |
| 14 | sexual misconduct or unwanted advances and stuff            |
| 15 | like that, you did conduct interviews in that               |
| 16 | case, correct?  |
| 17 | A. The initial  |
| 18 | Q. You personally did that?                                 |
| 19 | A. Yes.   |
| 20 | Q. And then you proceeded to identify the                   |
| 21 | victims of this and interviewed those folks as              |
| 22 | well?   |
| 23 | A. Yes.   |
| 24 | Q. But in this case when those when                         |
| 25 | allegations of potential unwanted advances or               |
|    |   |

Page 110 1 wanting to be alone with somebody, you did not 2 conduct any interviews whatsoever? 3 Α. I did not. 4 Q. Why the difference in treatment between 5 what happened to Resident 76 who was white and 6 what happened to Dr. Papin here who was 7 interviewed -- who did not have any interviews 8 conducted regarding the allegations to determine 9 the validity or veracity of those allegations? 10 Α. There was one incident referred -- in 11 regard to Dr. Papin that did not, in my 12 estimation, rise to the level of sexual harassment 13 and specifically as it relates to Resident 76. That was one incident in the totality of all of 14 15 the acts that had been alleged by Dr. Papin. 16 it was felt that the documentation was conclusive 17 enough to warrant approval of the department's 18 Albeit from separating out that recommendation. one incident referred to him wanting to be alone 19 20 with a student. 21 So in Resident 76's case, you mentioned 0. 22 before that there were multiple nurses involved, 23 correct? 24 Α. Yes. 25 There were multiple nurse practitioners Q.

Page 111 1 involved, correct? 2 Α. At least one or two. I can't recall 3 specifically. 4 Q. Sure. And there were unwanted advances 5 made against several folks; is that correct? 6 Α. Yes. 7 0. And then -- so initially these reports 8 came in from a nurse regarding the involvement of 9 all these people, right? 10 Α. The nurse involving Resident 76 and one 11 During the course of that interview 12 others were identified. 13 Okay. So seeing how helpful interviews 14 can be in these types of situations to uncover 15 whether documentation is needed or whether 16 documentation is sufficient, shouldn't you have 17 also interviewed the folks that were allegedly, potentially being harassed with Dr. Papin to see 18 19 if there was anything going on there whatsoever? 20 Again, the totality of everything else 21 that had been alleged against Dr. Papin and the 22 length of time that it had occurred, that one 23 incident did not seem to take precedent over the 24 other things that were provided by Dr. Earl. 25 Q. Did you interview or investigate any of

Page 112 the totality of the other incidents that were 1 referenced to you or did you just take everything 2 as being -- all these -- what were essentially 3 unsubstantiated rumors to be as true and present 4 5 them as fact? 6 Α. I reviewed the evaluations. I reviewed 7 the summary of the information that Dr. Earl 8 provided to Dr. Papin that he signed 9 acknowledging. And it was determined that those 10 things were strong enough to support the department's recommendation for termination. 11 12 If Dr. Papin had not signed that Q. 13 document he would have been immediately terminated 14 and had no chance of remaining in the program, 15 correct? 16 I can't attest to that. Α. 17 Well, when he was presented that Q. document that he signed it was under the guise 18 19 that if he signed the document and he agreed to remediate these alleged issues that were brought 20 21 forth against him that he would have 60 days to 22 remediate himself, correct? 23 I was not in that meeting so I do not Α. 24 know how that occurred, but Dr. Earl did later indicate that he thought that he needed to give 25

```
Page 113
     Dr. Papin 60 days. Dr. 1Earl provided that
 1
 2
     information and met with Dr. Papin prior to HR
 3
     involvement.
 4
          Q.
               What's the basis for Dr. Earl thinking
 5
     that he needed to give -- he needed to give
 6
     Dr. Papin 60 days to remediate?
 7
               I don't know. I would presume that that
     was thought to be a part of the GME policy.
 8
 9
     not sure.
10
          Q.
               Okay.
11
               MR. WHITFIELD: Greg, we're approaching
12
          the hour.
13
               MR. SCHMITZ: Sure.
                                     I'm going to be --
          I'm either done right now and we can stop or
14
15
          I have like just a couple short more
16
          questions. I just want to get through this
17
          exhibit and then we can --
18
               MR. WHITFIELD: It's up to you.
19
               MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah.
                                     I'm getting hungry
20
          too.
21
               MR. WHITFIELD: I was going to say,
22
          look, hunger, you know, that's my queue.
23
          Q.
               (By Mr. Schmitz) With respect to Resident
24
     76 there were -- so there was multiple things going
25
     on in that case, right, there was illegal drug
```

Page 114 use -- alleged illegal drug use, there was alleged 1 sexual misconduct, there was alleged sexual assault 2 3 even, so there were multiple layers of the circumstances that would have lead to that 4 5 resident's termination, correct? 6 Α. Yes. 7 0. And in Dr. Papin's case, again, there were multiple layers involved in his termination 8 whether that would have been truthfulness, or his 9 alleged untruthfulness, or his alleged, you know, 10 being a danger to patients or, you know, his just 11 12 as you put it, his attitude issues that were 13 talking; is that correct? 14 Α. Yes. 15 But yet in the case of Resident 76 there Q. was a full investigation and interviews of 16 everybody involved by the human resources 17 department including yourself in that case, 18 19 correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 But in Dr. Papin's case there was no Q. investigation into any of the things that were 22 brought forth from the GME office, I'm assuming 23 the GME office also brought forth some of these 24 allegations as well to you to review and approve 25

| 1  | the termination for Resident 76, correct?  Page 115 |
|----|---|
| 2  | A. No.  |
| 3  | Q. So Dr. Earl or GME or nobody, this just          |
| 4  | came straight to HR first?                          |
| 5  | A. It came to HR through a report by a              |
| 6  | nurse who was the co-worker of the person who had   |
| 7  | the concerns. During the course of that there was   |
| 8  | discussion with the program director and the GME    |
| 9  | office but not as the initiator.                    |
| 10 | Q. Okay. And so in that case, again, there          |
| 11 | was a totality of circumstances with respect to     |
| 12 | why Resident 76 was terminated, correct?            |
| 13 | A. Yes.   |
| 14 | Q. And there was a totality of                      |
| 15 | circumstances for why Dr. Papin was terminated as   |
| 16 | well, correct?                                      |
| 17 | A. Yes.   |
| 18 | Q. But you had one Resident 76 got a full           |
| 19 | investigation and Dr. Papin got not even a single   |
| 20 | interview done by HR regarding any of the           |
| 21 | allegations that were brought against him,          |
| 22 | correct?  |
| 23 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                  |
| 24 | THE WITNESS: It was determined that the             |
| 25 | program director and the GME office had done        |
|    |   |

```
Page 116
 1
                           That's their responsibility
          due diligence.
 2
          when they're --
 3
                (By Mr. Schmitz) I'm not asking about --
          Q.
 4
     I'm not asking about the GME or what they did.
 5
     asking what you did. I'm -- what -- with re --
 6
     because you took action with Resident 76. You
 7
     didn't take any actions or do any interviews or
 8
     anything with respect to Dr. Papin, correct?
 9
               MR. WHITFIELD:
                                Object to the form.
10
               THE WITNESS: That is not correct.
11
          Q.
               (By Mr. Schmitz)
                                  Okay.
12
          Α.
               There was a review of all of the
13
     information that Dr. Earl, as the program
14
     director, had done. It was presumed that
15
     everything that he had done and presented was
16
     complete enough to support the recommendation.
17
     There was an interview with Dr. Papin when he did
     not deny the things that had occurred. And as a
18
19
     result of the interview with him, as well as a
20
     review of the various e-mails, evaluations, the
21
     meeting with Dr. Papin by Dr. Earl, it was
22
     determined that those were sufficient to warrant
23
     support of the department's recommendation for
     termination.
24
25
          Q.
               Dr. Earl, that was his first year being
```

| 1  | the program director of the general surgery        |
|----|--|
| 2  | department, correct?                               |
| 3  | A. I don't know.                                   |
| 4  | Q. So you don't know who was the surgery           |
| 5  | director before him?                               |
| 6  | A. I don't know.                                   |
| 7  | Q. Don't you correspond with these folks           |
| 8  | regularly as you oversee their department?         |
| 9  | A. I don't know.                                   |
| 10 | Q. So you have no idea how long Dr. Earl           |
| 11 | had been the program director?                     |
| 12 | A. I do not. I know he is a physician. He          |
| 13 | was credentialed. It was determined that he was    |
| 14 | sufficiently qualified to be in that role.         |
| 15 | Q. Does he have any HR background or               |
| 16 | employee discipline, or he's a surgeon background? |
| 17 | A. He's a surgeon.                                 |
| 18 | Q. Okay. So as an HR professional do you           |
| 19 | think that a person who operates on other human    |
| 20 | beings would have knowledge and sufficient         |
| 21 | training on how to conduct an employee discipline  |
| 22 | termination? Didn't you have to receive a          |
| 23 | certification to be a professional HR person to do |
| 24 | that same thing?                                   |
| 25 | A. I did receive certification for my HR           |
|    |  |

Page 118 involvement, but anyone who is in a position of 1 2 leadership also has certain responsibility and training that they must undergo. 3 4 Q. But didn't you have a responsibility to 5 conduct at least a single interview of your own 6 knowledge just to verify -- do your own due 7 diligence, wouldn't you think your own due 8 diligence in this case should have included 9 reaching out to at least one of the people who 10 made these allegations against Dr. Papin instead 11 of just taking these hearsay rumors to be as fact? 12 Α. I did not. 13 0. And you think that that's reasonable? This is a personal question, you think that that 14 15 was a reasonable course of action to take? 16 Α. In this situation, yes. 17 Why? Why was it reasonable to Q. 18 investigate Resident 76, do a whole federal case 19 and call everybody in and take notes and for you 20 to speak personally with everybody, but it was 21 unreasonable to do it in Dr. Papin's case? 22 Α. I spoke with Dr. Papin. I reviewed his evaluations. I reviewed the e-mails that had been 23 24 provided by the department. I reviewed the 25 information that Dr. Earl went over with

| 1  | Dr. Papin. It was determined that that was        |
|----|---|
| 2  | sufficient to warrant recommendation acceptance   |
| 3  | from what the department had provided.            |
| 4  | Q. All right. Let's take a lunch.                 |
| 5  | (A brief recess was taken.)                       |
| 6  | (Exhibit 5 marked for identification.)            |
| 7  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Ready?                        |
| 8  | A. We're ready.                                   |
| 9  | Q. Okay. Starting at the bottom of the            |
| 10 | exhibit, page two, I'll just go in order because  |
| 11 | that's the earliest first e-mail, the e-mail from |
| 12 | Rick Barr to yourself, Molly, and others within   |
| 13 | the HR Department including also Dr. Earl.        |
| 14 | The first question is who is Louise               |
| 15 | Dove?   |
| 16 | A. Louise was Dr. Barr's administrative           |
| 17 | support person.                                   |
| 18 | Q. Okay. So Dr. Barr is reaching out to           |
| 19 | you all at HR. Is this typical whenever they have |
| 20 | an issue with residents where Dr. Barr will reach |
| 21 | out to guys in HR to consult with you regarding   |
| 22 | these matters, types of matters?                  |
| 23 | A. If they feel there is an HR involvement,       |
| 24 | yes.  |
| 25 | Q. Okay. It states that the issues are            |
|    |   |

| _  |   |
|----|---|
| 1  | Page 120 serious enough, and also including serious patient |
| 2  | safety outcomes where return to work is not                 |
| 3  | desired. Mark has an extensive paper trail.                 |
| 4  | And, again, the documents that were                         |
| 5  | provided to you by Dr. Earl that you discussed              |
| 6  | today, can you just quickly run through those for           |
| 7  | me?   |
| 8  | A. There were several evaluations of                        |
| 9  | Dr. Papin at various times in his time here.                |
| 10 | There were e-mails that had come from his                   |
| 11 | colleagues and there was a letter that Dr. Earl             |
| 12 | had provided in a meeting to Dr. Papin with                 |
| 13 | Dr. Papin.  |
| 14 | Q. Okay. And that was the extent of what                    |
| 15 | was sent to you regarding Dr. Papin?                        |
| 16 | A. Yes.   |
| 17 | Q. I want to go to the first page of the                    |
| 18 | second e-mail from the top, it's from Earl to               |
| 19 | Ms. Brasfield January 13 at 12:48 p.m.?                     |
| 20 | A. Yes.   |
| 21 | Q. Okay. He states that after the first                     |
| 22 | sentence, I think there is a serious patient                |
| 23 | safety issue here and I'm uncomfortable with him            |
| 24 | taking care of patients. I'm including the letter           |
| 25 | that he had 60 days to show improvement because I           |
|    |   |

| 1  | thought I was required to give him the opportunity |
|----|--|
| 2  | to improve.  |
| 3  | What would have given Dr. Earl the                 |
| 4  | impression or are you aware of anything at UMMC    |
| 5  | procedures and policy wise that would have         |
| 6  | required Dr. Earl to have given Dr. Papin 60 days  |
| 7  | to improve?  |
| 8  | A. I am not. I can only presume that he            |
| 9  | must have thought it was something in keeping with |
| 10 | the GME requirements.                              |
| 11 | Q. Okay. Later down in this same e-mail he         |
| 12 | says, please let me know if there's any other      |
| 13 | documentation, evaluations, scores and milestones, |
| 14 | et cetera that you can provide.                    |
| 15 | Do you know whether evaluations, scores            |
| 16 | and milestones or anything like that were ever     |
| 17 | provided to you to review?                         |
| 18 | A. There were evaluations but I'm not              |
| 19 | familiar with milestones.                          |
| 20 | Q. Okay. Going to the next exhibit.                |
| 21 | MR. WHITFIELD: Out of curiosity, how               |
| 22 | many have you got today?                           |
| 23 | MR. SCHMITZ: You don't want to know,               |
| 24 | Tommy. There's only one that's going to take       |
| 25 | a long time but I've got about 20, 21, 22 of       |
|    |  |

|    | 72, 5000   |
|----|--|
| 1  | them.  |
| 2  | MR. WHITFIELD: Total?                              |
| 3  | MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah.                                 |
| 4  | MR. WHITFIELD: Okay. We were at like               |
| 5  | 19 with Renee the other day.                       |
| 6  | MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah, this would be a                 |
| 7  | lot of these are quick like this one, a lot        |
| 8  | of these are short.                                |
| 9  | (Exhibit 6 marked for identification.)             |
| 10 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) You ready?                     |
| 11 | A. Yes, sir.                                       |
| 12 | Q. All right. So this is an e-mail here at         |
| 13 | the top well, actually let me see. The e-mail      |
| 14 | at the bottom of page one from Joyce Olutade?      |
| 15 | A. Olutade.  |
| 16 | Q. Olutade to Bryce Ainsworth that                 |
| 17 | Dr. Papin passed his drug screen and blood ethanol |
| 18 | screen.  |
| 19 | Now, let me ask you this. If a resident            |
| 20 | does fail and were to happen to have some type of  |
| 21 | substance in their system, is that immediate       |
| 22 | grounds for termination? Is that automatic         |
| 23 | termination at UMMC?                               |
| 24 | A. It is not necessarily, no.                      |
| 25 | Q. Okay. Is it depending on the substance?         |
|    |  |

Page 123 1 Α. It depends on several factors. When 2 there is a suspicion of an illegal substance the 3 process calls for the supervisor to -- there's a 4 checklist and the supervisor goes over that 5 checklist, then the employee is given the 6 opportunity to consent to being tested. 7 If the employee does not consent then 8 there is immediate suspension followed by 9 termination. 10 If the employee consents to being tested 11 there is paid administrative leave that they're 12 paid on pending the results of the test. 13 results of the test are positive then there may be 14 rehabilitation through the benefits program for 15 that employee or some other program, or there may 16 be termination. 17 0. Okay. So depending on the circumstances some people would be allowed to go to some type of 18 19 rehabilitation program to break a potential 20 addiction problem or something like that and 21 others are terminated just depending on the 22 circumstances? 23 Α. Yes. 24 All right. Going back up to the Ο. Okav. 25 top e-mail -- well, I guess Dr. Earl had sent over

Page 124 1 some language to Molly Brasfield and to you all to 2 review that he was going to send to Dr. Papin in 3 this e-mail. Is this common, is this part of HR's 4 involvement in these types of incidences, you 5 know, when program directors are communicating 6 with their residents regarding sort of, I guess, 7 HR employment issues? 8 Ms. Brasfield sent the language to Α. 9 Dr. Earl. This was a different situation in that 10 the department had determined a need for the drug 11 screening but concomitant with that were the 12 issues on professionalism and performance. 13 there had been communication via telephone between 14 Ms. Brasfield and Dr. Earl, and that was where 15 they had discussed the overall concerns with 16 Dr. Papin. 17 Because his drug screen was negative, 18 typically he would have been brought back on 19 campus and resumed his regular scheduling. 20 because of those other concerns that's why 21 Ms. Brasfield recommended the language to tell him 22 that he would be contacted for further 23 investigation rather than being immediately returned to campus. 24 25 Q. Okay. Next exhibit.

```
Page 125
 1
                (Exhibit 7 marked for identification.)
 2
               I only have one question about this.
          Q.
 3
     Are you ready?
 4
          Α.
               Yes.
 5
               All right.
          Q.
                           Just let me know whenever
 6
     you're ready because I'm not --
 7
          Α.
               Sure.
 8
          0.
               I don't want to -- all right.
                                               So this
 9
     is an e-mail from Ms. Brasfield to you and she's
10
     delegating the task of setting up an interview to
11
     interview Dr. Papin. Is that typically your role
12
     in HR, are you the one who typically handles the
13
     interviews?
14
               If it's a department -- if it's a
          Α.
15
     department that I provide support to, yes.
16
               MR. SCHMITZ: Next.
                                     It's there, Tommy,
17
          number 8.
18
               (Exhibit 8 marked for identification.)
19
               THE WITNESS:
                              I'm readv.
20
          0.
               (By Mr. Schmitz) This is an e-mail from
     you to Brenda Traxler regarding an interview that
21
22
     you're going to sit -- you wanted her to sit in, and
     you said you wanted to have a meeting to fill her in
23
24
     on the specifics. Can you tell me about that
25
     meeting to fill her in on specifics, what you told
```

Page 126 1 her and what about the situation that was happening? 2 Α. The HR process is to always have two 3 employees sitting in on any interviews that we 4 would have do with the employees. And depending 5 on who the HR business partner was who supported 6 the department it would always be that person's 7 responsibility for the interview. 8 If there was not another HR business 9 partner available, Brenda Traxler, who at that 10 time was an associate HR business partner, would 11 be asked to sit in on the interviews. And prior 12 to the interview she would be given specifics of 13 what the case entailed. She also had the liberty 14 to ask questions in the interview. 15 0. The meeting that you had before the 16 interview, what was your discussion with 17 Ms. Traxler? 18 Α. She would have been given a copy. 19 would have been shown a copy of the information 20 that we had. 21 Q. And those are the documents you told me 22 about before? 23 A. Yes. 24 Did you give her any other details 25 regarding the situation and your thoughts or

| December | 02, 2020   |
|----------|--|
| 1        | Page 127 impressions of everything going on?       |
| 2        | A. No.   |
| 3        | Q. Moving right along here. Number 9.              |
| 4        | (Exhibit 9 marked for identification.)             |
| 5        | Q. Who is Bryce Ainsworth?                         |
| 6        | A. She's no longer employed with UMMC but          |
| 7        | at the time she was the person who managed the GME |
| 8        | office.  |
| 9        | Q. So it would be part of because you're           |
| 10       | asking the GME office for the ICare report, that   |
| 11       | would typically be something that would be handled |
| 12       | within the GME office if there were ICare report   |
| 13       | issues about a resident or something like that?    |
| 14       | A. Not necessarily but because there had           |
| 15       | been a meeting with Dr. Barr, who was the director |
| 16       | of the GME office, he would have been either in    |
| 17       | possession of the ICare report, or Dr. Earl would  |
| 18       | have discussed that with him.                      |
| 19       | Bryce was in attendance at the meeting,            |
| 20       | the initial meeting that was held with Dr. Barr    |
| 21       | and Dr. Earl when the question of whether or not   |
| 22       | an ICare report existed was raised.                |
| 23       | Q. Okay. That makes sense. All right.              |
| 24       | Exhibit 10.  |
| 25       | (Exhibit 10 marked for identification.)            |
|          |  |

Page 128 1 0. This is just the responses to your question from the last e-mail. 2 3 Α. I'm readv. 4 Q. Okay. So Bryce sent this -- it looks 5 like Bryce sent your e-mail with your inquiry 6 regarding the ICare report over to Dr. Earl and 7 Ms. Shirley Schlessinger. Who is Shirley 8 Schlessinger? 9 Α. Dr. Schlessinger was previously the GME 10 office director, and at that time she still had 11 some peripheral involvement. 12 Q. Is there any reason why you didn't --13 after Dr. Earl responded that there were no ICare 14 reports for that, is there any reason why you 15 didn't tell Dr. Earl to go ahead and submit one of 16 those? 17 Α. No, there wasn't. 18 Q. But you had previously told, or 19 recommended at least, that the prior meeting that you had with Dr. Earl, Barr, and other folks that 20 21 it was recommended that he fill out an ICare report, correct? 22 23 Α. Yes. 24 Q. And, again, you said after an ICare 25 report is filled out if it's about a patient care

| 1  | Page 129 issue then that patient care issue would be |
|----|--|
| 2  | flipped back to the department so that someone, a    |
| 3  | committee within the department could review the     |
| 4  | medical procedures that were followed and make a     |
| 5  | determination on, you know, whether there was a      |
| 6  | potential issue of care provided?                    |
| 7  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                   |
| 8  | She's not our 30(b)(6) on policies. She can          |
| 9  | answer to the best of her knowledge.                 |
| 10 | THE WITNESS: The ICare report goes to a              |
| 11 | specific database, it does not go to the             |
| 12 | department. When that ICare report goes to           |
| 13 | the area, and I'm not sure the name of the           |
| 14 | area responsible, but when the ICare report          |
| 15 | goes to that specific area that is where the         |
| 16 | determination is made for the committee's            |
| 17 | involvement.   |
| 18 | If there is no ICare report submitted                |
| 19 | and if there are concerns brought within the         |
| 20 | department then the department would be              |
| 21 | responsible for investigating as was the case        |
| 22 | with Dr. Papin. ICare reports are not                |
| 23 | mandatory.   |
| 24 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) I guess my question is           |
| 25 | do ICare reports typically trigger other things to   |

| 1  | Page 130   |
|----|--|
|    | happen after I mean, what happens once it's I        |
| 2  | mean, who is responsible for looking those things    |
| 3  | over and making sure that it just doesn't fall       |
| 4  | through the cracks and nobody cares?                 |
| 5  | A. There's a specific department that I              |
| 6  | can't I don't know the name of that area where       |
| 7  | ICare reports are maintained, and it is that         |
| 8  | area's responsibility to determine what course of    |
| 9  | action will occur.                                   |
| 10 | Q. Kind of like risk management or                   |
| 11 | something like that?                                 |
| 12 | A. I can not be certain of the name of the           |
| 13 | area. It may be risk management but I'm not sure.    |
| 14 | Q. Okay. So somebody does eventually                 |
| 15 | review all the ICare reports that are submitted,     |
| 16 | somebody is looking at those things, right?          |
| 17 | A. Yes. There is a specific area with                |
| 18 | responsibility for those.                            |
| 19 | Q. All right. Next Exhibit 11.                       |
| 20 | (Exhibit 11 marked for identification.)?             |
| 21 | A. I'm ready.  |
| 22 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. Starting at the            |
| 23 | bottom there's an e-mail from Dr. Earl February 14th |
| 24 | at 12:51 p.m. Do you see where I'm talking about?    |
| 25 | A. Yes.  |
|    |  |

| 1  | Page 131 Q. That e-mail was sent to you, correct?  |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. Yes.  |
| 3  | Q. Okay. In that Dr. Earl is says, Pat,            |
| 4  | need some feedback on this as I need to fill his   |
| 5  | slot before February 22nd, that February 22nd is   |
| 6  | what eight days after he sent or eight days        |
| 7  | later after he sent this e-mail. What happens on   |
| 8  | February 22nd that he needed to fill that slot?    |
| 9  | A. I'm not familiar with the process. I            |
| 10 | can only presume it has something to do with when  |
| 11 | medical students match and when they are getting   |
| 12 | assignments for the year that begins on July 1st.  |
| 13 | Q. Okay. So is it your understanding that          |
| 14 | he's basically promising you to say, hey, I need   |
| 15 | an answer from you guys because I need to figure   |
| 16 | out what I'm going to do with Dr. Papin's slot?    |
| 17 | A. He's inquiring about the status of his          |
| 18 | request for termination.                           |
| 19 | Q. Okay. So then, again, he follows up             |
| 20 | with you on February 20th at 9:15 a.m. saying that |
| 21 | he had heard nothing and if he is not to be        |
| 22 | renewed in July I have to fill his slot created by |
| 23 | his absence. This must be done by February 22nd    |
| 24 | due to National Residence Match Program. You were  |
| 25 | correct. So I need to know ASAP and I have         |
| 1  |  |

| 1  | Page 132  |
|----|---|
|    | someone ready to fill his slot but she must       |
| 2  | withdraw from the match no later than the 22nd.   |
| 3  | If I hear nothing I will be forced to assume he   |
| 4  | will not be renewed and fill his residency in     |
| 5  | which case he will not have a job here in July no |
| 6  | matter what HR findings are. Please help.         |
| 7  | What does he mean if he fills his                 |
| 8  | residency slot, so regardless of HR findings or   |
| 9  | whatever y'all were doing with respect to         |
| 10 | Dr. Papin, he was going to fill his slot one way  |
| 11 | or the other on the 22nd; is that correct?        |
| 12 | A. I can only presume that he meant that he       |
| 13 | would take advantage of the academic avenue to    |
| 14 | remove him from the program, but I can not attest |
| 15 | to that with certainty.                           |
| 16 | Q. So is it your testimony here today that        |
| 17 | Dr. Papin was only terminated for HR related      |
| 18 | reasons, he was not terminated for academic       |
| 19 | reasons, or is it a blur?                         |
| 20 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form.                |
| 21 | THE WITNESS: His employment was                   |
| 22 | terminated. He was terminated as an employee      |
| 23 | of UMMC.  |
| 24 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) By HR?                        |
| 25 | A. The ultimate decision was rendered by          |
|    |   |

Page 133 1 the employee relations director. 2 Q. But his participation and membership in 3 the residency program was terminated by the 4 program, correct? That's what Dr. Earl was implying here, correct? 5 6 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form. 7 THE WITNESS: I am not sure what the 8 process was for his removal from the program 9 as a result of his employee termination. 10 don't know whether or not there was some 11 specific document or some specific procedure 12 that had to occur. He was terminated as an 13 emplovee. 14 Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Right. But he was 15 terminated as an employee, my understanding, I'm just trying to -- he was terminated as an employee 16 17 because he was no longer going to be part of the 18 residency program and that decision was made by 19 Dr. Earl, correct? 20 He was terminated as an employee based 21 on his performance and actions in the program. 22 0. Again, earlier you testified that 23 Dr. Earl and Dr. Barr came to you stating that they wanted to terminate Dr. Papin, correct? 24 25 That they no longer wanted him to Α.

Page 134 1 continue, yes. 2 Q. Okay. So the recommendation for 3 termination for Dr. Papin came from Dr. Barr and Dr. Earl, correct? 4 5 Α. Yes. 6 Q. Initially so? 7 Α. Yes. 8 And then HR reviewed their Ο. 9 recommendation and the documents provided and then 10 confirmed that termination, correct? 11 Α. Yes. 12 So on February 20 at 9:15 a.m. you Q. received this e-mail from Dr. Earl copying 13 14 Dr. Barr asking for what's going on, he only has 15 two days to make this decision. At 3:40 p.m. on 16 the same day you reply back and state that the 17 employee relations has approved the termination of 18 Dr. Papin. What happened on that day between 9:15 19 and 3:40 that caused his termination to be 20 approved at that point in time? 21 Α. When a recommendation is received from a 22 department for termination of an employee, as an 23 HR business partner I summarize everything and 24 submit it to employee relations where all of the 25 authorization must be given. It is not uncommon

Page 135 1 for a department to contact me to ask for the 2 status. 3 Typically I would e-mail or make a phone 4 call to employee relations and relay that request to them that the department is inquiring about the 5 status. I can only presume that after I received 6 7 the e-mail from Dr. Earl I would have made a phone 8 call to either Pamela Greenwood or Cecilia Bass to 9 inquire about the status of the request for 10 Dr. Papin. And because I do not have an e-mail here listed, again, I can only presume that there 11 must have been a phone call where they gave me the 12 13 authorization. 14 And did you also -- do you recall if you 15 alerted them that Dr. Earl was stating that basically he only had like a day or two to make 16 17 this decision and that he needed an answer before 18 the 22nd? 19 Α. I do not recall. 20 Do you recall feeling pressured at all to make your decision due to his e-mails stating 21 that he needed to fill that slot by the 22nd? 22 23 Α. I did not. 24 You didn't feel any pressure at all, no Q. 25 sense of urgency from Dr. Earl's e-mail

Page 136 1 whatsoever? 2 I would not call it a sense of urgency because I understand the role that employee 3 4 relations has. There is a very small department 5 that is responsibility for the entire institution and it would just depend on how many other cases 6 they had as to how long it would take them to 7 8 render a decision. 9 So it is not uncommon for me to have 10 sent them a request at the time that I sent that and then it take several weeks before there is a 11 12 response. 13 So I did not necessarily sense or 14 consider Dr. Earl's inquire to the status a sense 15 of urgency that was presented to employee 16 relations. 17 So him stating this must be done by Ο. February 22nd due to the National Match Program 18 19 I need to know ASAP and I have requirement. someone ready to fill his slot but she also must 20 withdraw from the match no later than February 21 22 You didn't relay that to whoever you called over at employee relations that Dr. Earl had these 23 sort of deadlines coming up with respect to 24 25 Papin's slot?

```
Page 137
 1
                I would have given them that information
          Α.
     at my initial inquiry of the status of their
 2
     review of the case. When Dr. Earl initially asked
 3
     about it I would have given them that information.
 4
 5
                But, again, because they represent the
     entire institution I can not determine for them
 6
     how long it would take them to review how many
 7
     other cases they had or when they would get back
 8
     to me with a status on a particular case that I
 9
10
     have sent to them.
11
               There are 11 or 12 other HR business
12
     partners who also must send things through that
     office for resolution.
13
14
               Okay. So do you recall in this specific
     scenario of letting them know that, hey, I just --
15
     whoever you called afterwards, hey, that Dr. Earl
16
     is inquiring. He said that, you know, the match
17
18
     program is on -- did you remind them of that fact
     that basically there was only a few days left to
19
20
     do this?
21
               I can only presume that I would have
          Α.
22
     given that to them the first time Dr. Earl
23
                I do not recall from three years ago
     inquired.
24
     whether or not I made a second phone call with
25
     that same information.
```

| 1  | Q.         | Fair enough.  Page 138                     |
|----|------------|--|
| 2  |            | (Exhibit 12 marked for identification.)    |
| 3  | Q.         | Exhibit 12, same e-mail only different     |
| 4  | at the to  | op.  |
| 5  | A.         | I'm ready.                                 |
| 6  | Q.         | So this would have been your reaching      |
| 7  | out to the | ne team that you just referenced, correct? |
| 8  | Α.         | After a phone call, yes.                   |
| 9  | Q.         | Okay. And who is Johnny Gilmore?           |
| 10 | Α.         | He is no longer with UMMC but he was a     |
| 11 | senior HF  | R service partner. It is the request of    |
| 12 | the emplo  | yee relations director that when anything  |
| 13 | is sent t  | to the office the entire team is copied.   |
| 14 | Q.         | Chris Morgan, another person?              |
| 15 | A.         | He's also a senior HR service partner.     |
| 16 | Q.         | And they both are in employee relations?   |
| 17 | A.         | Yes.                                       |
| 18 | Q.         | Along with Ms. Greenwood?                  |
| 19 | Α.         | Yes.                                       |
| 20 | Q.         | Along with Ms. Bass?                       |
| 21 | Α.         | Yes.                                       |
| 22 | Q.         | Okay. All right, Exhibit 13.               |
| 23 |            | (Exhibit 13 marked for identification.)    |
| 24 | Α.         | I'm ready.                                 |
| 25 | Q.         | So looking at page, I'm not going to go    |
|    |            |  |

- Page 139 all the way down because the -- I'm going to start 1 2 at page two in the PDF. I'm sorry, hold on. 3 Okay, yes, page two in the PDF. 4 Α. Okav. 5 And this is you and Dr. Earl talking 0. 6 about where you're going to meet and what you're 7 going to do with the termination meeting for 8 Dr. Papin, correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 And he states we can meet in his office, 0. that you all can meet in his office. And he asked 11 you do you need to prepare anything? Do I contact 12 Does the GME office need to do anything? 13 14 This is all new to me. 15 At that point when he said, this is all new to me, did anything go off in your head that 16 17 perhaps that Dr. Earl had maybe not done all the due diligence he may have needed to do to 18 19 terminate Dr. Papin in the appropriate manner in 20 this case? 21 I interpreted that to mean the termination of the employee was new to him, the 22 23 actual process.
- Q. Right. But before you testified, right,
- 25 that you were relying on Dr. Earl to do his job

Page 140 and all the appropriate due diligence that he 1 needed to have done with respect to the 2 information he provided to you, correct? 3 4 Α. Yes. My interpretation of his statement 5 was what was new to him was the physical logistics of actually telling an employee that he was being 6 7 terminated. 8 Q. Okay. On page 1 at the bottom, 9 scrolling up a little bit, the bottom of the first page of the PDF. He stated the GME office may 10 contact him and ask him to come and meet you but 11 don't indicate what it's for. 12 I will prepare the documentation and send to you prior to the 13 14 meeting. 15 What documentation did you have to prepare and send to him prior to the meeting? 16 17 Any time an employee is being separated Α. they will be given information about how they will 18 be contacted if they're interested in continuing 19 their benefits. They will be asked to keep their 20 address updated for W2 purposes at the end of the 21 22 They will also be told whether or not they have any unused accrued personal leave and how 23 they will be compensated for that. 24 25 During Dr. Papin's termination meeting Q.

| did he did you provide him with all these  documentations?  A. At this point I do not recall. I do  recall during the meeting as we were meeting with him one of the other things that is required is that the employee's ID badge is retrieved. And when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  Q. Okay. Did you say anything to |    |   |
|--|----|---|
| A. At this point I do not recall. I do recall during the meeting as we were meeting with him one of the other things that is required is that the employee's ID badge is retrieved. And when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 1  | did he did you provide him with all these     |
| recall during the meeting as we were meeting with him one of the other things that is required is that the employee's ID badge is retrieved. And when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 2  | documentations?                               |
| 4 recall during the meeting as we were meeting with 5 him one of the other things that is required is 6 that the employee's ID badge is retrieved. And 7 when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not 8 give it and he got up and rushed from the room. 9 Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had 10 already left from that floor. 11 Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do 12 anything during the termination meeting? 13 A. There would not have been any documents 14 from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't 15 recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him. 16 Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the 17 give me some more details. So you met with 18 Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with 19 Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing 20 most of the talking or Dr. Earl? 21 A. Dr. Earl was. 22 Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was 23 telling Dr. Papin? 24 A. I do not recall.   | 3  | A. At this point I do not recall. I do        |
| him one of the other things that is required is that the employee's ID badge is retrieved. And when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 4  |   |
| that the employee's ID badge is retrieved. And when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 5  |   |
| when Dr. Papin was asked for his badge he did not give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with  Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with  Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 6  |   |
| give it and he got up and rushed from the room.  Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 7  |   |
| Dr. Earl attempted to go and catch him but he had already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 8  |   |
| already left from that floor.  Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 9  |   |
| anything during the termination meeting?  A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 10 |   |
| A. There would not have been any documents from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 11 | Q. Did Dr. Papin sign any documents or do     |
| from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 12 |   |
| from an HR standpoint for him to sign. I don't recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 13 | A. There would not have been any documents    |
| recall if Dr. Earl had anything for him.  Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the give me some more details. So you met with  Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with  Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing  most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was  telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 14 |   |
| give me some more details. So you met with  Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with  Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing  most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was  telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.   | 15 |   |
| give me some more details. So you met with  Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with  Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing  most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was  telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 16 | Q. Okay. Can you tell me about how the        |
| Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing most of the talking or Dr. Earl?  A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 17 | give me some more details. So you met with    |
| 20 most of the talking or Dr. Earl? 21 A. Dr. Earl was. 22 Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was 23 telling Dr. Papin? 24 A. I do not recall.  | 18 | Doctor it was you and Dr. Earl meeting with   |
| A. Dr. Earl was.  Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 19 | Dr. Papin, and how did the con were you doing |
| Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 20 | most of the talking or Dr. Earl?              |
| telling Dr. Papin?  A. I do not recall.  | 21 | A. Dr. Earl was.                              |
| 23 telling Dr. Papin? 24 A. I do not recall.   | 22 | Q. Okay. Can you recall what Dr. Earl was     |
| 1. I do not recarr.  | 23 | telling Dr. Papin?                            |
| Q. Okay. Did you say anything to   | 24 | A. I do not recall.                           |
|  | 25 | Q. Okay. Did you say anything to              |

Page 142 1 Dr. Papin? 2 Α. I attempted to share with him continuation of benefits and the other items that 3 I have previously mentioned. And then I asked for 4 5 his ID badge. 6 0. When you say he ran out of the room, 7 what do you mean? He got up from his chair and ran out the 8 Α. 9 door with the ID badge. 10 Q. Did he say anything? 11 There was some profanity that he spewed Α. out, but I can't recall specifically what it was. 12 13 He directed that at Dr. Earl. 14 You don't recall what he said though? 0. 15 Α. I don't. 16 You said Dr. Earl went and tried to 0. 17 chase after him? 18 Α. He got up -- Dr. Earl was seated behind 19 his desk. Dr. Papin and I were seated across from 20 When I asked for the ID badge Dr. Papin the desk. 21 got up and ran from the room. Dr. Earl came from around his desk and went out into the hall but 22 23 Dr. Papin was nowhere to be seen. 24 Q. You spoke in your report now for the 25 first time that Dr. Papin used profanity with

|    | Page 143  |
|----|---|
| 1  | respect to Dr. Earl, why was this never mentioned |
| 2  | before?   |
| 3  | A. Mentioned to whom or in what regard?           |
| 4  | Q. You hadn't mentioned this in any of your       |
| 5  | other e-mails regarding the termination meeting   |
| 6  | with respect to Dr. Papin prior to this or        |
| 7  | afterwards in any e-mails you sent regarding the  |
| 8  | meeting you had.                                  |
| 9  | A. I can not recall. I guess I presumed           |
| 10 | that it was not relevant to the situation.        |
| 11 | Q. Okay. It wasn't like they got into like        |
| 12 | a big screaming match or anything like that was   |
| 13 | it?   |
| 14 | A. No.  |
| 15 | Q. Okay.  |
| 16 | A. There was no screaming match going on.         |
| 17 | When I asked for the ID badge that's when         |
| 18 | Dr. Papin got up from his seat. Dr. Earl may have |
| 19 | said something to him and that was at the point   |
| 20 | when he responded and as he was leaving the       |
| 21 | office.   |
| 22 | Q. Okay.  |
| 23 | A. This all happened in a very short              |
| 24 | duration.   |
| 25 | Q. Is it normal procedure for program             |

Page 144 directors to try to physically restrain personnel 1 to keep them from leaving during a termination 2 3 meeting? 4 You're misinterpreting what I said. He Α. did not try to restrain him, he was only going 5 after him to try to retrieve the badge, the ID 6 7 badge. Okay. But he got up -- did he try to 8 block the door or block Dr. Papin in or he wasn't 9 10 fast enough? 11 The way we were situated Dr. Earl was Α. behind his desk. Dr. Papin and I were on the 12 13 opposite side of the desk. Dr. Papin was closest 14 to the door. Dr. Papin hurriedly got up from his 15 chair and exited the door. Dr. Earl came from around his desk to go out in the hallway but there 16 was no attempt to physically restrain Dr. Papin. 17 18 Okay. Did Dr. Earl state anything to Q. him as he was going down the hallway like stop or 19 20 anything like that? 21 By the time Dr. Earl got up from his Α. desk, came around the desk, and went out into the 22 23 hall he did not see Dr. Papin. He did not go further down the hall. 24 25 Q. Okay. At the top of page 1 of

| 1  | Exhibit 13. Good morning, what I will prepare is   |
|----|--|
| 2  | documentation for termination of employment and    |
| 3  | will look to you for any documentation as required |
| 4  | pertaining to his removal from the program.        |
| 5  | In terms of documentation required for             |
| 6  | removal of the program, did Dr. Earl have any      |
| 7  | documentation prepared or was there anything that  |
| 8  | he needed to give to Dr. Papin that he gave to him |
| 9  | that day or had him sign?                          |
| 10 | A. I don't recall.                                 |
| 11 | Q. Exhibit 14.                                     |
| 12 | (Exhibit 14 marked for identification.)            |
| 13 | A. I'm ready.                                      |
| 14 | Q. In this e-mail you state, the question          |
| 15 | of whether Dr. Papin was terminated because of his |
| 16 | race is rather ironic. Why do you think it was     |
| 17 | ironic?  |
| 18 | A. This came about as a result of an               |
| 19 | inquiry where Dr. Papin was appealing his          |
| 20 | termination and there was a footnote on it from    |
| 21 | the attorney representing him that he felt the     |
| 22 | termination was due to his race that he was        |
| 23 | Hispanic. So there was irony in that because the   |
| 24 | documentation that's attached to that e-mail there |
| 25 | indicates his ethnicity as white.                  |
|    |  |

| 1  | Q. The hallway outside of Dr. Earl's             |
|----|--|
| 2  | office, how big is that hallway? You said he was |
| 3  | already gone?                                    |
| 4  | A. I don't recall. It's an older building        |
| 5  | and I don't know dimensions of the hallway. It's |
| 6  | a typical hallway.                               |
| 7  | Q. Okay. It's not just like a little             |
| 8  | it's not like, oh, he could have skirted around  |
| 9  | the corner real quick?                           |
| 10 | A. That day that I met with him was the          |
| 11 | only time I've ever been in that office so I     |
| 12 | really can't recall the specifics of it.         |
| 13 | Q. So essentially you all told Dr. Papin         |
| 14 | he's being terminated and he just got up and     |
| 15 | sprinted out the door as fast as he could?       |
| 16 | A. At the point that I asked for the ID          |
| 17 | badge he did.                                    |
| 18 | Q. Okay. Did Dr. Papin during that               |
| 19 | conversation ever ask did he ask Dr. Earl if he  |
| 20 | could resign in lieu of termination?             |
| 21 | A. I don't recall.                               |
| 22 | Q. Do you recall Dr. Earl telling him that       |
| 23 | that wasn't an option because the decision had   |
| 24 | already been made?                               |
| 25 | A. I don't recall.                               |
|    |  |

| 1  | Q. Are you aware that someone can be more        |
|----|--|
| 2  | than one race at the same time, for instance,    |
| 3  | white and Hispanic?                              |
| 4  | A. I understand that people can have a           |
| 5  | multiplicity of backgrounds. But, no, I'm not    |
| 6  | familiar with what determines ethnicity.         |
| 7  | Q. What's the difference between ethnicity       |
| 8  | and race?  |
| 9  | A. I'm not an expert on those                    |
| 10 | terminologies. I don't know if that's semantics  |
| 11 | or not.  |
| 12 | Q. But is it conceivable that someone with       |
| 13 | multiple races or ethnicities may identify I     |
| 14 | mean, there wasn't multiple places for him to    |
| 15 | put on this sheet here, there wasn't multiple    |
| 16 | places for him to put more than one option if    |
| 17 | someone is multi-ethnic or multi-racial, right?  |
| 18 | There would only be you have to pick one here    |
| 19 | because you only get one choice, right?          |
| 20 | A. I don't know.                                 |
| 21 | Q. What don't you know?                          |
| 22 | A. You were if you'll repeat the                 |
| 23 | question I'll give you a specific answer.        |
| 24 | Q. Sure. Could he have put more than one         |
| 25 | choice here on this ethnicity box, the pull down |

```
Page 148
 1
     box here that's at the bottom of the e-mail?
 2
                I don't know what those options are.
 3
           Q.
                Okay. Is it possible that he just
     identified as white because that's the first box
 4
     that came up and then Hispanic he just was like,
 5
     well, I can't identify as both so I'll just go
 6
     with white, is that conceivable here?
 7
 8
          Α.
                I don't know.
 9
          Q.
               Okay.
10
               MR. SCHMITZ: Well, I'm going to take
11
          one minute.
12
                (A brief recess was taken.)
13
                (By Mr. Schmitz) Back on the record.
          Q.
                                                        I'm
14
     going to go to what is now Exhibit 15.
15
                (Exhibit 15 marked for identification.)
16
          Α.
               I'm ready.
17
               (By Mr. Schmitz) All right. So this is
          0.
     an e-mail from -- there is an e-mail from Cecilia
18
19
     Bass to you stating that there was a charge.
     see the charge. Prepare for responding to the
20
21
     charge, correct?
22
          Α.
               Yes.
23
          Q.
               Okay. And she said -- you asked, hasn't
     a file already been started on him?
24
                                           Isn't that --
25
    wouldn't you have already prepared the file on
```

| 1  | Dr. Papin at this point?   |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. Brenda Traxler prepared the files.  |
| 3  |  |
|    | in the stage of th |
| 4  | please check in Lawson. What's Lawson?   |
| 5  | A. Lawson was the employee system we were  |
| 6  | using at that point. In one of the previous  |
| 7  | exhibits that showed his ethnicity, that would   |
| 8  | have been a screen shot from Lawson.   |
| 9  | Q. Understood. Okay. Then it goes on to  |
| 10 | say, please see you want the form. I seem to   |
| 11 | recall it being marked white in Lawson. And then   |
| 12 | you state, this is not going to be any easy one.   |
| 13 | There's a lot to be desired in how it was handled  |
| 14 | prior to HR being involved.  |
| 15 | What did you mean by that statement?   |
| 16 | A. I meant that because of the program   |
| 17 | director and the GME had already taken quite a bit   |
| 18 | of action before HR was ever involved in it.   |
| 19 | Q. What actions were left to be desired  |
| 20 | that they could have done differently before HR  |
| 21 | had gotten involved?   |
| 22 | MR. WHITFIELD: Object.   |
| 23 | THE WITNESS: In a perfect world they   |
| 24 | would have contacted HR prior to doing   |
| 25 | anything, and at that point perhaps there  |
|    | z z. z. and pozite heritabs citeta   |

www.phippsreporting.com (888) 811-3408

| 1  | Page 150<br>would have been more investigations from HR |
|----|---|
| 2  | rather than merely from the department.                 |
| 3  | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. So by placing him             |
| 4  | on administrative leave prior to contacting HR, that    |
| 5  | is what potentially held up the fact that, you know,    |
| 6  | you guys were able to conduct an investigation into     |
| 7  | these allegations that were being brought forth         |
| 8  | against Dr. Papin?                                      |
| 9  | MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form. You                  |
| 10 | can answer.   |
| 11 | THE WITNESS: Not necessarily, but had                   |
| 12 | HR been involved prior to him being submitted           |
| 13 | to employee health for the drug screening               |
| 14 | there could have been some discussion as to             |
| 15 | what the reasons were, what kind of behavior            |
| 16 | was he exhibiting that warranted that. And              |
| 17 | there just could have been discussion with HR           |
| 18 | so we could know what they were doing and why           |
| 19 | they were doing it.                                     |
| 20 | We were brought in after the fact with a                |
| 21 | lot of what already had been done.                      |
| 22 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) What would you have done            |
| 23 | differently other than what they had already done?      |
| 24 | A. I can't tell at this point.                          |
| 25 | Q. Well, you have the information and you               |
|    |   |

Page 151 1 know what they had already did when it was 2 presented to you, so what steps differently would 3 you have taken had they involved you, let's say, in December, just hypothetically? 4 5 Α. I would have checked to see what kind of 6 documentation they had, what they were basing 7 their determinations on, what information had been 8 given for remediation to him, what their plan was, 9 had they provided some kind of step of remediation, what kind of information had he 10 provided them as to why his behavior was such that 11 12 it was. 13 Ο. Would there have been any, you know, had 14 you all been involved earlier, would there have 15 been -- is it typical for you -- I guess I'll say this, is it typical for you had you been involved 16 17 earlier where you would have actually had maybe 18 some conversations, prior conversations, with 19 Dr. Papin in addition to what Dr. Earl would have 20 done? 21 Α. Perhaps, but I can't say with certainty. 22 0. So to understand you correctly Sure. 23 and just to summarize what you had just stated, and if I misstate anything then please stop me, 24 25 but you basically -- you would have liked the

Page 152 1 opportunity to have done a little bit more 2 investigation into the basis of their allegations 3 regarding why they were recommending Dr. Papin to 4 be terminated, correct? 5 Α. It's always best to have involvement from the initiation of any action that is taken 6 7 toward an employee. 8 And that's why? Why is that? 0. 9 Α. Because it gives us the opportunity to implore all of our best practices in trying to 10 fair it out whatever information the person making 11 the complaint, the person who the complaint is 12 13 made against. Everything that we received had 14 occurred over a period of six months. 15 Q. Right. Did you feel that the 16 documentation that -- in terms of the counseling 17 and the follow-up of the counseling that Dr. Earl had provided to you, or the lack thereof, was a 18 19 little bit spotty, it could have been better? 20 I felt that it was sufficient to warrant Α. 21 the termination. 22 Q. Right. But there were a lot of instances where Dr. Earl had reported, well, I had 23 a talked to him about this, I had talked to him 24 about the nurses complaining that he was, you 25

Page 153 1 know, had a bad attitude, but then there was no 2 e-mail follow-up. Is that something that HR would 3 have corrected had they been involved earlier and said, well, if you're going to talk to him then 4 send an e-mail memorializing that conversation 5 that you had with him, is that a best practice at 6 7 UMMC? In the world of HR document, document, A. 9 document is our mantra. 10 Q. Right. So would you, in that vein, 11 would you have liked to have seen Dr. Earl do a 12 better job of documenting, documenting, 13 documenting some of these alleged conversations 14 that he had? 15 Α. In a perfect world, yes. 16 Prior to January 10th when Dr. Earl and 0. 17 Dr. Papin sat down and he signed that document, 18 which was part of your file that you've been referencing for most of the day today, were there 19 20 any other written warnings that you recall being in Dr. Papin's file from Dr. Earl regarding 21 22 Dr. Papin's conduct or misconduct? 23 Α. From an HR standpoint and in keeping with our progressive discipline process, there 24 25 were no written warnings.

Page 154 1 0. Okav. When someone -- and I'm sure this happens a lot from an HR perspective, you get 2 3 complaints about an employee having a bad 4 attitude, maybe not getting along with other 5 employees, that's typically something somebody 6 would get either a verbal or a written warning for 7 prior to termination, correct? 8 At UMMC managers have the discretion in 9 how they manage their employees. So if there are 10 cases of poor interpersonal interaction, there's 11 an expectation that the manager will take necessary steps to talk to those people, to send 12 13 them to some kind of class, or to do whatever else is required to resolve it. Those are not things 14 15 that always come to the level of needing HR 16 intervention. 17 0. Not saying HR intervention but from a 18 management level, shouldn't Dr. Earl have given 19 him at least a written warning about some of this 20 stuff and put it in writing that, hey, people are 21 put off by the way that you talk to them sometimes or, you know, I've gotten reports that, you know, 22 23 sometimes you're late for your rounds in the morning? Wouldn't those be the type of infraction 24 25 that UMMC that would typically warrant those

| 1  | Page 155 progressive discipline steps, requirements that |
|----|--|
| 2  | are set forth in the handbook?                           |
| 3  | A. Dr. Earl  |
| 4  | MR. WHITFIELD: Uh-oh.                                    |
| 5  | MR. SCHMITZ: You're breaking up a                        |
| 6  | little bit.  |
| 7  | MR. WHITFIELD: Give us a second and let                  |
| 8  | the system re are you there?                             |
| 9  | MR. SCHMITZ: I'm here. Is the court                      |
| 10 | reporter still there?                                    |
| 11 | COURT REPORTER: I'm here.                                |
| 12 | MR. SCHMITZ: Okay. I think we're good                    |
| 13 | now.   |
| 14 | MR. WHITFIELD: We had a thing that                       |
| 15 | popped up that said the internet was                     |
| 16 | unstable.  |
| 17 | MR. SCHMITZ: Oh, okay. Yeah, you're                      |
| 18 | good now.  |
| 19 | MR. WHITFIELD: All right.                                |
| 20 | A. Based on the documentation that Dr. Earl              |
| 21 | provided there were several instances where he           |
| 22 | indicated that he had met with Dr. Papin. I can          |
| 23 | not tell you why Dr. Earl took the approach that         |
| 24 | he did. I can only surmise that he felt in               |
| 25 | meeting with him and verbally sharing that               |

Page 156 1 feedback would have had a positive outcome. 2 Q. Okay. Exhibit 16 is the House Staff 3 Manual. 4 (Exhibit 16 marked for identification.) 5 Q. And I'm going to ask you, I don't want 6 you to review the whole House Staff Manual, go to 7 page 29 of the document. That's 29 within -- not 8 of the PDF but at the bottom of the page number of 9 the actual page 29 of the manual itself. 10 And we're going to be talking about 11 pages 29 through 31, so if you want to just familiarize yourself with those for a moment that's 12 13 fine. 14 Α. Okay, I've reviewed it. 15 Okay. Starting at page 31 of the 16 Harassment, in bold right there. handbook. refers to the GME website under administration and 17 18 policies. You're not familiar with any of the GME 19 policies as you sit here today, correct? 20 Α. Correct, I am not. 21 You are familiar though with the faculty Ο. and staff handbook and personnel procedures of 22 23 UMMC, correct? 24 I'm familiar with the booklet. Α. I would 25 have to review it to make a specific response

Page 157 1 about something contained in it. 2 Okav. Under discipline and behavior, 3 just scrolling up to the next part in bold there, 4 you see where I'm talking about? 5 Yes. Α. 6 0. Okav. So it states that, in the second 7 paragraph, it starts with, interns, residents and 8 fellows, house officers are subject to the rules 9 and regulations that govern the hospital. What 10 rules and regulations govern the hospital? 11 Α. That would pertain to all the policies 12 that are included in the faculty and staff 13 handbook. 14 Would that include other regulations like -- such as the ACGME regulations and 15 16 quidelines? 17 Α. I'm not familiar with that. 18 So you're not sure whether those govern 0. 19 the hospital or not? 20 I don't know specifically what this 21 book -- what -- the information that I'm reading, 22 I don't know what that is pertaining to. 23 Q. Okay. It states that UHHS professional behavior policy is available on the medical center 24 25 intranet and in the administrative policies and

Page 158 1 procedures manual. What's UHHS? Do you know what 2 that stands for? 3 At UMMC, University Medical Center, 4 there are separate divisions. There's one called 5 UHHS, University Hospital and Health Systems, that 6 would be any of the medical clinics. That would 7 include all of the nurses and any of the clinical 8 staff. 9 The area where I work is considered 10 academic service and research and it would be all 11 of the non-clinical areas. 12 There are some specific booklets and 13 guidelines for the UHHS employee binder that don't 14 pertain to the academic research and service side. 15 0. The next paragraph in this it states 16 that house staff shall have the right to grievance 17 procedures as detailed in the handbook for 18 employees at the medical center. There is a 19 separate house officer grievance policy for 20 residents maintained in the graduate medical education office and included on the GME website 21 22 under the administration policy/grievance. 23 Were you aware that house officers are 24 entitled to different procedures than just another 25 regular staff person at UMMC?

| 1  | Page 159 A. I'm not familiar specifically with that. |
|----|--|
| 2  | But, again, keep in mind that they have a dual       |
| 3  | status as the house officer on the academic side     |
| 4  | to which this pertains, and then the employment      |
| 5  | side to which the staff employee handbook would      |
| 6  | reference.   |
| 7  | Q. Right. But in administering any type of           |
| 8  | discipline, right, that is going affect the terms    |
| 9  | and conditions of a resident's employment, whether   |
| 10 | it comes from the HR side or the GME side,           |
| 11 | wouldn't, you know, wouldn't HR have to abide by     |
| 12 | the same things that the GME has to also abide by?   |
| 13 | A. I'm not familiar with what is included            |
| 14 | in the GME policy that is referred to here.          |
| 15 | MR. WHITFIELD: Greg, while you're                    |
| 16 | getting your next question together I've got         |
| 17 | to step out for about 20 seconds. We're not          |
| 18 | pausing, we're not going offline. I'll be            |
| 19 | right back.  |
| 20 | MR. SCHMITZ: No problem. Now I'm going               |
| 21 | to ask you all the good stuff. I'm just              |
| 22 | kidding.   |
| 23 | MR. WHITFIELD: I'm back, Greg.                       |
| 24 | MR. SCHMITZ: All right.                              |
| 25 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) I'm at the bottom of             |

> Page 160 It says, evaluation, 29 of the handbook. 1 page 29. 2 It states, evaluation and promotion and dismissal of 3 residence policy. 4 Α. Okay. 5 Q. So the second paragraph says, each 6 program must establish criteria for promotion. 7 Then after that next sentence states, 8 unsatisfactory training performance may result in 9 dismissal from the program of the house officer. This decision will be made by the program director 10 11 in consultation with the chairman for the 12 department. 13 So the decision to dismiss the house 14 officer from the program, not employment, I know 15 the distinction now, is made by the program 16 director and the chairman of the -- who was the 17 chairman of the department in this case? 18 Α. The chairman of the Department of Medicine is Dr. Javed Butler. 19 20 0. Okay. And he was the chairman back --21 Α. He was not at UMMC in 2017. 22 Who was the chairman in 2017? 0. 23 I don't recall. Α. 24 Q. Okay. Just bear with me a second, I've 25 got to pull up this other document. It's going to

Page 161 1 be Exhibit 17. 2 (Exhibit 17 marked for identification.) 3 Q. And I'm going to direct your attention 4 to what's Bates numbered 433 and 435 so you don't 5 have to review everything in that. 6 Α. I've reviewed it. 7 Q. On Bates number 433, Papin 433, there's 8 a paragraph where the department chairman states, 9 unsatisfactory trainee performance may result in 10 dismissal from the program of the house officer. 11 Again, it reiterates here that this 12 decision will be made by the program director in consultation with the chairman of the department. 13 14 That's in congruence with what we saw on the other 15 policy, correct? 16 Α. It appears to be. 17 The other policy in the House Staff 0. 18 Manual that we were just looking at? 19 Α. It appears to be the same. 20 0. Okay. And then under appeal from 21 departmental chair, house officer may appeal 22 grievable matters by petitioning in writing to the 23 vice chancellor for health affairs within 14 24 calendar days of notice of termination from the 25 program director or chairman, exclusive of UMMC

Page 162 holidays. Who is the vice chancellor of health 1 2 affairs? Do you recall who that would have been? 3 The vice chancellor at UMMC is 4 Dr. LouAnn Woodward. 5 Q. Okay. And she would have been presiding 6 over this as well back in 2017, she would have been in the same position? 7 8 Α. Yes. 9 0. Down a little bit further if you skip the -- it says, the appeals committee chair will 10 11 appoint an appeals committee of four additional 12 GMEC or RRSC members. What is GMEC and RRSC 13 members? What do these acronyms stand for? 14 Α. GME would be the Graduate Medical 15 Education Committee. I'm not familiar with this document so I don't know what the RRSC is. 16 presume it must have been referenced somewhere 17 earlier in this. 18 19 Q. Okay. The appeals committee chair will 20 promptly convene the committee to hear the appeal 21 generally within 10 business days. 22 Are you aware that it took until almost 23 six months later after Dr. Papin's termination for him to receive his appeal hearing before the panel 24 25 that was appointed?

| 1  | A. I'm not familiar with that process.             |
|----|--|
| 2  | Q. You've never had involvement in any of          |
| 3  | the other termination decisions that like with     |
| 4  | respect to Resident 76, how long it took for him   |
| 5  | to have his appeal hearing?                        |
| 6  | A. I am not familiar. As I indicated               |
| 7  | earlier, all of these things are done in segments. |
| 8  | And with regard to Resident 76, my involvement     |
| 9  | ended after those initial investigations. I am     |
| 10 | not sure what other areas were involved that       |
| 11 | ultimately led to that termination.                |
| 12 | Q. Are you aware of whether Dr. Papin did          |
| 13 | receive his appeal within 10 business days?        |
| 14 | A. I'm not. I'm not familiar with that             |
| 15 | process.   |
| 16 | Q. Were you present at Dr. Papin's appeal          |
| 17 | hearing at all?                                    |
| 18 | A. I was only present with Dr. Papin twice;        |
| 19 | when I interviewed him and again when I met with   |
| 20 | Dr. Earl for the termination. I had no other       |
| 21 | involvement.                                       |
| 22 | Q. Okay. All right. Okay, Exhibit 18.              |
| 23 | (Exhibit 18 marked for identification.)            |
| 24 | A. I've reviewed it.                               |
| 25 | Q. Okay. Are you familiar with this                |
|    |  |

Page 164 1 document? 2 Α. I am not. 3 0. Do you see it's -- states Policy 4 Sanctions for Plan Violations. At the top there's 5 employee action, there's another column on the 6 other side that says disciplinary action? Α. Yes. 8 So it states for employees who willfully Q. 9 provide materially false information or to UMMC, a 10 government, patient, insurer, or the like 11 disciplinary action shall be termination of 12 employment. Do you see that part? 13 Yes. Α. 14 Then if you go down it's got a Ο. Okav. 15 couple of other things after that. And then there 16 are some lines. And then there's employee 17 willfully viewing protected health information, 18 we're going to go past that then, down to the next 19 one. 20 Employees negligently providing incorrect information to UMMC, government agency, 21 22 patient, or insurance -- insurer or the like. 23 So it states here that disciplinary action shall range from counseling up to and 24 including termination. Egregious situations may 25

Page 165 1 result in suspension pending a termination. 2 Now, given the fact that there's 3 obviously a distinction here, do you see the 4 distinction I'm making between an employee 5 willfully providing materially false information 6 to UMMC and an employee negligently providing 7 incorrect information to UMMC. The distinction between willful and negligent, do you see that 8 9 there? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Did you conduct any investigation when 12 you were trying to approve or recommend 13 termination for Dr. Papin regarding whether 14 Dr. Papin willfully or negligently was just 15 providing incorrect information to UMMC? 16 I'm going to interpose MR. WHITFIELD: 17 an objection once again. She's not a 18 30(b)(6) witness and this is on the 19 compliance plan policies. 20 0. (By Mr. Schmitz) You can answer. 21 Α. That was what I was going to say. 22 is totally involving any kind of sanctions for 23 compliance plan violations, not the totality of 24 the HR employee violations that would be contained in the faculty staff handbook. 25

Page 166 1 Well, I see the distinction that you're Q. 2 making there but this just states if an employee 3 willfully provides materially false information to 4 UMMC then this document here states, this policy 5 document per UMMC, states that if you willfully do 6 that you will be fired; is that correct? 7 Α. In violation of the compliance plan. 8 0. But that's not what this says. 9 says right here, employee action willfully providing materially false information to UMMC. 10 11 If an employee is found to have willfully done 12 that you will be fired, correct? 13 It is the policy of UMMC to provide for 14 disciplinary actions to be taken against UMMC 15 employees who violate the provisions of the 16 compliance plan. That is what this document 17 pertains to. 18 0. Well, in terms of compliance Okay. 19 then, compliance with medical care provided to 20 patients, if a resident -- let's put this in the situation of this case, if a resident is willfully 21 22 providing materially false information to UMMC 23 regarding a patient, would that be a violation of the compliance plan? 24 25 If it's contained in this document it Α.

Page 167 1 would be. 2 0. Okay. So, again, my question is, was 3 there an investigation by you regarding whether 4 Dr. Papin willfully or negligently presented false 5 information to UMMC? 6 MR. WHITFIELD: I want to interpose my 7 same objection that this is part of the 8 compliance plan not the faculty and staff and 9 she is not a 30(b)(6) witness on the 10 compliance plan. She can answer whatever she 11 thinks, but I want my objection noted. 12 MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah. I'm not asking her 13 about the policies itself or whatever. 14 simply asking her, did she as the HR 15 professional who recommended termination in 16 this case, did she ever conduct an 17 investigation into whether Dr. Papin 18 willfully or negligently provided information 19 to UMMC? 20 THE WITNESS: No. 21 (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. Q. Previously we 22 discussed a meeting that you had with Dr. Earl where Dr. Earl was "adamant" about the fact that Dr. Papin 23 24 was not trustworthy and that he was a danger to 25 patients and he did not trust him to care for the

Page 168 1 patients at UMMC anymore. Do you recall that? 2 Α. Yes. 3 Q. Part of Dr. Earl's statements that we 4 just talked about, part of his arguments that 5 Dr. Papin was a danger to patients was because of his care of a patient who had an ulcer on his back 6 7 that Dr. Earl had felt Dr. Papin was not being 8 truthful about; is that correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 **Q**. Is it possible that a resident, a first 11 year resident may have misdiagnosed something on 12 the back of a patient, an ulcer, the severity or 13 grading of an ulcer and that could have just been 14 a learning experience to Dr. Papin instead of intentionally concealing that by Dr. Papin? 15 16 I don't know. Dr. Papin had graduated 17 from medical school. There are people who 18 graduate from medical school and go out into 19 practice, so I'm not familiar with the totality of 20 what he would have learned or retained prior to 21 coming to UMMC. 22 Was there any investigation into doing, Q. you know, well, hey, this is something that a lot 23 24 of people -- did you ever -- well, let me ask you 25 this.

Page 169 1 Did you ever do any investigation 2 regarding whether the grading of -- or did you ask 3 anybody whether the grading of the severity of an 4 ulcer was something that a first year resident 5 should and ought to know, or whether that's 6 something that could be mistaken by someone who 7 just had a lack of knowledge rather than someone 8 who was lying about seeing a patient? 9 Α. No. 10 Q. Are you aware if anybody else -- if 11 anybody else did any investigation into the decubitus ulcer patient that was referenced by 12 Dr. Earl to identify whether this was an instance 13 14 of intentional concealment or negligence? 15 Α. No. 16 And, again, there was no ICare report Q. 17 filled out regarding this? 18 Α. Not that I am aware. 19 If there would have been an ICare 0. 20 investigation or typically an ICare investigation 21 involving a patient in patient harm or care, would 22 there be an investigation into whether a doctor or 23 resident intentionally harming a patient was 24 intentionally harming a patient or just 25 negligently harming a patient? Would that be

Page 170 1 something that would be looked into during the 2 ICare investigation process? 3 I don't know, it's not a part of HR. Α. 4 Ο. Is it your understanding that 5 intentionally misrepresenting something to UMMC 6 and negligently misrepresenting something to UMMC 7 carries a different disciplinary penalty at UMMC, 8 or would you weigh those two things differently 9 from an HR perspective at -- from UMMC? 10 The only place where I see that is Α. 11 delineated is in comparison to the compliance 12 plan. 13 Q. Okay. But just would you consider 14 something that was intentional versus something 15 that was negligent, is the negligent would be a 16 less egregious offense by somebody rather than somebody intentionally just, you know, I'm lying 17 18 about seeing a patient versus I just didn't know 19 what I was looking at? 20 Α. I would presume it would depend on the 21 outcome of that action, because if there were a patient harm I don't think it would matter whether 22 23 or not it was willful or negligent if there were a detrimental outcome. 24 25 Q. Have you ever been part of any other

| 1  | Page 171 cases where any residents have committed medical |
|----|---|
| 2  | malpractice?  |
| 3  | A. I have not.  |
| 4  | Q. Have you heard of residents at UMMC                    |
| 5  | committing medical malpractice?                           |
| 6  | A. I can not say specifically.                            |
| 7  | Q. But it does happen from time to time,                  |
| 8  | correct?  |
| 9  | A. I presume it does, yes.                                |
| 10 | Q. Okay. Who would handle that if a claim                 |
| 11 | of medical malpractice would that just go to              |
| 12 | legal?  |
| 13 | A. There is a medical staff office there.                 |
| 14 | UMMC is quite compartmentalized and so there is a         |
| 15 | medical staff office that I presume would handle          |
| 16 | that in conjunction with the legal department.            |
| 17 | Q. Are you aware of any other residents not               |
| 18 | just in any department, in any other                      |
| 19 | departments during your tenure at UMMC being              |
| 20 | labeled as a danger to patients?                          |
| 21 | A. I'm not sure.  |
| 22 | Q. Have you encountered any others?                       |
| 23 | A. I have not been involved in any cases.                 |
| 24 | Q. Okay. Except this one?                                 |
| 25 | A. Yes.   |
|    |   |

| 1  | Q. Okay. Exhibit 19.                               |
|----|--|
| 2  | (Exhibit 19 marked for identification.)            |
| 3  | A. I'm ready.                                      |
| 4  | Q. Okay. I'm going to just skip down to            |
| 5  | the part, this is a House Officer Contract between |
| 6  | UMMC and Joseph Papin; is that correct?            |
| 7  | A. Yes.  |
| 8  | Q. And these types of contracts are                |
| 9  | provided to all different residents, all the       |
| 10 | residents, correct? They all sign something like   |
| 11 | this?  |
| 12 | A. Yes.  |
| 13 | Q. Okay. And in Roman Numeral II it says           |
| 14 | that UMMC agrees further that number 1, it will    |
| 15 | provide an educational program for post graduate   |
| 16 | training in keeping with established standards.    |
| 17 | The established standards such standards, would    |
| 18 | that include the House Staff Manual?               |
| 19 | A. I'm not familiar with what those would          |
| 20 | be.  |
| 21 | Q. Well, do you have any idea what those           |
| 22 | would be or you have no idea what standards would  |
| 23 | govern the employment of residents?                |
| 24 | A. I do not.                                       |
| 25 | Q. Well, can you tell me what standards you        |
|    |  |

Page 173 1 do know that apply to employees and residents of 2 UMMC? 3 Α. From an employee standpoint it would be 4 what is contained in the faculty staff handbook. 5 But all programs have their own contracts that would go through the legal office and then they 6 7 may have other documents that guide those programs 8 based on their standards or certifications that 9 would not be amenable to HR per se. 10 0. Okay. And so you would have no idea 11 what the ACGME standards and stuff like that would 12 be the standards that they're talking about 13 here --14 A. I would not. 15 Q. -- post graduate training? 16 I would not. Α. 17 Q. It does specifically reference the UMMC 18 house staff manual here, so are you aware that that would apply to the residents? 19 20 Α. I presume so, but I'm not familiar with 21 that. 22 Number two states that it will Okay. 23 administer -- that UMMC will administer physicians 24 training program in accordance with the policies, rules, and regulations of the Board of Trustees of 25

> Page 174 1 Institutions of Higher Learning and the University 2 of Mississippi. 3 What is the Board of Trustees and 4 Institutions of Higher Learning? 5 Α. It is an entity that quides all of the 6 public institutions in the state of Mississippi. 7 Okay. Would that be for like Ο. 8 accreditation standpoint? 9 It would be for accreditation, all of 10 your practices, everything that is embodied in any 11 public institution is the -- IHL is the oversight 12 body for that. 13 Q. Okay. Number 4, it states, physician 14 shall not be required to perform duties other than 15 those related to the residency program. 16 recall in your investigation that there was an 17 incident with a nurse practitioner and Dr. Papin 18 in this case whereby the nurse practitioner was 19 asking Dr. Papin to do something that he felt was 20 outside the scope of the residency program? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. Okay. And so here do you see that that 23 fact was held against Dr. Papin but yet in this 24 contract which UMMC agreed that Dr. Papin would 25 not have to perform other duties that were not

```
Page 175
 1
     related to his residency program; is that correct?
 2
          Α.
               Yes.
 3
          Q.
               Looking at page 2 of the contract, Roman
 4
     Numeral IV says, both parties further agree that,
 5
     do you see where I'm talking about?
 6
          Α.
               Yes.
 7
          0.
               Okay.
                     States, that in accordance with
     the Mississippi Constitution UMMC is empowered to
 8
 9
     terminate this contract at any time for
10
     malfeasance, inefficiency, or contumacious conduct
     by the physician. Do you have an idea sitting
11
12
     here today what they mean by malfeasance,
     inefficiency, or contumacious conduct by a
13
14
     physician?
15
               MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form again
16
          because she's not our 30(b)(6) witness and
17
          you're asking for legal conclusions as to the
18
          meaning of this contract language.
19
               THE WITNESS:
                             I do not.
20
               (By Mr. Schmitz) So not knowing what
          Q.
21
     these three things malfeasance, inefficiency, and
22
     contumacious conduct mean, yet you still were able
23
     to recommend the termination of Dr. Papin's contract
24
     with UMMC and his employment with UMMC not knowing
25
     what these three things encompass or embody?
```

Page 176 1 The recommendation for his termination Α. 2 was based on the documentation that was provided 3 by the department. 4 0. All right. But to terminate his 5 employment, his contract, which would mean his 6 employment, you would need to find malfeasance, 7 inefficiency, or contumacious conduct by the physician. And you just testified that you were 8 9 unaware what these terms meant? 10 MR. WHITFIELD: I'm going to object to 11 the form of the question, and it required her to make a legal conclusion as to the way you 12 13 worded the question. 14 (By Mr. Schmitz) You can answer if you 15 can. 16 I'm not aware of the legal 17 interpretation of those. The recommendation that 18 I made was from an HR standpoint based on 19 documentation that the department provided and it 20 was in keeping with those things that Dr. Papin 21 violated in accordance with the faculty and staff 22 handbook. 23 0. So you weren't taking into consideration 24 this House Officer Contract when making your 25 decision to recommend his termination, is that

| 1  | correct? Page 177                                  |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. Not at all.                                     |
| 3  | Q. Okay. Fair enough. Now, this one we're          |
| 4  | going to jump this is the the transcript           |
| 5  | from your meeting, Exhibit 20, with Dr. Papin. So  |
| 6  | we're going to jump around here. I don't want you  |
| 7  | to review the whole thing, but I'll tell you which |
| 8  | page we're going to go to and then we'll once      |
| 9  | you review the page then we can both be on the     |
| 10 | same page, all right?                              |
| 11 | (Exhibit 20 marked for identification.)            |
| 12 | MR. WHITFIELD: First page.                         |
| 13 | MR. SCHMITZ: First page is first                   |
| 14 | let's go to page 3 of the transcript, Tommy,       |
| 15 | not the PDF page but actual page 3. It's           |
| 16 | broken down in blocks of four.                     |
| 17 | MR. WHITFIELD: I forgot this one was in            |
| 18 | the four page version.                             |
| 19 | MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah, I prefer that                   |
| 20 | anyway.  |
| 21 | MR. WHITFIELD: I don't. I like the                 |
| 22 | full page.   |
| 23 | MR. SCHMITZ: I know.                               |
| 24 | MR. WHITFIELD: All right. You said                 |
| 25 | page 3 of the actual transcript?                   |
|    |  |

```
Page 178
 1
                              Yeah, just page 3, yes.
               MR. SCHMITZ:
          So, you know, on the first page, the first
 3
          four. It starts --
 4
               MR. WHITFIELD: We got it.
 5
               MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah, the first word is
 6
          since July 1.
 7
               THE WITNESS: Yes, I see it.
 8
          Q.
                (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. Go ahead and take
 9
     a look at that. And just really quick, this
10
     interview took place, again, on January 27?
11
          Α.
               Yes.
12
          0.
               And you confirmed Dr. Papin's
13
     termination with Dr. Earl on February -- I believe
14
     it was the 20th, it was two days before the
15
     deadline?
16
          Α.
               Yes.
17
          0.
               Okay. Just let me know whenever you're
18
     ready.
19
          Α.
               I'm readv.
20
               So this is you were talking to Dr. Papin
21
     here about a run-in with one of the nurse
22
     practitioners; is that correct?
23
          Α.
               Yes.
24
               This is the incident we talked about
          Ο.
25
     where that became a heated exchange?
```

Page 179 1 Α. Yes. 2 0. Okay. So Dr. Papin explained to you 3 that he had been told by the attending physician 4 that he could go down to the operating room; is 5 that correct? 6 Α. Yes. 7 0. And in response to him trying to do that 8 a nurse practitioner got aggressive with him; is 9 that correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Okay. And on page 4 Dr. Papin informed 12 you that he had told the chief resident about the 13 incident that day and they told Dr. Earl that day, 14 and then the nurse practitioner came and spoke to 15 him the next day and apologized; is that correct? 16 Α. That was Dr. Papin's statement, yes. 17 0. Okay. Did you -- and I believe you 18 testified earlier, you never went and spoke to 19 this nurse who he had the incident with? 20 Α. I did not. 21 Q. And HR typically does investigate and 22 conduct interviews in instances where a potential 23 violence or work place bullying is taking place? 24 Α. When things are reported. But, again, this was an incident that had occurred six months 25

Page 180 1 prior. 2 Okay. Can you go to page 10 for me. 3 This is -- you're still discussing the incident with the run-in with the nurse here. If you look 4 5 on line 12 you ask Dr. Papin, so was there anyone 6 who witnessed that exchange? 7 Α. Yes, I see that. 8 0. And then he said, yes, Marita 9 Walton was in there. And you said, who is that. 10 And he said, she's another nurse practitioner. 11 Did you ever reach out to Marita Walton to get her 12 side of the story of what happened during that --13 for that heated exchange? 14 I did not. Again, this had occurred six 15 months prior to the conversation with Dr. Papin. 16 But this is part of the totality of Q. 17 circumstances as you call them, which were used to 18 justify and which you used to recommend the 19 termination of Dr. Papin's employment, correct? I 20 know it's not the whole reason but it's part of 21 the reason why Dr. Papin was terminated, correct? 22 Α. Yes. 23 0. Okay. And yet there was no talking to 24 any of the witnesses or to the nurses by you 25 whatsoever?

Page 181 1 Α. No. 2 What did you do to prepare for this Q. 3 interview with Dr. Papin on the 27th? 4 Α. I reviewed the documentation that had 5 been provided by the department? 6 Q. And that's all the things that Okay. 7 you mentioned previously today? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. Did you prepare a question outline for 10 this interview with Dr. Papin, did you do any 11 other preparations like that? 12 Α. Typically I would prepare questions for 13 myself to prompt to ask questions, and I would 14 always ask the person that I was interviewing to 15 just share information. I would let them know why they were being interviewed and then I would just 16 17 allow them to talk, and as they talked I would ask 18 questions. And then whatever notes I had already written regarding the documentation that I had 19 20 already reviewed, there would be little triggers 21 for me to ask questions as well. There is no 22 template for doing these investigations. 23 Q. Okay. So you did have some questions 24 already or talking points at least mapped out 25 prior to the start of the interview?

Page 182 1 Α. Yes. 2 Did you provide those questions or that 0. 3 outline or notes that you had prepared to Tommy so 4 that he could produce those to us? 5 Α. I typically destroy those after No. I've done the interview because all of the 6 7 interviews are recorded and everything that is 8 discussed is on the recording. 9 Q. Okay. 10 Α. I never do an interview with the 11 perception that it is going to lead to some legal 12 proceeding. 13 0. So in all the interviews that you do 14 they're transcribed like this? 15 They're recorded, they're only 16 transcribed if there is some kind of outside 17 action beyond UMMC. 18 Q. Okay, that makes sense. I'm going to go 19 to page 12, line 7 on page 12 you start asking him 20 about an instance supposedly where a code was 21 called and it was your patient but you didn't come 22 to check on him? 23 Yes, I see that. A. 24 0. Where did you hear about this, like who 25 told you that?

| 1  | Page 183 A. Everything that Dr. Papin was questioned |
|----|--|
| 2  | about was included in the documentation that I had   |
| 3  | reviewed prior to interviewing him.                  |
| 4  | Q. Okay. And you stated earlier that                 |
| 5  | Dr. Papin basically admitted to all this stuff so    |
| 6  | there was no reason to do a follow-up                |
| 7  | investigation; is that correct?                      |
| 8  | A. A follow-up investigation with him?               |
| 9  | Q. A follow-up investigation with anybody?           |
| 10 | A. I felt that the documentation was                 |
| 11 | conclusive.  |
| 12 | Q. You also said that the documentation was          |
| 13 | conclusive, as well as during your interview with    |
| 14 | Dr. Papin that Dr. Papin had admitted to almost      |
| 15 | everything so there was no real reason to question   |
| 16 | the validity of the documentation that you had       |
| 17 | received?  |
| 18 | A. Yes.  |
| 19 | Q. Okay. But Dr. Papin didn't admit that             |
| 20 | he had caused a problem with this nurse              |
| 21 | practitioner did he?                                 |
| 22 | A. Dr. Papin did not feel that his actions           |
| 23 | were accurately perceived.                           |
| 24 | Q. Okay. And with respect to the code, the           |
| 25 | patient being coded, Dr. Papin also had an           |
|    |  |

> Page 184 1 explanation for that as to why he didn't come 2 back, correct? 3 Α. Yes. 4 Q. And he had told you that basically he 5 was already too far gone already in the car before 6 he had known about the code? 7 No, he said he heard the code but he had Α. 8 already signed out and it did not occur to him --9 because there were other patients on that floor --10 0. Right. 11 -- it did not occur to him that that may 12 have been his patient but he did not check because 13 he had already signed out. 14 Right. And like you testified earlier Q. 15 before, they don't call out patient, the name over 16 the loud speaker and say that patient is coding 17 right now, they just say patient on the third 18 floor there is a Code Blue, right? 19 Α. Correct. 20 0. Okay. It wasn't until he was already 21 gone and in the car when he learned that it was 22 actually his patient, correct? 23 Α. That's what he said, yes. 24 At the bottom of page 13 you mentioned, 0. line 21, that there's a perception that he was 25

25

please --

Page 185 1 always in a hurry to leave. And so you asked him 2 what his typical day was like. And then on page 14 Dr. Papin explains that -- his day and what 3 4 that is like. And then he states that he was 5 never in a hurry to leave and that this was actually the first he had ever heard of that, on 6 7 line 13 and 14. 8 And then you followed up on line 15 of 9 page 14 stating that, so no one has ever told you 10 or said anything to you about that. And he 11 stated, no, ma'am. 12 And so, again, this is another instance where Dr. Papin is denying the fact that anyone 13 14 has ever told him that he was in a hurry to leave; 15 is that correct? 16 Α. That's what he said, yes. 17 Q. Did you ever conduct any investigations to follow up on those facts about Dr. Papin being 18 19 in a hurry to leave? 20 Α. Other than the review of the 21 documentation that had been provided, no. 22 All right. So at the bottom of page 15, 0. 23 line 25, you start -- you're asking him a 24 question, you say -- and if I'm going to too fast

Page 186 1 Α. No, I see it. 2 Okay. You say, so tell me about you Q. 3 leaving during your regular workday to tell people 4 you are going to exercise, right? And he says, right, right. And then he said, one time I asked 5 6 the chief resident. He said, it was a really slow 7 dav. And she said that -- you said, do you think it's okay. And she said, yes, just bring your 8 9 pager, you'll be fine to go. So he went for 15 10 minutes, came back, didn't miss anything. And he said that Dr. Earl did bring that up multiple 11 12 times. 13 Are you aware or did you conduct any 14 investigation into whether Dr. Papin had asked for 15 permission to go for a quick run on campus --16 Α. No. 17 Q. -- or whether that permission was 18 granted? 19 Α. No. 20 Did you conduct any investigation into 0. 21 whether that permission was later denied by that 22 same chief resident about a week later when 23 Dr. Papin posed the same question? 24 Α. I did not. 25 Q. Dr. Papin on line 20 of page 16 said,

Page 187 1 but I had permission and I had a written 2 conversation here, which if you would like to see 3 it I can bring it out. Did you ever obtain that 4 written conversation from Dr. Papin so that you could review it for your own eyes? 5 6 Α. I did not. 7 Ο. On page 17, line 4 you bring up the 8 incident with the ulcer patient. And you say, 9 there were patients that are supposed to be 10 checked and you had indicated you had seen the patient but this patient had a stage 4 decubitus 11 12 wound and you never mentioned that. Do you recall 13 that situation? 14 Α. I see it. 15 On line 17 on page 17 you state, well, 16 the version we got was after someone else 17 discovered the wound. Then you said, oh, yeah, 18 that patient does have a wound. But the premise 19 being if it -- the premise is that with it being 20 stage 4 you should have seen it. That would have 21 not occurred over a period of a day or two, that's 22 something that would have occurred over a long 23 time. Who told you that that would have occurred 24 over a long time? Where are you getting this information regarding how stage 4 decubitus ulcer 25

Page 188 1 wounds go one way or the other? 2 I have done immanent research on what 3 those were because I needed to be familiar with 4 what decubitus was. 5 Ο. Okay. So prior to the interview you looked up on Google or something what a decubitus 6 ulcer was and how they act? 7 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. Okay. Previously you testified that you 10 had not reviewed any of the patient records from this decubitus ulcer patient; is that correct? 11 12 Α. That's correct. 13 Q. So when making this statement you would 14 have not been aware that many other -- there were 15 several other providers including the wound care 16 nurse and other people who were in fact aware that there was a wound on this patient's back for quite 17 18 a long time? 19 Α. That's correct. But from the 20 information that Dr. Earl provided it was more so 21 that Dr. Papin was supposed to be checking those 22 patients and it appeared that he had not done what 23 he should have done in regard to seeing that 24 patient. 25 Q. Okay. But would that be an instance

> Page 189 1 where he was a first year resident and he was 2 trying to learn, this was a learning experience 3 for Dr. Papin, correct? I presume after that four years of 4 Α. 5 medical school he would have had some knowledge of 6 what a decubitus wound was and how it occurred. 7 But you don't -- you don't have -- of 8 course you don't have any medical background to 9 make that kind determination do you? 10 Α. No, but I was relying on the information 11 that the program director had provided. 12 Q. Do you know if Dr. Earl had reviewed 13 this patient's records or seen this patient? 14 The information about the incident with 15 the patient's wound was included in the 16 information that Dr. Earl provided. I can not say 17 that he actually reviewed that patient's case. 18 Q. So on page 18, line 7 Dr. Papin 19 responded to your question stating, I mean, I think it was more of a gap of knowledge more than, 20 21 you know, it didn't look like floridly terrible or 22 anything like that because if the patient that I'm 23 talking about, the wound ostomy, this is the day I 24 went -- this is the day before I went on Christmas 25 vacation. And the wound ostomy nurse printed a

Page 190 1 note that day and I had seen it but didn't 2 think -- but then you stopped him and you stated, 3 but you had not voiced that it was there and 4 supposedly you had been seeing this patient. 5 said, oh, I had been. So we alternate, I'm not 6 the only resident. So, I mean, there was Wilbrook 7 and there were nurse practitioners that alternated 8 every day, so I was not the only person seeing the 9 patient. And, yeah, I seen it and I didn't think 10 it was that bad. So, I mean, it was an issue of knowledge I think maybe. 11 12 So when Dr. Papin explains that I didn't 13 do this intentionally, I just didn't know exactly 14 what I was looking at and that it needed to be 15 reported because there were so many other people 16 also caring for this patient, wouldn't you think 17 that that is a reasonable explanation that should 18 be brought up to rebut what Dr. Earl thought was 19 just blatant lying on the part of Dr. Papin? 20 I thought that if Dr. Papin was caring Α. for the patient and he knew he was supposed to be 21 22 checking the patient, if there was a concern with 23 a break in the skin he would have also reported it to someone. Whether that was willful or 24 25 negligent, he did not do that.

Page 191 1 Q. Okay. But if a resident, a first year 2 trainee resident doesn't know what he's doing or 3 what he's looking at at that point in time, what 4 basis did you have to assume that this was a 5 willful act on his part? 6 Α. I did not say it was willful. I said he 7 did not report it to anyone, and caring for that 8 patient was a part of what his responsibility was. 9 Again, and just based on your knowledge, 10 I know that you're not a medical expert or 11 anything like that, but when a patient is being 12 cared for by a resident, it's not just the 13 resident's responsibility, there's also another --14 there's a whole other team of people who see a 15 patient, which would include nurses, nurse 16 practitioners, and attending physicians; is that 17 correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 So then the responsibility, the lowest 20 man on the totem pole, not even a real -- has no 21 medical license --22 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form. 23 Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) -- the first year resident is responsible for not recognizing this 24 wound on the back, or the severity of the wound on a 25

> Page 192 1 patient's back, not the atten -- in your opinion, it 2 would not be the nurses, it would not be the nurse 3 practitioners, or the doctors problem that they also 4 didn't notice the fact that this patient had a wound 5 on his back? 6 Α. I do not know what the process is or 7 what kind of acclamation the first year residents 8 have, what they are required to do, so I can not 9 respond to that. 10 0. Does that sound fair to you though that 11 a first year resident gets all the blame for 12 something that everybody else on the entire team also missed until it became a stage 4 wound? 13 14 Α. I don't know whether or not there were 15 any other people held blameless, but since we were 16 dealing with Dr. Papin, this pertained to what his 17 responsibility was and what it was felt that he 18 did not carry out as a part of his responsibility. 19 Q. You're not aware sitting here today 20 though that anybody else was put any blame on did-21 or anybody else was disciplined, from HR at least? 22 Were any other doctors, nurse practitioners, 23 nurses, anybody else who saw this person, were 24 they disciplined as the result of their care of 25 this patient?

Page 193 1 Α. There was no -- there was no other information provided to me pertaining to that or 2 3 any other patient. 4 0. Okay. So sitting here today to the best of your knowledge, nobody else received any type 5 6 of discipline for the care of this decubitus ulcer 7 patient that --8 Α. I don't know. 9 Okay. You were not involved in the Ο. discipline of anybody else who cared for this 10 11 patient, correct? 12 Α. That's correct. 13 0. Did you ever reach out to this Wilbrook, 14 the other resident Wilbrook, to ask him if he also 15 checked the back of this patient? 16 Α. I did not. 17 Q. Is there any reason why you didn't reach 18 out to Wilbrook? I did not interview any other persons 19 20 involved with Dr. Papin's case. 21 Why is it that Dr. Papin gets labeled as 22 a danger to patients as a resident while Wilbrook, 23 who also saw this patient, did not get labeled and 24 terminated as a danger to patients? 25 Α. I can not attest to that, that would

Page 194 1 have been Dr. Earl's call. 2 Between January 27 and February 20 when 3 you recommended and approved Dr. Papin's 4 termination you never thought it would be a good idea to reach out to Wilbrook to see if Wilbrook 5 6 needed some type of discipline with respect to 7 this case? 8 I did not. Α. 9 On page 19, line 5, after he got done 10 saying it wasn't that bad you said, well, that's 11 And Dr. Papin on line 6 said, she asked me, she said, oh, yeah, it doesn't look that bad. 12 The 13 wound ostomy nurse dropped in a note. ostomy didn't mention anything about needing any 14 15 sort of surgical intervention. 16 So Dr. Papin did have a conversation with a wound ostomy nurse who did also recognize 17 18 that the wound occurred and she also didn't recommend surgical intervention; is that correct? 19 20 Α. That is stated. And then if you will 21 look further down where Dr. Papin did say 22 eventually what the patient needed, but I don't 23 know what the timeframe was between the time he said he talked with the ostomy nurse. 24 25 And are you aware that the ostomy nurse 0.

Page 195 1 had been recommending conservative topical 2 treatments on this patient's wound for a period of 3 approximately two weeks prior to Dr. Papin being 4 accused of not ever reporting this wound? 5 Α. I am not. 6 Q. Did you ever seek out to talk to the 7 wound ostomy nurse that Dr. Papin is talking about 8 here? 9 Α. I did not. 10 Q. So do you think it would have been a 11 good idea to ask her if you thought that Dr. Papin was actively trying to conceal the fact that this 12 person had a wound on his back that was getting 13 14 worse and worse by the day? 15 I took the word of the leader of the 16 program that all of the concerns that had been 17 brought forth had been confirmed. 18 Q. Okay. Page 21, line 6, you brought up 19 the fact to Dr. Papin, well, there's another 20 concern to indicate that you've gone on rounds 21 when you actually haven't seen a patient? 22 Α. I see that. 23 Q. Okay. And then so Dr. Papin's response says number 9, right, he mentioned that. 24 I'm assuming he said Dr. Earl mentioned that to him. 25

Page 196 1 And I still don't know what he's referring to 2 because I categorically deny ever saying I've seen a patient and not seeing a patient. 3 4 So, again, here -- before -- you stated 5 before that Dr. Papin admitted to basically all of 6 the allegations, so there was no need to go 7 confirm any of this stuff. But, yet, here, again, 8 he's categorically denying that he lied about 9 seeing patients that he hadn't -- that he had 10 seen. 11 So did you ever think here where there's 12 a categorical denial by Dr. 1Papin that, hey, 13 maybe I should go look into this and see if this 14 guy is full of it or not? 15 I took the word of the leader of the 16 program because there was more than one report 17 from various co-workers to support these 18 allegations. 19 0. Didn't you say earlier that the mantra 20 of HR is document, document, document, correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. In this case do you think that you did a 23 sufficient job from your perspective documenting, documenting, documenting these facts as they were 24 25 presented to you or doing any type of

| 1  | investigation regarding these facts?               |
|----|--|
| 2  | A. In reviewing all of the documentation           |
| 3  | that was provided I felt that it was conclusive    |
| 4  | enough to support the recommendation. There was    |
| 5  | no need for me to go back and redo what the        |
| 6  | department had already done.                       |
| 7  | Q. But this is a resident who was up for           |
| 8  | potential termination and who had been discussed   |
| 9  | for termination, I mean, don't you think that it   |
| 10 | would have been prudent and best practices from HR |
| 11 | perspective to have looked into some of these      |
| 12 | things, just at least to peak and check before     |
| 13 | potentially ruining this resident's medical        |
| 14 | career?  |
| 15 | A. I felt that the documentation provided          |
| 16 | was sufficient.                                    |
| 17 | Q. Are you aware of the due process rights         |
| 18 | that residents have with respect to their          |
| 19 | entitlement to participate in residency programs?  |
| 20 | A. I am not.                                       |
| 21 | Q. So those, you know, alleged potential           |
| 22 | due process rights that Dr. Papin would have       |
| 23 | possessed did not factor into your investigation   |
| 24 | or your recommendation to terminate Dr. Papin?     |
| 25 | A. No.   |

```
Page 198
 1
          0.
               My notes were a little bit off.
                                                 I'm
 2
     sorry, let me get organized.
 3
               MR. WHITFIELD: Greg, you want to take
 4
          our five minute hour break?
 5
               MR. SCHMITZ: Yeah, that's fine.
                                                  Yeah.
 6
          I was actually just going to suggest that.
 7
               MR. WHITFIELD: All right.
 8
                (A brief recess was taken.)
 9
          Q.
                (By Mr. Schmitz) Back on the record.
     Page 23 of the transcript here starting at line 17.
10
11
          Α.
               Yes.
12
               So Dr. Papin just told you, I can tell
          0.
13
     you honestly that I do want to improve.
14
     said, so what do you think it would take for them
15
     to regain trust? And you stated question -- or
16
     there's no question about the potential and the
17
     ability and the capacity that you have.
                                               But there
     is a concern that the motivation is not there, the
18
19
     truthfulness is not there.
                                 It's almost like
     this -- like a cavalier type attitude that, well,
20
21
     that's not my patient, or yeah, but then you go
22
     and -- you go, oh yeah, I did that, but then you
     go back and look at the records and find that
23
24
     there's something missing. What do you think
25
     could be done in terms of support for you so that
```

Page 199 1 you could feel sure that this person should be in 2 this program. 3 So you asked Dr. Papin what could be 4 done in terms of support. Do you -- was anything 5 ever done after this interview in terms of trying to support Dr. Papin's success in the program? 6 7 Α. I don't know. 8 Q. You had never seen Dr. Papin in action 9 or anything like that, correct, worked along side 10 him, observed him working with his co-workers? 11 Α. No, I would have no reason to. 12 Q. But yet you classified him as having this cavalier type of attitude but yet you didn't 13 14 have any first-hand knowledge of whether he 15 actually did have that attitude, correct? 16 Α. His attitude was cavalier when I met 17 with him. But what I was talking to him about 18 during the interview was based on the information that had been provided by the department. 19 20 Q. Okay. Page 30, line 22, you're talking 21 about when feedback is given to him. 22 Α. Yes. 23 Q. And you ask him, are you ever given the 24 specifics of which patient it was or which nurse 25 practitioner or what day and when these things

Page 200 1 have occurred? And Dr. Papin replies to you on 2 page 31, line 2 saying, never ever am I ever given 3 And Dr. Earl, and this kind of a cultural 4 thing with surgery, with surgery it's kind of 5 you're told something is more militaristic in that 6 regard. If you're told something that's gospel. 7 You don't question it. You don't say anything. 8 You know, whatever they tell you is what it is. 9 So in stating that, that he was never 10 give specific feedback regarding his interactions 11 with other people or who it was or anything like 12 that, did you ever make an effort to try to give Papin more details on these things so perhaps that 13 14 he could go back and apologize to these people or 15 connect with these people and say, hey, I think 16 we're just -- we're not connecting well and I just 17 wanted to say -- I want to apologize and I'm 18 working on that? Was there any attempt by you to 19 facilitate any kind of discussions like that? 20 Α. That was not my role or responsibility, 21 no. 22 Q. Are you aware of whether Dr. Earl -- did 23 you have any conversations with Dr. Earl after 24 this regarding, hey, can you provide Dr. Papin with the specifics, he's saying that he didn't 25

Page 201 have the specifics on these people that he was 1 2 making angry and he'd like to go back and try to 3 make amends with these folks so he can continue on 4 in this program? 5 Α. I did not. 6 Q. I want to go to the last line of 7 page 34, number 25, line 25 on 34. 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. You're wrapping up the interview and you 10 say, okay, well, as I said, we consider this a 11 fact-finding session. Anytime concerns are 12 brought to us we do talk with the people involved and then what we do is provide a summary and give 13 14 that to whomever has asked us to do an 15 investigation. 16 So you were asked to do an 17 investigation, it was a fact-finding thing, did 18 you talk to any of the people involved with this 19 case? 20 Α. Dr. Papin. 21 Q. Just Dr. Papin, correct? 22 Α. Yes. 23 Q. And you said, and then whatever the 24 ultimate outcome is it's left up to the 25 department, but this is a very confidential thing

Page 202 1 so please keep it confidential and we ask you to 2 do the same. 3 So why did you state that it would 4 ultimately be the department's decision, I thought 5 you were part of the decision as well? 6 Α. I'm not a part of the decision. I may 7 review and support the recommendation, but 8 ultimately HR's role is to give recommendations 9 and advice. But in terms of terminations, 10 everything must be approved by employee relations. 11 But you stated here that whatever 0. Okav. 12 the ultimate outcome is it's left up to the department, that would be a the general surgery 13 14 department, the GME, and all that kind of stuff? 15 Α. Yes, that was my reference. 16 0. Okay. All right. Let's get to the next 17 Almost done. That was the hard part. 18 Α. I've reviewed it. 19 (Exhibit 21 marked for identification.) 20 Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. This is an e-mail 21 between Pam Greenwood and Cecilia Bass, Johnny Gilmore, and Chris Morgan? 22 23 Α. Yes. 24 Regarding Papin and the request for 25 termination. Cecilia is bringing up the fact

Page 203 1 that -- or Pam is bringing up the fact to Cecilia 2 that she's reviewed the documentation and she's 3 noted some concerns. Did she say or share any of 4 these concerns with you? 5 Α. These are similar to the items that she 6 provided on that same date in an e-mail, and that 7 was the basis of Molly Brasfield's response that 8 what she was inquiring about was more from the 9 analysis of a standpoint from academics and not 10 from employee. 11 Q. Don't you think these are normal kind of 12 things that would take place in an HR 13 investigation, correct, whether I quess it's 14 outside of the wheelhouse because there's this 15 distinction between program and HR and this and 16 that, but wouldn't these -- some of these things 17 that she's raising, the fact that there were 18 feedback sessions held -- it is known that 19 feedback sessions were held with Dr. Papin in 20 regards to unsatisfactory performance but did not 21 see any supporting documentation of the meetings 22 held to discuss the employee's performance 23 deficiency other than the letter issued to him by 24 the program director, Dr. Earl. 25 Wouldn't the fact that there was a lack

| 1  | Page 204 of documentation regarding prior meetings other |
|----|--|
| 2  | than the one that you've been referencing all day,       |
| 3  | wouldn't that be something that is concerning to         |
| 4  | you from an HR perspective, lack of documentation,       |
| 5  | document, document?                                      |
| 6  | A. Document, document, document is what HR               |
| 7  | does and it is what we recommend, but there are          |
| 8  | often times when the departments will seek to do         |
| 9  | verbal meetings. They will say, well, I met with         |
| 10 | Dr. Papin, I talked to him about this.                   |
| 11 | And keep in mind that HR is getting all                  |
| 12 | of this information after the fact, so we would          |
| 13 | not ever tell anyone to go and recreate something        |
| 14 | after it has occurred if they can not                    |
| 15 | specifically, accurately, and factually record           |
| 16 | everything that has occurred from a previous             |
| 17 | encounter.   |
| 18 | MR. SCHMITZ: Can you hold on, my wife                    |
| 19 | just got something with my daughter? I'll be             |
| 20 | right back.  |
| 21 | MR. WHITFIELD: All right.                                |
| 22 | (A brief recess was taken.)                              |
| 23 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) All right. So back                   |
| 24 | to we're on Exhibit 21. Bullet point number 2,           |
| 25 | the academic remediation protocol checklist is           |
|    | •  |

Page 205 1 incomplete and is not signed by the resident or the 2 program director. 3 Did this cause any concern with respect to 4 your decision making process determining Dr. Papin? 5 It did not. Again, these were some of Α. the similar concerns that she sent in an e-mail to 6 7 me on that same day and those were all determined to be in the academic vein rather than the 8 9 employee vein. 10 0. The fact that the next bullet point is 11 raises the issue that nothing is indicated 12 anywhere in the documentation, what measures were 13 taken to address Dr. Papin's performance issues 14 and concerns, you hadn't seen anything that would 15 warrant -- that wouldn't warrant you to do 16 anything further with respect to that? 17 Α. No, because, again, that has to do with 18 the academic component as a house officer under 19 the auspices of the GME. 20 If you're going to fire somebody from a 21 HR perspective, doesn't the fact that somebody, 22 you know, if they have some type of performance 23 issues, what type of remedial measures were taken 24 or conferences they would have or counseling they 25 were given, that's HR too, right? You know,

| 1  | Page 206 that's not just GME, that would blur, right, into |
|----|--|
| 2  | what you do, right?  |
| 3  | A. From an HR standpoint it would be those                 |
| 4  | things that were not in compliance with what is            |
| 5  | included in the faculty staff handbook. The                |
| 6  | analysis trainee comments document is specifically         |
| 7  | referring to some component of his training                |
| 8  | educationally, not anything in comparison to the           |
| 9  | employee aspect of his status.                             |
| 10 | Q. Right. But the employee aspect of his                   |
| 11 | status would encompass behavioral problems,                |
| 12 | correct?   |
| 13 | A. But the issues that Ms. Greenwood raised                |
| 14 | would more be in line with the academic component.         |
| 15 | Q. So bullet point number 4, would this                    |
| 16 | also be an academic component, disruptive behavior         |
| 17 | almost escalating into a physical fight, how was           |
| 18 | this behavior addressed? That seems like an HR             |
| 19 | thing, right?  |
| 20 | A. It is, and it was included in the report                |
| 21 | from Dr. Earl where he said he had spoken with             |
| 22 | them. And, again, that was from six months prior.          |
| 23 | Q. Okay. All right. Now, the next I                        |
| 24 | only have it in two separate pages, but it's all           |
| 25 | going to be one page consisting of Exhibit 22.             |

```
Page 207
 1
                (Exhibit 22 marked for identification.)
 2
               MR. WHITFIELD: Is it two separate down
          loads or is it one?
 3
 4
               MR. SCHMITZ: Yes, it's going to be --
 5
          they're both Exhibit 22 just different pages.
 6
          For whatever reason I have them in like --
 7
               MR. WHITFIELD: Why did they switch to
 8
          jpegs instead of PDF?
 9
               MR. SCHMITZ: I don't know. I'm not a
10
          computer quy.
11
               MR. WHITFIELD: Well, I gave them to you
12
          in PDF.
                   What did y'all do?
13
               MR. SCHMITZ: Somehow they got turned
14
          into a jpeg so we're going to roll with it.
15
               MR. WHITFIELD: All right. I think I
16
          got them up where we can read them.
17
               THE WITNESS: I see them.
18
          Q.
               (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. Is this a
19
     document that you've been talking about for most of
20
     the day that both Dr. Papin and Dr. Earl had signed
21
     whereby Dr. Papin had signed off on the fact that he
22
     had done a lot of these things?
23
          Α.
               Yes.
24
          0.
               Okay. The document -- this is
25
     essentially what you would call in the HR world a
```

```
Page 208
 1
     performance improvement plan; is that correct?
 2
          Α.
                No, it is not.
 3
          Ο.
                What is it?
 4
          Α.
                I perceived it as a document outlining
 5
     the concerns that were brought forth to this
 6
     particular employee.
 7
                And this also outlines that he had 60 --
          Q.
 8
     or he was supposed to have 60 days to improve on
 9
     these things that are outlined in this document?
10
          Α.
                It does.
11
          Q.
                Isn't that what a performance
     improvement plan does, it gives a set time period
12
13
     of things --
14
          Α.
               A performance --
15
          0.
               -- improve on and then --
16
               A performance improvement plan outlines
          Α.
17
     what the concerns are, then it divides -- it
     devises what the process is for improvement with a
18
19
     timeline.
20
               Isn't that exactly what this document
          0.
21
     does?
22
          Α.
               It's similar to that, yes.
23
               Okay. So on January 10 Dr. Earl sat
          Q.
     down with Joe and said that many of these
24
25
     issues -- the concerns raised regarding your
```

Page 209 1 performance, many of these issues relate to 2 professionalism and system based practice issues 3 and raised concerns for patient safety. 4 Just paraphrasing says, these 5 concerns -- these include concerns with lying and 6 being untruthful about patient care. And as we 7 discussed during your interview with Dr. Papin on 8 the 27th he denied that he was lying about patient 9 care, correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Leaving the hospital during duty hours 12 to exercise, dereliction of duty. Now, during your interview with Dr. Papin, Dr. Papin testified 13 14 that he -- that he had permission when he left the one time to go, from the chief resident, to go 15 exercise for 15 minutes; isn't that correct? 16 17 Α. He did say that, yes. 18 Ο. Unwillingness to help with tasks. 19 did explain that he had received instructions from an attending physician that he could go to the OR 20 21 if he wanted to observe instead of helping out 22 with other sort of more menial tasks --23 MR. WHITFIELD: Object to the form. 24 MR. SCHMITZ: You can answer. 25 MR. WHITFIELD: Misstating the prior

|   | 1  | Page 210 testimony, but go ahead.                    |
|---|----|--|
|   | 2  | THE WITNESS: There were several                      |
|   | 3  | incidents, and I would have to go back and           |
|   | 4  | review them specifically, but there were             |
|   | 5  | other incidents where a nurse practitioner in        |
|   | 6  | particular had attempted to show him how to          |
|   | 7  | do something and I think his response was I'm        |
|   | 8  | a surgeon. So it was not just one incident           |
| i | 9  | of unwillingness to help with tasks.                 |
|   | 10 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) Okay. So on Tuesday, on          |
|   | 11 | the Tuesday, December 20, we met with Renee Greene   |
|   | 12 | present and discussed these issues. This is in       |
|   | 13 | addition to some other means including               |
|   | 14 | MR. WHITFIELD: Greg, we can't hardly                 |
|   | 15 | hear you.  |
|   | 16 | MR. SCHMITZ: Oh, I'm sorry.                          |
|   | 17 | Q. (By Mr. Schmitz) It says on Tuesday,              |
|   | 18 | December 20, we met with Renee Greene present to     |
|   | 19 | discuss these issues. This is in addition to         |
|   | 20 | several other meetings including but not limited to  |
|   | 21 | your semi-annual review, feedback from senior        |
|   | 22 | residents, and a meeting in late November between    |
|   | 23 | you and I outside of OR16. You were told             |
|   | 24 | significant improvement was needed in these areas in |
|   | 25 | the near future or we would have to implement formal |
|   |    |  |

Page 211 1 remediation. Based on the feedback received, see 2 document attached, after our December 20 meeting it 3 is evident that no improvement has been made, and 4 most concerning we have serious issues with 5 truthfulness. Therefore, we discussed, you are now 6 in formal remediation and you have 60 days from 7 today to show significant improvement. Significant 8 improvement means zero confirmed suspicious reports 9 of lying, zero episodes of dereliction of duty, 10 improvement in evaluations of core competencies, I 11 don't know what those abbreviations mean, SBP, PBLI 12 and PROF. And then number four states, zero reports 13 of unwillingness to complete a task unless patient 14 safety issues are raised. 15 Are you aware of whether Dr. Papin was 16 ever given any chance to improve on any of these 17 areas? 18 Α. I am not, because on that same date 19 Dr. Earl placed him on paid administrative leave 20 and he did not return to campus following this 21 date. 22 Q. Okay. There's some additional 23 requirements it states. Number one would be 24 development and submission of a personal study and 25 action plan by January 17, 2017. Are you aware of

| 1  | Page 212 whether Dr. Papin submitted that plan as required |
|----|--|
| 2  | by January 17?   |
| 3  | A. I am not.   |
| 4  | Q. Was that ever provided to you in the                    |
| 5  | documentation that Dr. Earl had?                           |
| 6  | A. It was not.   |
| 7  | Q. Additional resources if desired, meet                   |
| 8  |  |
| 9  | with the Senior Associate Dean for the GME. Who            |
|    | was the Senior Associate Dean for the GME at that          |
| 10 | time?  |
| 11 | A. I'm not familiar with that title. There                 |
| 12 | is a person now who is a Vice Dean for the medical         |
| 13 | school, and I can only presume that is who he was          |
| 14 | referring to.  |
| 15 | Q. Who would that have been?                               |
| 16 | A. Her name is Dr. Loretta Jackson                         |
| 17 | Williams.  |
| 18 | Q. Did you ever recommend that Dr. Papin go                |
| 19 | see her?   |
| 20 | A. I did not.  |
| 21 | Q. What is the office of academic                          |
| 22 | development?   |
| 23 | A. I'm not familiar with what Dr. Earl is                  |
| 24 | referring. In the Department of Academic Affairs           |
| 25 | there is a psychologist who has responsibility for         |
|    |  |

Page 213 meeting with professional students who either need 1 2 tutoring or who are having some kind of difficulty or deficiencies in other areas. 3 That is not her title and I can only presume that is who Dr. Earl 4 5 was referring to. 6 Q. Page 2 of this. It states many of these 7 behaviors are serious threats to patient safety 8 and therefore grounds for immediate action. 9 the improvement required above as determined by 10 the program director are not met within 60 days or 11 any event seriously threaten patient safety occurs 12 after remediation period, then the following may 13 be implemented, again, at the discretion of the 14 program director: Referral to HR and the GME office for immediate termination for safety 15 16 infractions deemed egregious by the PD. 17 Nonrenewal of contract, placed on a 18 formal probation, requirement to repeat a year of 19 training. 20 So then they both signed this on 1/10, 21 and then one day later Dr. Earl and the GME office, Dr. Barr, you all received an e-mail 22 23 stating that they believed that he was no longer 24 rehabilitated -- he couldn't be rehabilitated, 25 correct?

Page 214 1 Α. Yes. 2 Are you aware of any events that 0. 3 would -- any events that occurred between the 10th and the 11th that would have placed patients in 4 5 jeopardy of serious harm? 6 I am not privy to what led to Dr. Earl's 7 decision. 8 Okay. Are you aware that basically they Ο. 9 just went with option one here the next day and 10 referred this case -- they did in fact refer this 11 thing over to you the next day, correct? 12 Α. Yes, it was referred the next day. 13 Did you ever have any conversations with Q. 14 Dr. Earl or Dr. Barr regarding these other options that were in this plan such as nonrenewal of 15 16 contract, placement on formal probation, or 17 requirement to repeat a year of the training? 18 Α. There were not. In the meeting that was 19 subsequently held with Drs. Barr and Earl, the 20 decision was made that they did not feel confident in Dr. Papin's ability or interaction to continue 21 22 in the program. 23 Q. Are you aware of anything that would 24 have required them to try to at least remediate 25 Dr. Papin in these behaviors that they're stating

```
Page 215
 1
     he exhibited?
 2
          Α.
                I am not.
 3
               Next Exhibit 23. I am only asking you
          0.
 4
     about the final page of this, it's the Academic
     Remediation and Protocol Checklist.
 5
 6
                (Exhibit 23 marked for identification.)
 7
          Α.
               I see it.
 8
          0.
               This is an academic remediation protocol
     checklist that was referenced in the e-mails that
 9
10
     we just went over from Ms. Bass.
                                        There are
11
     several things on here. Are you aware of whether
12
     any of these steps on this checklist would have
13
     taken place between Dr. Earl and Dr. Papin?
14
          Α.
               I am not.
15
          0.
               Are you aware of any of these
16
     guidelines, the guidelines going up to page 1, the
17
     Guidelines for Academic Remediation Office of
18
     Graduate Medical Education?
19
          Α.
               I am not familiar with that.
20
          Q.
               Okay. All right. Next Exhibit 24.
21
               (Exhibit 24 marked for identification.)
22
          Q.
               Before you start reading, are you
23
     familiar with this UMMC Graduate Medical Education
24
     Evaluation Policy and Grievance Algorithm?
25
          A.
               I am not.
```

```
Page 216
 1
          Q.
               Do you have any awareness of whether
 2
     Dr. Earl and Dr. Barr followed the policies and
 3
     procedures set forth in this?
 4
          Α.
               I do not.
 5
          Q.
               Okay. Last one.
 6
               MR. WHITFIELD: I'm pretty sure that one
 7
          was a repeat.
 8
               THE WITNESS:
                             Uh-huh (affirmative).
 9
          Yeah, we saw that one earlier.
10
               MR. SCHMITZ: Okay. You know, I think I
          get different -- there's a couple of
11
12
          different years with the different versions
13
          so I think there's a little bit -- well,
14
          that's all right.
15
               Okay, last one.
16
               (Exhibit 25 marked for identification.)
17
          Q.
               (By Mr. Schmitz) This is the Academic
18
     Remediation Protocol Checklist, seems to be filled
19
     out by Dr. Earl here?
20
          Α.
               Yes.
21
               All right. So on this checklist 1, 2,
          0.
22
     3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, there's 8 things on this
23
     checklist that they're supposed to go through; is
     that correct? You count the same as I'm counting?
24
25
          Α.
               Yes.
```

| 1  | Q. And on here you see completion date and         |
|----|--|
| 2  | there's only 1, 2, 3, there's 3 things completed;  |
| 3  | is that correct?                                   |
| 4  | A. Yes.  |
| 5  | Q. So have you ever seen this document             |
| 6  | before?  |
| 7  | A. I have seen yes, this particular one,           |
| 8  | I've seen a copy of this.                          |
| 9  | Q. This partially filled out document?             |
| 10 | A. Yes.  |
| 11 | Q. Okay. So earlier you testified that you         |
| 12 | had believed that Dr. Earl had done all his due    |
| 13 | diligence so you just relied on Dr. Earl for all   |
| 14 | the documents and all the things to have been      |
| 15 | complete sufficient enough for you to conclude     |
| 16 | that the termination of Dr. Joe Papin was          |
| 17 | warranted, correct?                                |
| 18 | A. From the HR standpoint in comparison to         |
| 19 | the faculty staff handbook. This particular        |
| 20 | checklist would have to do with the academic       |
| 21 | component of which I had no involvement.           |
| 22 | Q. Right. But if you see only 3 out of the         |
| 23 | 8 things on the academic component are checked off |
| 24 | on a checklist, a UMMC checklist, wouldn't that    |
| 25 | raise some concern in the mind of someone else who |
|    |  |

Page 218 1 is trying to review a termination decision? 2 Not from the standpoint of the employee 3 component. And this checklist evidently was done 4 on the same -- was begun on the same date that 5 Dr. Earl and Dr. Papin had their meeting when he 6 provided him with the letter that we recently 7 reviewed. 8 You see here where it says, submitted Q. 9 written personal study or corrective action plan, 10 so it looks like Joseph Papin did that on 1/17 as 11 was required by the -- I call it performance 12 improvement plan, that we just reviewed? 13 I don't know if that was the date it was Α. 14 completed or if that the targeted date because I 15 do not have familiarity with this checklist. 16 Okay. You also were not provided the 17 written personal study plan or corrective action 18 plan that Joe Papin submitted to Dr. Earl on 19 January 17? 20 Α. I was not. 21 Okay. All right. Well, thank you so 0. 22 much for your time today. Now, you can -- we're 23 all finished here, you can now either read the 24 transcript to correct any errors or you can waive. 25 I guess you and Tommy can talk about that.

| - |    |  |
|---|----|--|
|   | 1  | Page 219<br>MR. WHITFIELD: Read and sign.    |
|   | 2  | MR. SCHMITZ: You're going to read and        |
|   | 3  | sign. All right. No worries.                 |
|   | 4  | So I guess that concludes today's            |
| ļ | 5  | deposition. Thank you so much, Ms. Whitlock, |
| İ | 6  | I appreciate your time today. Sorry I kept   |
|   | 7  | you for so long and I appreciate you both.   |
|   | 8  | Thank you.                                   |
|   | 9  | COURT REPORTER: Mr. Whitfield, do you        |
|   | 10 | need a copy of the transcript?               |
|   | 11 | MR. WHITFIELD: I do.                         |
|   | 12 | (Deposition concluded at 4:27 p.m.)          |
|   | 13 | SIGNATURE/NOT WAIVED                         |
|   | 14 |  |
|   | 15 | ORIGINAL: GREGORY SCHMITZ, ESQ.              |
|   | 16 | COPY: TOMMY WHITFIELD, ESQ.                  |
|   | 17 |  |
|   | 18 |  |
|   | 19 |  |
|   | 20 |  |
|   | 21 |  |
|   | 22 |  |
|   | 23 |  |
|   | 24 |  |
|   | 25 |  |
| L |    |  |

| $\overline{}$ |  |
|---------------|--|
| 1             | CERTIFICATE OF DEPONENT  |
| 2             | DEPONENT: PAT WHITLOCK   |
| 3             | DATE: December 2, 2020 CASE STYLE: JOSEPH PAPIN, MD vs. UNIVERSITY OF  |
| 4             | MISSISSIPPI MEDICAL CENTER, ET AL ORIGINAL TO: Gregory Schmitz, ESQ.   |
| 5             | I, the above-named deponent in the deposition taken in the herein styled and numbered  |
| 6             | cause, certify that I have examined the deposition taken on the date above as to the correctness                                     |
| 7             | thereof, and that after reading said pages, I find<br>them to contain a full and true transcript of the<br>testimony as given by me. |
| 8             | Subject to those corrections listed below, if any, I find the transcript to be the   |
| 9             | correct testimony I gave at the aforestated time and place.  |
| 10            | Page Line Comments   |
| 11            |  |
| 12            |  |
| 13            |  |
| 14            |  |
| 15            |  |
| 16            |  |
| 17            |  |
| 19            | This the day of, 2020.   |
| 20            | PAT WHITLOCK State of Mississippi  |
| 21            | County of  |
| 22            | Subscribed and sworn to before me, this the day of, 2020.  |
| 23            | My Commission Expires:   |
| 24            |  |
| 25            | Notary Public  |
|               |  |

| 1  | Page 221<br>CERTIFICATE OF COURT REPORTER          |
|----|--|
| 2  | I, Dawn Dillard, Court Reporter and                |
| 3  | Notary Public, in and for the State of             |
| 4  | Mississippi, hereby certify that the foregoing     |
| 5  | contains a true and correct transcript of the      |
| 6  | testimony of PAT WHITLOCK, as taken by me in the   |
| 7  | aforementioned matter at the time and place        |
| 8  | heretofore stated, as taken by stenotype and later |
| 9  | reduced to typewritten form under my supervision   |
| 10 | by means of computer-aided transcription.          |
| 11 | I further certify that under the                   |
| 12 | authority vested in me by the State of Mississippi |
| 13 | that the witness was placed under oath by me to    |
| 14 | truthfully answer all questions in the matter.     |
| 15 | I further certify that, to the best of             |
| 16 | my knowledge, I am not in the employ of or related |
| 17 | to any party in this matter and have no interest,  |
| 18 | monetary or otherwise, in the final outcome of     |
| 19 | this matter.                                       |
| 20 | Witness my signature and seal this the             |
| 21 | 1st day of January, 2021.                          |
| 22 |  |
| 23 | Dawn Dillard                                       |
| 24 | DAWN DILLARD, #1763 CCR                            |
| 25 | My Commission Expires:<br>March 2, 2021            |
|    |  |

|                               | 1 |
|-------------------------------|---|
| 12/15/16                      |   |
| 57:19                         |   |
| 12:48                         |   |
| 120:19                        |   |
| 12:51                         |   |
| 130:24                        |   |
| 13                            |   |
| 120:19                        |   |
| 138:22,23                     |   |
| 145:1 184:24                  |   |
| 185:7                         |   |
| 14                            |   |
| 145:11,12                     |   |
| 161:23 185:3,                 |   |
| 7,9                           |   |
| 14th                          |   |
| 130:23                        |   |
| 15                            |   |
| 32:25 38:9                    |   |
| 95:17 99:14                   |   |
| 148:14,15                     |   |
| 185:8,22                      |   |
| 186:9 209:16                  |   |
| 16                            |   |
| 156:2,4                       |   |
| 186:25                        |   |
| 17                            |   |
| 85:21 161:1,2                 |   |
| 187:7,15                      |   |
| 198:10 211:25<br>212:2 218:19 |   |
|                               |   |
| 163.22.23                     |   |
| 163:22,23<br>189:18           |   |
|                               |   |
| 190.5 170.1 0                 |   |
| 122:5 172:1,2                 |   |

|                      | Exhibit 013 Whi | 1/10/17              | 12/15/16 |
|----------------------|-----------------|----------------------|----------|
| Exhibits             | tlock           | 44:24 45:1           | 57:19    |
| Exhibit 001 Whi      | 3:22 138:22,    | 60:4                 | 12:48    |
| tlock                | 23 145:1        | 1/17                 | 120:19   |
| 3:9 32:5             | Exhibit 014 Whi | 218:10               | 12:51    |
| Exhibit 003 Whi      | tlock           | 1/19/17              | 130:24   |
| tlock                | 3:23 145:11,    | 88:8                 | 13       |
| 3:11 79:11           | 12              | 1/27/17              | 120:19   |
| 94:21                | Exhibit 015 Whi | 91:13                | 138:22,  |
| Exhibit 004 Whi      | tlock           | 1/3/17               | 145:1 1  |
| tlock                | 3:24 148:14,    | 60:4                 | 185:7    |
| 3:12 100:25          | 15              | 10                   | 14       |
| Exhibit 005 Whi      | Exhibit 016 Whi | 22:23 34:2           | 145:11,  |
| tlock                | tlock           | 87:9 107:10,         | 161:23   |
| 3:14 119:6           | 3:25 156:2,4    | 17 127:24,25         | 7,9      |
| Exhibit 006 Whi      | Exhibit 018 Whi | 162:21 163:13        | 14th     |
| tlock                | tlock           | 180:2 208:23         | 130:23   |
| 3:15 122:9           | 4:3 163:22,23   | 10/2/53              | 15       |
| Exhibit 007 Whi      | Exhibit 019 Whi | 7:8                  | 32:25 3  |
| tlock                | tlock           | 102                  | 95:17 9  |
| 3:16 125:1           | 4:5 172:1,2     | 7:10                 | 148:14,  |
| Exhibit 008 Whi      | Exhibit 021 Whi | 10:22                | 185:8,2  |
| tlock                | tlock           | 32:25                | 186:9 2  |
| 3:17 125:18          | 4:8 202:19      | 10:52                | 16       |
| Exhibit 009 Whi      | 204:24          | 38:10                | 156:2,4  |
| tlock                | Exhibit 022 Pat |                      | 186:25   |
| 3:18 127:4           | Whitlock        | 10th<br>153:16 214:3 | 17       |
|                      | 4:9 206:25      |                      | 85:21 1  |
| Exhibit 010 Whitlock | 207:1,5         | 11                   | 187:7,1  |
| 3:19 127:24,         |                 | 130:19,20            | 198:10   |
| 25                   | 1               | 137:11               | 212:2 2  |
|                      | 1               | 11th                 | 18       |
| Exhibit 011 Whitlock | 32:5 140:8      | 214:4                | 163:22,  |
| 3:20 130:19,         | 144:25 172:14   | 12                   | 189:18   |
| 20                   | 178:6 215:16    | 137:11 138:2,        | 19       |
|                      | 216:21 217:2    | 3 180:5              | 122:5 1  |
| Exhibit 012 Whitlock | 1/10            | 182:19               | 194:9    |
| 3:21 138:2,3         | 38:14 45:3      | 12/15                | 1:32     |
| 3.21 130:2,3         | 213:20          | 59:18                | 95:18    |
|                      |                 |                      |          |

|               |               |                         | 1             |
|---------------|---------------|-------------------------|---------------|
| 1earl         | 20th          | 21 106:18               | 44            |
| 113:1         | 131:20 178:14 | 107:3 177:14,           | 105:16        |
| 1papin        | 21            | 15,25 178:1             | 45            |
| 196:12        | 121:25 184:25 | 216:22 217:2,           | 94:7          |
| 1st           | 195:18 202:19 | 22                      | 4:00          |
| 131:12        | 204:24        | 30                      | 91:17 93:3    |
|               | 22            | 94:15 101:17,           | 4:27          |
| 2             | 121:25 199:20 | 21 199:20               | 219:12        |
|               | 206:25 207:1, | 30 (ъ) (б)              |               |
| 2             | 5             | 16:7 47:4               | 5             |
| 79:5,7,9,11,  | 22nd          | 78:12,21 84:4           |               |
| 19 95:1 175:3 | 131:5,8,23    | 96:21 129:8             | 5             |
| 200:2 204:24  | 132:2,11      | 165:18 167:9            | 119:6 194:9   |
| 213:6 216:21  | 135:18,22     | 175:16                  | 216:22        |
| 217:2         | 136:18,22     | 31                      | 5:45          |
| 2/6           | 23            | 156:11,15               | 48:8 50:17    |
| 41:24         | 103:16,21     | 200:2                   | 5:59          |
| 20            | 198:10 215:3, | 34                      | 80:11         |
| 121:25 134:12 | 6             | 201:7                   |               |
| 159:17 177:5, | 24            | 37                      | 6             |
| 11 186:25     | 215:20,21     | 104:16                  |               |
| 194:2 210:11, | 25            | 3:00                    | 6             |
| 18 211:2      | 185:23 201:7  | 91:15 93:1,4            | 48:7,10 50:17 |
| 2014          | 216:16        | 94:9                    | 122:9 194:11  |
| 101:6 107:5   | 26            |                         | 195:18 216:22 |
| 2015          | 10:18         | 3:40                    | 60            |
| 101:10        |               | 91:16 93:2<br>134:15,19 | 112:21 113:1, |
| 2016          | 27            | 134:13,19               | 6 120:25      |
| 85:20         | 9:22 55:15    |                         | 121:6 208:7,8 |
| 2017          | 178:10 194:2  | 4                       | 211:6 213:10  |
| 12:17 14:18   | 27th          | 4                       | 6:00          |
| 18:19,22 20:7 | 88:1 181:3    | 100:25 174:13           | 80:15         |
| 21:16,18 23:4 | 209:8         | 179:11 187:7,           | 6:01          |
| 34:2 38:9     | 29            | 11,20,25                | 80:12         |
| 48:7 50:17    | 156:7,9,11    | 192:13 206:15           |               |
| 55:4 95:18    | 160:1         | 216:22                  | 7             |
| 102:17        |               | 433                     | •             |
| 160:21,22     | 3             | 161:4,7                 | 7             |
| 162:6 211:25  | 3             | 435                     | 125:1 182:19  |
|               | -             | 161:4                   | 189:18 216:22 |
|               | 79:11 94:20,  |                         |               |

| 7/29/16                               | 9:15          | 216:17          | accustomed                   |
|---------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|------------------------------|
| 48:25                                 | 131:20        | 217:20,23       | 52:21                        |
| 7/29/2016                             | 134:12,18     | academics       | ACGME                        |
| 52:18                                 |               | 203:9           | 19:19,23 20:                 |
| 73                                    | A             | accept          | 46:10,18,25                  |
| 107:6                                 | a.m.          | 91:19,23        | 47:4,17                      |
| 74                                    | 32:25 38:10   | acceptance      | 157:15 173:1                 |
| 107:6                                 | 131:20 134:12 | 119:2           | acknowledgemen               |
| 75                                    | abbreviations | accepting       | 78:1                         |
| 107:6                                 | 211:11        | 91:25           | acknowledging                |
| 76                                    |               |                 | 31:11 112:9                  |
| 107:1 108:1                           | abide         | access<br>69:15 | acronym                      |
| 110:5,13                              | 159:11,12     |                 | 42:2                         |
| 111:10 113:24                         | abilities     | accessed        | acronyms                     |
| 114:15 115:1,                         | 105:19        | 22:13           | 162:13                       |
| 12,18 116:6                           | ability       | accessible      | _                            |
| 118:18 163:4,                         | 29:8 198:17   | 69:19           | act                          |
| 8                                     | 214:21        | acclamation     | 77:14 188:7                  |
| 76's                                  | absence       | 192:7           | 191:5                        |
| 110:21                                | 131:23        | accordance      | action                       |
| 78                                    | absent        | 173:24 175:7    | 71:17 72:15                  |
| 101:9 102:12                          | 58:1,5,7      | 176:21          | 91:24 116:6                  |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | abstracts     | accountability  | 118:15 130:9                 |
| 79                                    | 9:13          | 91:20,24,25     | 149:18 152:6                 |
| 102:16,19                             | academic      | accreditation   | 164:5,6,11,2<br>166:9 170:21 |
|                                       | 10:20,22      | 174:8,9         | 182:17 199:8                 |
| 8                                     | 34:5,11,25    | -               | 211:25 213:8                 |
| 8                                     | 35:9,12,17    | accrued         | 218:9,17                     |
| 125:17,18                             | 36:6,13,18,19 | 140:23          |                              |
| 216:22 217:23                         | 38:6,22 39:9  | accurate        | actions                      |
| 8/31                                  | 41:6 76:9     | 63:16 75:10     | 14:25 27:16                  |
| 59:18                                 | 96:12 97:2    | 96:5            | 38:20 44:9                   |
|                                       | 102:16        | accurately      | 49:5,8 70:7<br>91:20,24      |
| 8/31/16                               | 132:13,18     | 7:22 183:23     | 102:9 108:24                 |
| 57:19                                 | 158:10,14     | 204:15          | 116:7 133:21                 |
|                                       | 159:3 204:25  | accused         | 149:19 166:1                 |
| 9                                     | 205:8,18      | 18:2 43:6       | 183:22                       |
| 9                                     | 206:14,16     | 44:10 104:2     |                              |
| 18:22 127:3,4                         | 212:21,24     | 105:8 108:20    | actively                     |
| 195:24                                | 215:4,8,17    | 195:4           | 195:12                       |

| 4   |  |  |  |
|-----|--|--|--|
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
| - 4 |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |
|     |  |  |  |

| activities     | 150:4 157:25  | affirmative  | allocation    |
|----------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|
|                |               | 907.75       | allegation    |
| 58:2,6,7,13    | 211:19        | 6:17 79:24   | 16:2 83:1     |
| 74:13 88:21    | administrator | 216:8        | 84:9,10 109:5 |
| acts           | 43:18 60:6,21 | African      | allegations   |
| 85:22 110:15   | 88:14         | 101:9 102:15 | 16:14 20:14   |
| actual         | admission     | afternoon    | 21:8 30:17    |
| 25:24 63:20    | 96:11         | 48:3         | 31:7 44:18    |
| 74:2 139:23    | admit         | agency       | 58:5 62:23    |
| 156:9 177:15,  | 67:8 89:9     | 164:21       | 63:2,11 64:7  |
| 25             | 183:19        |              | 75:6 83:25    |
| adamant        |               | aggressive   | 84:22 109:13, |
| 88:25 89:5     | admittance    | 179:8        | 25 110:8,9    |
| 167:23         | 61:12 62:3    | aggrieved    | 114:25 115:21 |
|                | admitted      | 84:11        | 118:10 150:7  |
| addiction      | 62:9 87:23    | agree        | 152:2 196:6,  |
| 123:20         | 183:5,14      | 94:12 175:4  | 18            |
| addition       | 196:5         | agreed       | alleged       |
| 151:19         | advance       | 93:1 112:19  | 19:1,16 44:9  |
| 210:13,19      | 56:20 101:17  | 174:24       | 56:5 83:5     |
| additional     | advanced      |              | 110:15 111:21 |
| 33:5,12        | 101:20        | agreement    | 112:20 114:1, |
| 75:23,25       |               | 97:14        | 2,10 153:13   |
| 162:11 211:22  | advances      | agrees       | 197:21        |
| 212:7          | 109:14,25     | 172:14       | allegedly     |
| address        | 111:4         | ahead        | 17:22 18:13   |
| 7:9 47:5       | advantage     | 43:12 128:15 | 44:18 73:2    |
| 140:21 205:13  | 132:13        | 178:8 210:1  | 111:17        |
|                | advice        | Ainsworth    |               |
| addressed      | 10:10 11:3    | 88:14 91:10  | alleging      |
| 14:11 38:2     | 202:9         | 122:16 127:5 | 6:2           |
| 39:23 206:18   | advises       |              | allowed       |
| administer     | 10:5          | alarm        | 18:4 74:3     |
| 15:8 173:23    |               | 85:9         | 123:18        |
| administering  | advising      | Albeit       | alluded       |
| 159:7          | 13:20         | 110:18       | 39:6          |
| administration | affairs       | alcohol      | altercation   |
| 156:17 158:22  | 10:20,22      | 93:12,15,18  | 55:9,21 59:4  |
|                | 161:23 162:2  | alerted      |               |
| administrative | 212:24        | 135:15       | alternate     |
| 44:25 45:4     | affect        |              | 190:5         |
| 51:15 61:1     | 159:8         | Algorithm    | alternated    |
| 119:16 123:11  |               | 215:24       | 190:7         |
|                |               |              | J             |

5

|                   |                   | 1                  | 1                       |
|-------------------|-------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|
| amenable          | appealed          | approve            | Asian                   |
| 173:9             | 101:9 102:16      | 114:25 165:12      | 103:16                  |
| amends            | appealing         | approved           | aspect                  |
| 201:3             | 145:19            | 52:6 134:17,       | 206:9,10                |
| American          | appeals           | 20 194:3           | assault                 |
| 101:9 102:15      | 9:17 162:10,      | 202:10             | 114:2                   |
| analysis          | 11,19             | approximately      | assertion               |
| 38:1 203:9        | appeared          | 80:11 195:3        | 64:22                   |
| 206:6             | 188:22            | area               | assessed                |
| anger             | appears           | 81:8 102:10        | 56:13                   |
| 103:17,22         | 98:20 161:16,     | 103:20             |                         |
| 104:4             | 19                | 129:13,14,15       | assigned<br>14:12 57:22 |
| angry             | applicable        | 130:6,13,17        |                         |
| 201:2             | 29:2              | 158:9              | assignments             |
| announced         | apply             | area's             | 131:12                  |
| 91:6              | 27:19 173:1,      | 130:8              | assistant               |
|                   | 19                | areas              | 61:1                    |
| anonymous<br>42:4 | applying          | 47:13 158:11       | associate               |
|                   | 72:1              | 163:10 210:24      | 88:10,12                |
| anonymously 73:8  |                   | 211:17 213:3       | 126:10 212:8,           |
|                   | appoint<br>162:11 | arguments          | 9                       |
| answering         |                   | 168:4              | assume                  |
| 7:23              | appointed         | arrested           | 7:4 76:5                |
| answers           | 162:25            | 7:18               | 132:3 191:4             |
| 6:15,20           | appointment       | arrive             | assumed                 |
| anymore           | 91:17 93:3,6,     | 68:3               | 76:4                    |
| 17:18,23          | 15,18,19          | arrived            | assuming                |
| 25:19 168:1       | 94:1,5 98:22      | 68:11,17,24        | 41:1 60:9               |
| Anytime           | approach          | 91:17              | 69:23 98:23             |
| 102:3 201:11      | 24:24 93:8        | arriving           | 114:23 195:25           |
| apologize         | 155:23            | 68:5,14            | attached                |
| 200:14,17         | approaching       | •                  | 145:24 211:2            |
| apologized        | 113:11            | arrogantly<br>53:2 | attempt                 |
| 179:15            | appropriately     |                    | 144:17 200:18           |
| appeal            | 28:22 76:17,      | ASAP               | attempted               |
| 9:18 27:11,15     | 19,23             | 131:25 136:19      | 141:9 142:2             |
| 161:20,21         | approval          | Ashley             | 210:6                   |
| 162:20,24         | 15:10 77:18       | 18:21 79:2         | atten                   |
| 163:5,13,16       | 110:17            | 80:4 86:5,15,      | 192:1                   |
|                   |                   | 22                 |                         |
|                   |                   | <u> </u>           | <u> </u>                |

www.phippsreporting.com (888) 811-3408

| ### attendance   | attend          | avenue  | 95:6 106:5                            | 214:14,19     |
|--|-----------------|---|---------------------------------------|---------------|
| attendance         avoided         129:2 134:16         Barr's           91:7 127:19         98:14         137:8 148:13         119:16           attending         aware         160:20 162:6         13:12 23:15           74:2,8,12,22         26:16,17         18:20,21         160:20 162:6         13:12 23:15           78:7,9,18         37:16 40:6,15         188:17 191:25         29:18,22           209:20         47:17 56:8         192:1,5         16 37:6 39:1           attendings         57:11 59:10         193:15 195:13         48:23 54:13           78:14         60:16 61:24         197:5 198:9,         86:17 100:18           40:10 73:19,         83:16 93:11         201:2 204:20,         201:2 204:20,           23 84:1,17,24         100:9 161:3         17:18 100:5         17:15,16         19:9:18           10:10 12 112:16         169:10,18         17:17 173:18         17:17 173:18         147:5         20:22 21:1           attitude         16:16 186:13         153:1 154:3         19:10         15:25 183:5           145:21         21:15,25         19:17 200:22         21:15,25         21:15,25         21:15,25         21:18,22           attorney         21:15,25         19:19 141:6,7         21:20,21 35:6   |                 |   |                                       | · ·           |
| 91:7 127:19 attending 68:15 71:25 74:2,8,12,22 26:16,17 78:7,9,18 37:16 40:6,15 179:3 191:16 45:2,6,12 209:20 47:17 56:8 attendings 78:14 60:16 61:24 65:19 69:9 71:20,24 108:9 161:3 121:4 147:1 108:9 161:3 121:4 147:1 132:14 193:25 44:21 54:15 60:12 112:16 132:14 193:25 179:13,15,16 159:19,23 160:20 162:6 166:6,12 188:17 191:25 163:12 192:1,5 163:12 192:1,5 193:15 199:13 163:16 193:13 199:16 183:12 23:15 188:17 191:25 11:14 46:10 199:15 199:19 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 155:20 173:8 176:2,18 209:20 117:15,16 129:19 120:20 117:15,16 120:20 120 |                 |   |                                       |               |
| attending         aware         159:19,23         based           68:15 71:25         18:20,21         160:20 162:6         13:12 23:15           74:2,8,12,22         26:16,17         168:6,12         28:18,22           78:7,9,18         37:16 40:6,15         188:17 191:25         16 37:6 39:1           179:3 191:16         45:2,6,12         192:1,5         16 37:6 39:1           209:20         47:17 56:8         193:15 195:13         48:23 54:13           attendings         57:11 59:10         193:15 195:13         48:23 54:13           78:14         60:16 61:24         197:15 198:9,         23 200:14           attention         65:19 69:9         71:20,24         201:2 204:20,         201:33:20           40:10 73:19,         83:16 93:11         197:18 100:5         117:15,16         209:2 211:1           108:9 161:3         121:4 147:1         117:15,16         209:2 211:1           attest         158:23 162:22         163:12         147:5         209:2 211:1           60:12 112:16         169:10,18         147:5         25:21 75:4           61:12 153:1         188:14,16         192:19 194:25         194:10,11,12         184:4 196:5           199:13,15,16         192:19 194:25         194:10,11,12   |                 |   |                                       |               |
| actending         aware         16:20,21         16:20,21         16:20,21         16:8:6,12         13:12,23:15         22:16,17         16:8:6,12         13:12,3:15         22:18,22         23:15         24:2,6,12         16:8:6,12         13:12,3:15         22:15,22         23:14,34:15,16         37:6,63:12         31:14,34:15,16         31:15,31         31:14,34:15,16         31:15,31         31:14,34:15,16         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,31         31:15,32         31:15,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:15,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:14,31         31:15,31         31:15,31   | 91:/ 12/:19     | 98:14   |                                       | 119:16        |
| 18:15 /1:25     18:20,21     168:6,12     13:12 23:15       74:2,8,12,22     26:16,17     37:16 40:6,15     188:17 191:25     16 37:6 39:1       179:3 191:16     45:2,6,12     192:1,5     16 37:6 39:1       209:20     47:17 56:8     193:15 195:13     41:14 46:10       attendings     57:11 59:10     193:15 198:9,     48:23 56:13       78:14     60:16 61:24     197:5 198:9,     23 200:14     20:22 204:20,       40:10 73:19,     83:16 93:11     97:18 100:5     117:15,16     103:12     117:15,16       108:9 161:3     121:4 147:1     117:15,16     209:2 211:1       attest     158:23 162:22     189:8     199:8       44:21 54:15     169:10,18     147:5     25:21 75:4       60:12 112:16     169:10,18     173:11 73:18     147:5     25:21 75:4       attitude     176:16 186:13     173:1 154:3     155:25 183:5       114:12 153:1     188:14,16     190:10     15:125 183:5       154:4 198:20     192:19 194:25     194:10,11,12     184:4 196:5       145:21     214:2,8,23     215:11,15     43:17 144:6,     43:17 144:6,       8:19     autorney/client     61:2 64:12     13:14 33:4     15:25 183:5       authority     6:14 8:24     88:10 91:9     30:13,14 34:  | _               | aware   | · ·                                   | based         |
| 78:7,9,18 78:7,9,18 37:16 40:6,15 37:16 40:6,15 45:2,6,12 209:20 47:17 56:8 57:11 59:10 78:14 60:16 61:24 65:19 69:9 71:20,24 201:2 204:20, 20 201:2 204:20, 20 201:2 204:20, 20 201:2 204:20, 20 20:20 40:10 73:19, 23 84:1,17,24 108:9 161:3 21:14 147:1 2154:15 60:12 112:16 132:14 193:25 216:16,17 188:17 191:25 192:1,5 193:15 195:13 41:14 46:10 48:23 54:13 197:5 198:9, 48:23 54:13 48:21 79:12:14 201:2 204:20, 23 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 176:2,18 209:2 211:1 189:8 176:16 186:13 114:12 153:1 114:12 153:1 114:12 153:1 114:12 153:1 114:12 153:1 114:12 153:1 115:14 198:20 199:13,15,16 211:15,25 211:15,25 214:2,8,23 215:11,15 214:2,8,23 215:11,15 214:14 14:6, 216:1 212:19 216:1 212:10 211:15,25 214:2,8,23 215:11,15 214:14 4:6, 216:1 212:20 212:20 212:20 213:10:1 22:20 23 210:3 23 210:3 23 210:3 23 210:3 23 210:3 23 210:3 217:5:20 173:8 20:12 204:20, 23 210:3 20:12 204:20, 23 210:3 20:12 204:20, 23 210:3 20:12 204:20, 23 210:3 216:12 209:22 211:1 209:2 21:1 209:2 211:1 209:2 21:1 209:2 21:1 209:2 21:1 20 | 68:15 71:25     | 18:20,21  |                                       | 13:12 23:15   |
| 78:7,9,18 179:3 191:16 209:20 47:17 56:8 279:14 3ttention 78:14 65:19 69:9 71:20,24 201:2 204:20, 23 20:14 23 200:14 201:3 200:14 201:3 200:14 201:3 200:14 201:2 204:20, 23 201:4 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 201:3 201:4 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 201:4 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 201:4 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 201:4 201:2 204:20, 23 210:3 201:4 201:3 200:14 201:3 20:14 201:3 20:12 201:2 201:2 201:2 201:2 201:2 201:1 201:10:16 201:3 200:14 201:2 201:2 201:2 201:2 201:2 201:1 201:10:16 201:10:10:16 201:10:10:16 201:10:10:16 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10:10:10 201:10: |                 | 26:16,17  | l '                                   | 28:18,22      |
| 179:3 191:16   45:2,6,12   192:1,5   16 37:6 39:1     209:20   | 78:7,9,18       | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·   |                                       | 31:14 34:15,  |
| ### ### ### ### ### ### ### ### ### ##   |                 | 45:2,6,12   |                                       | 16 37:6 39:16 |
| attendings         5/:11 59:10         197:5 198:9,         48:23 54:13         86:17 100:18           attention         71:20,24         23 200:14         20 133:20         155:20 173:8         176:2,18           40:10 73:19,         33:16 93:11         23 84:1,17,24         33:16 93:11         201:2 204:20,         23 210:3         176:2,18           attest         108:9 161:3         121:4 147:1         117:15,16         209:2 211:1           60:12 112:16         158:23 162:22         163:12         backgrounds         191:9 199:18           60:12 112:16         169:10,18         147:5         25:21 75:4           32:14 193:25         171:17 173:18         bad         96:19 131:14           attitude         176:16 186:13         153:1 154:3         135:16 137:1           14:12 153:1         188:14,16         190:10         194:10,11,12         184:4 196:5           199:13,15,16         192:19 194:25         194:10,11,12         184:4 196:5         184:4 196:5           attorney         21:15,25         214:2,8,23         214:18,23         214:8         214:8           audible         6:15,20         B         B         B         B         B           authority         6:14 8:24         88:10 91:9 <t< td=""><td>209:20</td><td>47:17 56:8</td><td></td><td>41:14 46:10</td></t<>  | 209:20          | 47:17 56:8  |                                       | 41:14 46:10   |
| 78:14       65:19 69:9       23 200:14       20 133:20         40:10 73:19,       83:16 93:11       23 210:3       155:20 173:8         40:10 73:19,       83:16 93:11       97:18 100:5       176:2,18         108:9 161:3       97:18 100:5       117:15,16       209:2 211:1         attest       158:23 162:22       163:12       209:2 211:1         60:12 112:16       169:10,18       147:5       25:21 75:4         60:12 112:16       169:10,18       147:5       25:21 75:4         132:14 193:25       171:17 173:18       186:13       153:1 154:3       135:16 137:1         14:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       21:15,25       21:15,25       21:15,25         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       21:15,25       69:19 141:6,7       142:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         attorney       21:511,15       43:17 144:6,       11:10 36:9         audible       6:14 8:24       61:21 64:12       11:10 36:9         auspices       8       12:20,21 35:6       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authority       6:14 8:24       88:1  | attendings      | 57:11 59:10   |                                       | 48:23 54:13   |
| ### attention ### 40:10 73:19, ### 23 84:1,17,24 ### 108:9 161:3  ### attest ### 158:23 162:22 ### 160:12 112:16 ### 132:14 193:25 ### 17:17 173:18 ### 17:15,16 ### 132:14 193:25 ### 17:17 173:18 ### 17:18 100:5 ### 17:17 173:18 ### 17:18 100:10 ### 17:18 100:10 ### 17:18 100:5 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15,16 ### 10:10 117:15 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 117:10 ### 10:10 | 78:14           | 60:16 61:24   | i i                                   | 86:17 100:18, |
| 40:10 73:19,       71:20,24       83:16 93:11       23 210:3       155:20 173:8         23 84:1,17,24       97:18 100:5       176:2,18       176:2,18         108:9 161:3       121:4 147:1       117:15,16       209:2 211:1         attest       158:23 162:22       168:12       189:18       backgrounds       147:5       25:21 75:4         60:12 112:16       169:10,18       147:5       25:21 75:4       96:19 131:14         132:14 193:25       171:17 173:18       168:14,16       153:1 154:3       135:16 137:1         114:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       194:10,11,12       184:4 196:5         214:2,8,23       215:11,15       143:17 144:6,       143:17 144:6,       143:17 144:6,         8:19       audible       6:15,20       6:14 8:24       12:20,21 35:6       11:10 36:9         auspices       B       12:20,21 35:6       13:4       15:1         authority       6:14 8:24       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         134:222       135:13       128:2  | attention       | 65:19 69:9  |                                       | 20 133:20     |
| 23 84:1,17,24       83:16 93:11       97:18 100:5       176:2,18         108:9 161:3       121:4 147:1       117:15,16       209:2 211:1         attest       158:23 162:22       163:12       backgrounds       14:22 24:4         44:21 54:15       169:10,18       147:5       25:21 75:4         132:14 193:25       171:17 173:18       147:5       25:21 75:4         attitude       176:16 186:13       153:1 154:3       135:16 137:1         114:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       194:10,11,12       184:4 196:5         214:2,8,23       215:11,15       143:17 144:6,       basing         attorney       216:1       69:19 141:6,7       143:17 144:6,       basis         audible       216:1       61:1,15       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       B       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         authority       6:14 8:24       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       50:14 58:9,18       128:20 133:23       148:19 202:2         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10  |                 | 71:20,24  | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 155:20 173:8  |
| 108:9 161:3  | •               | 83:16 93:11   |                                       | 176:2,18      |
| attest       121:4 147:1       189:8       209:2 211:1         44:21 54:15       158:23 162:22       189:8       backgrounds       14:22 24:4         60:12 112:16       132:14 193:25       169:10,18       147:5       25:21 75:4         attitude       176:16 186:13       153:1 154:3       135:16 137:1         114:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         154:4 198:20       192:19 194:25       194:10,11,12       184:4 196:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       211:15,25       214:28       69:19 141:6,7       184:4 196:5         attorney       211:15,25       69:19 141:6,7       142:5,9,20       85:18 151:6       85:18 151:6         attorney/client       awareness       216:1       143:17 144:6,       11:10 36:9       70:13 76:4       11:10 36:9         audible       6:15,20       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:       12:20,21 35:6       88ss         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:       34:         24:8,13,17,21       38:9 39:20       19:12,18,20       98:17,24       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       128:20 133:23       148:19 202:2         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       <   |                 | 97:18 100:5   |                                       | 191:9 199:18  |
| 44:21 54:15       153:23 162:22       backgrounds       14:22 24:4         60:12 112:16       163:12       147:5       25:21 75:4         132:14 193:25       171:17 173:18       147:5       96:19 131:14         25:21 75:4       96:19 131:14       153:1 154:3       135:16 137:1         114:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         154:4 198:20       192:19 194:25       194:10,11,12       184:4 196:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       21:15,25       214:2,8,23         215:11,5       214:2,8,23       215:11,15       42:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         216:1       216:1       216:1       216:17       213:46:17       213:46:17       213:46:17       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       213:40:10       214:8       215:10       214:8       214:8       <  |                 | 121:4 147:1   | · ·                                   | 209:2 211:1   |
| ## 44:21 54:15 60:12 112:16 132:14 193:25 ### 176:16 186:13 114:12 153:1 154:4 198:20 199:13,15,16 ### 176:16 186:13 145:21 ### 176:16 186:13 154:4 198:20 199:13,15,16 ### 176:16 186:13 154:4 198:20 199:13,15,16 ### 176:16 186:13 153:1 154:3 190:10 151:25 183:5 188:14,16 190:10 192:19 194:25 194:10,11,12 184:4 196:5 194:10,11,12 184:4 196:5 194:10,11,12 184:4 196:5 184:4 196:5 185:18 151:6 185:18 11:10 36:9 14:22 24:4 25:21 75:4 26:19 131:14 135:16 137:1 151:25 183:5 184:4 196:5 18 |                 | 158:23 162:22   | 189:8                                 | basically     |
| 60:12 112:16       169:10,18       147:5       25:21 75:4         132:14 193:25       171:17 173:18       had       96:19 131:14         144:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         154:4 198:20       192:19 194:25       194:10,11,12       184:4 196:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       hadge       214:2         21:15,25       214:2,8,23       69:19 141:6,7       hasing         145:21       214:2,8,23       142:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         attorney/client       143:17 144:6,       hasis         8:19       216:1       hall       70:13 76:4         6:15,20       6:146:17       13:4 152:2         auspices       B       12:20,21 35:6       hass         205:19       hack       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authority       41:21 44:19       100:21       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       50:14 58:9,18       128:20 133:23       148:19 202:2         3utomatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10  |                 | 163:12  | backgrounds                           | _             |
| attitude       171:17 173:18       bad       96:19 131:14         114:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         154:4 198:20       192:19 194:25       194:10,11,12       184:4 196:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       211:15,25       214:2,8,23       214:8         attorney       214:2,8,23       69:19 141:6,7       214:8         attorney/client       215:11,15       42:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         audible       216:1       5all       70:13 76:4         6:15,20       61:21 64:12       13:4 152:2         auspices       8arr       12:20,21 35:6       8ass         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       44:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10  |                 | 169:10,18   | 147:5                                 |               |
| attitude       176:16 186:13       153:1 154:3       135:16 137:1         114:12 153:1       188:14,16       190:10       151:25 183:5         199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       211:15,25       214:2,8,23       214:2,8,23         145:21       214:2,8,23       215:11,15       369:19 141:6,7       365:18 151:6         attorney/client       awareness       7 146:17       11:10 36:9         audible       6:15,20       61:21 64:12       13:4 152:2         auspices       Barr       19:14 203:7         205:19       back       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       128:20 133:23       148:19 202:2         automatic       79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | 132:14 193:25   | 171:17 173:18   | bad                                   |               |
| 114:12 153:1 154:4 198:20 199:13,15,16  attorney 145:21  attorney/client 8:19  audible 6:15,20  auspices 205:19  back authority 24:8,13,17,21  authorization 134:25 135:13 automatic 122:22  188:14,16 190:10 194:10,11,12 184:4 196:5 214:8  badge 69:19 141:6,7 142:5,9,20 85:18 151:6  basis 11:10 36:9 70:13 76:4 11:10 36:9 70:13 76:4 11:10 36:9 88:10 91:9 11:10 36: | attitude        | 176:16 186:13   | 153:1 154:3                           |               |
| 154:4 198:20 199:13,15,16  attorney 145:21 214:2,8,23 215:11,15 audible 6:15,20  auspices 205:19  authority 24:8,13,17,21  authorization 134:25 135:13 automatic 122:22  192:19 194:25 197:17 200:22 211:15,25 214:8  badge 69:19 141:6,7 142:5,9,20 143:17 144:6, 15ais 11:10 36:9 10:13 76:4 11:10 36:9 11:10  | 114:12 153:1    | 188:14,16   |                                       |               |
| 199:13,15,16       197:17 200:22       badge       214:8         attorney       214:2,8,23       69:19 141:6,7       basing         145:21       214:2,8,23       142:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         attorney/client       awareness       7 146:17       11:10 36:9         8:19       ball       70:13 76:4       13:4 152:2         audible       6:15,20       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       Basr       191:4 203:7         205:19       back       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       19:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | 154:4 198:20    | 192:19 194:25   |                                       |               |
| attorney       211:15,25       69:19 141:6,7       basing         145:21       214:2,8,23       142:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         attorney/client       143:17 144:6,       basis         8:19       216:1       ball       70:13 76:4         6:15,20       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       Barr       191:4 203:7         205:19       back       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | 199:13,15,16    | 197:17 200:22   |                                       |               |
| 145:21       214:2,8,23       3215:11,15       142:5,9,20       85:18 151:6         attorney/client       143:17 144:6,       basis         8:19       awareness       7 146:17       11:10 36:9         audible       5:15 14:12       11:10 36:9         6:15,20       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       8arr       191:4 203:7         205:19       back       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         3utomatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | attorney        | 211:15,25   |                                       |               |
| attorney/client       215:11,15       143:17 144:6,       basis         8:19       awareness       7 146:17       11:10 36:9         audible       515,20       61:21 64:12       11:10 36:9         auspices       61:21 64:12       11:4 152:2         205:19       back       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   |                 | 214:2,8,23  | i i                                   | _             |
| 8:19       awareness       7 146:17       basis         audible       216:1       ball       70:13 76:4         6:15,20       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       B       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         205:19       back       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | 2++22224/21ia=+ | 215:11,15   |                                       |               |
| audible       216:1       ball       70:13 76:4         6:15,20       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       191:4 203:7         205:19       back       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   |                 | awareness   |                                       | basis         |
| audible       ball       70:13 76:4         6:15,20       61:21 64:12       113:4 152:2         auspices       B       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         205:19       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10  |                 |   | / 146:1/                              | 11:10 36:9    |
| auspices       B       Barr       191:4 203:7         205:19       back       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10  |                 |   |                                       |               |
| auspices       Barr       191:4 203:7         205:19       back       12:20,21 35:6       Bass         authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10  | 6:15,20         |   | 61:21 64:12                           | 113:4 152:2   |
| authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       50:14 58:9,18       128:20 133:23       148:19 202:2         122:22       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | auspices        | B   | Barr                                  | 191:4 203:7   |
| authority       6:14 8:24       88:10 91:9       30:13,14 34:         24:8,13,17,21       14:18 18:4       100:21       48:3 50:17         authorization       38:9 39:20       119:12,18,20       98:17,24         134:25 135:13       41:21 44:19       127:15,20       135:8 138:20         automatic       71:5 79:6       134:3,14       215:10   | 205:19          | back  | 12:20,21 35:6                         | Bass          |
| 24:8,13,17,21     14:18 18:4     100:21     48:3 50:17       authorization     38:9 39:20     119:12,18,20     98:17,24       134:25 135:13     41:21 44:19     127:15,20     135:8 138:20       automatic     71:5 79:6     134:3,14     215:10   | authority       |   | i i                                   | 30:13,14 34:9 |
| authorization     38:9 39:20     119:12,18,20     98:17,24       134:25 135:13     41:21 44:19     127:15,20     135:8 138:20       automatic     50:14 58:9,18     128:20 133:23     148:19 202:2       122:22     71:5 79:6     134:3,14     215:10  | _               |   | 100:21                                | '             |
| 134:25 135:13  |                 |   | 119:12,18,20                          | 1             |
| automatic 122:22  50:14 58:9,18 128:20 133:23 148:19 202:2 134:3,14 215:10   |                 |   | · · ·                                 | 135:8 138:20  |
| automatic 71:5 79:6 134:3,14 215:10  |                 | · -   | · ·                                   | 148:19 202:21 |
| 122:22   |                 | , in the second |                                       |               |
| Bates  | 122:22          |   |                                       |               |
|  |                 | 00.21 71.20   | . = =                                 | Dates         |
|  |                 |   |                                       |               |

| 1 | ī | 7 |   |  |
|---|---|---|---|--|
|   | ŧ |   |   |  |
|   |   |   |   |  |
|   | - |   | ١ |  |
|   |   |   |   |  |

| 161:4,7                  | 140:20 142:3                  | 99:19 132:19              | 88:9 91:9                 |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|
| bathrooms                | Berger                        | 206:1                     | 95:17,20 96:6             |
| 7:3                      | 53:22 54:4                    | blurred                   | 98:17 99:2,13             |
| bear                     | 55:24                         | 38:25                     | 120:19 124:1,             |
| 160:24                   |                               |                           | 8,14,21 125:9             |
|                          | <pre>big   143:12 146:2</pre> | blurring<br>39:3,10,13,16 | Brasfield's               |
| began                    |                               | 1                         | 99:23 203:7               |
| 69:16                    | binder                        | Board                     | break                     |
| beginning                | 158:13                        | 173:25 174:3              | 6:24 7:1,3                |
| 53:24                    | birth                         | body                      | 50:15 75:19               |
| begins                   | 7:7                           | 174:12                    | 123:19 190:23             |
| 15:20 48:21              | bit                           | bold                      | 198:4                     |
| 131:12                   | 32:18 92:24                   | 156:16 157:3              |                           |
| begun                    | 93:24 140:9                   | book                      | breaking                  |
| 218:4                    | 149:17 152:1,                 | 157:21                    | 94:14 155:5               |
| behalf                   | 19 155:6                      | booklet                   | Brenda                    |
| 85:12                    | 162:9 198:1                   | 156:24                    | 125:21 126:9              |
|                          | 216:13                        |                           | 149:2                     |
| behavior                 | blame                         | booklets                  | bright                    |
| 19:8 24:5                | 58:3,17 71:2                  | 158:12                    | 56:14                     |
| 42:9 51:3,6,8            | 74:17,20                      | boss                      | bring                     |
| 54:5 79:3                | 192:11,20                     | 53:4,11 88:5              | 55:15,19                  |
| 80:6 86:19               | blamed                        | bothering                 | 186:8,11                  |
| 150:15 151:11            | 71:4                          | 17:22                     | 187:3,7                   |
| 157:2,24                 |                               | bottom                    | bringing                  |
| 206:16,18                | blameless                     | 32:16 119:9               | 45:24 77:20               |
| behavioral               | 192:15                        | 122:14 130:23             | 202:25 203:1              |
| 41:8 206:11              | blatant                       | 140:8,9 148:1             |                           |
| behaviors                | 190:19                        | 156:8 159:25              | broken                    |
| 213:7 214:25             | block                         | 184:24 185:22             | 177:16                    |
| beings                   | 144:9                         | bounce                    | brought                   |
| 117:20                   | blocks                        | 79:6                      | 13:1,9 40:10              |
| belief                   | 177:16                        |                           | 55:17 84:1,               |
| 41:14                    | blood                         | рож                       | 17,23 108:6,              |
|                          | 122:17                        | 147:25 148:1,             | 8,23 109:5                |
| believed                 |                               | 4                         | 112:20                    |
| 213:23 217:12            | Blue                          | boxes                     | 114:23,24                 |
| bells                    | 80:16,18                      | 107:7                     | 115:21 124:18             |
| 85:9                     | 184:18                        | Brasfield                 | 129:19 150:7,             |
|                          | blur                          | 14:19,20                  | 20 190:18                 |
| benefits                 | 2242                          | 14:17,20                  | 1                         |
| benefits<br>11:12 123:14 | 38:21 47:13                   | 30:12 38:10               | 195:17,18<br>201:12 208:5 |

| Bryce         | 136:2 137:24   | 22 70.0 10     | 127.2.0       |
|---------------|----------------|----------------|---------------|
| 88:14 91:10   | 136:2 137:24   | 23 78:8,19,    | 137:3,9       |
|               |                | 22,24 87:7,15  | 139:20 160:17 |
| 122:16 127:5, | 184:15 194:1   | 120:24 128:25  | 166:21 167:16 |
| 19 128:4,5    | 207:25 218:11  | 129:1,6        | 174:18 189:17 |
| buck          | called         | 166:19 167:25  | 193:20 194:7  |
| 78:9          | 15:20 31:20    | 168:6 169:21   | 196:22 201:19 |
| building      | 65:8 80:14,16  | 188:15 192:24  | 214:10        |
| 69:16 146:4   | 91:16 93:2,8   | 193:6 209:6,9  | cases         |
| bullet        | 136:22 137:16  | cared          | 12:24 20:9,12 |
| 37:24 39:21   | 158:4 182:21   | 191:12 193:10  | 21:21 22:9    |
| 48:1 75:18    | calling        | career         | 37:17 45:13   |
| 80:9 81:15    | 65:23          | 197:14         | 50:25 83:17   |
| 82:7,20 88:8  | calls          |                | 98:10 107:4   |
| 204:24 205:10 | 14:23 65:15    | cares<br>130:4 | 136:6 137:8   |
| 204:24 205:10 | 123:3          |                | 154:10 171:1, |
|               | 123:3          | caring         | 23            |
| bullying      | campus         | 190:16,20      | catch         |
| 55:7 179:23   | 38:14 45:5     | 191:7          | 141:9         |
| bunch         | 48:15,16       | carried        | · ·           |
| 75:15         | 69:18 124:19,  | 53:25          | categorical   |
| business      | 24 186:15      | carries        | 104:10 196:12 |
| 10:1 14:8,9,  | 211:20         | 170:7          | categorically |
| 12,16 16:15   | capacity       |                | 196:2,8       |
| 21:2 52:8     | 198:17         | carry          | caught        |
| 103:2,4       | car            | 192:18         | 71:1          |
| 126:5,8,10    | 67:23 80:12    | case           |               |
| 134:23 137:11 |                | 6:6 9:6,10,14  | caused        |
| 162:21 163:13 | 82:8 184:5,21  | 17:7,8,24      | 49:2 134:19   |
|               | card           | 18:2 20:13,    | 183:20        |
| Butler        | 67:18,22 68:8  | 18,19 21:6,12  | causing       |
| 160:19        | 69:11,15       | 23:6,11 36:11  | 51:7          |
|               | cardiovascular | 37:8,11 39:12  | cavalier      |
| С             | 52:18,20,23    | 42:25 67:15    | 92:24 93:8    |
|               | 53:23 54:5     | 97:11 98:7     | 198:20        |
| calendar      | 56:1,3,4,10    | 105:12 108:2,  | 199:13,16     |
| 161:24        | care           | 5 109:3,11,    |               |
| calender      | 42:15,18,24    | 16,24 110:21   | Cecilia       |
| 98:21         | i i            | 113:25 114:7,  | 30:13,14 48:3 |
| call          | 43:2,6,21,23,  | 15,18,21       | 50:17 98:17   |
| 64:10 80:20   | 25 52:20,23    | 115:10 118:8,  | 135:8 148:18  |
| 86:22 118:19  | 53:24 54:5     | 18,21 126:13   | 202:21,25     |
| 135:4,8,12    | 71:13,25       | 129:21 132:5   | 203:1         |
|               | 73:16 74:11,   | 147:41 134:3   |               |

|                  | 1             | 1             |               |
|------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| center           | 70:16         | Christmas     | 60:9 196:17   |
| 157:24 158:3,    | chase         | 189:24        | 199:10        |
| 18               | 142:17        | circumstances | coaching      |
| certainty        | check         | 102:19 114:4  | 33:13         |
| 72:13 132:15     | 50:22 53:4,5, | 115:11,15     | code          |
| 151:21           | 13,17 65:7    | 123:17,22     | 49:21 80:10,  |
| certificates     | 70:16 81:1    | 180:17        | 11,14,16,18,  |
| 8:9              | 84:20 98:21   | cited         | 20 182:20     |
| certification    | 149:4 182:22  | 79:2 80:5     | 183:24 184:6, |
| 8:11 117:23,     | 184:12 197:12 | claim         | 7,18          |
| 25               | checked       | 171:10        | coded         |
| certifications   | 151:5 187:10  | claims        | 183:25        |
| 173:8            | 193:15 217:23 | 5:17 52:13,14 | coding        |
|                  | checking      | · ·           | 184:16        |
| cetera<br>121:14 | 46:2 188:21   | clarify       |               |
|                  | 190:22        | 13:17 17:14   | coffee        |
| chair            | checklist     | 75:20         | 54:1          |
| 142:8 144:15     | 34:6 123:4,5  | class         | Colin         |
| 161:21           | 204:25 215:5, | 154:13        | 61:10,15      |
| 162:10,19        | 9,12 216:18,  | classified    | colleagues    |
| chairman         | 21,23 217:20, | 199:12        | 120:11        |
| 160:11,16,17,    | 24 218:3,15   | clear         | color         |
| 18,20,22         | -             | 6:20 91:22    | 80:20         |
| 161:8,13,25      | chicken       | clinical      | column        |
| chance           | 97:8,9        | 42:13 44:2,8, | 164:5         |
| 112:14 211:16    | chief         | 11 73:14      |               |
| chancellor       | 41:9 95:22    | 105:19 158:7  | comment       |
| 161:23 162:1,    | 179:12 186:6, | clinics       | 93:22         |
| 3                | 22 209:15     | 158:6         | comments      |
| change           | choice        |               | 38:1,23 206:6 |
| 51:7 92:13       | 147:19,25     | clocked       | committed     |
| 95:1             | chooses       | 67:14         | 171:1         |
| characterize     | 82:22 85:2    | closely       | committee     |
| 28:16,25         | chose         | 60:22         | 44:2,8,11     |
| ·                | 105:17        | closest       | 73:15 101:6   |
| charge           | Chris         | 144:13        | 129:3 162:10, |
| 148:19,20,21     | 98:18 138:14  | co-worker     | 11,15,19,20   |
| charting         | 202:22        | 42:10,20      | committee's   |
| 69:24 70:4,17    |               | 115:6         | 129:16        |
| charts           | Christian     | co-workers    | committing    |
|                  | 88:12 91:10   |               | Comma CCLIIG  |
|                  |               |               |               |
|                  |               |               | -             |

| 171:5             | complaints    | 69:25                    | 219:12                      |
|-------------------|---------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|
| common            | 154:3         | con                      | concludes                   |
| 124:3             | complete      | 141:19                   | 219:4                       |
| communicate       | 34:5 40:22    | conceal                  | conclusion                  |
| 61:14             | 116:16 211:13 | 195:12                   | 176:12                      |
| communicated      | 217:15        |                          |                             |
| 40:25 62:21       | completed     | concealing               | conclusions<br>83:22 175:17 |
|                   | 18:25 34:7    |                          |                             |
| communicating     | 41:25 217:2   | concealment              | conclusive                  |
| 61:21 124:5       | 218:14        | 169:14                   | 30:25 31:13                 |
| communication     | completely    | conceivable              | 77:22 110:16                |
| 124:13            | 25:3,4 45:22  | 147:12 148:7             | 183:11,13                   |
| company           | *             | concern                  | 197:3                       |
| 5:23              | completion    | 13:1,6,9,12              | concomitant                 |
| comparison        | 81:18 217:1   | 14:3,10                  | 124:11                      |
| 170:11 206:8      | compliance    | 190:22 195:20            | concrete                    |
| 217:18            | 22:12 46:24   | 198:18 205:3             | 39:17                       |
|                   | 107:8,20,22   | 217:25                   | concur                      |
| compartmentaliz   | 165:19,23     | concerned                | 77:17                       |
| ed<br>171:14      | 166:7,16,18,  | 39:3 51:17               |                             |
|                   | 19,24 167:8,  | 89:1,13,14               | concurrence                 |
| compensated       | 10 170:11     |                          | 23:23                       |
| 140:24            | 206:4         | concerns<br>13:4,25 14:1 | condescending               |
| compensation      | complied      | 19:7 49:2                | 92:9                        |
| 11:12             | 23:8,13 24:1  | 71:10 75:15,             | conditions                  |
| competencies      | complimentary | 17 76:6,8,21             | 7:22 159:9                  |
| 211:10            | 57:23         | 87:5 89:10               | conduct                     |
| competent         | complying     | 91:18 92:15              | 13:11 19:15                 |
| 82:10             | 29:1          | 100:22 108:6,            | 21:12 30:16                 |
|                   |               | 23 115:7                 | 39:25 44:17                 |
| compilation 63:22 | component     | 124:15,20                | 54:19 65:3                  |
|                   | 19:6 35:9,10, | 129:19 195:16            | 81:11 83:17                 |
| compile           | 12,13 36:6,8, | 201:11 203:3,            | 84:22 87:21                 |
| 60:16             | 9 38:6 41:6   | 4 205:6,14               | 109:15 110:2                |
| compiled          | 76:10 205:18  | 208:5,17,25              | 117:21 118:5                |
| 60:6,8 71:6       | 206:7,14,16   | 209:3,5                  | 150:6 153:22                |
| complaining       | 217:21,23     | ·                        | 165:11 167:16               |
| 152:25            | 218:3         | conclude                 | 175:10,13,22                |
| complaint         | computer      | 51:22 217:15             | 176:7 179:22                |
| 40:5 152:12       | 207:10        | concluded                | 185:17                      |
| 70.5 152.12       | computers     | 51:24 52:2               | 186:13,20                   |
|                   |               |                          |                             |
| <u> </u>          |               |                          |                             |

| ٠ |  | 4 |  |
|---|--|---|--|
|   |  |   |  |

| 21:6 22:14   | _            |               |               | 1             |
|--|--------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| 63:10 83:14 84:2 87:16 102:5 110:8 conjunction  conducting 49:12 76:17, 19 connect 77:15 consect 36:2 75:2 conferences 205:24 conferencing 47:21 confidence 63:9 confident 214:20 confidential 201:25 202:1 confidently 202:13 confidently 202:14 confidently 62:13 confidently 62:13 congruence 73:9 89:11 135:1 139:12 101:13 172:8 101:13 173:5 contumacious 175:10,13,22 176:7 convene 162:20 contacting 162:20 contacting 162:20 contacting 162:20 contacting 162:20 contacting 162:20 context 165:24 166:25 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 146:19 153:5 101:13 172:8 173:5 173:5 176:7 contumacious 175:10,13,22 176:7 convene 162:20 context 165:24 166:25 146:19 153:5 180:15 187:2 140:19 149:24 contemporaneous 87:25 97:25 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:17,21,23 105:18 15:18 153:1 100:18 187:20 104:18 187:10 104:17,21,23 105:18 187:20 104:18 187:10 104:17,21,23 105:18 187:10 104:17,21,23 105:18 18 |              | _             |               | 213:17 214:16 |
| 84:2 87:16 102:5 110:8  conducting 49:12 76:17, 19 connect 77:15 confer 36:2 75:2 consents 205:24 conferencing 47:21 confidence 63:9 confident 214:20 confident 201:25 202:1 confidently 202:31 confidently 202:31 confidently 202:31 confidently 202:4 confidently 202:41 confidently 202:41 confidently 202:41 confidently 202:42 22 7:24 28:5 47:22 confident 214:20 confidently 225:202:1 23:10 confidently 24:22 27:24 28:5 47:22 confidently 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:14 26:14 26:13 26:13 26:13 26:14 26:13 26:13 26:14 26:13 26:13 26:14 27:25 20:15 26:14 26:14 26:13 26:14 26:13 26:14 27:25 20:16 26:14 26:13 27:14 21:20 20:15 20:16 21:14:124:22 21:20 20:16 21:14:124:22 21:14:12 21:14:124:22 21:14:21 21:13:13:12 21:14:124:22 21:14:21 21:13:13:12 21:13:13:12 21:14:124:22 21:14:21 21:13:13:12 21:13:13:12:13 21:14:124:22 21:14:21 21:13:13:12:13 21:14:124:22 21:14:21 21:13:13:12:13 21:13:12:13 21:13:12:13 21:13:12:13 21:13:13:12:13 21:13:13:12:13 21:13:13:12:13 21:14:124:22 21:14:12:13 21:14:124:22 21:14:11 21:14:124:22 21:14:12:13 21:14:124:22 21:14:11 21:14:124:22 21:14:12:13 21:14:124:22 21:14:11 21:14:124:22 21:16:13:14:12:22 21:16:13:14:12:22 21:16:11:13:17:18 21:11:13:13:12 21:10:11:13:17:18 21:11:13:13:12 21:10:11:13:17:18 21:10:11:13:17:18 21:10:11:13:17:18 21:10:11:13:17:18 21:11:13:13:12 21:10:11:13:17:18 21:11:11:13:13:12 21:10:11:13:12:14 21:10:11:13:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:13:12:12 21:10:11:12:12:12 21:10:11:12:12:12 21:10:11:12:12:12 21:10:11:12:12:12:12:12 21:10:11:12:12:12:12:12:12:12:12:12:12:12:12:  |              | 79:12         |               | contracts     |
| 102:5 110:8     103:14     140:11     173:5  |              | congruence    |               | 101:13 172:8  |
| conducting         171:16         contacted         175:10,13,22           49:12 76:17,         200:15         140:19 149:24         176:7           conduit         200:15         contacting         162:20           confer         consensus         contained         87:25 97:25           36:2 75:2         57:24         consent         165:24 166:25         146:19 153:5           205:24         consent         173:4         180:15 187:2           conferencing         consents         33:19         conversations           47:21         consents         33:19         conversations           confidence         conservative         78:6 86:6         151:18 153:1           confident         consideration         142:3         conversing           confidential         201:25 202:1         10:23 14:6         97:13 101:15         7:15           confidently         24:22 27:24         134:1 201:3         coordinated           62:13         28:5 47:22         214:21         20:20  |              | 161:14        |               | 173:5         |
| conducting         171:16         contacted         175:10,13,22           49:12 76:17,         200:15         200:15         200:19         200:15           conduit         connecting         150:4         convenee           77:15         consensus         200:16         contacting         162:20           confer         consensus         27:4 157:1         104:17,21,23           conferences         consent         165:24 166:25         146:19 153:5           205:24         consent         123:6,7         contemporaneous         4 194:16           confidence         consents         33:19         conversations           confident         consideration         142:3         conversations           confident         consideration         142:3         conversing           confidential         201:25 202:1         10:23 14:6         97:13 101:15         7:15           confidently         24:22 27:24         134:1 201:3         coordinated           62:13         28:5 47:22         214:21         20:20   | 102:5 110:8  | conjunction   | 140:11        | contumacious  |
| 49:12 76:17,       connect       91:14 124:22       176:7         19       200:15       convenee         conduit       connecting       150:4       convenee         77:15       consensus       contained       87:25 97:25         36:2 75:2       57:24       consent       165:24 166:25       104:17,21,23         conferences       consent       123:6,7       contemporaneous       4 194:16         confidence       consents       33:19       conversations         confident       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confidential       consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       28:5 47:22       134:1 201:3       coordinated  | conducting   | l *           | contacted     |               |
| 19   | 49:12 76:17, |               | 91:14 124:22  | · · ·         |
| conduit         connecting         contacting         162:20           77:15         200:16         contained         87:25 97:25           36:2 75:2         57:24         27:4 157:1         104:17,21,23           conferences         205:24         165:24 166:25         146:19 153:5           205:24         123:6,7         contemporaneous         4 194:16           conferencing         consents         33:19         conversations           confidence         conservative         78:6 86:6         151:18 153:1           confident         consideration         176:23         continuation         200:23 214:1           confidential         considered         26:3 49:7,8         convicted           confidently         24:22 27:24         34:1 201:3         coordinated           20:213         28:5 47:22         214:21         29:20  | 19           |               | 140:19 149:24 |               |
| 77:15     connecting     150:4     conversation       confer     consensus     27:4 157:1     104:17,21,23       conferences     205:24     165:24 166:25     146:19 153:5       conferencing     consents     173:4     180:15 187:2       conferencing     consents     33:19     conversations       confidence     conservative     8:17,25 76:2       63:9     195:1     continuation     200:23 214:1       confident     consideration     142:3     conversing       confidential     considered     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       confidently     24:22 27:24     34:1 201:3     coordinated       28:5 47:22     214:21     28:20  | conduit      |               | contacting    |               |
| confer       200:16       contained       87:25 97:25         36:2 75:2       57:24       27:4 157:1       104:17,21,23         conferences       consent       165:24 166:25       146:19 153:5         205:24       123:6,7       contemporaneous       4 194:16         conferencing       consents       33:19       conversations         47:21       consents       33:19       conversations         confidence       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confident       consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       134:1 201:3       coordinated         62:13       28:5 47:22       214:21       28:20  |              | _             |               | 162:20        |
| 36:2 75:2     consensus     27:4 157:1     104:17,21,23       conferences     consent     165:24 166:25     146:19 153:5       205:24     123:6,7     contemporaneous     4 194:16       conferencing     consents     33:19     conversations       confidence     conservative     78:6 86:6     151:18 153:1       confident     consideration     142:3     conversing       confidential     considered     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       confidently     24:22 27:24     134:1 201:3     coordinated       62:13     28:5 47:22     214:21     coordinated   |              | 200:16        |               | conversation  |
| conferences       57:24       165:24 166:25       146:19 153:5         205:24       123:6,7       180:15 187:2         conferencing       consents       33:19       4 194:16         confidence       conservative       8:17,25 76:2         63:9       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confident       consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       97:13 101:15       7:15         coordinated       28:5 47:22       214:21       28:20   |              | consensus     |               | 87:25 97:25   |
| 205:24       consent       173:4       180:15 187:2         conferencing       consents       33:19       conversations         confidence       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confident       consideration       176:23       continuation       200:23 214:1         confidently       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         201:25 202:1       10:23 14:6       97:13 101:15       7:15         confidently       24:22 27:24       134:1 201:3       coordinated         62:13       28:5 47:22       214:21       29:20   | 36:2 /5:2    | 57:24         | –             | 104:17,21,23  |
| 205:24  conferencing 47:21  consents 123:10  conservative 63:9  confident 214:20  confidential 201:25 202:1  confidently 62:13  123:6,7  contemporaneous 33:19  context 78:6 86:6 151:18 153:1 200:23 214:1  continuation 142:3 continue 26:3 49:7,8 97:13 101:15 134:1 201:3 200:000000000000000000000000000000000  |              | consent       | 1             | 146:19 153:5  |
| conferencing       consents       contemporaneous       4 194:16         47:21       123:10       context       8:17,25 76:2         confidence       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confident       consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       97:13 101:15       7:15         coordinated       28:5 47:22       214:21       coordinated   | 205:24       |               |               | 180:15 187:2, |
| 47:21     123:10     context     8:17,25 76:2       63:9     20:23 214:1       confident     consideration     142:3     conversing       confidential     considered     20:23 14:6     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       confidently     24:22 27:24     33:19     conversations       8:17,25 76:2     151:18 153:1     200:23 214:1       continuation     conversing     6:14       confidently     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       7:15     134:1 201:3     coordinated       28:5 47:22     214:21     28:20  | conferencing | , ·           | _             | 4 194:16      |
| confidence       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confident       consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       34:1 201:3       coordinated         62:13       28:5 47:22       214:21       coordinated   | 47:21        |               | 33:19         | conversations |
| 63:9       conservative       78:6 86:6       151:18 153:1         confident       consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       34:1 201:3       coordinated         62:13       28:5 47:22       214:21       coordinated   | confidence   |               | context       | 8:17,25 76:20 |
| confident       195:1       continuation       200:23 214:1         consideration       142:3       conversing         confidential       considered       26:3 49:7,8       convicted         confidently       24:22 27:24       97:13 101:15       7:15         62:13       28:5 47:22       214:21       coordinated   |              |               | 78:6 86:6     | 151:18 153:13 |
| 214:20     consideration     142:3     conversing       confidential     considered     6:14       201:25 202:1     considered     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       confidently     24:22 27:24     97:13 101:15     7:15       62:13     28:5 47:22     214:21     28:30   |              | 195:1         | continuation  | 200:23 214:13 |
| confidential     considered     201:25 202:1     considered     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       confidently     24:22 27:24     34:1 201:3     coordinated       62:13     28:5 47:22     214:21     28:30   |              | consideration |               | conversing    |
| confidential     considered     26:3 49:7,8     convicted       10:23 14:6     97:13 101:15     7:15       201:25 202:1     24:22 27:24     134:1 201:3     200rdinated       62:13     28:5 47:22     214:21     28:30  |              | 176:23        |               | _             |
| 201:25 202:1  confidently 62:13  10:23 14:6 24:22 27:24 28:5 47:22  20:3 49:7,8 97:13 101:15 7:15 coordinated 214:21   |              | considered    | ·             |               |
| confidently     24:22 27:24     37:13 101:13     7:15       62:13     28:5 47:22     134:1 201:3     coordinated       28:5 47:22     214:21     28:30   | 201:25 202:1 | · ·           | · ·           |               |
| 62:13 28:5 47:22 214:21 coordinated  | confidently  |               | ·             | 7:15          |
| 414:41   00.20   | 62:13        |               |               | coordinated   |
| <b>CONTIRM</b>   109:6-158:9   | confirm      | 109:6 158:9   |               | 88:20         |
| 14:25 53:10 continued copied   |              |               |               | copied        |
| CONSISCING   ACTION ACTION   |              | _             | 26:7,11 89:2  | 95:19 138:13  |
| 96:18 100:14   continues   | 96:18 100:14 |               | continues     | CODY          |
| 196:7 Constitution 48:12 40:25 41:2 2  |              |               | 48:12         | 40:25 41:2,25 |
| 175:8 confirmation 175:8   | confirmation | 175:8         | continuing    |               |
| concult.   |              | consult       | _             | 217:8 219:10, |
| 103:14 119:21  |              | 103:14 119:21 |               | •             |
| consultant   |              | consultant    |               |               |
| 62:17,18 63:8 5:16 28:1,4, copying   | · ·          | 10:4          |               |               |
| 64:19,22 5,7,9 101:10, 134:13  | ·            | consultation  | ' '           | 134:13        |
| 134.10 1/0.12 Core   |              |               |               | core          |
| 195:17 211:10  | 195:17 211:8 |               | i i           | 211:10        |
| confronted corner  | confronted   |               |               | corner        |
| 54:2 58:3,17 <b>consulted</b> 175:3,9,18,23 146:9  | 54:2 58:3,17 |               |               | 146:9         |
| 62:12 51:16,25 176:5,24  | 62:12        | 51:16,25      | 176:5,24      |               |
|  |              |               |               |               |

| correct       | 171:8 172:6,  | court         | 193:22,24     |
|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| 9:22 17:10    | 10 175:1      | 6:19 12:5     | dangerous     |
| 25:6,19 26:3  | 177:1 178:22  | 79:17 155:9,  | 73:24         |
| 27:20 28:2    | 179:5,9,15    | 11 219:9      |               |
| 30:8 34:25    | 180:19,21     | cover         | database      |
| 35:7,20 36:15 | 183:7 184:2,  | 64:13         | 129:11        |
| 43:2,13 44:10 | 19,22 185:15  | cracks        | date          |
| 54:14 55:16   | 188:11,12,19  | 130:4         | 7:7 45:5      |
| 56:18,21,25   | 189:3 191:17  |               | 48:24 52:16   |
| 57:3 59:25    | 193:11,12     | creams        | 70:12 87:13   |
| 60:3,15,17    | 194:19 196:20 | 72:1          | 203:6 211:18, |
| 63:21 64:1,   | 199:9,15      | created       | 21 217:1      |
| 18,21 65:5,   | 201:21 203:13 | 131:22        | 218:4,13,14   |
| 18,21 66:1,8  | 206:12 208:1  | credentialed  | dated         |
| 67:18 68:16,  | 209:9,16      | 117:13        | 32:25 48:7    |
| 18,23 69:8    | 213:25 214:11 | credentials   | 95:17         |
| 70:1,6,14     | 216:24 217:3, | 8:10          | dates         |
| 74:3,5 75:12, | 17 218:24     |               | 87:12         |
| 16 78:10,19   | corrected     | Crews         | daughter      |
| 81:8 83:2     | 153:3         | 66:7,9,18     | 204:19        |
| 84:2 87:18    | corrective    | 70:20,25      | l i           |
| 90:20 91:7    | 218:9,17      | crime         | day           |
| 96:3,18       | İ             | 7:16          | 11:10,22      |
| 100:1,4       | correctly     | criteria      | 22:23 49:24   |
| 103:12 107:18 | 151:22        | 160:6         | 52:22 69:6,17 |
| 108:2 109:16  | correspond    | crossed       | 70:18 79:22   |
| 110:23 111:1, | 117:7         | 15:1 100:16   | 81:4,25       |
| 5 112:15,22   | counsel       | cultural      | 101:21 107:17 |
| 114:5,13,19   | 9:1 88:13     | 200:3         | 122:5 134:16, |
| 115:1,12,16,  | counseling    |               | 18 135:16     |
| 22 116:8,10   | 15:6,17,21    | culture       | 145:9 146:10  |
| 117:2 128:22  | 152:16,17     | 92:8          | 153:19        |
| 131:1,25      | 164:24 205:24 | curiosity     | 179:13,15     |
| 132:11 133:4, | count         | 121:21        | 185:2,3 186:7 |
| 5,19,24       | 216:24        | current       | 187:21        |
| 134:4,10      |               | 7:9           | 189:23,24     |
| 138:7 139:8   | counting      |               | 190:1,8       |
| 140:3 148:21  | 216:24        | D             | 195:14 199:25 |
| 152:4 154:7   | couple        |               | 204:2 205:7   |
| 156:19,20,23  | 6:12 113:15   | danger        | 207:20 213:21 |
| 161:15 166:6, | 164:15 216:11 | 114:11 167:24 | 214:9,11,12   |
| 12 168:8      |               | 168:5 171:20  |               |
| <u> </u>      |               |               |               |
|               |               |               |               |

| days          | 134:15        | delegating              | 125:14,15     |
|---------------|---------------|-------------------------|---------------|
| 71:16 72:14   | 135:17,21     | 125:10                  | 126:6 129:2,  |
| 99:6 101:17   | 136:8 146:23  | delineated              | 3,12,20 130:5 |
| 107:11 112:21 | 160:10,13     | 170:11                  | 134:22 135:1, |
| 113:1,6       | 161:12 176:25 |                         | 5 136:4 150:2 |
| 120:25 121:6  | 202:4,5,6     | demarcation             | 160:12,17,18  |
| 131:6 134:15  | 205:4 214:7,  | 102:7                   | 161:8,13      |
| 137:19 161:24 | 20 218:1      | denial                  | 171:16,18     |
| 162:21 163:13 | decisions     | 196:12                  | 176:3,19      |
| 178:14 208:8  | 47:16,19      | denied                  | 181:5 197:6   |
| 211:6 213:10  | 163:3         | 31:4 186:21             | 199:19 201:25 |
| deadline      | decubitus     | 209:8                   | 202:13,14     |
| 178:15        | 169:12        | deny                    | 212:24        |
| deadlines     | 187:11,25     | 31:1 67:7               | department's  |
| 136:24        | 188:4,6,11    | 116:18 196:2            | 23:23 39:18   |
| deal          | 189:6 193:6   | denying                 | 85:23 110:17  |
|               |               | 185:13 196:8            | 112:11 116:23 |
| 17:3 32:2     | deem          |                         | 202:4         |
| dealing       | 40:16 64:5    | department              | departmental  |
| 192:16        | 101:15        | 10:17,25                | 161:21        |
| deals         | deemed        | 11:18 13:2,4,           |               |
| 38:16         | 14:10 51:3    | 19,20,23<br>14:2,5 17:1 | departments   |
| Dean          | 213:16        | 20:25 23:16             | 10:5,11 15:8  |
| 88:10 212:8,  | defense       | 24:24 29:15             | 40:13 45:19   |
| 9,12          | 83:20         | 30:5,8,25               | 171:19 204:8  |
| deceased      | deficiencies  | 31:13 40:22             | depend        |
| 29:20 94:11   | 213:3         | 41:16,17                | 14:2 16:13    |
| December      | deficiency    | 44:13 46:3              | 17:8 27:3     |
| 151:4 210:11, | 203:23        | 49:11 50:19             | 73:9 84:10    |
| 18 211:2      | deficient     | 51:13 52:5,             | 101:19 103:3  |
|               | 76:2          | 11,13 54:22,            | 136:6 170:20  |
| decided       |               | 24 55:11                | dependent     |
| 34:24 63:17   | definitively  | 60:17,22                | 25:3,4 96:11  |
| decides       | 84:14         | 61:22 62:4              | depending     |
| 35:17,25      | degree        | 65:24 73:21             | 27:18 122:25  |
| decision      | 8:1,5         | 77:19 103:3,            | 123:17,21     |
| 24:6 28:12,15 | delayed       | 14 105:13               | 126:4         |
| 37:15 41:13   | 62:4,9        | 114:18 117:2,           | depends       |
| 96:2,15,16    | delegated     | 8 118:24                | 13:7 24:23    |
| 103:9,24      | 61:11         | 119:3,13                | 54:21 101:18  |
| 132:25 133:18 |               | 124:10                  | 123:1         |
|               |               |                         |               |
|               |               |                         |               |
|               |               |                         |               |

|               | 1              | 1                   | 1                      |
|---------------|----------------|---------------------|------------------------|
| deposed       | determinations | differently         | 189:11 203:24          |
| 5:11          | 151:7          | 149:20 150:23       | 205:2 213:10,          |
| deposition    | determine      | 151:2 170:8         | 14                     |
| 5:8,14 8:20   | 22:12 23:18    | difficult           | director's             |
| 9:3,15 219:5, | 39:8 49:13     | 6:18 39:8           | 105:1                  |
| 12            | 59:2 67:13     | difficulty          | directors              |
| depositions   | 75:9 77:15     | 213:2               | 104:8 124:5            |
| 5:19,21 6:9   | 82:11 86:23    | diligence           | 144:1                  |
| derelict      | 96:25 97:12    | 19:12 75:9,12       | disciplinary           |
| 42:24 43:5,   | 110:8 130:8    | 76:5 116:1          | 11:15 164:6,           |
| 22,24         | 137:6          | 118:7,8             | 11,23 166:14           |
| dereliction   | determined     | 139:18 140:1        | 170:7                  |
| 209:12 211:9  | 22:15 34:9     | 217:13              |                        |
|               | 73:10 107:23   | dimensions          | discipline 12:24 13:10 |
| dermatology   | 109:11 112:9   | 146:5               | 14:21,23 15:4          |
|               | 115:24 116:22  |                     | 22:5,6,15,17,          |
| descent       | 117:13 119:1   | direct              | 21 45:14               |
| 103:16        | 124:10 205:7   | 14:7 26:21          | 50:25 77:3             |
| desired       | 213:9          | 63:1 99:22<br>161:3 | 100:2,6                |
| 120:3 149:13, | determines     |                     | 107:24,25              |
| 19 212:7      | 44:3 147:6     | directed            | 117:16,21              |
| desirous      | determining    | 142:13              | 153:24 155:1           |
| 57:25         | 205:4          | directly            | 157:2 159:8            |
| desk          | detrimental    | 16:16 21:19         | 193:6,10               |
| 142:19,20,22  | 170:24         | 108:2               | 194:6                  |
| 144:12,13,16, | development    | director            | disciplined            |
| 22            | 211:24 212:22  | 5:15 11:19          | 22:18 67:3             |
| destroy       |                | 14:5,22 19:9        | 192:21,24              |
| 182:5         | devises        | 24:16 35:25         | discovered             |
| detailed      | 208:18         | 49:6 50:20          | 22:14 53:22            |
| 158:17        | dictate        | 76:12 88:9,12       | 187:17                 |
|               | 27:14          | 91:4 95:20          |                        |
| details       | did-           | 96:17,24,25         | discretion             |
| 126:24 141:17 | 192:20         | 97:12 105:5         | 15:8 103:24            |
| 200:13        | difference     | 115:8,25            | 154:8 213:13           |
| determination | 101:11 110:4   | 116:14 117:1,       | discrimination         |
| 30:4 48:21    | 147:7          | 5,11 127:15         | 6:3,7                  |
| 103:7 105:2   | differential   | 128:10 133:1        | discuss                |
| 129:5,16      | 104:12 105:6,  | 138:12 149:17       | 88:23 98:4,            |
| 189:9         | 13             | 160:10,16           | 21,24 101:25           |
|               |                | 161:12,25           | 203:22 210:19          |
|               |                |                     |                        |

| discussed     | division      | 181:4,19       | dropped       |
|---------------|---------------|----------------|---------------|
| 34:8 35:17    | 30:10         | 183:2,10,12,   | 61:21 64:12   |
| 87:5 89:17,18 |               | 16 185:21      | 194:13        |
| 90:2,7 91:18  | divisions     |                | 194:13        |
| 92:5 99:9     | 10:18 158:4   | 197:2,15       | Drs           |
|               | doctor        | 203:2,21       | 214:19        |
| 120:5 124:15  | 69:22 74:3    | 204:1,4        | drug          |
| 127:18 167:22 | 141:18 169:22 | 205:12 212:5   | 51:1,5 113:25 |
| 182:8 197:8   | doctors       | documentations | 114:1 122:17  |
| 209:7 210:12  |               | 141:2          | 124:10,17     |
| 211:5         | 56:18 192:3,  | documented     | 150:13        |
| discussing    | 22            | 15:21          |               |
| 96:13 100:13  | document      |                | drugs         |
| 180:3         | 31:10,12,16,  | documenting    | 7:20 20:15    |
|               | 20 32:8 38:1  | 153:12,13      | 109:1         |
| discussion    | 59:20 87:10   | 196:23,24      | dual          |
| 89:22 93:21,  | 112:13,18,19  | documents      | 25:25 159:2   |
| 23 99:15      | 133:11 153:8, | 8:21 75:23     |               |
| 115:8 126:16  | 9,17 156:7    | 120:4 126:21   | due           |
| 150:14,17     | 160:25 162:16 | 134:9 141:11,  | 19:12 75:9,12 |
| discussions   | 164:1 166:4,  | 13 173:7       | 76:5 105:17   |
| 200:19        | 5,16,25       | 217:14         | 116:1 118:6,7 |
| dismiss       | ,             | 217:14         | 131:24 135:21 |
|               | 196:20 204:5, | door           | 136:18 139:18 |
| 24:21 96:2,16 | 6 206:6       | 142:9 144:9,   | 140:1 145:22  |
| 160:13        | 207:19,24     | 14,15 146:15   | 197:17,22     |
| dismissal     | 208:4,9,20    | dotted         | 217:12        |
| 160:2,9       | 211:2 217:5,9 | 15:1 100:15,   | duly          |
| 161:10        | documentation | 16             | 5:2           |
| dismissed     | 29:14 31:8,14 | -              |               |
| 25:10         | 33:5,9,13     | Dove           | duration      |
|               | 38:2,3 39:17  | 119:15         | 143:24        |
| disruptive    | 40:21 41:15,  | download       | duties        |
| 39:23 206:16  | 18 48:24      | 31:25          | 10:3 174:14,  |
| distinct      | 49:11,15 51:9 | drafted        | 25            |
| 35:8,23 102:6 | 75:16 77:16   | 48:2           | d., +         |
| distinction   | 100:20 110:16 |                | duty          |
| 25:22 35:15,  |               | drink          | 62:17 209:11, |
| · ·           | 111:15,16     | 93:15,17       | 12 211:9      |
| 16 160:15     | 121:13        | drinks         |               |
| 165:3,4,7     | 140:13,15     | 93:12          | E             |
| 166:1 203:15  | 145:2,3,5,7,  |                |               |
| divides       | 24 151:6      | Drive          | e-mail        |
| 208:17        | 152:16 155:20 | 7:10           | 32:24 33:3    |
|               | 176:2,19      |                | 35:5 38:8     |

| 48:1,2,7<br>50:16 63:20<br>75:22 79:2<br>80:3,9 84:18<br>86:15 94:11<br>98:17 99:7,<br>12,14,23<br>119:11 120:18<br>121:11 | 58:10 60:23<br>63:12,19,23<br>71:9 72:20<br>75:17 76:1,5,<br>12,20 77:21,<br>25 82:4,14<br>87:4,8,13,17<br>88:11,25 89:4<br>91:2 92:4,14   | 178:13 179:13<br>186:11 188:20<br>189:12,16<br>190:18 195:25<br>200:3,22,23<br>203:24 206:21<br>207:20 208:23<br>211:19 212:5,<br>23 213:4,21 | 46:10,15,20,<br>23 47:8,18<br>60:5,21<br>88:11,13,21<br>158:21 162:15<br>215:18,23<br>educational<br>19:5 172:15<br>educationally |
|--|--|---|---|
| 122:12,13<br>123:25 124:3<br>125:9,20<br>128:2,5<br>130:23 131:1,<br>7 134:13<br>135:3,7,10,25                             | 97:19,22,24,<br>25 98:4<br>100:20,21<br>102:1 111:24<br>112:7,24<br>113:4 115:3<br>116:13,21,25  | 214:14,19<br>215:13 216:2,<br>19 217:12,13<br>218:5,18<br>Earl's<br>44:14 60:25<br>135:25 136:14  | 206:8  effort  92:12,25  200:12  egg  97:8  |
| 138:3 145:14,<br>24 148:1,18<br>153:2,5<br>202:20 203:6<br>205:6 213:22<br>e-mailed  | 117:10 118:25<br>119:13 120:5,<br>11,18 121:3,6<br>123:25 124:9,<br>14 127:17,21<br>128:6,13,15,   | 135:25 136:14<br>146:1 168:3<br>194:1 214:6<br>earlier<br>47:12 59:22<br>82:25 96:9<br>106:19 133:22  | egregious 85:22 164:25 170:16 213:16 electronic 22:10 70:13 electronically  |
| 55:24 71:9 e-mails 8:24 33:20,23 60:6,8,13,14, 16 71:6 72:19 75:3 92:4 116:20 118:23 120:10 135:21                         | 20 130:23<br>131:3 133:4,<br>19,23 134:4,<br>13 135:7,15<br>136:23 137:3,<br>16,22 139:5,<br>17,25 141:9,<br>15,18,20,21,<br>22 142:13,16, | 151:14,17<br>153:3 162:18<br>163:7 179:18<br>183:4 184:14<br>196:19 216:9<br>217:11<br>earliest<br>119:11                                     | 69:25 70:8  else's 91:21  embodied 174:10  embody 175:25  |
| 143:5,7 215:9  eager 12:1  Earl 12:18,21 31:18,21 33:10,14,16, 21 34:1 35:6 44:16 50:20                                    | 18,21 143:1,<br>18 144:11,15,<br>18,21 145:6<br>146:19,22<br>151:19<br>152:17,23<br>153:11,16,21<br>154:18 155:3,<br>20,23 163:20          | easily 6:21 easy 67:13 149:12 education 7:25 11:1,4 19:25 24:20 25:5 37:4,9   | employed 127:6 employee 6:2 11:18 13:6 16:3,15, 17 17:1 18:2, 3 21:4 23:17 24:14,23,25 27:2,9,20                                  |
| 51:3,11,17,<br>22,24 55:24   | 167:22,23<br>168:7 169:13  | 38:18,21 39:2<br>43:18 45:18  | 30:5,10<br>34:15,16   |

| 35:10,12                      | 66:24 67:6,         | engaged                      | essence                |
|-------------------------------|---------------------|------------------------------|------------------------|
| 36:7,8 37:7                   | 10,11 104:23        | 16:22                        | 57:2                   |
| 38:11 39:7,9                  | 126:3,4             | enrollment                   | essentially            |
| 42:8,20 46:17                 | 154:5,9             | 96:12                        | 112:3 146:13           |
| 48:12,19 49:3                 | 158:18 164:8,       | ensure                       | 207:25                 |
| 50:18,21 51:5                 | 20 166:15           | 61:4                         | establish              |
| 52:6,7,10                     | 173:1               |                              | 160:6                  |
| 67:1,2 77:2                   | employment          | entailed                     | i i                    |
| 86:16 97:3,4                  | 5:18 6:1            | 126:13                       | established            |
| 99:20 100:19                  | 25:2,4,13,24        | enter                        | 172:16,17              |
| 102:8 117:16,                 | 26:1,11,19          | 61:13 64:12                  | estimation             |
| 21 123:5,7,                   | 27:2,24 28:6        | enterprise                   | 78:3 110:12            |
| 10,15 132:22                  | 29:1 34:19,23       | 42:13                        | ethanol                |
| 133:1,9,13,                   | 36:14 41:11         | entire                       | 122:17                 |
| 15,16,20                      | 96:10 97:5          | 136:5 137:6                  | ethnicities            |
| 134:17,22,24                  | 99:17 102:2         | 138:13 192:12                | 147:13                 |
| 135:4 136:3,<br>15,23 138:12, | 124:7 132:21        | entities                     | ethnicity              |
| 16 139:22                     | 145:2 159:4,9       | 97:14                        | 103:15 145:25          |
| 140:6,17                      | 160:14 164:12       | entitled                     | 147:6,7,25             |
| 149:5 150:13                  | 172:23 175:24       | 158:24                       | 149:7                  |
| 152:7 154:3                   | 176:5,6             |                              | evaluate               |
| 158:13 159:5                  | 180:19              | entitlement                  | 29:8                   |
| 164:5,16                      | empowered           | 197:19                       |                        |
| 165:4,6,24                    | 175:8               | entity                       | evaluation             |
| 166:2,9,11                    | encompass           | 174:5                        | 160:1,2<br>215:24      |
| 173:3 202:10                  | 49:1 175:25         | environment                  |                        |
| 203:10 205:9                  | 206:11              | 34:11,12                     | evaluations            |
| 206:9,10                      | encounter           | episodes                     | 33:22 57:21            |
| 208:6 218:2                   | 40:7,8 204:17       | 211:9                        | 59:19 77:23            |
| employee's                    | encountered         | error                        | 112:6 116:20           |
| 5:16 6:1                      | 171:22              | 62:5 71:3,4                  | 118:23 120:8           |
| 141:6 203:22                  | end                 | errors                       | 121:13,15,18<br>211:10 |
| employees                     | 17:21 49:20         | 218:24                       |                        |
| 5:24 10:7,8                   | 95:1 101:16         |                              | evening                |
| 17:12 19:5                    | 140:21              | <b>escalated</b> 54:3 103:23 | 53:6,15,18             |
| 20:7 22:17                    |                     | 104:6 105:11                 | event                  |
| 24:5 25:12                    | endangering<br>42:5 |                              | 213:11                 |
| 26:2 27:10                    |                     | escalating                   | events                 |
| 40:6 42:3                     | ended               | 206:17                       | 52:17 214:2,3          |
| 54:18 59:3,6                  | 109:12 163:9        | ESQ                          | eventually             |
|                               |                     | 219:15,16                    | <u>-</u>               |
|                               |                     |                              |                        |
|                               |                     |                              |                        |

|  |   | <del> </del>  |   |
|--|---|---|---|
| 90:16 130:14<br>194:22<br>evidence<br>39:18<br>evident   | 94:19,21<br>100:24,25<br>113:17 119:6,<br>10 121:20<br>122:9 124:25   | experience 59:6,8 85:10 168:14 189:2 experienced 60:10  | 20 165:2<br>167:23 174:23<br>185:13 188:16<br>192:4 195:12,<br>19 202:25  |
| 211:3  evidently 218:3  exact 21:13 69:9  EXAMINATION 5:4 50:13  examined 5:2 71:18 72:16 74:19  examining 71:21  excellent 58:1  excessive                                      | 125:1,18 127:4,24,25 130:19,20 138:2,3,22,23 145:1,11,12 148:14,15 156:2,4 161:1,2 163:22,23 172:1,2 177:5,11 202:19 204:24 206:25 207:1, 5 215:3,6,20, 21 216:16 exhibited 215:1 | expert 9:5,9 147:9 191:10 experts 47:23 74:13 explain 104:12 105:6, 13 209:19 explained 179:2 explains 185:3 190:12 explanation 184:1 190:17 extensive  | 203:1,17,25 204:12 205:10,21 207:21 214:10  fact-finding 201:11,17  factor 41:10 197:23  factors 123:1  facts 50:20 185:18 196:24 197:1  factually 204:15   |
| 31:8 67:1  exchange 54:3,9,12,13, 14 178:25 180:6,13  exchanged 9:6  exchanges 54:18  exclusive 161:25  exercise 87:21 186:4 209:12,16  exhibit 31:24 32:5 47:25 79:5,7, 9,11,19 | exhibiting 150:16 exhibits 94:17 149:7 existed 37:10 127:22 exited 144:15 expectation 41:9 154:11 expectations 36:2 40:25 41:2,8,19 57:5,7,10,12, 16 76:14 expecting 106:2        | 120:3  extent     120:14  eyes     187:5   F  face     75:6 77:8  facilitate     200:19  fact     43:11 64:10     66:19 75:14     87:16 92:16,     17,21 104:8     112:5 118:11     137:18 150:5, | faculty  14:6 23:17  27:4,17,22  29:5,6 42:3  59:15 156:21  157:12 165:25  167:8 173:4  176:21 206:5  217:19  fail  122:20  fair  14:21 28:18  90:8 138:1  152:11 177:3  192:10  faith  88:25  fall |

| 130:3           | 134:12                 | female        | fine          |
|-----------------|------------------------|---------------|---------------|
| falls           | 136:18,21              | 82:21,24      | 50:10 94:16   |
| 15:9            | 178:13 194:2           | 85:6,25 86:8, | 96:23 108:17  |
| false           | federal                | 10 105:10     | 156:13 186:9  |
| 164:9 165:5     | 118:18                 | fight         | 198:5         |
| 166:3,10,22     | feedback               | 59:3 206:17   | finish        |
| 167:4           | 31:9 33:13,20          | figure        | 7:2 12:1      |
| familiar        | 48:4,11 92:15          | 63:4 131:15   | finished      |
| 9:7 57:9,17     | 131:4 156:1            | file          | 218:23        |
| 59:2 69:19      | 199:21 200:10          | 76:3 148:24,  | fire          |
| 121:19 131:9    | 203:18,19              | 25 153:18,21  | 205:20        |
| 147:6 156:18,   | 210:21 211:1           | filed         |               |
| 21,24 157:17    | feedback/              | 5:17          | fired         |
| 159:1,13        | coaching               | ·             | 166:6,12      |
| 162:15 163:1,   | 33:10                  | files         | first-hand    |
| 6,14,25         | feel                   | 149:2         | 199:14        |
| 168:19 172:19   | 18:14 38:12,           | fill          | fledged       |
| 173:20 188:3    | 15 105:10              | 51:6 125:23,  | 56:21         |
| 212:11,23       | 119:23 135:24          | 25 128:21     | flipped       |
| 215:19,23       | 152:15 183:22          | 131:4,8,22    | 129:2         |
| familiarity     | 199:1 214:20           | 132:1,4,10    | float         |
| 47:10 218:15    | feeling                | 135:22 136:20 | 80:11         |
| familiarization | 86:10 135:20           | filled        | floor         |
| 105:23          |                        | 43:12 62:7    | 141:10 184:9, |
| familiarize     | <b>feels</b> 42:9 49:6 | 73:4 128:25   | 18            |
| 156:12          |                        | 169:17 216:18 |               |
|                 | fellow                 | 217:9         | Florida       |
| fast            | 63:24                  | fills         | 92:7          |
| 144:10 146:15   | fellows                | 132:7         | floridly      |
| 185:24          | 61:5 157:8             | final         | 189:21        |
| fault           | felt                   | 15:24 22:24   | folks         |
| 91:21           | 31:12 38:11            | 24:8,13 59:23 | 60:17 105:24  |
| favors          | 39:16 40:21            | 107:14,17     | 106:12 107:15 |
| 82:23 85:2      | 42:5 85:21             | 215:4         | 109:21 111:5, |
| February        | 100:19 110:16          | find          | 17 117:7      |
| 32:25 38:9      | 145:21 152:20          | 65:12 176:6   | 128:20 201:3  |
| 48:7,10 50:17   | 155:24 168:7           | 198:23        | follow        |
| 95:17 99:14     | 174:19 183:10          |               | 13:3 185:18   |
| 130:23 131:5,   | 192:17 197:3,          | findings      | follow-up     |
| 8,20,23         | 15                     | 132:6,8       | 13:5,8 41:24  |
|                 |                        |               |               |

|                             |               |                               | <del></del>   |
|-----------------------------|---------------|-------------------------------|---------------|
| 75:7 152:17                 | four-step     | generally                     | GME's         |
| 153:2 183:6,                | 15:4          | 162:21                        | 105:1         |
| 8,9                         | fourth        | get all                       | GMEC          |
| footnote                    | 15:23 57:7,13 | 94:18,24                      | 162:12        |
| 145:20                      | freely        | Gilmore                       | good          |
| forced                      | 74:4          | 98:18 138:9                   | 33:4 48:3     |
| 132:3                       | friends       | 202:22                        | 56:16 75:22   |
| forgot                      | 94:2          | give                          | 145:1 155:12, |
| 177:17                      |               | 23:21 79:7                    | 18 159:21     |
| form                        | full          | 112:25 113:5                  | 194:4 195:11  |
| 15:2 18:8,15                | 5:5 56:20     | 121:1 126:24                  | Google        |
| 19:3 24:10                  | 114:16 115:18 | 141:8,17                      | 188:6         |
|                             | 177:22 196:14 | 145:8 147:23                  |               |
| 25:7,16 28:20<br>30:1 35:21 | fully         | 155:7 200:10,                 | gospel        |
| 36:23 41:12                 | 7:5           | 12 201:13                     | 200:6         |
| 47:2 72:4                   | function      | 202:8                         | govern        |
| 73:5 75:1                   | 40:17         |                               | 46:19 157:9,  |
| 77:12 78:11,                | future        | giving<br>41:7                | 10,18 172:23  |
| 20 84:3 86:4                | 210:25        |                               | government    |
| 89:24 96:20                 | FWW           | GME                           | 164:10,21     |
| 115:23 116:9                | 107:13        | 88:15,16                      | grading       |
| 129:7 132:20                | 1013          | 96:17,24                      | 168:13 169:2, |
| 133:6 149:10                |               | 97:12,22 98:5                 | 3             |
| 150:9 175:15                | G             | 99:16,22                      | graduate      |
| 176:11 191:22               | game          | 101:5 102:5,                  | 11:1,4 19:9,  |
| 209:23                      | 58:3,17       | 7,9 103:8,20,                 | 24,25 24:20   |
| formal                      | gap           | 25 104:14                     | 25:5 37:4,9   |
| 25:24 35:16                 | 189:20        | 113:8 114:23,                 | 38:18,20 39:2 |
| 210:25 211:6                |               | 24 115:3,8,25                 | 45:17 46:3,9, |
| 213:18 214:16               | garage        | 116:4 121:10                  | 14,19,23      |
|                             | 67:16,17      | 127:7,10,12,                  | 47:8,18       |
| formally                    | 68:1,12,14,   | 16 128:9<br>139:13 140:10     | 88:11,21      |
| 35:1                        | 18,25 80:13   | 149:17                        | 158:20 162:14 |
| forward                     | gave          |                               | 168:18 172:15 |
| 84:1,23                     | 31:18 135:12  | 156:17,18<br>158:21           | 173:15        |
| forwarded                   | 145:8 207:11  |                               | 215:18,23     |
| 22:16                       | general       | 159:10,12,14<br>162:14 202:14 | graduated     |
| found                       | 13:15,20,22   | 205:19 206:1                  | 168:16        |
| 49:23 59:14,                | 14:4,14 60:21 | 212:8,9                       |               |
| 15 80:13                    | 88:13 117:1   | 212:8,9                       | granted       |
| T2 00:T2                    | 202:13        | 410.14,41                     | 186:18        |

| 43:18 60:20       71:9 88:13       14:9 63:14       144:16,         91:10 210:11,       18       92:7       hand         Greenfield       36:5       47:9       handbook         Greenwood       32:24 34:9,20       31:22 123:25       17,22 2         35:11 39:22       45:24 46:13       143:9 151:15       156:16,         95:18 98:18       99:2,11 135:8       18:18 202:21       203:13 218:25       157:13         99:2,11 135:8       138:18 202:21       10:10 24:5       176:22         206:13       10:10 24:5       176:22       217:19         Greenwood's       48:1       guided       40:13 5         Greg       50:2 79:13       100:6 157:16       15         113:11       159:15,23       100:6 157:16       15         158:13       215:16,17       handled         20:17 5       20:17 5         Gregory       219:15       174:5       103:19         Grievable       27:17 161:22       112:18       handles         23:25 158:16,       86:2       125:12 |   |   | ·   |  |
|--|---|---|---|--|
| grievance gun 19:25 2 23:25 158:16, 86:2 125:12  | 87:18 110:5,6 134:18 143:23 180:12 happening 126:1 happy 93:5,15,19,25 94:2,5 harassed 18:13 111:18 harassment 16:2 18:3 19:1,16 20:14 55:7 83:1,5, 17,25 84:23 85:1 104:23 110:12 156:16 hard 106:8 202:17 harm 169:21 170:22 214:5 harming 169:23,24,25 head 11 6:16 85:9 127:11 139:16 | hall 142:22 144:23,2 hallway 144:16,1 146:1,2, hand 60:22 handbook 23:17 27 17,22 29 59:16 15 156:16,2 157:13 1 159:5 16 165:25 1 176:22 2 217:19 handle 40:13 54 25 83:13 104:1 17 15 handled 20:17 51 12 55:11 103:19 1 | ground 6:11 grounds 122:22 213:8 group 14:9 63:14 grown 92:7 guardian 47:9 guess 31:22 123:25 124:6 129:24 143:9 151:15 203:13 218:25 219:4 guide 10:10 24:5 173:7 guided 99:21 guidelines 100:6 157:16 158:13 215:16,17 guides 174:5 guise | 49:7  Green 60:5  Greene 43:18 60:20 71:9 88:13 91:10 210:11, 18  Greenfield 36:5  Greenwood 32:24 34:9,20 35:11 39:22 45:24 46:13 75:14,22 76:6 95:18 98:18 99:2,11 135:8 138:18 202:21 206:13  Greenwood's 48:1  Greg 50:2 79:13 113:11 159:15,23 198:3 210:14  GREGORY 219:15 |
| Griffin 196:14 207:10 83:10 18:21 79:2,8 guys happen   | 85:1 104:23 110:12 156:16  hard 106:8 202:17  54:22, harm 13 169:21 170:22 214:5 harming 169:23,24,25  head 11 6:16 85:9 139:16 headed 81:3  20:1 health 50:21 150:13 158:5 161:23 162:1 164:17 hear  | 165:25 1 176:22 2 217:19 handle 40:13 54 25 83:13 104:1 17 15 handled 20:17 51 12 55:11 103:19 1 149:13 handles 19:25 20 125:12 handling 83:10 happen 122:20 1  | guide     10:10 24:5     173:7  guided     99:21  guidelines     100:6 157:16     158:13     215:16,17  guides     174:5  guise     112:18  gun     86:2  guy     196:14 207:10  guys     12:8 52:1     119:21 131:15                       | 138:18 202:21 206:13  Greenwood's 48:1  Greg 50:2 79:13 113:11 159:15,23 198:3 210:14  GREGORY 219:15  grievable 27:17 161:22  grievance 23:25 158:16, 19 215:24  Griffin 18:21 79:2,8 80:4 81:12 86:6,23  |

| heard<br>80:25 91:11<br>131:21 171:4<br>184:7 185:6 | highest<br>7:25               | house         | 52:3,8 54:19  |
|---|-------------------------------|---------------|---------------|
| 131:21 171:4  | 7:25                          |               |               |
|   |                               | 20:9,16       | 55:9 58:21,23 |
| 184:7 185:6   | highly                        | 21:16,22,25   | 64:4,5 67:21  |
|   | 64:15                         | 22:5,6 23:4   | 76:24 77:5,6, |
| hearing   | hired                         | 24:22 25:8    | 10,14 83:20   |
| 162:24 163:5,                                       | 26:20                         | 26:23 27:1    | 84:1 85:9,16  |
| 17  |                               | 34:21 36:1    | 86:14 88:9    |
|   | Hispanic                      | 37:2 45:20,23 | 91:15 93:9,23 |
| Hearings<br>101:6                                   | 145:23 147:3                  | 47:7 52:19    | 95:20,22,25   |
| ]   | 148:5                         | 57:20 61:4    | 96:18 97:3,   |
| hearsay   | hitting                       | 65:13,16      | 10,16 100:12, |
| 118:11  | 59:5                          | 76:14 97:1    | 13 102:8,10   |
| heated  | hold                          | 99:19 101:6   | 103:2,8,12,   |
| 54:3,8,9,12,  | 8:9 50:9                      | 107:4 108:21  | 20,23 104:1,  |
| 16,17 178:25  | 108:10 139:2                  | 156:2,6 157:8 | 6,21 105:11   |
| 180:13  | 204:18                        | 158:16,19,23  | 106:25 108:6  |
| held  | holidays                      | 159:3 160:9,  | 113:2 115:4,  |
| 48:4,11   | 81:18,25                      | 13 161:10,17, | 5,20 117:15,  |
| 127:20 150:5  | 162:1                         | 21 172:5,18   | 18,23,25      |
| 174:23 192:15                                       |                               | 173:18 176:24 | 119:13,19,21, |
| 203:18,19,22  | home                          | 205:18        | 23 124:7      |
| 214:19  | 82:8                          | HR            | 125:12 126:2, |
| helpful   | honestly                      | 5:15 11:8     | 5,8,10 132:6, |
| 111:13  | 198:13                        | 13:1,7 14:4,  | 8,17,24       |
|   | honesty                       | 7,9,12,13,16, | 134:8,23      |
| helping   | 89:1                          | 24 15:10      | 137:11        |
| 209:21  | hospital                      | 16:3,15       | 138:11,15     |
| helps   | 17:20,21                      | 19:13,15      | 141:14        |
| 10:6  | 42:16 65:7,9,                 | 20:2,22 21:1, | 149:14,18,20, |
| hesitate  | 10,21,25 66:4                 | 21 22:16 24:3 | 24 150:1,4,   |
| 6:23  | 69:22 80:17                   | 25:1,14 26:22 | 12,17 153:2,  |
| hey   | 81:4 87:20                    | 27:8,14       | 8,23 154:2,   |
| 131:14  | 157:9,10,19                   | 29:11,23 30:9 | 15,17 159:10, |
| 137:15,16   | 158:5 209:11                  | 34:12 35:19   | 11 165:24     |
| 154:20 168:23                                       | hour                          | 36:3,12,21    | 167:14 170:3, |
| 196:12  |                               | 37:6,10,14    | 9 173:9       |
| 200:15,24   | 50:4 93:6,15,<br>19,25 94:2,5 | 38:6,16,19,22 | 176:18 179:21 |
| hierarchy   | 113:12 198:4                  | 39:1 40:6,8,  | 192:21 196:20 |
| 14:1  |                               | 13 41:10 44:5 | 197:10        |
|   | hours                         | 45:25 46:12,  | 203:12,15     |
| Higher  | 209:11                        | 16 47:16      | 204:4,6,11    |
| 174:1,4   |                               | 50:18 51:13   | 205:21,25     |
|   |                               |               |               |

| 206:3,18       | 14,18,22,25        |                               |                            |
|----------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 207:25 213:14  | 130:7,15           | 169:13                        | 198:13 208:8,<br>15 211:16 |
| 217:18         | 169:16,19,20       | identity                      |                            |
|                | 170:2              | 56:9 61:24                    | improvement                |
| HR's           |                    | 63:5 86:23                    | 98:13 120:25               |
| 40:10 107:24   | ICU                | IHL.                          | 208:1,12,16,               |
| 124:3 202:8    | 61:12,14,16,       | 174:11                        | 18 210:24                  |
| huh-uhs        | 20,21 62:4,        | ıı                            | 211:3,7,8,10               |
| 6:17           | 10,15,19,20        | 172:13                        | 213:9 218:12               |
| human          | 63:2,9 64:11,      |                               | in/sign                    |
| 8:12 10:1      | 20,24 65:24        | <b>illegal</b><br>20:15 50:22 | 69:3                       |
| 13:16 24:14    | ID                 |                               | inappropriate              |
| 30:5 40:17     | 141:6 142:5,       | 109:1 113:25                  | 42:11 79:3                 |
| 51:16 52:11    | 9,20 143:17        | 114:1 123:2                   | 80:5 86:19                 |
| 86:16 107:4    | 144:6 146:16       | immanent                      | 104:17,21                  |
| 114:17 117:19  | idea               | 188:2                         | 108:24                     |
| hunger         | 18:24 30:22        | immediately                   | incidence                  |
| 113:22         | 117:10             | 112:13 124:23                 | 58:12                      |
|                | 172:21,22          | impetuous                     |                            |
| hungry         | 173:10 175:11      | 60:18                         | incidences                 |
| 113:19         | 194:5 195:11       | implement                     | 124:4                      |
| hurriedly      | identification     | 210:25                        | incident                   |
| 144:14         | 32:5 79:9          |                               | 19:1 39:23                 |
| hurry          | 94:21 100:25       | implemented                   | 40:1 44:1                  |
| 185:1,5,14,19  | 119:6 122:9        | 22:11 213:13                  | 49:17,19                   |
| hypothetically | 125:1,18           | implicated                    | 55:5,15,20                 |
| 151:4          | 127:4,25           | 46:21                         | 62:8 71:3                  |
| 131.4          | 130:20 138:2,      | implications                  | 72:22 80:8                 |
|                | 23 145:12          | 47:17,18                      | 81:13 89:15                |
|                | 148:15 156:4       | implore                       | 90:17 110:10,              |
| ICARE          | 161:2 163:23       | 152:10                        | 14,19 111:23               |
| 41:24,25       | 172:2 177:11       |                               | 174:17 178:24              |
| 42:1,12,19,25  |                    | implying                      | 179:13,19,25               |
| 43:4,10,20,24  | 202:19 207:1       | 133:5                         | 180:3 187:8                |
| 44:3,6,12,15   | 215:6,21<br>216:16 | important                     | 189:14 210:8               |
| 62:7 72:21     |                    | 45:25 46:1,8                  | incidents                  |
| 73:3,7,10,11,  | identified         | impression                    | 31:9 40:12                 |
| 22 90:9,12,16  | 109:7 111:12       | 121:4                         | 45:1 49:22                 |
| 91:1 127:10,   | 148:4              | impressions                   | 54:17 58:22                |
| 12,17,22       | identify           | 127:1                         | 79:3 80:5                  |
| 128:6,13,21,   | 79:18 109:20       |                               | 86:18,19                   |
| 24 129:10,12,  | 147:13 148:6       | improve                       | 107:20 112:1               |
|                |                    | 121:2,7                       |                            |

| include<br>10:14 157:14 | 4             |                             |               |
|-------------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|---------------|
|                         | 175:10,13,21  | informed                    | 182:20 185:12 |
|                         | 176:7         | 61:14,15                    | 188:25        |
| 158:7 172:18            | Ines          | 97:21 179:11                | instances     |
| 191:15 209:5            | 53:21 54:4    |                             | 49:10 97:11,  |
| included                | infected      | infraction<br>107:23 154:24 | 16 104:15     |
| 23:19 49:12,            | 71:22 72:3    |                             | 152:23 155:21 |
| 15 99:14                |               | infractions                 | 179:22        |
| 100:6 118:8             | infer         | 23:18 213:16                | institution   |
| 157:12 158:21           | 85:2          | initial                     | 136:5 137:6   |
| 159:13 183:2            | influence     | 20:21 108:3                 | 174:11        |
| 189:15 206:5,           | 7:20          | 109:17 127:20               |               |
| 20                      | informal      | 137:2 163:9                 | institution's |
| includes                | 15:5,13,16    | initially                   | 16:9          |
| 48:19                   | 59:22         | 19:10 99:12                 | institutions  |
|                         | information   | 111:7 134:6                 | 174:1,4,6     |
| including               | 13:3,7 22:16  | 137:3                       | instructed    |
| 12:24 16:21             | 23:15 29:13   | initiated                   | 61:13         |
| 21:8 22:5               | 30:24 33:5,16 | 35:2                        | instructions  |
| 98:12 114:18            | 47:21 52:8    | initiation                  | 91:22 209:19  |
| 119:13 120:1,           | 58:10,19      | 152:6                       | insurance     |
| 24 164:25               | 72:18 75:24,  |                             | 164:22        |
| 188:15                  | 25 77:21 81:9 | initiator                   |               |
| 210:13,20               | 84:13 85:17,  | 115:9                       | insure        |
| incomplete              | 24 86:1 87:11 | inquire                     | 23:7 63:15    |
| 205:1                   | 101:14,18     | 91:16 93:2                  | 91:2          |
| incorrect               | 107:9 108:25  | 135:9 136:14                | insurer       |
| 164:21 165:7,           | 112:7 113:2   | inquired                    | 164:10,22     |
| 15                      | 116:13 118:25 | 137:23                      | insuring      |
| incredible              | 126:19 137:1, | inquiries                   | 76:13         |
| 82:21                   | 4,25 140:3,18 | 51:20                       | intelligent   |
| incredibly              | 150:25 151:7, | inquiring                   | 57:25         |
| 85:7 105:10             | 10 152:11     | 90:8 131:17                 | intensive     |
|                         | 157:21 164:9, | 135:5 137:17                | 52:20,23      |
| incumbent               | 17,21 165:5,  | 203:8                       | 53:24 54:5    |
| 47:14 54:18             | 7,15 166:3,   |                             |               |
| 86:20                   | 10,22 167:5,  | inquiry<br>128:5 137:2      | intentional   |
| independent             | 18 181:15     | 128:5 137:2                 | 169:14 170:14 |
| 73:14                   | 187:25 188:20 |                             | intentionally |
| independently           | 189:10,14,16  | instance                    | 168:15        |
| 64:6 65:7               | 193:2 199:18  | 49:14 105:2                 | 169:23,24     |

| 170:5,17                            | 54:19 91:15   | investigated                | 19.1 11 20.6                   |
|-------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 190:13                              | 109:4 111:11, | 107:21                      | 18:1,11 20:6,<br>17 21:2,8,20, |
|                                     | 25 115:20     |                             | 22 22:1,4                      |
| interact                            | 116:17,19     | investigating               | 25:1 28:17                     |
| 17:17                               | 118:5 125:10, | 129:21                      | 29:18,24                       |
| interaction                         | 11,21 126:7,  | investigation               | 36:13 37:18                    |
| 11:14 14:7                          | 12,14,16      | 13:11 14:11                 | 44:5 45:15,16                  |
| 19:7,11 42:10                       | 178:10 181:3, | 16:20 18:25                 | 51:13 52:4                     |
| 89:10 104:5                         | 10,25 182:6,  | 29:11,18                    | 55:21 66:23,                   |
| 109:8 154:10                        | 10 183:13     | 34:14 40:1,17               | 25 77:6 78:24                  |
| 214:21                              | 188:5 193:19  | 43:25 44:17                 | 83:10 90:24,                   |
| interactions                        | 199:5,18      | 54:20 58:8                  | 25 98:10                       |
| 11:9 13:14                          | 201:9 209:7,  | 61:18 63:10                 | 102:14,21,22,                  |
| 200:10                              | 13            | 65:4 66:17,25<br>74:22 75:6 | 25 103:5,20                    |
| interest                            | interviewed   | 74:22 /5:6<br>77:9 81:12,20 | 104:22 105:16                  |
| 93:23                               | 55:14 109:8,  | 83:2,4,14,18,               | 106:11 108:2,                  |
| interested                          | 10,21 110:7   | 19 84:2,16,22               | 18 110:22                      |
| 108:7 140:19                        | 111:17 163:19 | 85:4 87:17,22               | 111:1 114:8,                   |
| intern                              | 181:16        | 108:4 114:16,               | 17 149:14,18,                  |
| 57:2,6                              | interviewing  | 22 115:19                   | 21 150:12                      |
| internet                            | 181:14 183:3  | 124:23 150:6                | 151:3,14,16                    |
| 155:15                              | interviews    | 152:2 165:11                | 153:3 163:10                   |
| interns                             | 16:21,23      | 167:3,17                    | 171:23 193:9,<br>20 201:12,18  |
| 74:5 157:7                          | 19:15 20:21   | 168:22 169:1,               | · ·                            |
| interpersonal                       | 21:3,7,11     | 11,20,22                    | involvement                    |
| 154:10                              | 22:15 30:17   | 170:2 174:16                | 12:23 20:2,20<br>26:21 28:19   |
|                                     | 63:10 66:18   | 183:7,8,9                   | 37:5 38:7,25                   |
| <pre>interpose   165:16 167:6</pre> | 109:15 110:2, | 186:14,20                   | 40:13 77:5                     |
|                                     | 7 111:13      | 197:1,23                    | 96:1 97:17                     |
| interpretation                      | 114:16 116:7  | 201:15,17                   | 103:9 104:18                   |
| 140:4 176:17                        | 125:13 126:3, | 203:13                      | 106:16 107:24                  |
| interpreted                         | 11 179:22     | investigations              | 109:4,12                       |
| 139:21                              | 182:7,13      | 67:6,9 108:3                | 111:8 113:3                    |
| intervention                        | intranet      | 109:2 150:1                 | 118:1 119:23                   |
| 154:16,17                           | 157:25        | 163:9 181:22                | 124:4 128:11                   |
| 194:15,19                           | investigate   | 185:17                      | 129:17 152:5                   |
| interview                           | 42:17 52:12   | involve                     | 163:2,8,21                     |
| 8:23 9:21                           | 53:16 77:7    | 20:9 55:8                   | 217:21                         |
| 29:15,21 30:3                       | 104:22 111:25 | involved                    | involving                      |
| 31:1 53:9,15                        | 118:18 179:21 | 10:23 11:16,                | 19:1 21:15                     |
|                                     |               | 21,22 17:24                 |                                |
|                                     | 1             |                             | <u> </u>                       |

|                 |                                       |               | 4             |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------|---------------|---------------|
| 45:1,14 62:8    | IX                                    | Josh          | 9,10 154:13   |
| 84:15 98:11     | 20:18 106:19                          | 40:2          | 165:22 182:16 |
| 102:10 111:10   | 109:11                                | Joshua        | 189:9 192:7   |
| 165:22 169:21   |                                       | 39:24,25      | 200:3,4,19    |
| ironic          | J                                     | Joyce         | 202:14 203:11 |
| 145:16,17       |                                       | 122:14        | 213:2         |
| irony           | Jackson                               |               | knew          |
| 145:23          | 212:16                                | jpeg          | 190:21        |
|                 | Jamie                                 | 207:14        | knock         |
| irregularity    | 88:12 91:9                            | jpegs         | 105:5         |
| 42:16           | January                               | 207:8         |               |
| issue           | 9:22 12:17                            | July          | knowing       |
| 38:12,15        | 18:22 34:2                            | 131:12,22     | 175:20,24     |
| 104:4,6         | 55:3,15 85:21                         | 132:5 178:6   | knowledge     |
| 119:20 120:23   | 87:9 88:1                             | jump          | 16:9,10,12    |
| 129:1,6         | 107:5 120:19                          | 177:4,6       | 19:18 21:20   |
| 190:10 205:11   | 153:16 178:10                         | June          | 22:25 23:2    |
| issued          | 194:2 208:23                          | 85:20         | 24:11,13      |
| 203:23          | 211:25 212:2                          |               | 27:8,25 28:18 |
| issues          | 218:19                                | justify       | 47:3,15 54:13 |
| 39:14 45:11     | Javed                                 | 180:18        | 90:18 96:22   |
| 51:21 55:25     | 160:19                                |               | 100:7,11      |
| 56:6,9 60:10    | jeopardy                              | К             | 105:18 106:15 |
| 89:23 99:24     | 214:5                                 | keeping       | 117:20 118:6  |
| 103:22 112:20   |                                       | 121:9 153:23  | 129:9 169:7   |
| 114:12 119:25   | job                                   | 172:16 176:20 | 189:5,20      |
| 124:7,12        | 76:23,24                              |               | 190:11 191:9  |
| 127:13          | 132:5 139:25                          | kicking       | 193:5 199:14  |
| 205:13,23       | 153:12 196:23                         | 59:5          | Kronos        |
| 206:13 208:25   | jobs                                  | kidding       | 67:12         |
| 209:1,2         | 77:2                                  | 159:22        |               |
| 210:12,19       | Joe                                   | kind          | L             |
| 211:4,14        | 80:12 208:24                          | 6:18 7:21     | 1-h-1-3       |
| issues/concerns | 217:16 218:18                         | 10:7 13:25    | labeled       |
| 37:25           | Johnny                                | 14:22 23:18   | 171:20        |
| items           | 98:18 138:9                           | 25:25 26:20   | 193:21,23     |
| 89:17,18 90:2   | 202:21                                | 42:22 44:4    | lack          |
| 92:1 102:4      | Joseph                                | 66:23,25 79:6 | 23:19 73:19   |
| 142:3 203:5     | 9:18,22 12:12                         | 81:9 93:21    | 75:15 89:8    |
|                 | 172:6 218:10                          | 97:7 130:10   | 105:18 152:18 |
| IV              | 172.0 210.10                          | 150:15 151:5, | 169:7 203:25  |
| 175:4           |                                       |               |               |
|                 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | <u> </u>      | I             |

| 204:4         | 143:20 144:2              | license       | 136:7 137:7       |
|---------------|---------------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| language      | 186:3 209:11              | 191:21        | 163:4 187:22,     |
| 28:5 124:1,8, | led                       | licensed      | 24 188:18         |
| 21 175:18     | 163:11 214:6              | 74:25         | 219:7             |
| large         | left                      | lie           | longer            |
| 17:19 64:24   | 80:10 137:19              | 66:16         | 25:12,18          |
| late          | 141:10 149:19             | lied          | 48:15 88:19       |
| 67:1,7,8 68:5 | 201:24 202:12             | 196:8         | 96:25 127:6       |
| 79:16 94:7    | 209:14                    |               | 133:17,25         |
| 154:23 210:22 | legal                     | lieu          | 138:10 213:23     |
| Lawson        | 5:6 83:20,22              | 146:20        | looked            |
| 149:4,5,8,11  | 171:12,16                 | light         | 85:11,15          |
|               | 173:6 175:17              | 101:24        | 170:1 188:6       |
| layers        | 176:12,16                 | limited       | 197:11            |
| 114:3,8       | 182:11                    | 210:20        | Loretta           |
| lead          | length                    | lines         | 212:16            |
| 114:4 182:11  | 111:22                    | 6:4 164:16    | lot               |
| leader        | lessened                  | list          | 12:5 21:21        |
| 63:14 75:8    | 71:17 72:15,              | 106:2,16      | 56:14 101:18      |
| 195:15 196:15 | 16 74:19                  | listed        | 122:7 149:13      |
| leadership    | letter                    | 27:16 31:11   | 150:21 152:22     |
| 118:2         | 77:25 92:3                | 135:11        | 154:2 168:23      |
| learn         | 120:11,24                 | listen        | 207:22            |
| 18:13 189:2   | 203:23 218:6              | 10:9          | Louann            |
| learned       |                           | lists         | 162:4             |
| 18:17 168:20  | <pre>letting 137:15</pre> | 106:13        | loud              |
| 184:21        |                           |               | 184:16            |
| learning      | level                     | loads         | Louise            |
| 90:9 97:1     | 7:25 97:16                | 207:3         | 119:14,16         |
| 168:14 174:1, | 110:12                    | location      |                   |
| 4 189:2       | 154:15,18                 | 16:14 80:20   | lounge<br>69:8,12 |
| leave         | liability                 | 91:16         |                   |
| 44:25 45:4    | 49:7 89:2                 | log           | lowest            |
| 51:16 80:14   | liable                    | 70:5,6        | 191:19            |
| 123:11 140:23 | 51:21                     | logistics     | lunch             |
| 150:4 185:1,  | liaison                   | 140:5         | 94:15 106:6       |
| 5,14,19       | 77:15                     | long          | 119:4             |
| 211:19        | liberty                   | 11:6 65:15    | lying             |
| leaving       | 126:13                    | 93:5,18       | 87:6,14 169:8     |
| 51:21 87:20   |                           | 117:10 121:25 | 170:17 190:19     |
| J1.41 07.40   |                           |               |                   |
|               | •                         |               |                   |

| 209:5,8 211:9 | 176:12 189:9    | manner        | 10:24 47:22   |
|---------------|-----------------|---------------|---------------|
|               | 200:12 201:3    | 139:19        | 132:6 170:22  |
| M             | makes           | mantra        | matters       |
|               | 83:1 127:23     | 153:9 196:19  | 11:15 74:13   |
| made          | 182:18          | manual        | 119:22 161:22 |
| 16:14,25      | making          | 156:3,6,9     | meaning       |
| 18:14,21 21:8 | 17:18 23:12     | 158:1 161:18  | 175:18        |
| 30:4,17 35:14 | 31:7 47:16      | 172:18 173:18 |               |
| 44:22,23      | 70:4 84:10,18   |               | means         |
| 45:2,3 52:13  | 85:6 103:9      | mapped        | 85:3 210:13   |
| 53:10 82:20,  | 105:9 130:3     | 181:24        | 211:8         |
| 21 84:9 96:2, | 152:11 165:4    | Marita        | meant         |
| 15,16 100:18  | 166:2 176:24    | 180:8,11      | 132:12 149:16 |
| 108:24 111:5  | 188:13 201:2    | Mark          | 176:9         |
| 118:10 129:16 | 205:4           | 120:3         | measures      |
| 133:18 135:7  |                 | marked        | 83:19,20      |
| 137:24 146:24 | male            | 32:5 79:9     | 98:6,11       |
| 152:13        | 82:23           | 94:21 100:25  | 205:12,23     |
| 160:10,15     | malfeasance     | 119:6 122:9   | medical       |
| 161:12 176:18 | 30:18 175:10,   | 125:1,18      | 7:21 11:1,4   |
| 211:3 214:20  | 12,21 176:6     | 127:4,25      | 19:9,24,25    |
| Madison       | malpractice     | 130:20 138:2, | 22:13 24:20   |
| 7:10          | 171:2,5,11      | 23 145:12     | 25:5 29:9     |
| Mahoney       | man             | 148:15 149:11 | 37:4,9 38:18, |
| 41:1,3,18     | 191:20          | 156:4 161:2   | 21 39:2 45:18 |
| 71:8,11 72:10 |                 | 163:23 172:2  | 46:3,9,15,19, |
| 89:16         | manage<br>154:9 | 177:11 202:19 | 23 47:8,18    |
| main          |                 | 207:1 215:6,  | 56:21 62:2    |
| 61:7          | managed         | 21 216:16     | 67:15 71:2,4  |
|               | 47:11 127:7     |               | 72:8 78:8     |
| maintained    | management      | master's      | 82:18 88:11,  |
| 65:15 92:13   | 103:17,22       | 8:1           | 21 105:9,10,  |
| 130:7 158:20  | 104:4 130:10,   | match         | 18 129:4      |
| make          | 13 154:18       | 131:11,24     | 131:11 157:24 |
| 6:14,18 10:6  | manager         | 132:2 136:18, | 158:3,6,18,20 |
| 13:12 14:25   | 88:15,16,18     | 21 137:17     | 162:14 166:19 |
| 16:6 20:22    | 154:11          | 143:12,16     | 168:17,18     |
| 48:20 64:10   |                 | materially    | 171:1,5,11,   |
| 76:25 93:9,21 | managers        | 164:9 165:5   | 13,15 189:5,8 |
| 108:11 129:4  | 154:8           | 166:3,10,22   | 191:10,21     |
| 134:15 135:3, | mandatory       | matter        | 197:13 212:12 |
| 16,21 156:25  | 129:23          |               | 15,.15 212.12 |
|               |                 |               |               |

|               |               | <u> </u>        |               |
|---------------|---------------|-----------------|---------------|
| 215:18,23     | 133:2         | middle          | mixing        |
| medicine      | memorializing | 87:20           | 36:24         |
| 10:18 11:1    | 153:5         | milestones      | model         |
| 13:23 50:21   | menial        | 121:13,16,19    | 95:2          |
| 74:4 88:12    | 209:22        | militaristic    | Molly         |
| 160:19        |               | 200:5           | 14:19,20      |
| meet          | mention       |                 | 30:11 38:10   |
| 69:7 87:8     | 61:9 106:19   | mind            | 88:9 91:9     |
| 91:14 94:2    | 194:14        | 159:2 204:11    |               |
|               | mentioned     | 217:25          | 95:7,17,19    |
| 139:6,10,11   | 6:6 22:2      | minute          | 98:17,19      |
| 140:11 212:7  | 46:18 86:22   | 32:20 148:11    | 99:13 119:12  |
| meeting       | 93:14 110:21  | 198:4           | 124:1 203:7   |
| 20:3 34:8     | 142:4 143:1,  | minutes         | moment        |
| 36:1 76:14    | 3,4 181:7     | 50:8 94:7       | 156:12        |
| 87:9 89:5,19  | 184:24 187:12 | 186:10 209:16   | month         |
| 90:4,14,15,20 | 195:24,25     |                 | 48:17         |
| 91:6 93:1     | mentor        | misconduct      | monthly       |
| 94:9 99:4,10, | 56:15         | 30:18 109:14    | 11:10         |
| 13 100:21     |               | 114:2 153:22    |               |
| 104:7 112:23  | mentors       | misdiagnosed    | months        |
| 116:21 120:12 | 104:8         | 168:11          | 55:4,6 57:20  |
| 125:23,25     | menu          | misinterpreting | 152:14 162:23 |
| 126:15        | 17:10,13      | 144:4           | 179:25 180:15 |
| 127:15,19,20  | messed        |                 | 206:22        |
| 128:19 139:7  | 79:22 94:18,  | misrepresenting | Morgan        |
| 140:14,16,25  | 24            | 170:5,6         | 98:18 138:14  |
| 141:4,12,18   |               | missed          | 202:22        |
| 143:5,8 144:3 | met           | 44:18 192:13    | morning       |
| 155:25 167:22 | 87:4,13 88:9  | missing         | 33:4 67:23    |
| 177:5 210:22  | 98:23 113:2   | 198:24          | 75:22 145:1   |
| 211:2 213:1   | 141:17 146:10 | Mississippi     | 154:24        |
| 214:18 218:5  | 155:22 163:19 | 7:11 92:8       |               |
| meetings      | 199:16 204:9  | 174:2,6 175:8   | motivated     |
| 203:21 204:1, | 210:11,18     | Í               | 56:14         |
| 9 210:20      | 213:10        | misstate        | motivation    |
|               | Michigan      | 151:24          | 198:18        |
| members       | 92:7          | misstating      | Moving        |
| 29:23 42:3    | Mid           | 72:5 209:25     | 127:3         |
| 92:19,21      | 12:17         | mistaken        | multi-ethnic  |
| 162:12,13     |               | 169:6           |               |
| membership    | mid-january   |                 | 147:17        |
| _             | 18:19         |                 |               |
|               |               |                 |               |
|               |               |                 |               |

| multi-racial 147:17 multiple 32:9 103:2 110:22,25 113:24 114:3, 8 147:13,14, 15 186:11 multiplicity 147:5 Muncie 61:10,15,19 62:15,20 63:21,24,25 Muncie's 64:22 mutual 97:14  N  names 106:10 108:14 National 131:24 136:18 nature 17:25 38:23 59:9 60:13 98:14 107:23 | 111:15 112:25 113:5 131:8 135:17,22 139:18 140:2 145:8 188:3 190:14 194:6, 22 210:24  needing 154:15 194:14  negative 6:17 50:23 124:17  negligence 44:9 51:20 169:14  negligent 43:22 165:8 170:15,23 190:25  negligently 164:20 165:6, 14 167:4,18 169:25 170:6  nicer 12:5 night 69:6 80:10  non-clinical 158:11 | 143:25 203:11 note 190:1 194:13 noted 38:1 73:18 80:4 167:11 203:3 notes 118:19 181:18 182:3 198:1 notice 101:20,21 161:24 192:4 notified 61:16 85:21 101:17 November 210:22 NP 54:2 NPS 52:25 number 21:13 94:17 125:17 127:3 156:8 161:7 172:14 173:22 174:13 195:24 201:7 204:24 | numerous 71:10 nurse 40:2 52:21 53:7,9 54:7 55:20 56:1,3, 4,10 62:15, 20,24 63:2 71:25 74:12, 24 104:5 108:16,17,19 109:5 110:25 111:8,10 115:6 174:17, 18 178:21 179:8,14,19 180:4,10 183:20 188:16 189:25 190:7 191:15 192:2, 22 194:13,17, 24,25 195:7 199:24 210:5 nurses 82:9 108:19 110:22 152:25 158:7 180:24 191:15 192:2, 23 |
|---|---|---|---|
| 63:21,24,25<br>Muncie's   | 44:9 51:20<br>169:14  | 161:24 192:4<br><b>notified</b><br>61:16 85:21  | 115:6 174:17,<br>18 178:21<br>179:8,14,19   |
| mutual<br>97:14   | 43:22 165:8<br>170:15,23<br>190:25  | November<br>210:22  | 183:20 188:16<br>189:25 190:7<br>191:15 192:2,  |
| names   | 164:20 165:6,<br>14 167:4,18  | <b>NPS</b> 52:25  | 24,25 195:7<br>199:24 210:5   |
| 131:24 136:18  nature  17:25 38:23 59:9 60:13 98:14 107:23  | 12:5 night 69:6 80:10 non-clinical  | 21:13 94:17<br>125:17 127:3<br>156:8 161:7<br>172:14 173:22   | 110:22 152:25<br>158:7 180:24<br>191:15 192:2,<br>23  |
| navigate<br>56:15   | non-exempt 67:11  | 206:15<br>211:12,23   | object  |
| necessarily 11:18 42:23 68:2 122:24 127:14 136:13 150:11  | nondescript 56:6 nonrenewal 101:10,11   | numbered<br>161:4<br>numbers<br>105:23 106:3,   | 15:2 18:8,15<br>19:3 24:9<br>25:7 28:20<br>30:1 35:21<br>36:23 41:12  |
| needed<br>14:10 33:6  | 102:3 213:17<br>214:15<br>normal  | 9 Numeral 172:13 175:4  | 73:5 75:1<br>77:12 78:11,   |

|               | •             |                |                   |
|---------------|---------------|----------------|-------------------|
| 20 83:21 84:3 | 116:18 152:14 | 171:13,15      | operate           |
| 86:4 89:24    | 179:25 180:14 | 173:6 212:21   | 45:19,21          |
| 96:20 115:23  | 187:21,22,23  | 213:15,22      | operated          |
| 116:9 129:7   | 189:6 194:18  | 215:17         | 35:23 104:15      |
| 132:20 133:6  | 200:1 204:14, | officer        | operates          |
| 149:22 150:9  | 16 214:3      | 20:16 21:22,   | 38:19 47:9        |
| 175:15 176:10 | occurs        | 25 23:4 24:22  | 117:19            |
| 191:22 209:23 | 37:6 40:11    | 26:23 34:22    |                   |
| objection     | 102:7,8       | 36:1 37:2      | operating         |
| 16:7 165:17   | 213:11        | 52:19 65:16    | 46:3 179:4        |
| 167:7,11      | offense       | 95:22 97:1     | operations        |
| obligations   | 83:16 170:16  | 99:19 107:4    | 52:23             |
| 99:15         | offered       | 108:21 158:19  | opinion           |
| observation   | 109:1         | 159:3 160:9,   | 31:3 49:9         |
| 71:12         |               | 14 161:10,21   | 64:9 192:1        |
|               | offering      | 172:5 176:24   | opinions          |
| observations  | 20:15         | 205:18         | 9:10 74:14        |
| 70:4          | office        | officers       | opportunity       |
| observe       | 11:2,4 16:16  | 20:10 21:16    | 98:2 121:1        |
| 209:21        | 19:9,24,25    | 22:5,7 25:9    | 123:6 152:1,9     |
| observed      | 21:4 22:11    | 27:1 45:20,23  | _                 |
| 199:10        | 24:14,20      | 47:8 57:21     | opposed<br>107:18 |
| observes      | 37:4,9 38:18, | 61:5 65:14     |                   |
| 37:4          | 21 45:18      | 76:14 101:6    | opposite          |
| observing     | 46:10,15      | 157:8 158:23   | 144:13            |
| 71:21         | 47:9,11 48:19 | offices        | option            |
|               | 52:7 83:9     | 16:19 83:13    | 146:23 147:16     |
| obtain        | 88:15,17,22   | offline        | 214:9             |
| 82:17 187:3   | 96:17,24      | 159:18         | options           |
| occasions     | 97:4,12,22    |                | 148:2 214:14      |
| 25:10         | 98:5 99:16,22 | ointments      | OR16              |
| occur         | 102:5 103:25  | 72:1           | 210:23            |
| 130:9 133:12  | 107:21,22     | older          | order             |
| 184:8,11      | 114:23,24     | 146:4          |                   |
| occurred      | 115:9,25      | Olutade        | 36:3 79:12        |
| 31:2,5 39:23  | 127:8,10,12,  | 122:14,15,16   | 84:13 97:5        |
| 40:12 49:1    | 16 128:10     | open           | 119:10            |
| 55:4,6 63:18  | 137:13 138:13 | 69:12          | ordering          |
| 78:2 80:11    | 139:10,11,13  |                | 70:4              |
| 90:5 109:8    | 140:10 143:21 | openly<br>91:5 | orders            |
| 111:22 112:24 | 146:2,11      | 31:2           | 61:13             |
|               | 158:21        |                |                   |
|               | <br>          | I              | 1                 |

| - 2 |  |
|-----|--|

| organization  | 94:9 95:18    | 51:15 52:17,  | 23 142:1,19,  |
|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| 5:13,16       | 120:19 130:24 | 18 53:10,16,  | 20,23,25      |
| organized     | 134:15 219:12 | 23 55:14,16,  | 143:6,18      |
| 198:2         | paged         | 25 56:6,8,23  | 144:9,12,13,  |
|               | 49:20         | 59:19 60:1,11 | 14,17,23      |
| ORIGINAL      | j             | 61:11,13,20   | 145:8,15,19   |
| 219:15        | pager         | 62:12,17,18   | 146:13,18     |
| ostomy        | 65:17 186:9   | 63:8 64:7,10, | 149:1 150:8   |
| 189:23,25     | pages         | 23,25 65:8    | 151:19 152:3  |
| 194:13,14,17, | 95:12 106:21, | 66:3,14,19    | 153:17 155:22 |
| 24,25 195:7   | 22 156:11     | 68:21 69:1,   | 161:7 163:12, |
| outcome       | 206:24 207:5  | 15,20 70:12,  | 18 165:13,14  |
| 156:1 170:21, | paid          | 17 71:11,18,  | 167:4,17,23   |
| 24 201:24     | 123:11,12     | 20 74:9,14,18 | 168:5,7,14,   |
| 202:12        | 211:19        | 77:24 79:4    | 15,16 172:6   |
| outcomes      | Pam           | 80:6,21 83:5  | 174:17,19,23, |
| 120:2         | 75:22 98:17   | 85:22,25      | 24 176:20     |
| outline       | 202:21 203:1  | 86:20 87:5,8, | 177:5 178:20  |
| 181:9 182:3   | Pamela        | 13,23 88:24   | 179:2,11      |
|               | 32:24 45:24   | 89:6 91:14,16 | 180:5,15,21   |
| outlined      | 95:18 135:8   | 92:5,23 93:11 | 181:3,10      |
| 29:6 208:9    |               | 97:18 98:1,8  | 183:1,5,14,   |
| outlines      | panel         | 102:18,23     | 19,22,25      |
| 208:7,16      | 162:24        | 104:2 105:7   | 185:3,13,18   |
| outlining     | paper         | 106:17 107:18 | 186:14,23,25  |
| 208:4         | 120:3         | 110:6,11,15   | 187:4 188:21  |
| overhead      | Papin         | 111:18,21     | 189:3,18      |
| 80:15         | 8:23 9:22     | 112:8,12      | 190:12,19,20  |
| overruled     | 12:13,16      | 113:1,2,6     | 192:16 193:21 |
| 37:21         | 18:13,18      | 115:15,19     | 194:11,16,21  |
|               | 19:2,16 23:6  | 116:8,17,21   | 195:3,7,11,19 |
| oversee       | 24:7,18 28:17 | 118:10,22     | 196:5 197:22, |
| 103:11 117:8  | 29:12,16,21,  | 119:1 120:9,  | 24 198:12     |
| overseeing    | 25 30:19      | 12,13,15      | 199:3,8       |
| 74:8          | 31:4,7,10,17  | 121:6 122:17  | 200:1,13,24   |
| oversight     | 33:15,18,21,  | 124:2,16      | 201:20,21     |
| 174:11        | 24 34:1 39:24 | 125:11 129:22 | 202:24 203:19 |
|               | 40:1,19 41:1, | 132:10,17     | 204:10 205:4  |
| P             | 4,20 43:6     | 133:24 134:3, | 207:20,21     |
|               | 44:18,23      | 18 135:10     | 209:7,13      |
| p.m.          | 45:1,3 49:20, | 139:8,19      | 211:15 212:1, |
| 48:8 80:12,15 | 23 50:21      | 141:7,11,19,  | 18 214:25     |

| 215:13 217:16 | 76:2,24 79:1                    | past          | 15,23 194:22  |
|---------------|---------------------------------|---------------|---------------|
| 218:5,10,18   | 84:20,21                        | 164:18        | 195:21 196:3  |
| Papin's       | 113:8 124:3                     | Pat           | 198:21 199:24 |
| 9:18 23:13    | 127:9 133:17                    | 5:1 33:4      | 209:3,6,8     |
| 27:24 28:4    | 153:18 157:3                    | 75:23 98:22   | 211:13 213:7, |
| 29:1,18 31:1  | 164:12 167:7                    | 131:3         | 11            |
| 34:19 36:6,14 | 168:3,4                         |               | patient's     |
| 44:9 48:13    | 170:3,25                        | Pathology     | 54:1 62:3     |
| 51:18 54:4    | 172:5 180:16,                   | 10:17         | 80:17 89:17,  |
| 57:23 60:7,9  | 20 190:19                       | patient       | 21 188:17     |
| 67:21 70:6    | 191:5,8                         | 42:6,15,17,24 | 189:13,15,17  |
| 76:3 89:1,22  | 192:18 202:5,                   | 43:2,6,21,23, | 192:1 195:2   |
| 98:24 100:19  | 6,17                            | 25 49:5,9,13  |               |
| 102:1 114:7,  | partially                       | 51:21 61:12,  | patients      |
| 21 118:21     | 86:18 217:9                     | 16,22,25 62:8 | 44:19 49:21   |
| 131:16 136:25 |                                 | 69:24 71:12,  | 66:15,21      |
| 140:25        | participants                    | 13,18,21,25   | 68:10 69:23   |
| 153:21,22     | 16:21                           | 72:9,16,22    | 70:5,18 74:1, |
| 162:23 163:16 | participate                     | 73:2,17,19    | 25 81:7       |
| 175:23 178:12 | 197:19                          | 74:9,15,20    | 114:11 120:24 |
| 179:16 180:19 | participation                   | 78:8,19,21,24 | 166:20 167:25 |
| 193:20 194:3  | 89:2 133:2                      | 80:13 81:2    | 168:1,5       |
| 195:23 199:6  | parties                         | 82:8,10,12,14 | 171:20 184:9  |
| 205:13 214:21 | 175:4                           | 87:7,15       | 187:9 188:22  |
|               |                                 | 89:19,23      | 193:22,24     |
| paragraph     | partner                         | 120:1,22      | 196:9 214:4   |
| 71:8 87:4     | 10:1 14:8,9,                    | 128:25 129:1  | Patricia      |
| 157:7 158:15  | 12,14 16:16                     | 164:10,22     | 5:7           |
| 160:5 161:8   | 21:2 52:8                       | 166:23 168:6, | pausing       |
| paraphrasing  | 103:5 126:5,                    | 12 169:8,12,  | 159:18        |
| 209:4         | 9,10 134:23                     | 21,23,24,25   |               |
| park          | 138:11,15                       | 170:18,22     | 22.23         |
| 67:22 68:2    | partners                        | 182:21 183:25 | 22:23         |
| parking       | 14:16 103:2                     | 184:12,15,16, | PBLI          |
| 67:16,17,21   | 137:12                          | 17,22 187:8,  | 211:11        |
|               | parts                           | 11,18 188:10, | PD            |
| part          | 69:16                           | 11,24 189:13, | 213:16        |
| 13:22 21:2    |                                 | 22 190:4,9,   | PDF           |
| 25:5,23 26:2  | <pre>party    108:7 109:9</pre> | 16,21,22      | 139:2,3       |
| 28:11,14      |                                 | 191:8,11,15   | 140:10 156:8  |
| 34:25 38:6    | passed                          | 192:4,25      | 177:15 207:8, |
| 40:16 41:5    | 122:17                          | 193:3,7,11,   | 12            |
|               |                                 |               | <u> </u>      |
| _             |                                 |               | I             |
|               |                                 |               |               |

|               |               |                         | 0             |
|---------------|---------------|-------------------------|---------------|
| peak          | 19:8 24:5     | person's                | pharmacists   |
| 197:12        | 29:9 37:25    | 82:17 126:6             | 56:10         |
| penalty       | 42:9,22 46:17 | personal                | phone         |
| 170:7         | 48:12,14 60:7 | 28:18 65:14             | 65:25 66:4    |
| pending       | 88:24 98:13   | 88:19 118:14            | 86:22 91:14   |
| 7:1 123:12    | 124:12 133:21 | 140:23 211:24           | 135:3,7,12    |
| 165:1         | 160:8 161:9   | 218:9,17                | 137:24 138:8  |
| people        | 203:20,22     | personally              | phones        |
| 31:6 47:22    | 205:13,22     | 109:18 118:20           | 65:7,14,20    |
| 55:2 75:5     | 208:1,11,14,  | personnel               | physical      |
| 76:25 89:11   | 16 209:1      | 144:1 156:22            | 40:7 55:8     |
| 90:24,25 91:7 | 218:11        |                         | 59:4 140:5    |
| 106:3 107:8   | period        | persons                 | 206:17        |
| 108:18,25     | 152:14 187:21 | 21:7 101:16             |               |
| 109:1,9 111:9 | 195:2 208:12  | 193:19                  | physically    |
| 118:9 123:18  | 213:12        | perspective             | 25:19 144:1,  |
| 147:4 154:12, | peripheral    | 27:8 36:21              | 17            |
| 20 168:17,24  | 128:11        | 46:1 58:21              | physician     |
| 186:3 188:16  | permission    | 100:12 103:13           | 74:2,8,12,23  |
| 190:15 191:14 | 186:15,17,21  | 154:2 170:9             | 78:7,10,18    |
| 192:15        | 187:1 209:14  | 196:23 197:11           | 117:12 174:13 |
| 200:11,14,15  | person        | 204:4 205:21            | 175:11,14     |
| 201:1,12,18   | 14:6,15 20:16 | pertain                 | 176:8 179:3   |
| people's      | 21:1 29:20    | 157:11 158:14           | 209:20        |
| 108:11        | 30:2,16 35:20 | pertained               | physicians    |
| perceive      | 36:3 39:6     | 192:16                  | 68:16 173:23  |
| 92:18         | 61:9 63:5     | pertaining              | 191:16        |
|               | 76:15 83:8    | 10:6 42:23              | Physiology    |
| perceived     | 84:11 88:20   | 95:3 145:4              | 10:20         |
| 64:21 92:12   | 94:10 97:2,   | 157:22 193:2            | pick          |
| 183:23 208:4  | 13,15 103:4   | pertains                | 6:19 86:22    |
| perception    | 105:4 109:6   | 159:4 166:17            | 147:18        |
| 92:23 93:7    | 111:11 115:6  |                         | picture       |
| 182:11 184:25 | 117:19,23     | pertinent<br>16:21 76:9 | 79:20         |
| perfect       | 119:17 127:7  |                         |               |
| 149:23 153:15 | 138:14        | petitioning             | pique         |
| perform       | 152:11,12     | 161:22                  | 93:23         |
| 53:1 174:14,  | 158:25 181:14 | PGY3                    | place         |
| 25            | 190:8 192:23  | 66:7                    | 5:18 16:19,24 |
| performance   | 195:13 199:1  | pharmacist              | 32:17 65:9    |
| berrormance   | 212:12        | 56:2,5                  | 74:20 99:4    |
|               |               | ·                       |               |
|               |               |                         | <u>.</u>      |

| 170:10 178:10 | points                 | position                    | 104:5 174:17,               |
|---------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 179:23 203:12 | 39:21 48:2             | 9:24 14:17                  | 18 179:8,14                 |
| 215:13        | 69:14 75:18            | 118:1 162:7                 | 180:10 183:21               |
| placement     | 99:11 181:24           | positive                    | 199:25 210:5                |
| 214:16        | pole                   | 123:13 156:1                | practitioners               |
| places        | 191:20                 | possessed                   | 52:21 53:7,9                |
| 69:18,20      | policies               | 197:23                      | 56:1,4,5,10                 |
| 147:14,16     | 23:7,11,25             |                             | 74:24 108:20                |
| ·             | 24:4 26:22,25          | possession                  | 110:25 178:22               |
| placing       | 27:3,14,19,23          | 127:17                      | 190:7 191:16                |
| 150:3         | 28:23 29:2,4           | possibility                 | 192:3,22                    |
| plan          | 58:20 77:1             | 26:18                       | pre-round                   |
| 31:18 44:24   | 84:4,21 129:8          | post                        | 81:16                       |
| 98:20 151:8   | 156:18,19              | 172:15 173:15               |                             |
| 164:4 165:19, | 157:11,25              | potential                   | precedent                   |
| 23 166:7,16,  | 165:19 167:13          | 47:17 56:14                 | 111:23                      |
| 24 167:8,10   | 173:24 216:2           | 109:7,25                    | prefer                      |
| 170:12 208:1, |                        | 123:19 129:6                | 177:19                      |
| 12,16 211:25  | policy                 | 179:22 197:8,               | preferentially              |
| 212:1 214:15  | 22:19 23:21            | 21 198:16                   | 82:22 85:1                  |
| 218:9,12,17,  | 51:5 53:24             |                             | preliminary                 |
| 18            | 54:2 58:23,24          | potentially                 | 104:9                       |
| plans         | 59:11 83:24            | 8:17 17:13                  |                             |
| 45:9 98:13    | 84:8 107:8,            | 40:6 42:5,24                | premise                     |
| point         | 15,20 113:8            | 46:21 49:5,8                | 187:18,19                   |
| 37:24 42:8    | 121:5 157:24           | 55:8 73:24<br>98:1,6 111:18 | premises                    |
| 48:16,17      | 158:19 159:14          | ·                           | 49:23                       |
| 50:3,7 59:24  | 160:3 161:15,          | 150:5 197:13                | preparation                 |
| 61:7 77:6     | 17 164:3               | power                       | 9:2 63:13                   |
| 80:9 81:7,15  | 166:4,13<br>215:24     | 23:3,5                      | 89:8                        |
| 82:7,20 88:8  |                        | practice                    | preparations                |
| 89:15 109:12  | policy/                | 56:21 74:4                  | 181:11                      |
| 134:20 139:15 | grievance              | 153:6 168:19                |                             |
| 141:3 143:19  | 158:22                 | 209:2                       | <b>prepare</b><br>8:20 9:14 |
| 146:16 149:1, | poor                   | practices                   | 8:20 9:14<br>139:12         |
| 6,25 150:24   | 154:10                 | 28:22 152:10                | l i                         |
| 191:3 204:24  | popped                 | 174:10 197:10               | 140:12,16<br>145:1 148:20   |
| 205:10 206:15 | 155:15                 | practitioner                |                             |
| pointed       |                        | 40:2 54:8                   | 181:2,9,12                  |
| 92:10,11      | <b>posed</b><br>186:23 | 40:2 54:8<br>55:20 62:16,   | prepared                    |
| 92.1U,11      | 100:23                 | •                           | 9:13 58:2,12,               |
|               |                        | 20,24 63:2                  | 13 145:7                    |
|               |                        |                             |                             |
|               |                        | · · · ·                     |                             |

| becember 02, 2020 |                  |               | 3                              |
|-------------------|------------------|---------------|--------------------------------|
| 148:25 149:2      | 7:22             | probation     | 208:18                         |
| 182:3             | previous         | 102:16,20     | processes                      |
| presence          | 149:6 204:16     | 213:18 214:16 | 10:9 16:4                      |
| 50:22             | previously       | problem       | 24:19 37:3                     |
| present           | 42:6 89:7        | 10:16 38:17   | 65:19 96:1                     |
| 22:17 23:18       | 99:25 128:9,     | 42:15 103:17  |                                |
| 107:25 112:4      | 18 142:4         | 123:20 159:20 | produce<br>182:4               |
| 163:16,18         | 167:21 181:7     | 183:20 192:3  |                                |
| 210:12,18         | 188:9            | problems      | PROF                           |
| presented         |                  | 206:11        | 211:12                         |
| 31:20 41:15       | primary<br>89:22 |               | profanity                      |
| 58:19 77:17       |                  | procedure     | 142:11,25                      |
| 85:20 92:1,3      | print            | 50:24 58:23   | professional                   |
| 112:17 116:15     | 106:5            | 133:11 143:25 | 8:10,11 11:8                   |
| 136:15 151:2      | printed          | procedures    | 52:25 85:9,16                  |
| 167:4 196:25      | 189:25           | 16:1,8 23:12, | 86:14 117:18,                  |
|                   | prior            | 25 24:2       | 23 157:23                      |
| presiding         | 20:7 21:16       | 26:23,25      | 167:15 213:1                   |
| 162:5             | 23:22 28:5,9     | 27:23 29:2,4  | professionalism                |
| pressure          | 34:1 50:15       | 58:21 77:1    | 23:19 124:12                   |
| 135:24            | 55:4 71:22       | 84:21 121:5   | 209:2                          |
| pressured         | 72:2,5 80:15     | 129:4 156:22  | Professor-                     |
| 135:20            | 81:16,18         | 158:1,17,24   | anesthesiology                 |
| presume           | 113:2 126:11     | 216:3         | 53:22                          |
| 51:2 57:15        | 128:19           | proceeded     |                                |
| 78:23 113:7       | 140:13,16        | 80:14 109:20  | program                        |
| 121:8 131:10      | 143:6 149:14,    | proceeding    | 11:19 13:15                    |
| 132:12 135:6,     | 24 150:4,12      | 182:12        | 14:5,14,22                     |
| 11 137:21         | 151:18 153:16    | process       | 19:8 24:16,22                  |
| 162:17 170:20     | 154:7 168:20     | 15:5,19 16:5, | 25:6,9,11,17,                  |
| 171:9,15          | 180:1,15         | 13 23:8,14    | 23 26:2,6,10                   |
| 173:20 189:4      | 181:25 183:3     | 28:17,19,21,  | 34:22,25                       |
| 212:13 213:4      | 188:5 195:3      | 25 29:12,24   | 35:17,20,25                    |
| presumed          | 204:1 206:22     | 48:18 59:24   | 36:4,14,18,20                  |
| 116:14 143:9      | 209:25           | 69:3,9 123:3  | 37:3,13,18,21<br>39:7 46:20,23 |
|                   | privacy          | 126:2 131:9   | ·                              |
| pretending        | 108:12           | 133:8 139:23  | 49:6 56:17,18                  |
| 68:9              | privilege        | 153:24 163:1, | 57:16,17 75:8<br>76:12 89:3    |
| pretty            | 8:19             | 15 170:2      | 91:3 96:3,12,                  |
| 10:21 216:6       |                  | 192:6 197:17, | 16,24 97:1,9,                  |
| prevent           | privy            | 22 205:4      | 10,24 97:1,9,                  |
|                   | 214:6            |               | 12,13,20                       |
|                   |                  | <u> </u>      |                                |

| 99:21 100:2,        | prompt        | 12 121:17     | purview       |
|---------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| 11,15 104:8         | 44:16 83:18   | 129:6 134:9   | 44:14 46:14   |
| 105:1,4             | 181:13        | 140:3 151:9,  | pushing       |
| 112:14 115:8,       | prompted      | 11 152:18     | 59:5          |
| 25 116:13           | 109:2         | 155:21 166:19 | _             |
| 117:1,11            | promptly      | 167:18 172:9  | put           |
| 123:14,15,19        | 162:20        | 176:2,19      | 17:16,20      |
| 124:5 131:24        |               | 181:5 185:21  | 59:21 79:5,8  |
| 132:14 133:3,       | proper        | 188:20        | 88:24 92:25   |
| 4,8,18,21           | 77:1          | 189:11,16     | 102:19 114:12 |
| 136:18 137:18       | protect       | 193:2 197:3,  | 147:15,16,24  |
| 143:25 145:4,       | 108:11        | 15 199:19     | 154:20,21     |
| 6 149:16            | protected     | 203:6 212:4   | 166:20 192:20 |
| 160:6,9,10,         | 8:18 164:17   | 218:6,16      | putting       |
| 14,15 161:10,       | protocol      | provider      | 92:12         |
| 12,25 172:15        | 34:6 204:25   | 73:10 78:24   |               |
| 173:24              |               |               | Q             |
| 174:15,20           | 215:5,8       | providers     |               |
| 175:1 189:11        | 216:18        | 188:15        | Quail         |
| 195:16 196:16       | provide       | providing     | 7:10          |
| 199:2,6 201:4       | 7:4 10:10     | 48:18 63:17   | qualified     |
| 203:15,24           | 11:3 13:2,4   | 164:20 165:5, | 117:14        |
| 205:2 213:10,       | 40:24 41:18,  | 6,15 166:10,  | question      |
| 14 214:22           | 25 42:4       | 22            | 6:22 7:1,2,5, |
| programs            | 121:14 125:15 | provisions    | 6 12:1,4      |
| 5:24 19:19,23       | 141:1 164:9   | 166:15        | 13:17 14:3    |
| 99:17 173:5,7       | 166:13 172:15 | prudent       | 18:16 23:10   |
| 197:19              | 182:2 200:24  | 19:13 101:15  | 34:4 40:24    |
| ·                   | 201:13        | 19:13 101:15  | 73:6 75:20    |
| progress            | provided      |               | 118:14 119:14 |
| 44:22 45:2          | 13:3 23:16    | psychologist  | 125:2 127:21  |
| progressive         | 29:14 30:24   | 212:25        | 128:2 129:24  |
| 153:24 155:1        | 31:9,15       | public        |               |
| project             | 33:17,20      | 174:6,11      | 145:14 147:23 |
| 88:14,16,18         | 39:17 40:21   | pull          | 159:16 167:2  |
|                     | 58:10 72:18   | 67:17,21      | 176:11,13     |
| promising<br>131:14 | 77:21 81:10   | 147:25 160:25 | 181:9 183:15  |
|                     | 91:19 100:21  |               | 185:24 186:23 |
| promoted            | 106:12 108:25 | purpose       | 189:19        |
| 104:9               | 111:24 112:8  | 52:3          | 198:15,16     |
| promotion           | 113:1 118:24  | purposes      | 200:7         |
| 95:23 160:2,6       | 119:3 120:5,  | 52:1 140:21   | questionable  |
| ·                   | 119:3 120:5,  |               |               |
|                     |               |               |               |

| 51:4                        | raising                     | 148:16 172:3              | 22,25 149:11              |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|
| questioned                  | 203:17                      | 178:18,19                 | 153:20 160:23             |
| 183:1                       | ran                         | real                      | 162:2 168:1               |
| questions                   | 142:6,8,21                  | 12:7 146:9                | 174:16 187:12             |
| 7:23 10:8                   | random                      | 183:15 191:20             | receive                   |
| 11:11 33:7,8                | 51:4                        | realm                     | 57:21 62:2                |
| 34:10,20                    |                             | 45:19,22 46:4             | 117:22,25                 |
| 35:10 36:4                  | range<br>164:24             |                           | 162:24 163:13             |
| 61:7 93:20                  |                             | reason                    | received                  |
| 113:16 126:14               | ratify                      | 7:3 31:5 35:3             | 19:21 31:12               |
| 181:12,13,18,               | 37:14                       | 103:21                    | 49:11,15 55:3             |
| 21,23 182:2                 | reach                       | 128:12,14<br>180:20,21    | 59:19 60:13,              |
| queue                       | 11:20 83:12                 | · ·                       | 15 72:19                  |
| 113:22                      | 97:16 119:20                | 183:6,15<br>193:17 199:11 | 107:16                    |
|                             | 180:11                      | 207:6                     | 134:13,21                 |
| quick                       | 193:13,17                   |                           | 135:6 152:13              |
| 12:7 50:3                   | 194:5                       | reasonable                | 183:17 193:5              |
| 122:7 146:9<br>178:9 186:15 | reached                     | 118:13,15,17              | 209:19 211:1              |
| ·                           | 12:18                       | 190:17                    | 213:22                    |
| quickly                     | reaching                    | reasons                   | receiving                 |
| 6:12 120:6                  | 118:9 119:18                | 132:18,19                 | 44:23                     |
|                             | 138:6                       | 150:15                    |                           |
| R                           | reactions                   | rebut                     | recently 218:6            |
| race                        | 52:24                       | 190:18                    | 218:6                     |
| 145:16,22                   |                             | recall                    | recess                    |
| 147:2,8                     | read                        | 12:12 21:13               | 32:4 50:12                |
|                             | 79:23 80:2<br>207:16 218:23 | 26:13 28:11               | 119:5 148:12              |
| races                       | 219:1,2                     | 33:22,25                  | 198:8 204:22              |
| 147:13                      | ·                           | 41:22 42:2                | recognize                 |
| raise                       | reading                     | 43:17 58:6,               | 194:17                    |
| 85:8 217:25                 | 75:3 84:18                  | 12,16 71:3                | recognizing               |
| raised                      | 157:21 215:22               | 89:20 90:6                | 191:24                    |
| 35:11 36:5                  | ready                       | 98:15 99:5                | recollection              |
| 75:14 76:6,8                | 80:1 95:14,15               | 102:11 103:18             | 21:25 94:5                |
| 87:6 99:12                  | 101:3,4                     | 111:2 135:14,             |                           |
| 127:22 206:13               | 119:7,8                     | 19,20 137:14,             | recommend<br>28:12 90:12, |
| 208:25 209:3                | 122:10 125:3,               | 23 141:3,4,               | 28:12 90:12,<br>19 100:14 |
| 211:14                      | 6,19 128:3                  | 15,22,24                  | 165:12 175:23             |
| raises                      | 130:21 132:1                | 142:12,14                 | 176:25 180:18             |
| 205:11                      | 136:20 138:5,               | 143:9 145:10              | 176:25 180:18             |
|                             | 24 145:13                   | 146:4,12,21,              | 212:18                    |
|                             |                             |                           |                           |

| recommendation  | 65:15 67:21            | regard         | 48:19 50:18               |
|-----------------|------------------------|----------------|---------------------------|
| 20:25 21:3      | 72:9 82:18             | 110:11 143:3   | 52:7,10 86:16             |
| 34:14 35:13     | 188:10 189:13          | 163:8 188:23   | 97:5 133:1                |
| 40:23 63:13     | 198:23                 | 200:6          | 134:17,24                 |
| 76:11 77:23     | recreate               | regular        | 135:4 136:4,              |
| 78:4 85:18,23   | 204:13                 | 59:20 124:19   | 16,23 138:12,             |
| 100:18 110:18   | redo                   | 158:25 186:3   | 16 202:10                 |
| 112:11          | 197:5                  | regularly      | relationship              |
| 116:16,23       |                        | 117:8          | 25:24 78:7                |
| 119:2 134:2,    | refer                  |                |                           |
| 9,21 176:1,17   | 51:5 214:10            | regulations    | relationships 78:13 99:18 |
| 197:4,24        | reference              | 157:9,10,14,   |                           |
| 202:7           | 53:8 87:9              | 15 173:25      | relay                     |
| recommendations | 159:6 173:17           | regurgitate    | 135:4 136:22              |
| 13:12 16:25     | 202:15                 | 77:9           | relevant                  |
| 17:2,4 20:22    | referenced             | rehabilitated  | 21:7 34:13,21             |
| 77:19 202:8     | 33:11,14,23            | 213:24         | 35:11 93:21               |
| recommended     | 72:10 89:16            | rehabilitation | 143:10                    |
| 44:4 70:8       | 112:2 138:7            | 123:14,19      | relied                    |
| 90:10,23 91:2   | 162:17 169:12          | reiterated     | 217:13                    |
| 124:21          | 215:9                  | 76:21 99:13    | relieve                   |
| 128:19,21       | referencing            |                | 69:2,5,7                  |
| 167:15 194:3    | 88:6 153:19            | reiterates     | relying                   |
| recommending    | 204:2                  | 161:11         | 139:25 189:10             |
| 86:17 152:3     | Referral               | relabel        |                           |
| 195:1           | 213:14                 | 79:15 94:23    | remaining                 |
| recommends      |                        | relate         | 112:14                    |
| 52:5            | referred<br>30:3 50:21 | 209:1          | remedial                  |
|                 | 51:1 110:10,           | related        | 83:18 205:23              |
| record          | ·                      | 34:11 38:22    | remediate                 |
| 5:6 6:21        | 19 159:14<br>214:10,12 | 132:17 174:15  | 112:20,22                 |
| 67:11 70:11     | ŕ                      | 175:1          | 113:6 214:24              |
| 79:18 148:13    | referring              | relates        | remediation               |
| 198:9 204:15    | 9:8 196:1              | 110:13         | 24:2 31:18                |
| recorded        | 206:7 212:14,          |                | 34:5 44:24                |
| 29:22 70:8      | 24 213:5               | relation       | 45:9 98:12                |
| 182:7,15        | refers                 | 99:17          | 151:8,10                  |
| recording       | 156:17                 | relations      | 204:25 211:1,             |
| 182:8           | regain                 | 16:17 17:1     | 6 213:12                  |
| records         | 198:15                 | 21:5 24:14     | 215:5,8,17                |
| 22:11,13 62:2   |                        | 30:6,10 38:11  | 216:18                    |
|                 |                        |                |                           |
|                 |                        |                | <u> </u>                  |

| remedy        | reply         | represent                      | requires      |
|---------------|---------------|--------------------------------|---------------|
| 51:22,25 52:2 | 134:16        | 137:5                          | 19:23         |
| remember      | report        | representing                   | research      |
| 45:17 62:14   | 16:18 41:24   | 145:21                         | 63:24 158:10, |
| remembered    | 42:1,3,12,14  | request                        | 14 188:2      |
| 65:1          | 43:1,5,21,24  | 23:23 35:4,5                   | residence     |
| remind        | 44:7,12,16    | 36:10,13,17                    | 131:24 160:3  |
| 137:18        | 62:7 64:3     | 37:6 39:18                     | residency     |
| reminded      | 72:21 73:3,11 | 41:16 43:19                    | 19:19,23      |
| 93:3          | 90:9,13,16    | 131:18 135:4,                  | 37:12,13,18   |
|               | 91:1 115:5    | 9 136:10                       | 56:17,24      |
| removal       | 127:10,12,17, | 138:11 202:24                  | 132:4,8       |
| 133:8 145:4,6 | 22 128:6,22,  | requested                      | 133:3,18      |
| remove        | 25 129:10,12, | 24:24,25                       | 174:15,20     |
| 36:3 132:14   | 14,18 142:24  | 34:19 37:13,                   | 175:1 197:19  |
| rename        | 169:16 191:7  | 19 43:10,12                    | resident      |
| 94:17         | 196:16 206:20 | requesting                     | 12:24 13:10   |
| render        | reported      | 31:14                          | 14:21 18:14,  |
| 136:8         | 42:11,20      | require                        | 21 19:2 20:23 |
| rendered      | 55:18 63:16   | 13:10 26:23                    | 21:9 25:3,18  |
| 9:10 132:25   | 66:11 71:14,  | 100:3                          | 26:7,10 27:6  |
| Renee         | 18 72:17      |                                | 35:18,19      |
| 43:17 60:5,20 | 73:20 74:20   | required                       | 36:18 37:14,  |
| 88:13 91:10   | 152:23 179:24 | 69:21 71:15                    | 20,21 41:9    |
| 122:5 210:11, | 190:15,23     | 72:24 73:2                     | 45:14 46:6    |
| 18            | reporter      | 89:14 121:1,6                  | 51:19 56:24   |
|               | 6:19 12:5     | 141:5 145:3,5<br>154:14 174:14 | 57:8,12,14    |
| renewed       | 79:17 155:10, | 154:14 1/4:14                  | 58:14 61:15   |
| 101:23 102:12 | 11 219:9      | 212:1 213:9                    | 63:25 64:4    |
| 131:22 132:4  | reporting     | 212:1 213:9                    | 65:17 66:7,8  |
| renewing      | 42:4 86:7     |                                | 69:4,5,8,12   |
| 101:25        | 195:4         | requirement                    | 73:25 74:21   |
| repeat        | reports       | 136:19 213:18                  | 78:8 81:5     |
| 23:10 147:22  | 9:6 42:1,19   | 214:17                         | 83:6 84:15    |
| 213:18 214:17 | 44:3 73:7,12, | requirements                   | 101:9 102:11, |
| 216:7         | 22 111:7      | 19:19 20:4                     | 12,15,19      |
| rephrase      | 128:14        | 61:6,8 73:12                   | 103:16,18,21  |
| 6:24 26:8     | 129:22,25     | 76:17,19                       | 104:7,9,10,   |
| replies       | 130:7,15      | 100:2 121:10                   | 16,24 105:7,  |
| 200:1         | 154:22 211:8, | 155:1 211:23                   | 9,16,17 107:1 |
| 200.1         | 12            |                                | 108:1,15      |
|               |               |                                |               |

| 114:25        | 130:10,13     | ruining       | scenario      |
|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| 116:12,20     | RN            | 197:13        | 17:3 137:15   |
| 121:17 124:2  | 79:2          | rules         | scheduled     |
| 129:3 130:15  | role          | 6:12 157:8,10 | 68:3 91:15    |
| 137:3,7       | 10:5 26:19    | 173:25        | scheduling    |
| 156:6,25      | 46:16 61:4    | rumors        | 124:19        |
| 161:5 177:7,9 | 77:10,14      | 112:4 118:11  |               |
| 185:20 187:5  | 117:14 125:11 | [             | Schlessinger  |
| 202:7 210:4,  | 136:3 200:20  | run           | 128:7,8,9     |
| 21 218:1      | 202:8         | 7:10 52:22    | Schmitz       |
| reviewed      |               | 120:6 186:15  | 5:4 11:24     |
| 8:21,22,23    | roll          | run-in        | 12:7,11,12    |
| 9:5,12,17,20  | 207:14        | 178:21 180:4  | 15:3 16:11    |
| 23:16,22      | Roman         | running       | 18:12,20      |
| 32:22 63:20   | 172:13 175:3  | 68:8          | 19:14 24:16   |
| 73:15 77:20   | room          | rushed        | 25:15 28:24   |
| 80:4 84:24    | 12:8 54:1     | 141:8         | 30:7 32:2,6,  |
| 92:5 107:21   | 141:8 142:6,  | 141.0         | 12,20 36:11,  |
| 112:6 118:22, | 21 179:4      |               | 25 41:17      |
| 23,24 134:8   | Rosenthal     | <u> </u>      | 47:12 50:5,9, |
| 156:14 161:6  | 5:7           | safety        | 13 72:6 73:13 |
| 163:24 181:4, | rotation      | 49:5,9 51:21  | 75:4 78:6,15  |
| 20 183:3      | 52:19 53:25   | 89:19,23      | 79:1,10,15,   |
| 188:10        | _             | 120:2,23      | 19,21,25      |
| 189:12,17     | rotations     | 209:3 211:14  | 83:24 84:5    |
| 202:18 203:2  | 57:21         | 213:7,11,15   | 86:13 90:3    |
| 218:7,12      | rounds        | sake          | 94:16,22 95:9 |
| reviewing     | 53:6,15,19    | 42:17         | 96:23 101:2   |
| 32:7 33:4     | 66:15,21      |               | 105:25 106:7, |
| 75:23 76:11   | 68:6,8,15     | samples       | 18,23 107:2,3 |
| 98:19 197:2   | 70:20 154:23  | 70:19         | 108:13        |
| reviews       | 195:20        | sanctions     | 113:13,19,23  |
| 22:12 44:3    | route         | 164:4 165:22  | 116:3,11      |
|               | 18:6          | sat           | 119:7 121:23  |
| Rick          | routine       | 30:3 88:23    | 122:3,6,10    |
| 88:10 119:12  | 53:1          | 153:17 208:23 | 125:16,20     |
| rights        |               | satisfactory  | 129:24 130:22 |
| 197:17,22     | RRSC          | 48:13,15      | 132:24 133:14 |
| rise          | 162:12,16     | ·             | 148:10,13,17  |
| 110:12        | rude          | SBP           | 150:3,22      |
| risk          | 92:9,18,21    | 211:11        | 155:5,9,12,17 |
|               |               |               | 159:20,24,25  |
|               |               |               |               |
|               |               |               |               |

| 165:20                     | seconds                   | separated                     | 16:2 18:2     |
|----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------|
| 167:12,21                  | 159:17                    | 5:25 140:17                   | 19:16 20:14   |
| 175:20 176:14              | seek                      | separately                    | 84:23 85:1    |
| 177:13,19,23               | 26:18 77:18               | 35:24                         | 104:17,21,22, |
| 178:1,5,8                  | 85:3 195:6                | separating                    | 23 109:14     |
| 191:23 198:5,              | 204:8                     | 17:12,15                      | 110:12 114:2  |
| 9 202:20                   | segments                  | 110:18                        | Shake         |
| 204:18,23                  | 163:7                     |                               | 55:24         |
| 207:4,9,13,18              |                           | separation                    | chalin-       |
| 209:24                     | selected                  | 51:23,25 52:3                 | Shaking       |
| 210:10,16,17               | 26:19                     | serve                         | 6:16          |
| 216:10,17                  | semantics                 | 10:4 61:6                     | share         |
| 219:2,15                   | 147:10                    | served                        | 32:1,2 142:2  |
| school                     | semi-annual               | 5:15                          | 181:15 203:3  |
| 50:20 168:17,              | 210:21                    |                               | sharing       |
| 18 189:5                   |                           | serves                        | 94:19 155:25  |
| 212:13                     | <b>send</b><br>82:7 98:21 | 46:12                         | sheet         |
|                            | 124:2 137:12              | service                       | 147:15        |
| <b>scope</b><br>95:25 96:9 | 140:13,16                 | 138:11,15                     |               |
|                            | 153:5 154:12              | 158:10,14                     | shift         |
| 174:20                     |                           | session                       | 49:20,25 69:6 |
| scores                     | sending                   | 201:11                        | 81:17 87:21   |
| 121:13,15                  | 52:10                     | sessions                      | shifts        |
| screaming                  | senior                    | 33:10,14                      | 17:16         |
| 143:12,16                  | 41:9 43:18                | 48:4,11                       | Shirley       |
| screen                     | 60:5,20 88:13             | 203:18,19                     | 128:7         |
| 32:1 122:17,               | 138:11,15                 | set                           | short         |
| 18 124:17                  | 210:21 212:8,             |                               | 113:15 122:8  |
| 149:8                      | 9                         | 94:8,10 155:2<br>208:12 216:3 | 143:23        |
| screening                  | sense                     |                               |               |
| 124:11 150:13              | 127:23 135:25             | setting                       | shortcomings  |
| ·                          | 136:2,13,14               | 125:10                        | 58:4,17       |
| scroll                     | 182:18                    | severe                        | shortly       |
| 47:25 75:21                | sentence                  | 71:14 72:23                   | 40:11 91:17   |
| 95:6                       | 53:21 120:22              | 73:2                          | shot          |
| scrolling                  | 160:7                     | severed                       | 149:8         |
| 140:9 157:3                |                           | 5:17                          | shots         |
| seat                       | separate                  | severity                      | 14:23         |
| 143:18                     | 35:22 37:10               | 74:18 168:12                  | show          |
| seated                     | 47:7,11 96:10             | 169:3 191:25                  | 31:23 66:14   |
| 142:18,19                  | 158:4,19                  |                               | 81:16 120:25  |
| 142.10,13                  | 206:24 207:2              | sexual                        | 01:10 120:23  |
|                            |                           |                               |               |

| 210:6 211:7                     | 205:6 208:22  | skip          | speaker                 |
|---------------------------------|---------------|---------------|-------------------------|
| showed                          | similarly     | 162:9 172:4   | 184:16                  |
| 93:16 94:7                      | 20:16         | skirted       | speaking                |
| 149:7                           | simply        | 146:8         | 82:1,5                  |
| showing                         | 167:14        | slot          | specific                |
| 34:6 66:20                      | single        | 131:5,8,16,22 | 27:6 34:13              |
| 67:1 68:7,22                    | 115:19 118:5  | 132:1,8,10    | 37:3 45:18              |
| 70:20                           | sir           | 135:22        | 57:9,16 58:7            |
| shown                           | 122:11        | 136:20,25     | 70:5 71:10              |
| 126:19                          |               | slow          | 80:20 84:13             |
| side                            | sit           | 186:6         | 87:12 90:14             |
| 42:13 97:3                      | 125:22 126:11 | small         | 108:8 129:11,           |
| 144:13 158:14                   | 156:19        | 136:4         | 15 130:5,17             |
| 159:3,5,10                      | sitting       | 1             | 133:11 137:14           |
| 164:6 180:12                    | 86:14 90:20   | smoking       | 147:23 156:25           |
| 199:9                           | 126:3 175:11  | 86:2          | 158:12 200:10           |
| sign                            | 192:19 193:4  | Sociology     | specifically            |
| 69:3 81:18                      | situated      | 8:3,6,7       | 13:18 59:1,13           |
| 141:11,14                       | 20:17 144:11  | sole          | 83:8 84:25              |
| 145:9 172:10                    | situation     | 23:3          | 86:10 91:2              |
| 219:1,3                         | 5:22,25 8:25  | solely        | 110:13 111:3            |
| SIGNATURE/NOT                   | 17:5 18:7,10  | 103:8         | 142:12 157:20           |
| 219:13                          | 26:5,9 27:18  | someone's     | 159:1 171:6             |
|                                 | 37:19 38:24   | 25:2,16       | 173:17 204:15           |
| signed                          | 40:19 46:5    | sort          | 206:6 210:4             |
| 31:11,17 34:5                   | 52:10 54:21,  | 10:23 11:22   | specifics               |
| 78:1 81:3                       | 25 83:13      | 39:2 42:16    | 47:6 104:25             |
| 87:10 112:8,<br>12,18,19        | 84:15 86:12   | 60:25 124:6   | 125:24,25               |
| 153:17 184:8,                   | 108:19 118:16 | 136:24 194:15 | 126:12 146:12           |
| 13 205:1                        | 124:9 126:1,  | 209:22        | 199:24 200:25           |
| 207:20,21                       | 25 143:10     | sound         | 201:1                   |
| 213:20                          | 166:21 187:13 | 192:10        | spewed                  |
|                                 | situations    |               | 142:11                  |
| <b>significant</b> 71:15 210:24 | 10:7 26:13,16 | span          | spill                   |
| 71:15 210:24<br>211:7           | 42:4 73:24    | 57:19         | 39:5                    |
| ·                               | 83:10 107:19  | speak         |                         |
| signs                           | 111:14 164:25 | 9:2 31:6      | <b>spoke</b> 62:19 63:8 |
| 81:5                            | skin          | 40:18 56:2    | 64:20 118:22            |
| similar                         | 64:13 71:12   | 61:19 74:7    | 142:24                  |
| 104:3 203:5                     | 190:23        | 80:21 81:12   | 179:14,18               |
|                                 |               | 93:9 118:20   | 1/3.14,10               |

| spoken        | 141:14 153:23 | 58:11 59:13   | 200:9 213:23  |
|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| 33:17,24      | 173:3 174:8   | 62:12 64:19   | 214:25        |
| 42:21 55:2    | 176:18 203:9  | 89:15 92:2    |               |
| 59:21 62:13,  | 206:3 217:18  | 140:10 151:23 | status        |
| 16 64:23,25   | 218:2         | 183:4 185:11  | 25:13 34:15,  |
| 206:21        | stands        | 190:2 194:20  | 17,21 36:7,8, |
| spotty        | 158:2         | 196:4 198:15  | 9 37:7 76:10  |
| 152:19        |               | 202:11        | 97:2 100:19   |
|               | start         |               | 101:19 131:17 |
| sprinted      | 32:14,16      | statement     | 135:2,6,9     |
| 146:15        | 56:16 69:23   | 48:22,25 53:8 | 136:14 137:2, |
| staff         | 81:17 139:1   | 96:5 140:4    | 9 159:3       |
| 14:6 23:17    | 181:25 182:19 | 149:15 179:16 | 206:9,11      |
| 27:4,17,22    | 185:23 215:22 | 188:13        | Stavins       |
| 29:5,6 59:15  | started       | statements    | 39:25 40:3,18 |
| 92:19,22      | 42:7 70:17    | 53:3,10 57:23 | 104:5         |
| 156:2,6,22    | 148:24        | 75:10 168:3   | step          |
| 157:12 158:8, | starting      | states        | 15:5,6,7,11,  |
| 16,25 159:5   | 68:15 119:9   | 34:4 37:24    | 12,16,22,23   |
| 161:17 165:25 | 130:22 156:15 | 39:22 40:24   | 68:20 151:9   |
| 167:8 171:13, | 198:10        | 41:23 53:21   | 159:17        |
| 15 172:18     |               | 80:10 87:4    |               |
| 173:4,18      | starts        | 88:24 95:25   | steps         |
| 176:21 206:5  | 33:4 39:11    | 101:7,8       | 27:5 36:19,20 |
| 217:19        | 48:3 88:8     | 103:15 105:3  | 51:17 54:22,  |
| stage         | 157:7 178:3   | 119:25 120:21 | 24 73:22      |
| 187:11,20,25  | state         | 139:10 157:6, | 97:23 151:2   |
| 192:13        | 5:5 51:15     | 23 158:15     | 154:12 155:1  |
|               | 53:13 55:23   | 160:2,7 161:8 | 215:12        |
| stand         | 57:20 58:21   | 164:3,8,23    | stop          |
| 162:13        | 60:5 61:10    | 166:2,4,5     | 15:19 50:10   |
| standard      | 63:7 80:17    | 173:22 174:13 | 78:9 81:1     |
| 50:24 51:4    | 87:14 89:12   | 175:7 185:4   | 113:14 144:19 |
| standards     | 90:8 91:23    | 211:12,23     | 151:24        |
| 46:10,19,25   | 134:16 144:18 | 213:6         | stopped       |
| 47:4 51:18    | 145:14 149:12 | ·             | 190:2         |
| 172:16,17,22, | 174:6 187:15  | stating       | stopping      |
| 25 173:8,11,  | 202:3         | 41:18 53:3    | 50:3,7        |
| 12            | stated        | 81:21 96:19   |               |
| standpoint    | 33:14 38:10   | 133:23        | stops         |
| 24:3 25:14    | 41:3,19 43:23 | 135:15,21     | 39:11         |
|               | 47:12 53:16   | 136:17 148:19 | story         |
| 46:16 102:8,9 | ************* | 185:9 189:19  | 180:12        |
|               |               |               |               |
|               |               |               |               |

| straight                  | submitted     | 89:8 92:2              | supposedly             |
|---------------------------|---------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| 115:4                     | 21:4 33:5     | summarizing            | 182:20 190:4           |
| strategies                | 43:14,16      | 52:9 86:15             | surgeon                |
| 10:6                      | 73:8,11 90:9, |                        | 53:4,11 58:1           |
| street                    | 13 129:18     | summary<br>48:18,22,25 | 88:4 89:13             |
| 82:9                      | 130:15 150:12 | 63:17,19               | 117:16,17              |
|                           | 212:1 218:8,  | 72:13,19               | 210:8                  |
| strong                    | 18            | 84:18 95:10            |                        |
| 112:10                    | subsequently  | 112:7 201:13           | surgery<br>13:15,20,22 |
| student                   | 214:19        |                        | 14:4,14 60:21          |
| 71:2,4 82:21,             | substance     | supervises             | 71:15 72:23            |
| 24 83:7,8                 | 8:16 51:7     | 14:16                  | 73:3 89:3              |
| 84:12,16                  | 122:21,25     | supervision            | 117:1,4 200:4          |
| 85:6,8,25                 | 123:2         | 74:2                   | 202:13                 |
| 86:8,10,24                | substances    | supervisor             |                        |
| 87:1 105:9,10             | 50:22         | 14:8,13                | surgical               |
| 110:20                    |               | 123:3,4                | 51:19 66:7,8           |
| students                  | substantiate  | supervisors            | 103:10,12              |
| 131:11 213:1              | 52:14 62:3    | 11:17 51:5             | 194:15,19              |
| studied                   | success       | support                | surmise                |
| 92:7                      | 199:6         | 13:2 31:13             | 155:24                 |
| study                     | sufficient    | 39:18 40:22            | suspended              |
| 211:24 218:9,             | 77:17 78:3    | 41:16 77:22            | 18:3 107:10            |
| 17                        | 111:16 116:22 | 78:4 85:23             | suspension             |
| stuff                     | 117:20 119:2  | 112:10                 | 22:23 98:12            |
| 6:18 35:4                 | 152:20 196:23 | 116:16,23              | 107:17 123:8           |
| 86:1 95:10                | 197:16 217:15 | 119:17 125:15          | 165:1                  |
| 109:14 154:20             | sufficiently  | 196:17 197:4           | suspicion              |
| 159:21 173:11             | 117:14        | 198:25 199:4,          | 123:2                  |
| 183:5 196:7               | suggest       | 6 202:7                |                        |
| 202:14                    | 198:6         | supported              | suspicious<br>211:8    |
|                           |               | 21:3 126:5             |                        |
| <b>subject</b> 35:5 47:22 | sum           |                        | swipe                  |
| 74:12 108:20              | 10:21         | supporting             | 67:18 68:1             |
| 74:12 108:20<br>157:8     | summaries     | 33:9,12 38:2,          | 69:11,15               |
|                           | 9:13          | 3 203:21               | swiping                |
| submission                | summarize     | supposed               | 67:22 68:8             |
| 211:24                    | 77:10 134:23  | 46:5 100:11            | switch                 |
| submit                    | 151:23        | 187:9 188:21           | 207:7                  |
| 128:15 134:24             | summarized    | 190:21 208:8           | sworn                  |
|                           | 60:14 87:12   | 216:23                 | 5:2                    |
|                           |               |                        | 3.2                    |

| symptom                   | 157:4 173:12        | tenure                   | 34:14,18      |
|---------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|---------------|
| 70:11                     | 175:5 178:20        | 171:19                   | 35:4,6,14     |
| synopsis                  | 180:23 181:24       | term                     | 36:10 39:19   |
| 48:20                     | 189:23 195:7        | 93:25                    | 46:5 52:6     |
| system                    | 199:17,20           | terminate                | 76:12 78:5    |
| 22:11 56:15               | 207:19              | 23:4,5 24:7,             | 86:17 96:1    |
| 67:12 70:9,13             | talks               | 17 35:18                 | 98:7,14,24    |
| 122:21 149:5              | 74:22               | 36:14,18                 | 100:14,22     |
| 155:8 209:2               | tardiness           | 37:20 41:11,             | 101:11,24     |
| Systems                   | 67:2,10             | 13 133:24                | 104:6 112:11  |
| 158:5                     | ·                   | 139:19 175:9             | 114:5,8 115:1 |
| 130:3                     | targeted            | 176:4 197:24             | 116:24 117:22 |
|                           | 218:14              |                          | 122:22,23     |
| T                         | task                | terminated               | 123:9,16      |
| takes                     | 125:10 211:13       | 20:24 21:1               | 131:18 133:9  |
| 16:19 70:7                | tasks               | 23:1 25:17               | 134:3,10,17,  |
|                           | 34:6 53:1           | 26:6,10,24               | 19,22 139:7,  |
| taking                    | 88:3 209:18,        | 27:12 37:14,             | 22 140:25     |
| 93:8 118:11               | 22 210:9            | 22 59:7 97:6             | 141:12 143:5  |
| 120:24 176:23             | teach               | 102:18 112:13            | 144:2 145:2,  |
| 179:23                    | 53:1                | 115:12,15                | 20,22 146:20  |
| talk                      | teaching            | 123:21                   | 152:21 154:7  |
| 32:21 54:4,7              | 46:15               | 132:17,18,22             | 161:24 162:23 |
| 55:13 95:16               |                     | 133:3,12,15,             | 163:3,11,20   |
| 153:4 154:12,             | team                | 16,20 140:7              | 164:11,25     |
| 21 181:17                 | 62:19 63:9          | 145:15 146:14            | 165:1,13      |
| 195:6 201:12,             | 64:20,24            | 152:4 180:21             | 167:15 175:23 |
| 18 218:25                 | 74:23 138:7,        | 193:24                   | 176:1,25      |
| talked                    | 13 191:14           | terminating              | 178:13 180:19 |
| 152:24 168:4              | 192:12              | 27:24 28:6,              | 194:4 197:8,9 |
| 178:24 181:17             | telephone           | 17,25 29:24              | 202:25 213:15 |
| 194:24 204:10             | 124:13              | 36:19,21                 | 217:16 218:1  |
| talking                   | telling             | 102:2                    | terminations  |
| 12:6 31:16                | 82:10 140:6         | termination              | 21:15 77:3    |
| 43:1 46:22                | 141:23 146:22       | 9:18 15:25               | 202:9         |
| 48:5 55:3                 | template            | 17:9 18:6                | terminologies |
| 90:5 95:11                | 181:22              | 20:7 21:22               | 147:10        |
| 20.0 20:11                |                     | 22:1,6 23:8,             |               |
|                           |                     | *                        | terms         |
| 96:8 106:20,              | tend                | 13 24:25                 |               |
| 96:8 106:20,<br>21 114:13 | tend<br>38:21 47:13 | 13 24:25<br>25:14 27:11, | 8:21 13:18,20 |
| 96:8 106:20,              |                     |                          |               |

|               | 4                     |
|---------------|-----------------------|
| threaten      | title                 |
| 213:11        | 20:17 88:18           |
| threats       | 106:19 109:11         |
| 213:7         | 212:11 213:4          |
| time          | today                 |
| 10:16 40:11   | 6:13 7:21,23          |
| 47:20 49:18   | 9:3,15 90:11          |
| 52:5 53:6,14  | 96:13 105:22          |
| 59:24 65:10   | 106:3 120:6           |
| 66:8 67:9,12, | 121:22 132:16         |
| 22 68:11,17,  | 153:19 156:19         |
| 22,24 69:14   | 175:12 181:7          |
| · ·           | 192:19 193:4          |
| 70:12,17      | 211:7 218:22          |
| 81:16 88:20   | 219:6                 |
| 94:12 95:21   |                       |
| 101:14 102:17 | today's               |
| 111:22 120:9  | 219:4                 |
| 121:25 126:10 | told                  |
| 127:7 128:10  | 54:16 56:8            |
| 134:20 136:10 | 62:13 71:11           |
| 137:22 140:17 | 90:11 101:22          |
| 142:25 144:21 | 125:25 126:21         |
| 146:11 147:2  | 128:18 140:22         |
| 171:7 175:9   | 146:13 179:3,         |
| 186:5 187:23, | 12,13 182:25          |
| 24 188:18     | 184:4 185:9,          |
| 191:3 194:23  | 14 187:23             |
| 208:12 209:15 | 198:12 200:5,         |
| 212:10 218:22 | 6 210:23              |
| 219:6         | tolerance             |
| timeframe     | 58:24 59:11           |
| 194:23        | Tommy                 |
| timeline      | 8:17 12:7             |
| 52:17 57:18   | 105:25 121:24         |
| 208:19        | 125:16 177:14         |
| times         | 182:3 218:25          |
| 14:6 38:20    | 219:16                |
| 65:13,23      |                       |
| · '           | top                   |
|               | 32:14 120:18          |
| 204.0         | 122:13 123:25         |
| _             | 120:9 186:12<br>204:8 |

| 138:4 144:25 164:4  topic 89:22  topical 72:1 195:1  total 90:6 122:2  totality 38:19 85:19 110:14 111:20 112:1 115:11, 14 165:23 168:19 180:16  totally 39:9 45:19,22 46:8,11 165:22  totem 191:20  track 19:10 39:1,2 61:5 97:2 100:13  tracks 19:6 35:9,23 39:1 47:7,13, 15  trail 120:3  trail 120:3  trainee 24:23 38:1 100:3 161:9 191:2 206:6  training 19:22 25:9 34:22 37:2 | 160:8 172:16 173:15,24 206:7 213:19 214:17  transcribed 182:14,16  transcript 8:22 9:17,20, 21 87:25 90:4 177:4,14,25 198:10 218:24 219:10  trauma 61:12 82:1,21 84:16 85:25  traumas 81:24 82:4  Traxler 125:21 126:9, 17 149:2  treat 74:25  treatment 104:13 105:6, 14 110:4  treatments 195:2  tricky 98:20 99:24  trigger 129:25  triggers 181:20  trip 81:19 | 64:14  true 68:4 112:4  Truman 50:20 88:11  trust 167:25 198:15  trusted 76:15  Trustees 173:25 174:3  trustworthy 167:24  truthful 51:19 68:21 89:10 93:10 168:8  truthfully 7:23  truthfulness 114:9 198:19 211:5  Ts 14:25 100:16, 17  Tuesday 210:10,11,17  turned 207:13  tutoring 213:2  type 6:15,21 11:15 13:19 17:7 18:7 19:21 20:3 22:4 | 104:3 122:20 123:18 154:24 159:7 193:5 194:6 196:25 198:20 199:13 205:22,23  typed 84:19  types 9:12 22:6 50:24 89:4 111:14 119:22 124:4 172:8  typical 16:3,5 17:6 45:8 119:19 146:6 151:15, 16 185:2  typically 11:16 13:9,25 14:4 42:12,14 43:23 65:25 69:7 74:1 124:18 125:11,12 127:11 129:25 135:3 154:5, 25 169:20 179:21 181:12 182:5 |
|--|--|---|---|
| training<br>19:22 25:9   | 181:20   | 13:19 17:7<br>18:7 19:21  | 6:17  |

|               |                   |                 | 31                 |
|---------------|-------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| 157:23 158:1, | 73:15 76:25       | understand      | unwanted           |
| 5,13          | 83:2,17,25        | 6:23 7:5        | 108:24             |
| ulcer         | 85:12 88:19       | 136:3 147:4     | 109:14,25          |
| 44:19 71:14   | 104:20 121:4      | 151:22          | 111:4              |
| 72:23 89:17,  | 122:23 127:6      | understanding   | unwillingness      |
| 21 168:6,12,  | 132:23 138:10     | 55:1 131:13     | 88:3 89:9          |
| 13 169:4,12   | 153:7 154:8,      | 133:15 170:4    | 209:18 210:9       |
| 187:8,25      | 25 156:23         | Understood      | 211:13             |
| 188:7,11      | 158:3,25          | 149:9           | · · · <del>-</del> |
| 193:6         | 160:21 161:25     | i i             | updated<br>140:21  |
| ultimate      | 162:3 164:9,      | undertake       |                    |
| 15:10 132:25  | 21 165:6,7,15     | 29:11           | upheld             |
| 201:24 202:12 | 166:4,5,10,       | unit            | 100:23 102:17      |
| ultimately    | 13,14,22          | 52:20,24 54:5   | urgency            |
| 78:9,18 97:4  | 167:5,19          | University      | 135:25 136:2,      |
| 99:20 163:11  | 168:1,21          | 158:3,5 174:1   | 15                 |
| 202:4,8       | 170:5,6,7,9       | unknown         | utilized           |
|               | 171:4,14,19       | 83:6            | 52:22              |
| umbrella      | 172:6,14          | unknowns        |                    |
| 30:9          | 173:2,17,23       | 86:12,14,21     | v                  |
| UMC           | 174:24 175:8,     |                 |                    |
| 57:3 58:25    | 24 182:17         | unnecessary     | VA                 |
| UMMC          | 215:23 217:24     | 73:3            | 82:9               |
| 9:25 10:12    | unaware           | unreasonable    | vacant             |
| 11:6,8 12:15  | 176:9             | 118:21          | 14:17              |
| 13:16,21      | uncomfortable     | unsatisfactory  | vacation           |
| 14:14 15:4    | 18:14 82:22       | 160:8 161:9     | 189:25             |
| 16:1,3 17:19  | 85:7 105:11       | 203:20          | validity           |
| 18:21 20:7    | 120:23            | unstable        | 64:6 66:19         |
| 23:9 25:8,18, | uncommon          | 155:16          | 81:21 110:9        |
| 19,22 26:3,11 | 134:25 136:9      | unsubstantiated | 183:16             |
| 27:10,14      | uncover           | 112:4           | vein               |
| 28:1,23 29:1, | 111:14            | untoward        | 153:10 205:8,      |
| 2 35:8 37:12  |                   | 86:11           | 9                  |
| 40:5 42:7     | uncovered<br>58:8 |                 | -                  |
| 46:12 52:5,22 |                   | untruthful      | veracity           |
| 56:17,25      | undergo           | 87:7,15 209:6   | 52:14 110:9        |
| 57:6,8 58:14, | 118:3             | untruthfulness  | verbal             |
| 20 59:4,10    | undergraduate     | 114:10          | 15:6,16,20         |
| 65:17 67:16   | 8:4               | unused          | 59:22,23           |
| 69:16 70:7    |                   | 140:23          | 154:6 204:9        |
|               |                   |                 |                    |
| I             |                   |                 |                    |

|               | 1                    | 1               | 1             |
|---------------|----------------------|-----------------|---------------|
| verbally      | voiced               | warranted       | 75:1 77:12    |
| 155:25        | 190:3                | 150:16 217:17   | 78:11,20      |
| verify        |                      | warrants        | 79:13,20,23   |
| 62:23 63:1    | W                    | 83:19           | 83:21 84:3    |
| 64:5,6 66:18  |                      | website         | 86:4 89:24    |
| 81:21 118:6   | W2                   | 156:17 158:21   | 94:14,20,25   |
| version       | 140:21               |                 | 95:4,8 96:20  |
| 177:18 187:16 | wait                 | Wednesday 32:25 | 101:1 106:1,  |
| versions      | 50:7                 |                 | 14,20,24      |
| 216:12        | waive                | week            | 108:10        |
|               | 218:24               | 186:22          | 113:11,18,21  |
| versus        | WAIVED               | weekly          | 115:23 116:9  |
| 170:14,18     | 219:13               | 11:10           | 121:21 122:2, |
| vice          |                      | weeks           | 4 129:7       |
| 161:23 162:1, | <b>wake</b><br>43:24 | 71:21 72:2      | 132:20 133:6  |
| 3 212:12      |                      | 136:11 195:3    | 149:22 150:9  |
| victim        | walking              | weigh           | 155:4,7,14,19 |
| 109:7         | 82:8 95:13           | 170:8           | 159:15,23     |
| victims       | Walton               | 1               | 165:16 167:6  |
| 109:21        | 180:9,11             | whatsoever      | 175:15 176:10 |
| viewed        | wanted               | 41:10 63:11     | 177:12,17,21, |
| 76:1 101:23   | 32:23 46:24          | 110:2 111:19    | 24 178:4      |
|               | 93:4 125:22,         | 136:1 180:25    | 191:22 198:3, |
| viewing       | 23 133:24,25         | wheelhouse      | 7 204:21      |
| 164:17        | 200:17 209:21        | 203:14          | 207:2,7,11,19 |
| violate       | wanting              | white           | 209:23,25     |
| 166:15        | 110:1,19             | 105:7 107:16    | 210:14 216:6  |
| violated      | ,                    | 110:5 145:25    | 219:1,9,11,16 |
| 107:15 176:21 | warned               | 147:3 148:4,7   | Whitlock      |
| violation     | 105:4                | 149:11          | 5:1,5,7 50:14 |
| 107:7,20      | warning              | Whitfield       | 219:5         |
| 166:7,23      | 15:7 22:24           | 11:25 12:3,10   | whomever      |
| ·             | 59:22 107:14,        | 15:2 16:6       | 16:22 73:9    |
| violations    | 17 154:6,19          | 18:8,15 19:3    | 201:14        |
| 164:4 165:23, | warnings             | 24:9 25:7       | wife          |
| 24            | 59:23 153:20,        | 28:20 30:1      | 204:18        |
| violence      | 25                   | 31:25 32:3,9    |               |
| 58:24 59:11   | warrant              | 35:21 36:23     | Wilbrook      |
| 179:23        | 110:17 116:22        | 41:12 47:2      | 190:6 193:13, |
| violent       | 119:2 152:20         | 50:2,6,11       | 14,18,22      |
| I             | 102.20               | 72:4 73:5       | 194:5         |

| willful   199:9 |
|-----------------|
| 5:23 60:22      |